

# An ab-initio study on the thermodynamics of disulfide, sulfide, and bisulfide incorporation into apatite and the development of a more comprehensive temperature, pressure, pH, and composition-dependent model for ionic substitution in minerals

YOUNGJAE KIM<sup>1,2,3,\*,\*†</sup>, BRIAN KONECKE<sup>1,4</sup>, ADAM SIMON<sup>1,‡</sup>, ADRIAN FIEGE<sup>1</sup>, AND UDO BECKER<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109, U.S.A.

<sup>2</sup>Chemical Sciences and Engineering Division, Argonne National Laboratory, Lemont, Illinois 60439, U.S.A.

<sup>3</sup>Division of Earth and Environmental System Sciences, Major of Environmental Geosciences, Pukyong National University, Busan, 48513, Republic of Korea

<sup>4</sup>Fathom Geophysics, LLC, 12956 Claylick Road, Neward, Ohio 43056, U.S.A.

## ABSTRACT

The mineral apatite,  $\text{Ca}_{10}(\text{PO}_4)_6(\text{F},\text{OH},\text{Cl})_2$ , incorporates sulfur (S) during crystallization from S-bearing hydrothermal fluids and silicate melts. Our previous studies of natural and experimental apatite demonstrate that the oxidation state of S in apatite varies systematically as a function of oxygen fugacity ( $f_{\text{O}_2}$ ). The S oxidation states  $-1$  and  $-2$  were quantitatively identified in apatite crystallized from reduced, S-bearing hydrothermal fluids and silicate melts by using sulfur  $K$ -edge X-ray absorption near-edge structure spectroscopy (S-XANES) where  $\text{S}^{6+}/\text{S}$  in apatite increases from  $\sim 0$  at FMQ-1 to  $\sim 1$  at FMQ+2, where FMQ refers to the fayalite-magnetite-quartz  $f_{\text{O}_2}$  buffer. In this study, we employ quantum-mechanical calculations to investigate the atomistic structure and energetics of S(-I) and S(-II) incorporated into apatite and elucidate incorporation mechanisms.

One S(-I) species (disulfide,  $\text{S}_2^-$ ) and two S(-II) species (bisulfide,  $\text{HS}^-$ , and sulfide,  $\text{S}^{2-}$ ) are investigated as possible forms of reduced S species in apatite. In configuration models for the simulation, these reduced S species are positioned along the  $c$ -axis channel, originally occupied by the column anions F, Cl, and OH in the end-member apatites. In the lowest-energy configurations of S-incorporated apatite, disulfide prefers to be positioned halfway between the mirror planes at  $z = 1/4$  and  $3/4$ . In contrast, the energy-optimized bisulfide is located slightly away from the mirror planes by  $\sim 0.04$  fractional units in the  $c$  direction. The energetic stability of these reduced S species as a function of position along the  $c$ -axis can be explained by the geometric and electrostatic constraints of the Ca and O planes that constitute the  $c$ -axis channel.

The thermodynamics of incorporation of disulfide and bisulfide into apatite is evaluated by using solid-state reaction equations where the apatite host and a solid S-bearing source phase (pyrite and  $\text{Na}_2\text{S}_{2(\text{s})}$  for disulfide; troilite and  $\text{Na}_2\text{S}_{(\text{s})}$  for sulfide) are the reactants, and the S-incorporated apatite and an anion sink phase are the products. The Gibbs free energy ( $\Delta G$ ) is lower for incorporation with Na-bearing phases than with Fe-bearing phases, which is attributed to the higher energetic stability of the iron sulfide minerals as a source phase for S than the sodium sulfide phases. The thermodynamics of incorporation of reduced S is also evaluated by using reaction equations involving dissolved disulfide and sulfide species [ $\text{H}_n\text{S}_{2(\text{aq})}^{2-n}$ ] and [ $\text{H}_n\text{S}_{(\text{aq})}^{2-n}$ ];  $n = 0, 1$ , and  $2$ ] as a source phase. The  $\Delta G$  of S-incorporation increases for fluorapatite and chlorapatite, and decreases for hydroxylapatite, as these species are protonated (i.e., as  $n$  changes from 0 to 2). These thermodynamic results demonstrate that the presence of reduced S in apatite is primarily controlled by the chemistry of magmatic and hydrothermal systems where apatite forms (e.g., an abundance of Fe; solution pH). Ultimately, our methodology developed for evaluating the thermodynamics of S incorporation in apatite as a function of temperature, pH, and composition is highly applicable to predicting the trace and volatile element incorporation in minerals in a variety of geological systems. In addition to solid-solid and solid-liquid equilibria treated here at different temperatures and pH, the methodology can be easily extended to different pressure conditions by just performing the quantum-mechanical calculations at elevated pressures.

**Keywords:** Sulfur incorporation into apatite, oxybarometer, disulfide, bisulfide, sulfide, fluorapatite, chlorapatite, hydroxylapatite, density functional theory (DFT) calculation; Experimental Halogens in Honor of Jim Webster