Minutes of the Third 2018 MSA Council Meeting

Saturday, 3 November 2018 JW Marriott-Indianapolis 10 S. West St., Indianapolis, Indiana, USA

Attending:

Michael Brown, President Mickey Gunter, Vice President Thomas Duffy, Treasurer Bryan Chakoumakos, Secretary Peter Nabelek, Councilor Sarah K. Carmichael, Councilor Sarah C. Penniston-Dorland, Councilor Jay Ague, Councilor Donna Whitney, Councilor

Not Present:

George Harlow, Past President Rajdeep Dasgupta, Councilor

Visitors:

J. Alex Speer, MSA Executive Director Rachel Russell, Managing Editor, *American Mineralogist* Carol Frost Mark Caddick Adam Simon Peter Heaney John Brady Ann Benbow

Note: Motions and Council action items are presented in *italics*; SoC = sense of Council

ITEMS

[1] 8:00 AM, Meeting called to order by Michael Brown. Attendees introduced themselves. Ann Benbow was introduced as the new incoming Executive Director to replace Alex Speer. Mark Caddick was introduced as one of the new incoming counselors. Others introduced themselves to Ann.

[2] Additions to and deletions from the Agenda, approval of the Agenda.

Mickey Gunter moved that the agenda be approved by Council, Sarah Carmichael seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[3] Accept Reports to Council containing no questions or action items as a group. Reports will be acknowledged by Secretary.

American Mineralogist Editorial Office, Series Editor of the Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry & Monographs Series, MSA Society News Editor for Elements, Editor of the Handbook of Mineralogy, Coordinator of Meetings, MSA Webmaster, Lecture Program Committee, Bloss Optical Crystallography Fund Committee, Crystallographic Research Grant Committee (Kraus), Mineralogy/Petrology Research Grant Committee (Min/Pet), Liaisons to American Crystallographic Association (ACA), American Geoscience Institute (AGI), European Mineralogical Union (EMU), Friends of Mineralogy (FM), Gemological Institute of America (GIA), Geological Society of America (GSA), Geological Society of America's Mineralogy, Petrology, Volcanology, and Geochemistry Division (GSA-MPVG), International Mineralogical Association (IMA), Society of Mineral Museum Professionals (SMMP), Pegmatites MSA Special Interest Group, Planetary Materials MSA Special Interest Group.

Not heard from: American Geophysical Union (AGU-VGP Section) nor American Geophysical Union (AGU-Mineral Physics)

Sarah Penniston-Dorland moved that the committee reports be accepted, Jay Ague seconded. Motion passed unanimously. Reports will be acknowledged by Secretary.

[4] Revisions, if any, and approval of the minutes of the 2^{nd} 2018 Council Meeting. The minutes reflect all revisions previously sent to the MSA Secretary (Section 2).

Sarah Penniston-Dorland moved that the minutes be approved by Council, Jay Ague seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[5] Review of Executive Committee actions (Section 1):

- a) Report on the Executive Director search and interview by the Executive Committee + chair of the Search and Selection Committee (SSC). So far:
 - Executive Committee approved the draft position description (Sec 1, Appendix A)
 - appointed Nancy Ross as Chair of the Search and Selection Committee (SSC)
 - after discussion with Nancy, appointed David Bish, Barb Dutrow, John Ferry, John Hughes and Rodney Ewing as members of the committee

 - SSC reviewed the draft position description and requested changes SSC and the Executive Committee approved the revised position description The position was widely advertised, 24 applications were received by the mid-
 - August deadline
 - in late August letters were sought for the top 7 candidates
 - after consideration SSC pared the number to 5 individuals
 - These five were invited for interviews October 15-17 at the MSA offices in Chantilly.
 - Five candidates were interviewed at the MSA Headquarters by a Panel consisting of the Executive Committee (present: Mike Brown, Mickey Gunter, Bryan Chakoumakos, Thomas Duffy) and the Chair of the Search Committee (Nancy Ross).
 - Ann Benbow was offered the position from unanimous consensus and she accepted the position. She is expected start in the early Spring and overlap with Alex for approximately one year.
- b) Other actions
 - 1. Transfer of \$75,000 from the Roebling fund to support operating expenses.

Medals, awards, grants, and honors

[6] Accept medal, award, grant, and honor recommendations:

The number of new Fellows each year is set at 0.5% of the membership, so Council can select up to 10 members as Fellows for 2018. The Committee has recommended 12 individuals based on the membership from 2017.

Because several past recipients said they were never officially informed of their awards, it was decided that the **outgoing MSA President** will notify the award winners (Roebling Medal, Distinguished Public Service Medal, Dana Medal, MSA Award) of their selection while at the meeting (or shortly after). The **incoming MSA President** will also notify the award winners, but in writing within the following month.

The President needs to inquire of the awardees if they accept the award and tell the recipients when and where their award is likely to presented. The purpose is to convey the message that the presentation venues and dates are fixed.

The MSA Business Office will send letters signed by the President to new Fellows. Contact information for the medal award winners:

Dr. Peter R. Buseck Arizona State University School of Earth & Space Exploration Box 871404 Tempe AZ 85287-1404 Tel: +1 (480) 965-3945 e-mail: pbuseck@asu.edu

Dr. Matthew J. Kohn Boise State University Dept Geosciences MS 1535 1910 University Dr Boise ID 83725-1535 Tel: +1 (208) 426-2757 e-mail: mattkohn@boisestate.edu Dr. Olivier Namur KU Leuven Dept Earth and Environmental Sciences Celestijnenlaan 200e - box 2411 BE-3001 Leuven Belgium Tel: +32 16 37 65 38 e-mail: olivier.namur@kuleuven.be

Prof. Rodney C. Ewing Stanford University Geological Sciences School of Earth Energy & Env. Sciences Stanford, CA 94305 USA Tel: 650-725-8641 e-mail: rewing1@stanford.edu

[7] Additional items about MSA awards:

a) Sarah Carmichael, Dana Medal Committee (Section 26) received several inquiries from people who wanted to nominate scientists who were more senior than they were, but as junior/mid-career scientists did not feel they were qualified as nominators, and/or that their nominations would not be taken seriously. Despite encouragement, they did not follow through with the nomination. When she wanted to nominate a candidate several years ago she could not get more senior scientists to reply to her about collaborating as co-sponsors on a potential nomination. It does seem that very good candidates are being overlooked because their former advisors have retired, died, or are too busy with administrative tasks to be a nominator. Is this just a cultural artifact that has to work itself out, or does MSA wish to address this in some way?

Peter Nabelek commented on the poor representation of women in the nomination pool. Council is aware of this disparity, and the awards committees are being encouraged to be as proactive as possible to find worthy candidates, with age and gender diversity.

Thom Duffy urged that the reports from the awards committees should not contain sensitive information, such as letters of recommendation that compare candidates, rankings of those not selected, etc. The worry is that the information can be inadvertently circulated. Is it necessary to see a ranked list for the medalists in the committee reports?

Mickey Gunter moved that the medal winners be accepted as presented, Sarah Penniston-Dorland seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Thomas Duffy moved that the medal award committees should forward the full nomination package for the top-ranked candidate, but the committee reports should include only an unranked list of the other nominees and no recommendation letters. Jay Ague seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

The 12 Fellows nominated would exceed the 0.5% limit of the current membership (10 Fellows), but Michael Brown argued that we should accept the 12 nominations anyway. It was not clear from the committee report how all the candidates were ranked. The handbook for the Fellows committee should be so modified to require the committee report includes a ranked list of the nominees.

Mickey Gunter moved that the Fellows committee report a ranked list of nominees. Thomas Duffy seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Personnel- committees, officers, appointed posts, and staff.

[8] MSA Committee members and appointed posts for 2019 as recommended by the Committee on Committees (Section 7). Review and fill any outstanding vacancies. The actual, formal vote on appointment of Committees and other posts will occur during the First 2019 Council Meeting this afternoon (Section 31).

The following Committee topics are specially mentioned in several reports:

- a) The Committee on Committees (Section 7) and Coordinator of the MSA Lecture Program (Section 21(b)) report that David Peate, current MSA Lecture Program Administrator, would like to step down as he will be stepping up to be the department chair. This position will need to be filled in the next few months.
- b) John M. Hughes asks Council to replace him as Chair of the Benefactors Committee. (Section 9). Update; Phil Neuhoff expressed interest as John's successor. Phil and John have talked and exchanged emails. John thinks Phil is a good choice, and John will continue to help.
- c) The Workshops Committee indicates that both Richard L. Hervig and James D. Webster terms are ended. Suggestions for replacements were made in

the second 2018 report from this committee (Ayra Udry, Vincent J. Van Hinsburg, and Julie Roberge).

d) AGI is looking to expand its pool of candidate to serve on AGI's Executive Committee or receive AGI awards for the 2019 nominations cycle (Section 29(b)). AGI is asking for participation from Member Societies in the form of nominations. The deadline is February 1, 2019; more information and online nomination forms are available at

https://www.americangeosciences.org/nominations.

Adam Simon agreed to Chair the Petrology Grant Award Committee. Mark Caddick agreed to chair the Kraus Crystallography Grant Committee. Davide Peate, Coordinator for the MSA Distinguished Lecture Program, has asked to be replaced.

Comment made by Peter Nabelek, that the Distinguished Lecturers do not uniformly acknowledge MSA. Council urged that the Executive Director should communicate clearly to the Lecturer Coordinator that this should be done, and offer a couple of slides about MSA to be used by the lecturers.

Sarah Carmichael moved that the Committee on Committees selections be approved, Thomas Duffy seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[9] 2019 Ballot & Election

a) The Nominating Committee for Officers (Section 8) presented a list of possible candidates for Vice-President, Secretary, and Councilors. The list was reviewed and ordered so that the current MSA Secretary can contact those on the list in the sequence decided by Council to invite them to run for office.

Each Officer and Councilor position was separated into Mineralogy/Crystallography and Petrology/Geochemistry focus positions.

Mickey Gunter moved that the ranked ordered list of VP candidates as modified by Council be accepted. Thomas Duffy seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Sarah Penniston-Dorland moved that the ranked ordered list of Secretary candidates as modified by Council be accepted. Jay Ague seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

b) The MSA President (Section1) proposes that for future elections, that the two Councilor positions be listed separately on the ballot. For the first position, the two nominees will be from petrology/geochemistry, whereas, for the second position, the two nominees will be from mineralogy/crystallography.

Mickey Gunter moved that the ranked ordered list of Councilors candidates as amended by Council be accepted. Jay Ague seconded. Motion passed unanimously. Michael Brown moved that two Councilor positions be listed separately on future ballots to ensure one from each research area is selected, but they will not be labeled as such on the ballot. Sarah Penniston-Dorland seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[10] Council considered recommendations of staff evaluations from the Management Committee of the preceding day. Recommendations were reported by Michael Brown.

SoC: The current policy for staff evaluations/pay increases references full-time staff, but now that we have part-time employees also, that wording will be changed to simply reference staff, with no distinction of full- or part-time.

It was emphasized that the Executive Director is the supervisor for the *American Mineralogist* Managing Editor, and will provide their evaluation. The process of employee performance evaluation needs to be formalized more. It is recommended that goals be set by each employee in coordination with the supervisor and that the employee provide a self-evaluation in addition to the supervisor's evaluation.

Jay Ague moved that the recommendations of the Management Committee concerning cost of living and merit increases for MSA staff be approved, Thomas Duffy seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[21] The Publications Director (Section 11c) had two items. The first item [21a] was taken out of order to accommodate John Brady's schedule:

- a) John Brady presented background information about his proposed online "book" and the estimated date to complete the first edition. He has two principal questions for Council:
 - 1) Is MSA willing to host the online petrology website, and if so, under what conditions?
 - 2) Should the website be made available through MSA now, or should MSA posting wait until it is more of a complete undergraduate textbook?

<u>http://www.science.smith.edu/~jbrady/petrology/tour.php</u> username: jbrady-guest password: ReadMyT3xt

The link takes you to a tour page that directs you to some of the more interesting features and tools, including the Rock Library. The site has been tested with Chrome, but most features work in other browsers. There is still lots to do but he think the framework is in place so that you can see the power of some of the images and tools for learning. He hopes that other petrologists will contribute material and activities to the website and that MSA hosting will encourage those contributions.]

Discussion by council focused on how this project could be described, not necessarily a book, but a web resource that can be used for teaching. What would the benefit to MSA be? Does MSA have the hardware/software to standup a server that can handle the expected traffic? How to handle use of the material in terms of copyright? Could we get a sponsor to finance the upgrade of the hardware/software needed? Could this type of web resource increase student membership for instance? Likely, it would be used by students in petrology classes.

SoC: Consensus is that MSA membership should be required to have access. If successful, this could be a new model that could be expanded to include other subject areas.

SoC: This project is something MSA should host. MSA membership should be required to have access. We will introduce it in conjunction with the Centennial. John Brady will look into any copyright issues and system requirements and coordinate with the Executive Director.

b) Item [21b] was covered in sequence and is below.

Operations

[11] The Executive Director requests that Council accept the 2018 election results and give permission to destroy the paper ballots and the electronic ballot files upon acceptance (Section 3).

Sarah Penniston-Dorland moved that the 2018 election results be accepted, Mickey Gunter seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[12] The Executive Director asked Council to decide about the location and timing Spring 2019 Council meeting so planning can be started (Section 3).

SoC: Spring Council meeting will be held Saturday, Apr 6, 2019 in Chantilly, Virginia.

[13] The Executive Director asked Council to recognize that the Third 2019 and First 2020 MSA Council Meetings be held in Phoenix, Arizona USA on Saturday 21 September 2019. The MSA Management Committee meeting will be held Friday afternoon or evening of 20 September 2019.

SoC: Third 2019 and First 2020 MSA Council Meetings will be held in Phoenix, Arizona USA on Saturday Sep 21 2019 and the MSA Management meeting will be held Friday afternoon or evening, Sep 20, 2019.

[14] The Treasurer (Section 4) had no specific action items relating to 2018 finances for the 2018 Council, but the 2019 budget will need to be approved during the First 2019 Council Meeting this afternoon (Section 31). The Treasurer will described highlights of both years and answered questions.

- a) Investment updates Thomas Duffy reported briefly.
- b) Action on MSA's request to increase the administrative allotment for managing the *Elements* business office (Section 16, Appendix D) This was approved by the Elements Advisory Council, but for one year. The request was for a continuing "cost of living" adjustments, but was objected to by non-US members on

the basis that the administrative allotment was not salary. Wording will be changed next year so that it will be called an inflation adjustment.

- c) State sales taxes in light of *South Dakota v. Wayfair, Inc.*, (2018) decision. Paperwork will be required for each individual state and local taxing jurisdictions where we have sales, which puts a significant burden on the MSA Office.
- d) Tripling of MSA dues to AGI (Section 29(b) Appendix C) Dues are being increased significantly because AGI is struggling financially. Executive Director is skeptical about the merits of the increase and sees no new or actual benefits to MSA to warrant our continued membership. Should we drop our membership to AGI?

SoC: MSA will not pay their membership dues to AGI.

[15] The Financial Advisory and Audit Committee (FAAC) had two advisory items (Section 6), and one action item:

a) **the 4% Rule**. The 4% rule was not to limit the authority of Council, but to provide a brake in the system, to ensure that large cash withdrawals from our endowment are carefully considered. At times such withdrawals are appropriate, for emergencies or unforeseen expenses. Exceeding the 4% limit is in effect spending principal from our endowment. Recognize that taking more money from the endowment today means less money available in the future to carry out the programs of MSA.

The FAAC anticipates that the society will be making greater demands on our endowment, both for increased expenses related to the management transition occasioned by Alex Speer's retirement, and for other expenses such as the Centennial celebration, and possibly the launching of new programs requiring resources. FAAC, with authority delegated to it by Council, attempts to manage the endowment for the long haul.

- ⇒ We need to replenish and augment the endowment for the future. The upcoming Centennial celebration provides a rare opportunity to do this by soliciting bequests and testamentary gifts. We urge MSA to take advantage of this opportunity.
- b) *Funds Held for Others*. Future FAAC reports will have a new section "Funds Held for Others." Current examples are the Meteoritical Society and Elements magazine. The cash balances in our bank accounts, as reported in the introduction of their report, give a sense of the amount of money involved, which is substantial.
- c) **2017** Audit. Section 6 Appendix D presents the draft audit report and financial statements for the years ending December 31, 2017 and 2016, respectively.

Thomas Duffy moved that the FAAC Report be accepted, Mickey Gunter seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

[16] Fund Raising. Michael Brown and Mickey Gunter undertook an effort to fund the Lecture program. As a first step, a message was sent to Presidents asking if they would commit to \$1,000 a year for the next 10 years (Section 01, Appendix B).

As of 10/09/2018, 10 have responded positively. Michael Brown and Mickey Gunter updated the progress and the plans for the future of this effort.

[17] The Executive Director presented a draft MSA Conduct Policy (Section 3, Appendix J). He related the history of its development and asked Council to review and approve, if acceptable, this Policy. The policy will be posted on the MSA website. For any MSA event requiring registration or invitation, the individuals will be required to check a box that would indicate that they are aware of and will comply with the policy as a condition to participate in the event, such as workshops, and short courses.

A consensus on the wording of the MSA Conduct policy was not reached, and it was agreed to table this item until the Spring Council meeting pending a new draft by Thomas Duffy.

MSA Programs - Publications, Short Courses, Lecture Program, Meetings, and Outreach

[18] Barb Dutrow, the MSA Representative to *Elements* Magazine, had several requests, but none requiring a vote of Council (Section 16):

- a) Council suggestions for the next Mineralogy editor to replace Nancy Ross.
- b) Send Jodi any information for People in the News.
- c) Consider proposing an issue of *Elements*.
- d) Review *Elements* in the past year, and send comments, concerns, and thoughts about the publication to Barb.
- e) review the new website and send comments

[19] The Short Course Committee (Section 19(a)) had two short courses they recommend for approval, one item requiring a sense of Council, and one informational item.

The two MSA short course proposals recommended for approval:

- a) *Triple oxygen isotope for terrestrial and extraterrestrial materials* by Ilya Bindeman and Andreas Pack. Planned for 2020 GSA Annual Meeting in Montreal, Quebec, Canada (October 25-28, 2020) or 2020 AGU Fall Meeting in San Francisco (December 2020) or similar meetings to be held in 2021
- b) *Geological Melts*, by D.R. Neuville, G.S. Henderson, D.B Dingwell. Planned for 2020 Goldschmidt Conference in Hawaii (June 21-26, 2020)

Jay Ague moved that the two MSA short course proposal above be approved, Mickey Gunter seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Item requiring a sense of Council:

c) Reactive Transport in Natural and Engineered System by Jennifer L. Druhan, Christophe Tournassat, Eric Oelkers. Planned for the 2019 Goldschmidt Conference in Barcelona, Spain (18-23 August, 2019).

The conveners are requesting funding support from the MSA, if available, to assist with the workshop to offset travel expenses of chapter authors and costs to provide refreshments. Funding of these expenses has been complicated by the fact that the conference will be held outside of the United States so planned support from the DOE will be more difficult to acquire than thought originally.

One informational item:

d) *Natural Diamonds: Their Mineralogy, Geochemistry, and Genesis* by Fabrizio Nestola, Graham Pearson, Steven Shirey, Thomas Stachel. Planned for the Fall GSA 2020 (Montreal) or Fall AGU 2020 (San Francisco) and perhaps again at the 12th International Kimberlite, Conference in Yellowknife, NWT Canada in 2021.

The Committee is waiting to receive a budget from the conveners for the "Natural Diamonds" short course.

All of these short courses are appealing, but a challenge is whether we can manage three RIMG volumes in a single year.

SoC: The other two proposals should be accepted, but no financial support will be provided. Workflow planning and coordination will be re-assessed with Ian Swainson to ensure more than one short course volume can be handled in the same year.

[20] The Report on GeoScienceWorld (GSW) (Section 17) requests a Sense of Council, and any thoughts, about MSA's participating in GSW's joint Open Access Transfer Journal project. Further background and justification of the need to pursue this are the "*Plan-S European Open Access*" and "*Read and Publish*" parts of the Executive Directors' Report (Section 3, pages 32-34)

Suggestion is that we start a cascade journal, named International Mineralogist, as an open access journal. Authors would choose which journal to publish in, but pay for the open access one. How do we want to manage it?

SoC: MSA Managing Editor will explore the various possible business models for publishing International Mineralogist for the Spring Council meeting.

[21] Publications. The Publications Director reported on John Winter's inquiry concerning whether MSA would consider publishing a third edition of his book, *Igneous and Metamorphic Petrology*.

SoC: Consensus is that this will not be supported.

Editorship of the American Mineralogist

[22] The Publications Director (Section 11c) will update the Council following the discussion about editorship of the American Mineralogist from the 2018 Spring Council Meeting. From those minutes:

Executive Committee meeting was held all day May 4. Deliberations about the Centennial celebration meeting and single-editor model of the American Mineralogist took place. Some issues have been reported about the current single-editor being able to effectively cover the full breadth of the science of the American Mineralogist. The Executive Committee recommends that the current single-editor stay on for one more year as of the first 2019 Council meeting, then the American Mineralogist will transition back to having two editors, one with a petrology/geochemistry expertise and one with a mineralogy/crystallography expertise. It is important that the American Mineralogist maintain a balance of the breath of disciplines, and feedback from notable MSA members has expressed concern that the balance of science at the American Mineralogist has slipped and is not being maintained. The two-editor model would be implemented with the appointments being made for 3-years, with an annual review by the Publications Director, i.e., MSA Vice-President, and, subject to a positive recommendation, annual reappointment at the first Council meeting of the year. The 3-year appointments will be renewable.

SoC that the American Mineralogist editorship will change as noted above from one editor model back to the two-editor model.

SoC: Keith Putirka has been Editor of American Mineralogist for approximately 7 years. The change back to the two editor model will be implemented by the new dual editors being appointed by the Council during the 1st meeting of 2019. New editors will start Jan 1, and Keith Putirka will continue to handle whatever manuscripts are in the system that were submitted through the end of the year. Keith would receive the honorarium through Jun 2019, which is paid in arrears. Currently, the honorarium for the Editor is \$15,000 per year. For the 2-editor model, we will go back to paying each editor \$7,500 per year honorarium. The new editors will take over all manuscripts coming in after Dec 31.

Centennial Celebration

[23] The Chair of the Centennial Celebration Committee will provide updates regarding the Centennial Symposium (Section 10(a)), and asks Council to approve the general budget structure for the MSA Centennial Symposium.

[Site visits to the Centennial venues were made Oct. 24; Michael Brown, Peter Heaney, Steve Shirey, Michelle Scholtes (caterer) and Alex Speer visited the Carnegie Building. Peter J. Heaney and Alex Speer visited with Tina Karl (site representative) at the Smithsonian. A screen capture of the Centennial website is Section 03 – Appendix G.] Peter Heaney gave an in-depth report about the Centennial meeting plans. Section 10(a) Appendix A gives a summary. Gender diversity in speakers was sought, and is not ideal, but is not unreasonable. We need about 400 attendees and the lecture hall has a 400 person limit. External fund-raising is up to \$34,000.

SoC: Registration fees agreed to are \$275 members (until March 31), \$325 members (from April 1), \$350 non-members (membership included), \$200 guest for social functions only, \$150 student (membership included), and Centennial registration of \$1000 (includes \$725 taxable donation towards endowment fund).

The Centennial Meeting website needs to go live as soon as possible.

The possibility of a RIMG volume is being considered, but would not be coincident with the meeting, yet published by the end of the calendar year.

Maximizing the attendance will depend on effective advertising.

Centennial activities in conjunction with the GSA Meeting in Phoenix include incorporating the 100 important questions in mineralogy as engaging artwork.

Sarah Carmichael moved to adjourn the meeting, Jay Ague seconded. Motion passed unanimously.

Respectively submitted,

Bryan Chakoumakos, MSA Secretary



1919 - CENTENNIAL - 2019

Mineralogical Society of America