1	<u>Revision 2</u>
2 3	Word count: 6854
4	
5 6	Single crystal analysis of La-doped pyromorphite (Pb5(PO4)3Cl)
7 8 9	Julia Sordyl <sup>1,2,*</sup> , John Rakovan <sup>3</sup> , Peter C. Burns <sup>4,5</sup> , Justyna Topolska <sup>1</sup> , Adam Włodek <sup>1</sup> , Jennifer E. S. Szymanowski <sup>4</sup> , Ginger E. Sigmon <sup>4</sup> , Jarosław Majka <sup>1,2</sup> , Maciej Manecki <sup>1,2</sup>
10 11 12 13 14 16	<ul> <li><sup>1</sup>Faculty of Geology, Geophysics and Environmental Protection, AGH University of Science and Technology, al. Mickiewicza 30, 30-059 Kraków, Poland</li> <li><sup>2</sup>Department of Earth Sciences, Uppsala University, Villavägen 16, SE-752 36 Uppsala, Sweden</li> <li><sup>3</sup>New Mexico Bureau of Geology &amp; Mineral Resources New Mexico Institute of Mining &amp; Technology, 87801, U.S.A.</li> <li><sup>4</sup>Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering and Earth Sciences, University of Notre</li> </ul>
17 18	Dame, Notre Dame, IN, 46556, USA <sup>5</sup> Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN, 46556, USA
19 20 21 22	Abstract
22	Rare earth elements (REE) in calcium apatite have been widely described in the literature.
24	Based on the investigations of minerals and their synthetic analogs, the mechanism of
25	substitution of $REE^{3+}$ for $Ca^{2+}$ and their structural positions are well established. Although the
26	presence of REE in natural pyromorphite has been reported, the structural response of
27	substitution of REE <sup>3+</sup> for Pb <sup>2+</sup> is not established. A better understanding of REE-rich Pb-apatite
28	may facilitate the potential use of this mineral in industrial processes. Two La-doped
29	pyromorphite analogs (Pb5(PO4)3Cl) and two control pyromorphite analogs (with the absence
30	of La) were synthesized from aqueous solutions at 25°C. Na <sup>+</sup> and K <sup>+</sup> were used as charge
31	compensating ions to facilitate the incorporation of trivalent REE cations ( $La^{3+} + Na^+ \Leftrightarrow 2Pb^{2+}$
32	and $La^{3+} + K^+ \Leftrightarrow 2Pb^{2+}$ ). Microprobe analysis, scanning electron microscopy, and Raman
33	spectroscopy were used to confirm the purity of obtained phases. High precision crystal
34	structure refinements ( $R_1 = 0.0140-0.0225$ ) of all four compounds were performed from single-
35	crystal X-ray diffraction data. The La content varied from 0.12(1) to 0.19(1) atoms per formula
36	unit with the counter ions of $K^+$ and $Na^+$ , respectively. Both substituting ions were

37	accommodated at the Pb1 site only. By comparing the La-doped pyromorphite analogs with
38	their control samples it was possible to detect small changes in bond distances and polyhedral
39	volumes caused by the La substitution. Variations in individual and mean interatomic distances
40	reflected the cumulative effect of both the amount of substitution and ionic radii of substituting
41	ions ( $La^{3+}$ , $Na^+$ and $K^+$ ).

42 *Keywords: apatite, pyromorphite, crystal structure, Rare earth elements* 

43

#### 44 **1. Introduction**

Pyromorphite (Pb<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Cl) belongs to the apatite supergroup of minerals and occurs in the oxidation zone of polymetallic deposits (Pasero et al. 2010). The pyromorphite structure was discussed in detail in Dai and Hughes (1989) and Okudera (2013). In the unit cell Pb occupies four Pb1 sites (bonding to nine oxygen atoms:  $3 \times O1$ ,  $3 \times O2$ , and  $3 \times O3$ ) and six Pb2 sites (bonding to six oxygen atoms [O1, O2, and  $4 \times O3$ ] and two Cl atoms located on the hexad at 0,0,0 and 0,0,1/2). Two distinct Pb polyhedrons are linked through O atoms shared with phosphate tetrahedra and are hexagonally distributed about a central [001] anion column.

52 As Pb-phosphates are highly stable under environmental conditions found in the critical 53 zone of the Earth (Nriagu 1974), pyromorphite is a natural weathering product in Pb-54 contaminated soils and a product of in-situ immobilization by precipitation induced by 55 phosphate amendments (Laperche et al. 1997; Ma et al. 1993; Ma et al. 1995; Manecki et al. 56 2000, 2020; Tang et al. 2013; Manecki 2019). The presence of rare earth elements (REE) has 57 been reported in natural pyromorphite (Markl et al. 2014). However, the mechanisms of 58 incorporation of REE, their structural position in Pb-apatite, and charge compensation 59 mechanisms are poorly understood, as compared to widely described calcium apatite (Borisov 60 and Klevcova 1963; Mackie and Young 1973; Hughes et al. 1991; Fleet and Pan 1995, 1997a, 61 1997b; Rakovan and Reeder 1996; Fleet et al. 2000). This is because the REE content in Ca-62 apatite plays a role in petrological and genetic interpretations of mineral deposit formation and

petrogenesis (Papike et al. 1984; Sha and Chappell 1999; Belousova et al. 2002; Harlov 2015;
Bouzari et al. 2016; Jonsson et al. 2016; O'Sullivan et al. 2018; Andersson at al. 2019; Zhang
et al. 2021). Nevertheless, the presence of REE in Pb-apatite is of interest because of its
potential use in industrial processes.

67 Laboratory experiments for the synthesis of Pb-apatite analogs containing REE were described by Newby (1981) in an unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, which demonstrated 68 differences in the amount of incorporated REE under different pH conditions. Owing to the 69 70 similarity in their structures (White et al. 2005), the substitution mechanisms of REE in Ca- and 71 Pb-apatites are likely to exhibit similarities. However, given the larger elemental cell size and 72 the different preference of Pb over Ca in occupying the cationic position, as well as the presence of a free electron pair on the Pb<sup>2+</sup> ion (Kim et al. 2000; Baikie et al. 2014), the mechanism and 73 74 magnitude of substitution may be different.

Exchange of REE<sup>3+</sup> for Ca<sup>2+</sup> requires a coupled substitution. The two most common
mechanisms of REE substitution in Ca, P-bearing apatite supergroup members are (Rønsbo
1989; Pan and Fleet 2002):

78 
$$\operatorname{REE}^{3+} + \operatorname{Me}^{+} \Leftrightarrow 2\operatorname{Ca}^{2+},$$
 (1)

79 
$$REE^{3+} + ZO_4^{4-} \Leftrightarrow Ca^{2+} + PO_4^{3-}$$
(2)

80 In natural Ca-apatites  $Me^+$  is most frequently Na and  $ZO_4^{4-}$  is most often SiO4.

In this study, pyromorphite Pb<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Cl was chosen as the model Pb-apatite, and La was
chosen as the model REE, as its chemical and physical properties well represent the entire group
of light rare earth metals. Moreover, it is easily available in high purity reagents for synthesis
(La(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>3</sub>·6H<sub>2</sub>O). Na<sup>+</sup> and K<sup>+</sup> were used as model charge compensating ions. It was
hypothesized that the substitution occurs through the following reactions:

86 
$$La^{3+} + Na^+ \Leftrightarrow 2Pb^{2+}$$
 (3)

87 
$$La^{3+} + K^+ \Leftrightarrow 2Pb^{2+}$$
 (4)

88 The research methodology involved the synthesis of pyromorphite crystals from aqueous 89 solutions, which is most relevant to natural environmental conditions and to natural REE-90 enriched pyromorphite found in the oxidation zones of deposits. Therefore, in the present study, 91 we report a single-crystal X-ray diffraction study of four synthetic Pb<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Cl pyromorphite 92 analogs containing La and Na or La and K substitutions and control samples synthesized from 93 aqueous solutions under the same conditions in the absence of La. The synthesized samples 94 were characterized using scanning electron microscopy (SEM), microprobe analysis, Raman 95 spectroscopy and single-crystal X-ray diffraction. We aimed to provide an explanation of the 96 site occupancy and substitution mechanism, to determine the effect of Na<sup>+</sup> and K<sup>+</sup> substitution 97 on the magnitude of  $La^{3+}$  substitution, and to capture similarities and differences with the better 98 studied Ca-apatite. Our findings contribute to a better understanding of light REE substitution 99 in Pb-apatite, which is particularly important because REE are considered as critical metals and 100 REE-rich Pb-apatite may prove to be useful in future industrial applications.

- 101
- 102

### 2. Experimental procedure

103 Four pyromorphite analogs were synthesized via precipitation from aqueous solution at room 104 temperature, namely two La-doped samples: La<sub>x</sub>Na<sub>x</sub>Pb<sub>5-2x</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Cl (La-Na-Pym), La<sub>x</sub>K<sub>x</sub>Pb<sub>5-</sub> 105 2x(PO4)3Cl (La-K-Pym), and two control samples without La: Na2xPb5-x(PO4)3Cl (Na-Pym) and 106 K<sub>2x</sub>Pb<sub>5-x</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Cl (K-Pym). The starting mixtures of Pb(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>2</sub> with La(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>3</sub>·6H<sub>2</sub>O in a molar 107 proportion of 4:1 (or without La(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>3</sub>·6H<sub>2</sub>O for control samples) were dissolved in double-108 distilled water and added slowly (10 mL/h) by dripping through a glass funnel into the still 109 solution column of dissolved PO4<sup>3-</sup> and Cl<sup>-</sup> salts: NaH<sub>2</sub>PO4·6H<sub>2</sub>O and NaCl for La-Na-Pym and 110 Na-Pym; K<sub>2</sub>HPO<sub>4</sub> and KCl for La-K-Pym and K-Pym. In all the experiments, the largest 111 crystals were needle-shaped (up to 1 mm long) and precipitated at the end of the funnel. These 112 crystals were collected using tweezers, washed with double-distilled water, and examined via 113 SEM in low vacuum for the uncoated samples using an FEI Quanta 200 FEG SEM (Hillsboro,

OR, USA) equipped with secondary-electron and back-scattered-electron detectors. Energy dispersive spectrometry (EDS, FEI Quanta, Lausanne, Switzerland) was employed to evaluate
 possible variations in chemical composition.

117 Quantitative chemical analyses were performed via electron microprobe (EMP) analysis 118 using a JEOL SuperProbe JXA-8230 located at the Laboratory of Critical Elements at the 119 Faculty of Geology, Geophysics and Environmental Protection, AGH UST Krakow. The EMP 120 operated at an accelerating voltage of 15 kV, a probe current of 15 nA, a peak count time of 20 121 s, and background count time of 10 s, with a beam diameter of  $1-5 \mu m$ , depending on individual 122 crystal sizes. Standards (analytical lines and Wavelength Dispersive Spectrometry (WDS) 123 diffracting crystals) included fluorite for F (K $\alpha$ , LDE1), fluorapatite for P (K $\alpha$ , PET), albite for 124 Na (Ka, TAP) and Si (Ka, TAP), sanidine for K (Ka, PET), crocoite for Pb (Ma, PET) tugtupite 125 for Cl (K $\alpha$ , PET), and synthetic LaPO<sub>4</sub> phosphate for La (L $\alpha$ , LiF) (Jarosewich and Boatner 126 1991). Durango apatite was used as secondary reference material for monitoring the Cl analysis. 127 Fluorapatite has not been used as F reference material because of time-dependent X-ray effects 128 on orientation of fluorapatite. During the EMP measurement of the Na Ka, K Ka and Cl Ka 129 lines of all synthetic Pb-apatite crystals, no time-dependent intensity loss effects were recorded. 130 For sample preparation, a dry precipitate was mixed with epoxy resin, placed in a standard ring, 131 and polished.

A Thermo Scientific DXR Raman confocal microscope was used to collect Raman spectra of samples, which were excited with a green laser (532 nm, with a power maintained at 10 mW and a slit aperture of 50  $\mu$ m) in the range of 100–3580 cm<sup>-1</sup>. Deconvolution of spectra was done using OMNIC for Dispersive Raman software (Thermo Fisher Scientific) in the ranges of 350– 600 and 800–1200 cm<sup>-1</sup> using the Gaussian/Lorentzian function, high sensitivity factor, and a constant baseline.

138	Single crystal X-ray diffraction measurements were performed on a Bruker APEXII Quazar
139	CCD X-ray diffractometer with Mo K $\alpha$ , $\lambda = 0.71073$ Å, for two control samples (Na-Pym and
140	K-Pym). A Rigaku XtaLAB Synergy-S diffractometer equipped with a full 4-circle kappa
141	goniometer, a Hypix6000E detector (hybrid), and Mo K $\alpha$ X-ray radiation from a microfocus
142	sealed tube was used for La-doped samples (La-Na-Pym and La-K-Pym). One sample (La-K-
143	Pym) was analyzed at both temperatures, 273(2) K and 180(2) K, showing that final parameters
144	did not change significantly due to cooling (Appendix A). The results of the measurements at
145	these two temperatures are the same within the experimental error. The reason for the absence
146	of thermal expansion in this temperature range is unknown. It is possible, though, that in a larger
147	range of temperatures such tendency would be observed. According to previous studies for Pb-
148	apatite, pure pyromorphite shows thermal expansion in the temperature range $298K - 1373K$
149	(Hovis et al. 2015; Knyazev et al. 2015; Gu et al. 2020). However, there is no similar data for
150	REE-substituted pyromorphite. A data collection strategy was calculated with the CrysAlis <sup>Pro</sup>
151	software. The crystal structures were refined using the Bruker SHELXTL v. 6.14 package of
152	programs (Sheldrick 2015).
153 154 155 156	<ul><li>3. Results and discussion</li><li>3.1. Morphology of the crystals</li></ul>
157	I a denote complex violeted along stad used to like servetals with how sound success sections in the
158	La-doped samples yielded elongated needle-like crystals with hexagonal cross-sections in the
159	size range of 100–500 $\mu$ m (Figure 1a and 1b), whereas those containing no La yielded two
160	generations of crystals: needle-like crystals elongated parallel to the [001] of 200 $\mu m$ and
161	hexagonal rods of less than 10 $\mu m$ (Figure 1c and 1d). EDS and microprobe analyses confirmed
162	the intended chemical compositions for both types of crystals habit.

- 164 **3.2. Chemistry**
- 165

166 Chemical compositions of each phase were analyzed using 13–21 individual spots. For each 167 sample, two results with a total furthest from 100% were discarded. Therefore, the calculation 168 of the chemical formulas was based on the average of the 11–18 superior spot analyses for each 169 sample. The microprobe analysis results (Table 1) showed that the average La<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> 170 concentrations were 1.19 wt.% ( $\sigma = 0.68$ ) and 0.63 wt.% ( $\sigma = 0.28$ ) for La-Na-Pym and La-K-171 Pym, respectively. The relatively high standard deviations may be attributed to the 172 heterogeneity among different crystals.

173

174 Owing to the difficulties in the preparation of small crystals, there were several problems 175 in the quantitative analysis of chemical composition, mainly in the determination of the Cl 176 content in small or porous crystals (due to the crystal habit). The epoxy infiltrated porosity, 177 causing an artificial Cl content within the samples. Crystal structure refinement, as discussed 178 below, confirmed no vacancies at the column anion X-site. Furthermore, no other monovalent 179 anions were available in the system, and Raman spectroscopy did not reveal the presence of 180 OH in the samples (Figure 2). This indicates that the X-site is fully occupied by the Cl<sup>-</sup>. 181 Therefore, we interpret EMP data that yield Cl concentrations different from 1 apfu suspect.

Quantitative analysis of Na<sub>2</sub>O and K<sub>2</sub>O in Pb-rich apatite (the average amount of PbO in all samples is 80.2 wt.%) was also challenging due to the low contents of these in the pyromorphites and the molar mass differences between the Pb and Na or K ions. The inconsistency of Na and K contents between WDS and structure refinement likely results from the detection limit of the electron microprobe analysis under the conditions applied. Therefore, all average empirical formulas based on electron microprobe analysis exhibit slight cation deficiency in charge balance.

- 189
- **3.3. Purity confirmation by Raman spectroscopy**
- 191

The aim of this study was the structural analysis of La-doped pyromorphite free from impurities such as carbonate or hydroxyl ions. Therefore, to verify the absence of potential impurities of  $CO_3^{2-}$  or OH<sup>-</sup>, Raman spectroscopy was the method of choice. The Raman spectra of all phases in the range of 100–3600 cm<sup>-1</sup> are shown in Figure 2 and described vibrational modes in the range of 100–1200 cm<sup>-1</sup> are shown in Figure 3.

197 The carbonate ion can be incorporated into an apatite structure in three positions: as a substitution for the anion in the hexagonal channel (two type-A substitutions) and for  $PO_4^{3-}$ 198 199 tetrahedron (type-B substitution) (Fleet et al. 2004). The quantity of carbonate ions in the apatite 200 structure depends mainly on the chemical composition and the conditions of synthesis 201 (Vignoles et al. 1988). The maximum content of carbonates in synthetic lead apatite precipitated 202 from an aqueous solution does not exceed 2.25 wt% (Kwaśniak-Kominek et al. 2017). The carbonate bands are found in the Raman spectra of pyromorphite at around 1116 cm<sup>-1</sup> (Botto et 203 204 al. 1997). In carbonated hydroxylpyromorphite, Pb<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>(OH), this band is located at 1102 cm<sup>-1</sup> (Kwaśniak-Kominek et al. 2017) and is attributed to  $v_1 \text{ CO}_3^{2-}$ . No such bands or other 205 206 Raman bands attributable to carbonate were observed. This indicates the absence of carbonate 207 in the structures of the synthetic pyromorphites. In addition, Raman scattering was not observed 208 above 1200 cm<sup>-1</sup> (Figure 2), indicating the absence of OH<sup>-</sup> groups.

In the pyromorphite spectra, the most intense bands at 919–947 cm<sup>-1</sup> along with the bands 209 210 in the 974–1048 cm<sup>-1</sup> region are attributed to the stretching vibrations of the P–O bond ( $v_1$  and 211 v<sub>3</sub>) (Levitt and Condrate 1970; Bartholomäi and Klee 1978; Botto et al. 1997; Frost and Palmer 212 2007; Bajda et al. 2011). A very weak band was apparent in all deconvoluted spectra at 1091 213 or 1092 cm<sup>-1</sup>, which may simply be a part of the background or the result of degeneration of the Pb-apatite structure (Kwaśniak-Kominek et al. 2017). The bands in the 541–586 cm<sup>-1</sup> region 214 215 correspond to the v4 scissor vibrations of the O–P–O angle and may be resolved into three bands 216 for control pyromorphites, and into four bands for La-doped pyromorphites. Splitting was also

217	observed for the $v_2$ scissor vibrations of the O–P–O angle in the 392–439 cm <sup>-1</sup> region. These,
218	however, were not systematic, as the bands for control samples were split into three bands and
219	those for La-doped pyromorphites into two (La-Na-Pym) or four (La-K-Pym). Such splitting is
220	attributed to the reduction of the symmetry of the ideal $(PO_4)^{3-}$ tetrahedron (Adler 1964). A
221	broad profile from 100 to 250 cm <sup>-1</sup> was attributed to lattice vibrations. However, the presence
222	or absence of the strongest band at 107 cm <sup>-1</sup> is strongly related to the crystal orientation.
223	Therefore, the lattice vibrations are of little use for phase identification. All band positions
224	resolved in the spectra collected for pyromorphite crystals are consistent with the previously
225	described Raman spectra for pyromorphite (Levitt and Condrate 1970; Bartholomäi and Klee
226	1978; Botto et al. 1997; Frost and Palmer 2007; Bajda et al. 2011). Owing to the small amount
227	of La substituting for Pb, no significant shifts were observed in the positions of the bands for
228	doped samples. However, the intensities of the different bands varied. This is influenced by the
229	crystal orientation relative to the incident beam (Frost and Palmer 2007).
230 231 232 233	3.4. Structure 3.4.1. Refinement of the structure
234	
235	The crystallographic characteristics and conditions for data collection are shown in Table 2.
236	The crystallographic information files can be found in the Supplementary Materials (Appendix
237	C). Crystal structures were solved and refined in space group $P6_3/m$ . No reflections
238	characteristic of a monoclinic superstructure were noted (Mackie et al. 1972; Elliott et al. 1973;
239	Bauer and Klee 1993). All structures were refined to $R1 = 0.0140 - 0.0225$ . The positional
240	parameters, equivalent isotropic displacement parameters and site occupancies can be found in
241	Appendix D.
242 243	3.4.2. Site occupancy
244	

In all the refined structures, the Pb2, P, and Cl sites were fully occupied by a single constituent. 245 246 However, the scattering from the Pb1 site indicated substitution of lighter elements. Based on 247 this, the La, K, and Na ions were assigned exclusively to the Pb1 site. The occupancies were 248 refined with the constraints of Pb1 + La + X = 1 (X = Na or K) for La-doped samples, and Pb1 249 + X = 1 for control samples. The following chemical formulas were derived from the 250 refinements: Pb4.62(1)La0.19(1)Na0.19(1)(PO4)3Cl (La-Na-Pym), Pb4.76(1)La0.12(1)K0.12(2)(PO4)3Cl 251 (La-K-Pym), Pb4.90(3)Na0.10(4)(PO4)3Cl (Na-Pym), and Pb4.88(3)K0.12(4)(PO4)3Cl (K-Pym). Small 252 deficiencies in positive charge are probably easily compensated by vacancies among anionic 253 positions, which is below the detection limit of the structural and microprobe analysis.

254 Various structural studies of La-doped apatites have been reported (Cockbain and Smith 255 1967; Mayer et al. 1980; Mayer and Swissa 1985; Hughes et al. 1991; Fleet at al. 2000). The 256 site preference for La is strongly related to the chemical composition of apatite. In an X-ray 257 study of a synthetic lanthanum calcium silicate apatite Ca4La6(SiO4)6(OH)2 (space group 258  $P6_3/m$ , Cockbain and Smith (1967) concluded that the La atoms are randomly distributed 259 between the two Ca sites. Hughes et al. (1991) described the observed site preference of light 260 REE for the Ca2 site based on the single-crystal analysis of four natural apatites, 261 Ca<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>(F,OH), with REE substitutions (space group  $P6_3/m$ ). In contrast, the Ca1 site is 262 favored to host La in the structure of chlorapatite, Ca<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Cl (Fleet et al. 2000). In this case, 263 the substitution of Cl for (F, OH) results in the distortion and large increase in size of the 264 Ca2O<sub>6</sub>X polyhedron, which is consistent with this unusual Ca-apatite site preference. However, 265 these crystals of REE-doped chlorapatite were monoclinic with the space group  $P2_1/b$ . 266 Numerous studies on REE-doped Ca-apatite have shown that the volatile anion components (F, 267 OH, Cl) are a significant factor in the selectivity of apatite for REE. This is due to their marked 268 influence on the stereochemical environment and effective size of the Ca2 site (Fleet and Pan 1997b). 269

270 The first attempts to refine the site preference of light REE in Pb-bearing apatite were made 271 by Mayer et al. (1980) and Mayer and Swissa (1985). Their conclusions, however, were based 272 only on the lattice parameter changes, mainly the c/a ratios, calculated from X-ray powder data. 273 They described some structural differences in F- and Cl- end members that potentially led to 274 different site preference for La, but in all cases La preference for Pb1 was observed. Partial 275 ordering was noted, i.e., the Pb ions mainly occupied the 6h position (Pb2 site), while the 276 smaller rare earth cations occupied in the 4f column positions (Pb1 site). These findings are 277 consistent with our refinements. Pb has a strong preference for the Me(2) (6h) site in the apatite structure because it better accommodates the stereoactive  $6s^2$  electron lone pair on the Pb<sup>2+</sup> 278 cation. Moreover, the avoidance of the Me2 site by REE in Cl-bearing apatite is caused by the 279 280 off-centering of Pb at the Me2 site, helped by the Cl at the channel. Therefore, the Me1 (4f) site 281 is more susceptible to substitution of other ions (Rouse et al. 1984). Similar preferences were 282 found in Pb-substituted hydroxylapatite, Ca<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>(OH), phosphohedyphane, Ca<sub>2</sub>Pb<sub>3</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Cl, 283 and fluorphosphohedyphane, Ca<sub>2</sub>Pb<sub>3</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>F (Bigi et al. 1991; Kampf et al. 2006; Kampf and Housley 2011), where  $Pb^{2+}$  always fills the Me2 site first. 284

Bond valence calculations for the substitution of La and Na (or K) for Pb are either inconclusive or not fully consistent with the structural findings (Table 3). Based on the bond valence-sum rule,  $La^{3+}$  should prefer the Pb2 site. However, in the case of apatite, ambiguity may occur in the interpretation of bond valence: calculations of bond valence values are based on the relationship between bond distance and bond strength and include a component attributed to variation in the size of structural positions that can cause ambiguity in interpretation (Fleet and Pan 1995).

292

### **3.4.3.** Structure variation

296 Table 4 shows the variations in selected bond lengths, bond angles, polyhedral volumes and 297 twist angles for all analyzed samples. The volume of each Pb polyhedron was calculated using 298 the software program VOLCAL (Hazen and Finger 1982). Minor substitution of Na and K ions 299 in the control samples slightly affected the mean Pb1–O distances, resulting in the increase in 300 the Pb1 polyhedral volume from 38.688 Å<sup>3</sup> in Na-Pym to 38.729 Å<sup>3</sup> in K-Pym. This is 301 consistent with the smaller ionic radius of Na than that of K, which for ninefold coordination 302 are 1.24 and 1.55 Å, respectively (values taken from Shannon 1976). The mean Pb1-O 303 distances for La-doped samples increased by 0.005 Å for La-K-Pym compared to those of La-304 Na-Pym, reflecting the polyhedral volume changes. The most sensitive bond for substitution 305 was the Pb1–O1 bond, which varied from 2.572(3) Å (La-Na-Pym) to 2.581(4) Å (La-K-Pym). The Pb1 polyhedral volume for La-Na-Pym decreased by 0.173 Å<sup>3</sup> compared to the control 306 307 sample, whereas the corresponding volume in La-K-Pym increased in comparison to the control 308 sample by 0.048 Å<sup>3</sup>. This variation may be caused by the differences in ionic radii. In the case 309 of Na and La substitutions for Pb, both substituting ions are smaller than Pb (ionic radii are:  $1.216 \text{ Å} (\text{La}^{3+}) < 1.24 \text{ Å} (\text{Na}^+) < 1.35 \text{ Å} (\text{Pb}^{2+}))$ , whereas in the case of K and La substitutions 310 for Pb, the K ion is larger than Pb and the La ion is smaller  $(1.216 \text{ Å} (\text{La}^{3+}) < 1.35 \text{ Å} (\text{Pb}^{2+}) < 1.35$ 311 312 1.55 Å (K<sup>+</sup>)). However, the average ionic radii of La and K is very close to that of Pb, which 313 may be the reason for the small volume change in this polyhedron compared to the control 314 sample (only by 0.048 Å<sup>3</sup>). Variations in individual and mean interatomic distances in Pb1 315 polyhedron reflect the cumulative effect of both the amount of substitution and ionic radii of 316 substituting ions.

Changes in the Pb1 polyhedron slightly affected the mean Pb2–O distances. The largest difference was visible for the weakest bond, Pb2–O1, which was shorter in both the La-doped pyromorphites compared to the control samples. A similar trend was observed for the Pb2 polyhedral volume. Substitution in Pb1 did not affect the PO4 tetrahedron, with volumes 321 differing by only 0.007 Å<sup>3</sup> which is within uncertainties. Moreover, all O–P–O angles within

322 each PO<sub>4</sub> tetrahedron were identical in all refined structures.

323 Changes in distances also affected the unit cell parameters and, consequently, their volumes 324 (Table 2). The unit cell parameter c appears to be more affected by the substitution and 325 decreased in La-doped samples compared to the control samples. In La-Na-Pym, the unit cell 326 parameter a also decreased compared to the control sample. However, in La-K-Pym, a 327 increased compared to K-Pym. This affected the volumes of the unit cell, and within the samples the smallest unit cell volume, 630.680 Å<sup>3</sup>, was observed for La-Na-Pym. This is due 328 to the substitution of two smaller ions (Na<sup>+</sup> and La<sup>3+</sup>) for Pb<sup>2+</sup>. In the La-K-Pym sample, the La 329 330 content is lower than in La-Na-Pym, and the K ion is larger than Na, which resulted in an overall 331 increase in the unit cell volume.

332

333

#### **4. Implications**

The restricted chemistry of synthetic analogs of La-doped pyromorphite allowed us to 335 336 determine the effect of La substitution on the structure. From our single-crystal X-ray 337 diffraction study, the following implications emerged. The mechanisms controlling La 338 substitution in Pb-apatite are somewhat different from those in Ca-apatite. In both types of apatite, owing to the charge difference, heterovalent substitution of La<sup>3+</sup> for Me<sup>2+</sup> requires 339 340 counter ions, which, in this case, were K<sup>+</sup> and Na<sup>+</sup>. However, in contrast to natural Ca-apatite, 341 in Pb-apatite La occupies the Me1 site and not the Me2 site. This is at least the case in 342 pyromorphites in which the counter ion is K or Na. It is possible that greater size of Ca2 in Cachlorapatite diminishes the selectivity of this position for REE relative to that of Ca1 (Fleet et 343 344 al. 2000). However, considering the present stage of knowledge, it is not possible to accurately 345 compare the results obtained for pyromorphite with its calcium chlorapatite counterpart 346 Ca<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Cl due to the difficulty in obtaining such apatite by simple synthesis from aqueous

347 solutions. Therefore, it is difficult to clearly assess how much of this difference in substitution 348 is due to the crystallization process and how much is due to a slight difference in structural properties, the influence of the lone-electron pair in  $Pb^{2+}$  ions, or the preference of Pb to occupy 349 350 the Me2 site. It is not yet clear as to how the charges are balanced in REE substitutions in natural 351 pyromorphite. Nevertheless, the magnitude of La substitution in the synthetic pyromorphites 352 described here was larger than that reported in natural ones (see for example Markl et al. 2014). 353 This substitution model appears to be the model for all REE in Pb-apatite (or at least for all 354 LREE).

355 Our preliminary tests with REE heavier than La indicate that the fractionation of REE 356 during crystallization of pyromorphite from aqueous solutions at ambient temperatures is nearly 357 negligible. It is necessary to determine the structure of pyromorphite containing heavy REE 358 (e.g., Yb, Lu) formed under identical conditions to determine the possible differences and 359 similarities in the substitution mechanisms. However, only the determination of the structures 360 of pyromorphite containing successively (but separately) other REE, with different charge 361 compensation mechanisms, will enable the determination of possible systematic similarities 362 and discrepancies in the structures and substitution mechanisms depending on the ionic size 363 and mass of the REE.

#### 364 **Declaration of Competing Interest**

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

### 367 Acknowledgements

368 This research was partly funded by the Polish NCN grant no. 2019/35/B/ ST10/03379 and partly

369 by program "Excellence initiative – research university" for the AGH University of Science

- and Technology. Fernando Camara and an anonymous reviewer provided thoughtful reviews
- that are very gratefully acknowledged, as they improved the present paper.

#### 372 Supplementary data

- 373 Appendix A: A1 Atomic coordinates, equivalent isotropic displacement parameters (Å2), and
- occupancies for the sample La-K-Pym analyzed at 273(2) K; A2 Experimental details and
- 375 crystallographic characteristics of La-K-Pym analyzed at two different temperatures, 180(2) K
- and 273(2) K; A3 Comparison of selected bond lengths (Å), bond angles (°) and twist angles
- 377 (°) for La-K-Pym analyzed at two different temperatures, 180(2) K and 273(2) K.
- 378 Appendix B Raw wavelength dispersive analyses for all analyzed samples
- 379 Appendix C Crystallographic Information File
- 380 Appendix D Atomic coordinates, equivalent isotropic displacement parameters ( $Å^2$ ), and occupancies
- 381 for all analyzed samples

#### 382 **References**

- 383 Adler, H. H. (1964) Infrared spectra of phosphate minerals: symmetry and substitutional
- 384 effects in the pyromorphite series. American Mineralogist: Journal of Earth and Planetary
- 385 Materials, 49, 1002-1015.
- 386
- Andersson, S. S., Wagner, T., Jonsson, E., Fusswinkel, T., and Whitehouse, M.J. (2019)
- 388 Apatite as a tracer of the source, chemistry and evolution of ore-forming fluids: The case of
- 389 the Olserum-Djupedal REE-phosphate mineralisation, SE Sweden. Geochimica et
- 390 Cosmochimica Acta, 255, 163-187.
- 391

- 392 Baikie, T., Schreyer, M., Wei, F., Herrin, J.S., Ferraris, C., Brink, F., Topolska, J., Piltz, R.O.,
- 393 Price, J., and White, T.J. (2014) The influence of stereochemically active lone-pair electrons
- on crystal symmetry and twist angles in lead apatite-2H type structures. Mineralogical
- 395 Magazine, 78, 325-345.
- 396
- 397 Bajda, T., Mozgawa, W., Manecki, M., and Flis, J. (2011) Vibrational spectroscopic study of
- 398 mimetite–pyromorphite solid solutions. Polyhedron, 30, 2479-2485.
- 399
- 400 Bartholomäi, G. and W. E. Klee. (1978) The vibrational spectra of pyromorphite, vanadinite
- 401 and mimetite. Spectrochimica Acta Part A: Molecular Spectroscopy, 34, 831-843.
- 402
- 403 Bauer, M. and Klee, W.E. (1993) The monoclinic-hexagonal phase transition in chlorapatite.
- European Journal of Mineralogy, 5, 307–316.
- 405
- 406 Belousova, E.A., Griffin, W.L., O'Reilly, S.Y., and Fisher, N.I. (2002) Apatite as an indicator
- 407 mineral for mineral exploration: trace-element compositions and their relationship to host
- 408 rock type. Journal of Geochemical Exploration, 76, 45-69.
- 409
- 410 Bigi, A., Gandolfi, M., Gazzano, M., Ripamonti, A., Roveri, N., and Thomas, S.A. (1991)
- 411 Structural modifications of hydroxyapatite induced by lead substitution for calcium. Journal
- 412 of the Chemical Society, Dalton Transactions, 11, 2883-2886.
- 413
- 414 Borisov, S.V. and Klevcova, R.F. (1963) The crystal structure of RE-Sr apatite. Zhurnal
- 415 Strukturnoi Khimii, 4, 629-631
- 416

- 417 Botto, I.L., Barone, V.L., Castiglioni, J.L., and Schalamuk, I.B. (1997) Characterization of a
- 418 natural substituted pyromorphite. Journal of materials science, 32, 6549-6553.
- 419
- 420 Bouzari, F., Hart, C.J., Bissig, T., and Barker, S. (2016) Hydrothermal alteration revealed by
- 421 apatite luminescence and chemistry: A potential indicator mineral for exploring covered
- 422 porphyry copper deposits. Economic Geology, 111, 1397-1410.
- 423
- 424 Brese, N. E. and O'Keeffe, M. (1991) Bond-valence parameters for solids. Acta
- 425 Crystallographica Section B: Structural Science, 47, 192-197.
- 426
- 427 Brown, I.D. and Altermatt, D. (1985) Bond-valence parameters obtained from a systematic
- 428 analysis of the Inorganic Crystal Structure Database. Acta Crystallographica Section B:
- 429 Structural Science, 41, 244-247.
- 430
- 431 Cockbain, A.G. and Smith, G.V. (1967) Alkaline-rare-earth silicate and germanate apatites.
- 432 Mineralogical Magazine, 36, 411-421.
- 433
- 434 Dai, Y. and Hughes, J.M. (1989) Crystal structure refinements of vanadinite and
- 435 pyromorphite. The Canadian Mineralogist, 27, 189-192.
- 436
- 437 Elliott, J.C., Mackie, P.E., and Young, R.A. (1973) Monoclinic hydroxyapatite. Science,
- 438 180, 1055–1057.Fleet, M.E. and Pan, Y. (1995) Site preference of rare earth elements in
- 439 fluorapatite. American Mineralogist, 80, 329-335.
- 440
- 441 Fleet, M.E. and Pan, Y. (1997a) Site preference of rare earth elements in fluorapatite: Binary

442 (LREE+HREE)-substituted crystals. American Mineralogist, 82, 870–877.

443

- 444 Fleet, M.E. and Pan, Y. (1997b) Rare earth elements in apatite: Uptake from H<sub>2</sub>O-bearing
- 445 phosphate fluoride melts and the role of volatile components. Geochimica et Cosmochimica
- 446 Acta, 61, 4745–4760.

- 448 Fleet, M.E., Liu, X. and Pan, Y. (2000) Rare-earth elements in chlorapatite [Ca10(PO4)6Cl2]:
- 449 Uptake, site preference, and degradation of monoclinic structure. American Mineralogist, 85,
- 450 1437-1446.
- 451
- 452 Fleet, M. E., Liu, X., and King, P. L. (2004) Accommodation of the carbonate ion in apatite:
- An FTIR and X-ray structure study of crystals synthesized at 2–4 GPa. American
  Mineralogist, 89, 1422-1432.
- 455
- 456 Frost, R.L. and Palmer, S.J. (2007) A Raman spectroscopic study of the phosphate mineral
- 457 pyromorphite Pb<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Cl. Polyhedron 26, 4533-4541.
- 458
- Gagné, O. C. and Hawthorne, F. C. (2015) Comprehensive derivation of bond-valence
  parameters for ion pairs involving oxygen. Acta Crystallographica Section B: Structural
  Science, Crystal Engineering and Materials, 71, 562-578.
- 462
- Gu, T., Qin, S. and Wu, X. (2020) Thermal Behavior of Pyromorphite (Pb10(PO4)6Cl2): In Situ
- High Temperature Powder X-ray Diffraction Study. Crystals, 10, 1070.
- 465
- 466 Harlov, D.E. (2015) Apatite: A fingerprint for metasomatic processes. Elements, 11, 171-176.

468	Hazen, R.M. and Finger, L.W. (1982) Comparative crystal chemistry: Temperature, pressure,
469	composition, and the variation of crystal structure. Wiley, New York.
470	
471	Hovis, G., Abraham, T., Hudacek, W., Wildermuth, S., Scott, B., Altomare, C., Medford, A.,
472	Conlon, M., Morris, M., Leaman, A., Almer, C., Tomaino, G. and Harlov, D. (2015) Thermal
473	expansion of F-Cl apatite crystalline solutions. American Mineralogist, 100, 1040-1046.
474	
475	Hu, SZ. (2007) A new approach to bond valence parameters for Pb (II)-halide bonds. Acta
476	Physico-Chimica sinica, 23, 786-789.
477	
478	Hughes, J. M., Cameron, M., and Mariano, A. N. (1991) Rare-earth-element ordering and
479	structural variations in natural rare-earth-bearing apatites. American Mineralogist, 76, 1165-
480	1173.
481	
482	Jarosewich, E. and Boatner, L. A. (1991) Rare-earth element reference samples for electron
483	microprobe analysis. Geostandards Newsletter, 15, 397-399.
484	
485	Jonsson, E., Harlov, D. E., Majka, J., Högdahl, K., and Persson-Nilsson, K. (2016)
486	Fluorapatite-monazite-allanite relations in the Grängesberg apatite-iron oxide ore district,
487	Bergslagen, Sweden. American Mineralogist, 101, 1769-1782.
488	
489	Kampf, A.R., Steele, I.M., and Jenkins, R.A. (2006) Phosphohedyphane, Ca <sub>2</sub> Pb <sub>3</sub> (PO <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>3</sub> Cl, the
490	phosphate analog of hedyphane: Description and crystal structure. American Mineralogist, 91,
491	1909-1917.

493	Kampf, A. R. and Housley, R. M. (2011) Fluorphosphohedyphane, Ca <sub>2</sub> Pb <sub>3</sub> (PO <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>3</sub> F, the first
494	apatite supergroup mineral with essential Pb and F. American Mineralogist, 96, 423-429.
495	
496	Kim, J.Y., Fenton, R.R., Hunter, B.A., and Kennedy, B.J. (2000) Powder diffraction studies
497	of synthetic calcium and lead apatites. Australian Journal of Chemistry, 53, 679-686.
498	
499	Knyazev, A. V., Bulanov, E. N. and Korokin, V. Z. (2015) Thermal expansion of solid
500	solutions in apatite binary systems. Materials Research Bulletin, 61, 47-53.
501	
502	Kwaśniak-Kominek, M., Manecki, M., Matusik, J., and Lempart, M. (2017) Carbonate
503	substitution in lead hydroxyapatite Pb5(PO4)3OH. Journal of Molecular Structure, 1147, 594-
504	602.
505	
506	Ma, Q. Y., Traina, S. J., Logan, T. J., and Ryan, J. A. (1993) In situ lead immobilization by
507	apatite. Environmental Science & Technology, 27, 1803-1810.
508	
509	Ma, Q.Y., Logan, T.J., and Traina, S.J. (1995) Lead immobilization from aqueous solutions
510	and contaminated soils using phosphate rocks. Environmental Science & Technology, 29,
511	1118-1126.
512	
513	Mackie, P.E., Elliott, J.C., and Young, R.A. (1972) Monoclinic structure of synthetic
514	Ca5(PO4)3Cl, chlorapatite. Acta Crystallographica, B 28, 1840–1848.
515	

- 516 Mackie, P.E. and Young, R.A. (1973) Location of Nd dopant in fluorapatite, Ca<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>F: Nd.
- 517 Journal of Applied Crystallography, 6, 26-31.
- 518
- 519 Manecki, M. (2019) Lead in Water and Soil: Speciation, Toxicity, and Treatment
- 520 Technologies. In Encyclopedia of Water: Science, Technology, and Society, edited by
- 521 P.A.Maurice, Willey and Sons.

522

- 523 Manecki, M., Maurice, P. A., Traina, S.J. (2000) Kinetics of aqueous Pb reaction with
- 524 apatites. Soil Science, 165, 920-933.

525

- 526 Manecki, M., Kwaśniak-Kominek, M., Majka, J.M., Rakovan, J. (2020) Model of interface-
- 527 coupled dissolution-precipitation mechanism of pseudomorphic replacement reaction in

528 aqueous solutions based on the system of cerussite PbCO<sub>3</sub>–pyromorphite

529 Pb5(PO4)<sub>3</sub>Cl. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 289, 1-13.

- 531 Markl, G., Marks, M. A., Holzäpfel, J., and Wenzel, T. (2014) Major, minor, and trace
- element composition of pyromorphite-group minerals as recorder of supergene weathering
- 533 processes from the Schwarzwald mining district, SW Germany. American Mineralogist, 99,
- 534 1133-1146.
- 535
- 536 Mayer, I. and Swissa, S. (1985) Lead and strontium phosphate apatites substituted by rare
- earth and silver ions. Journal of the Less Common Metals, 110, 411-414.
- 538
- 539 Mayer, I., Semadja, A., and Weiss, V. (1980) Lead phosphate apatites substituted by rare
- earth, sodium, and potassium ions. Journal of Solid State Chemistry, 34, 223-229.

541

542	Newby, H.P. (1981) Rare-earth elements in pyromorphite-group minerals. Ph.D. dissertation,
543	University of London Reactor Centre, Department of Mechanical Engineering, Imperial
544	College of Science and Technology.
545	
546	Nriagu, J.O. (1974) Lead orthophosphates - IV Formation and stability in the environment.
547	Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 38, 887–898.
548	
549	Laperche, V., Logan, T.J., Gaddam, P., and Traina, S.J. (1997) Effect of apatite amendments
550	on plant uptake of lead from contaminated soil. Environmental Science & Technology, 31,
551	2745-2753.
552	
553	Levitt, S.R. and Condrate Sr., R.A. (1970) The vibrational spectra of lead apatites. American
554	Mineralogist: Journal of Earth and Planetary Materials 55, 1562-1575.
555	
556	Okudera, H. (2013) Relationships among channel topology and atomic displacements in the
557	structures of Pb5(BO4)3Cl with B= P (pyromorphite), V (vanadinite), and As
558	(mimetite). American Mineralogist, 98, 1573-1579.
559	
560	O'Sullivan, G.J., Chew, D.M., Morton, A.C., Mark, C., and Henrichs, I. A. (2018) An
561	integrated apatite geochronology and geochemistry tool for sedimentary provenance
562	analysis. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 19, 1309-1326.
563	
564	Pan, Y., and Fleet, M.E. (2002) Compositions of the apatite-group minerals: substitution
565	mechanisms and controlling factors. Reviews in mineralogy and geochemistry, 48, 13-49.

5	6	6
J	υ	υ

567	Papike, J.J., Jensen, M., Shearer, C.K, Simon, S.B., Walker, R.J., and Laul, J.C. (1984)
568	Apatite as a recorder of pegmatite petrogenesis. Geological Society of America Abstracts with
569	Programs, 16, 617.
570	
571	Pasero, M., Kampf, A.R., Ferraris, C., Pekov, I.V., Rakovan, J., White, T.J. (2010)
572	Nomenclature of the apatite supergroup minerals. European Journal of Mineralogy, 22, 163-
573	179.
574	
575	Rakovan, J., and Reeder, R.J. (1996) Intracrystalline Rare Earth Element distributions in
576	apatite: Surface structural influences on zoning during growth. Geochimica et Cosmochimica
577	Acta, 60, 4435-4445.
578	
579	Rouse, R.C., Dunn P.J., and Peacor, D.R. (1984) Hedyphane from Franklin, New Jersey and
580	Långban, Sweden: cation ordering in an arsenate apatite. American Mineralogist, 69, 920-
581	927.
582	
583	Rønsbo, J.G. (1989) Coupled substitutions involving REEs and Na and Si in apatites in
584	alkaline rocks from the Ilimaussaq intrusion, South Greenland, and the petrological
585	implications. American Mineralogist, 74, 896–901.
586	
587	Sha, L.K., and Chappell, B.W. (1999) Apatite chemical composition, determined by electron
588	microprobe and laser-ablation inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry, as a probe into
589	granite petrogenesis. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 63, 3861-3881.
590	

- 591 Shannon, R.D. (1976) Revised effective ionic radii and systematic studies of interatomic
- 592 distances in halides and chalcogenides. Acta crystallographica section A: crystal physics,
- diffraction, theoretical and general crystallography, 32, 751-767.
- 594
- 595 Sheldrick, G.M. (2015) Crystal structure refinement with SHELXL. Acta Crystallographica
- 596 Section C: Structural Chemistry, 71, 3-8.

597

- 598 Tang, P., Zhou, Y.C., and Xie, Z.M. (2013) Immobilization of heavy metals in sludge using
- 599 phosphoric acid and monobasic calcium phosphate. Journal of Zhejiang University Science
- 600 A, 14, 177-186.

601

- Vignoles, M., Bonel, G., Holcomb, D. W., and Young, R. A. (1988) Influence of preparation
- 603 conditions on the composition of type B carbonated hydroxyapatite and on the localization of
- the carbonate ions. Calcified Tissue International, 43, 33-40.

605

- White, T., Ferraris, C., Kim, J., and Madhavi, S. (2005) Apatite–an adaptive framework
- 607 structure. Reviews in mineralogy and geochemistry, 57, 307-401.

608

- Zhang, L., Chen, Z., Wang, F., and Zhou, T. (2021) Apatite geochemistry as an indicator of
- 610 petrogenesis and uranium fertility of granites: A case study from the Zhuguangshan batholith,
- 611 South China. Ore Geology Reviews, 128, 103886.

612

613

# 615 Tables:

	La-Na-Pym	Na-Pym	La-K-Pym	K-Pym
	wt%			
$P_2O_5$	16.03(24)	15.63(37)	15.53(27)	15.41(41)
PbO	79.42(90)	81.27(71)	79.20(58)	81.09(51)
Na <sub>2</sub> O	0.04(4)	0.02(4)	b.d.	b.d.
K <sub>2</sub> O	b.d.	b.d.	0.05(9)	0.03(3)
La <sub>2</sub> O 3	1.19(68)	b.d.	0.63(28)	b.d.
Cl	2.34(19)	2.61(20)	2.97(24)	2.96(24)
O=Cl	-0.53	-0.59	-0.67	-0.67
total	98.49	98.94	97.69	98.82
		apfu based u	pon 13 anions	
Р	3.03(1)	3.01(2)	3.01(2)	2.99(3)
Pb	4.77(9)	4.97(6)	4.88(7)	5.01(8)
Na	0.02(2)	0.01(2)	b.d.	b.d.
Κ	b.d.	b.d.	0.01(3)	0.01(1)
La	0.10(6)	b.d.	0.05(2)	b.d.
Cl	0.89(8)	1.01(9)	1.15(10)	1.15(10)
empiri cal formu la	$\frac{Pb_{4.77(9)}La_{0.10(6)}Na_{0.02(2)}(PO_4)}{_{3.03(1)}Cl_{0.89(8)}}$	$\frac{Pb_{4.97(6)}Na_{0.01(2)}(PO_4)_{3.0}}{_{1(2)}Cl_{1.01(9)}}$	$\frac{Pb_{4.88(7)}La_{0.05(2)}K_{0.01(3)}(PO_4)_{3.}}{_{01(2)}Cl_{1.15(10)}}$	$\frac{Pb_{5.01(8)}K_{0.01(1)}(PO_4)_{2.9}}{_{(3)}Cl_{1.15(10)}}$

616 Table 1. Wavelength dispersive analyses for all analyzed samples (see Appendix B for all WDS data).617

618

## 619

620 **Table 2.** Experimental details and crystallographic characteristics of the analyzed samples.

	La-Na-Pym	Na-Pym	La-K-Pym	K-Pym
Diffractometer	Rigaku Oxford	Bruker AXS	Rigaku Oxford	Bruker AXS
	Diffraction		Diffraction	
X-ray radiation		ΜοΚα (λ =	0.71073 Å)	
Temperature	180(2) K	273(2) K	180(2) K	273(2) K
Space group		<i>P</i> 6	$m_{3}/m$	
Unit-cell parameters				
<i>a</i> (Å)	9.98367(9)	9.996(2)	10.00129(8)	9.9944(4)
<i>c</i> (Å)	7.30631(10)	7.319(2)	7.29865(8)	7.3142(4)
$V(Å^3)$	630.679(14)	633.3(3)	632.244(12)	632.72(6)
Ζ	2	2	2	2
Absorption coefficient	66.522 mm <sup>-1</sup>	66.225 mm <sup>-1</sup>	64.024 mm <sup>-1</sup>	66.303 mm <sup>-1</sup>
F(000)	1035	1129	1113	1130
$\theta$ range	2.36 to 29.03°	2.35 to 29.01°	2.35 to 33.78°	2.35 to 28.95°
Index ranges	-13<=h<=13,	-13<=h<=13,	-15<=h<=15,	-13<=h<=13,
	-13<=k<=13,	-13<=k<=12,	-15<=k<=15,	-13<=k<=13,
	<b>-</b> 9<=l<=9	<b>-</b> 9<=l<=9	-10<=l<=11	<b>-</b> 9<=1<=9

Collected reflections / unique reflections	43286 / 591	7606 / 593	45590 / 893	15516 / 586
Refinement method		Full-matrix leas	st-squares on F <sup>2</sup>	
Refined parameters	41	42	43	41
R1, Fo $>$ 4sig(Fo)	0.0140	0.0215	0.0225	0.0196
R1, all unique data	0.0149	0.0222	0.0238	0.0201
wR2	0.0285	0.0509	0.0448	0.0432
GooF	1.194	1.214	1.189	1.205
Extinction coefficient	0.00021(6)	0.00102(14)	0.00006(7)	0.00018(8)
Largest difference peaks (e-	1.476 and	2.831 and	4.679 and	2.829 and
Å-3)	-0.802	-1.093	-1.960	-1.008

<sup>622</sup> 

623

624

Table 3. Bond valence sums calculated for Pb, La, Na, and K in Pb1 and Pb2 structural sites in
 pyromorphite. Bond-valence parameters are taken from the studies by: Brown and Altermatt (1985) for

627  $K^+$  - Cl<sup>-</sup>, Brese and O'Keeffe (1991) for Na<sup>+</sup> - Cl<sup>-</sup> and La<sup>3+</sup> - Cl<sup>-</sup>; Hu (2007) for Pb<sup>2+</sup> - Cl<sup>-</sup>; Gagné and

628 Hawthorne (2015) for all cations - $O^{2-}$	•
-------------------------------------------------	---

	La-Na-Pym	Na-Pym	La-K-Pym	K-Pym
Pb				
Pb1	2.03	2.02	2.01	2.01
Pb2	1.98	1.97	1.99	1.98
La				
Pb1	2.20	-	2.16	-
Pb2	2.26	-	2.26	-
Na				
Pb1	0.85	0.84	-	-
Pb2	0.82	0.82	-	-
K				
Pb1	-	-	1.77	1.78
Pb2	-	-	1.86	1.86

630 **Table 4.** Selected bond lengths (Å), bond angles (°) and twist angles (°) for all analyzed samples.

	La-Na-Pym	Na-Pym	La-K-Pym	K-Pym
Pb1-O1 (×3)	2.572(3)	2.580(5)	2.581(4)	2.578(5)
O2 (×3)	2.671(3)	2.672(5)	2.674(4)	2.675(5)
O3 (×3)	2.877(3)	2.878(5)	2.881(5)	2.879(5)
Mean	2.707	2.710	2.712	2.711
Polyhedral volume (Å <sup>3</sup> )	38.515	38.688	38.777	38.729
Pb2–O1	3.065(3)	3.086(7)	3.079(4)	3.08619(11)
O2	2.357(4)	2.359(7)	2.356(6)	2.352(6)
O3 (×2)	2.630(3)	2.633(5)	2.625(4)	2.634(5)
O3 (×2)	2.637(3)	2.637(5)	2.636(5)	2.635(5)
Cl (×2)	3.10891(18)	3.1109(6)	3.1131(2)	3.1103(3)

Mean	2.772	2.776	2.773	2.774
Polyhedral volume (Å <sup>3</sup> )	36.941	37.138	37.019	37.085
P-O1	1.528(4)	1.523(7)	1.519(6)	1.522(7)
O2	1.555(4)	1.559(7)	1.557(6)	1.562(7)
O3 (×2)	1.534(3)	1.538(5)	1.539(4)	1.537(5)
Mean	1.538	1.540	1.536	1.540
Polyhedral volume (Å <sup>3</sup> )	1.862	1.869	1.866	1.869
O1–P–O2	110.6(3)	110.5(4)	110.5(4)	110.3(4)
O1–P–O3 (×2)	112.19(16)	112.3(2)	112.3(2)	112.2(2)
O2–P–O3 (×2)	107.29(16)	107.2(3)	107.3(2)	107.4(2)
O3–P–O3	107.0(3)	107.0(4)	106.9(4)	107.0(4)
Twist angle	17.19	17.89	17.91	17.73

631

# 632 Figures:



Figure 1. Scanning electron micrographs (BSE) of synthesized analogs: (a) La-Na-Pym; (b) La-K Pym; (c) control Na-Pym; and (d) control K-Pym.



637

**Figure 2.** Raman spectra of La-doped pyromorphites and control samples in the 100–3600 cm<sup>-1</sup>

639

region.



640

Figure 3. Raman spectra of La-doped pyromorphites and control samples in the 100–1200 cm<sup>-1</sup>
 region with deconvoluted phosphate bands at the 300–600 cm<sup>-1</sup> and 800–1100 cm<sup>-1</sup> regions.