# 1 Revision 1

- 2 8948 Words
- 3

# On the origin of fluorine-poor apatite in chondrite parent bodies

- 4 Francis M. McCubbin<sup>1</sup>, Jonathan A. Lewis<sup>1</sup>, Jessica J. Barnes<sup>2</sup>, Jeremy W. Boyce<sup>1</sup>, Juliane
- Gross<sup>1,3</sup>, Molly C. McCanta<sup>4</sup>, Poorna Srinivasan<sup>5,6</sup>, Brendan A. Anzures<sup>7</sup>, Nicole G. Lunning<sup>1</sup>,
   Stephen M. Elardo<sup>8</sup>, Lindsay P. Keller<sup>1</sup>, Tabb C. Prissel<sup>9</sup>, and Carl B. Agee<sup>5,6</sup>

<sup>1</sup>NASA Johnson Space Center, Mailcode XI, 2101 NASA Parkway, Houston, Texas 77058, U.S.A.

8 <sup>2</sup>Lunar and Planetary Laboratory, University of Arizona, 1629 E University Blvd, Tucson, Arizona 85721, U.S.A.

- <sup>3</sup>Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Rutgers University, Piscataway, New Jersey 08854, U.S.A.
- <sup>4</sup>Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, Tennessee 37996, U.S.A.
- <sup>5</sup>Institute of Meteoritics, University of New Mexico, 200 Yale Blvd SE, Albuquerque, NM, 87131, U.S.A.
- <sup>6</sup>Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of New Mexico, 200 Yale Blvd SE, Albuquerque, NM,
   87131, U.S.A.
- <sup>14</sup> <sup>7</sup>Lunar and Planetary Institute, 3600 Bay Area Boulevard, Houston, TX 77058, United States of America
- <sup>8</sup>Department of Geological Sciences, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida 32611, U.S.A.
- <sup>9</sup>Jacobs, NASA Johnson Space Center, 2101 NASA Parkway, Houston, Texas 77058, U.S.A.
- 17 18
- 19

#### Abstract

We conducted a petrologic study of apatite within one LL chondrite, six R chondrites, and six 20 CK chondrites. These data were combined with previously published apatite data from a broader 21 range of chondritic meteorites to determine that chondrites host either chlorapatite or 22 hydroxylapatite with  $\leq 33 \text{ mol}\%$  F in the apatite X-site (unless affected by partial melting by 23 impacts, which can cause F-enrichment of residual apatite). These data indicate that either 24 fluorapatite was not a primary condensate from the solar nebula or it did not survive lower 25 temperature nebular processes and/or parent body processes. Bulk rock Cl and F data from 26 chondrites were used to determine that the solar system has a Cl/F ratio of  $10.5 \pm 1.0$  (3 $\sigma$ ). The 27 Cl/F ratios of apatite from chondrites are broadly reflective of the solar system Cl/F value, 28 indicating that apatite in chondrites are fluorine poor because the solar system has about an order 29 of magnitude more Cl than F. The Cl/F ratio of the solar system was combined with known 30 apatite-melt partitioning relationships for F and Cl to predict the range of apatite compositions 31 that would form from a melt with a chondritic Cl/F ratio. This range of apatite compositions 32

allowed for the development of a crude model to use apatite X-site compositions from
achondrites (and chondrite melt rocks) to determine whether they derive from a volatile-depleted
and/or differentiated source, albeit with important caveats that are detailed in the manuscript.
This study further highlights the utility of apatite as a mineralogical tool to understand the origin
of volatiles (including H<sub>2</sub>O) and the diversity of their associated geological processes throughout
the history of our solar system, including at its nascent stage.

39

### Introduction

The mineral apatite  $[Ca_5(PO_4)_3(F,Cl,OH)]$  is one of the primary mineralogical reservoirs 40 for phosphorus on Earth (Piccoli and Candela, 2002), and it is a common phosphate mineral 41 within a broad range of extraterrestrial samples (e.g., McCubbin and Jones, 2015). Naturally 42 occurring apatite hosts F, Cl, and OH as essential structural constituents (ESC), and all three 43 make up the apatite endmembers fluorapatite, chlorapatite, and hydroxylapatite, respectively 44 (Hughes et al., 1989; Hughes et al., 1990). In addition to full ternary solution in the F-Cl-OH 45 46 apatite system, natural apatite can host a wide range of anions and/or molecules in this anion site (henceforth referred to as the X-site) including Br<sup>-</sup>, I<sup>-</sup>, S<sup>2-</sup>, O<sup>2-</sup>, CO<sub>3</sub><sup>2-</sup>, and H<sub>2</sub>O among others 47 (Brounce et al., 2019; Fleet et al., 2004; Hughes and Rakovan, 2015; Mason et al., 2009; Pan and 48 49 Fleet, 2002; Schettler et al., 2011), potentially making it a broadly applicable mineralogical tool to understand volatile abundances and processes in Earth and planetary systems. In fact, apatite 50 has gained prestige over the last two decades as one of the only volatile-bearing minerals that 51 52 occurs within a broad array of astromaterials (e.g., McCubbin and Jones, 2015). However, as its 53 name implies (i.e., the name apatite is derived from the Greek verb "to deceive"; Patrick and Martine, 2015), apatite has also gained notoriety as being a particularly difficult phase to analyze 54 and interpret (e.g., Boyce et al., 2014; Černok et al., 2019; Goldoff et al., 2012; McCubbin et al., 55

2010; Stock et al., 2015; Stormer et al., 1993; Webster and Piccoli, 2015). Nonetheless,
substantial progress has been achieved in developing apatite as a quantitative tool to understand
the origin, abundances, and isotopic compositions of volatiles in Earth and planetary systems.

Apatite has been used to determine the abundances of F, Cl, and H<sub>2</sub>O in magmas and 59 magmatic source regions on Earth, Moon, Mars, and the asteroid 4 Vesta (e.g., Filiberto et al., 60 2016b; Gross et al., 2013a; Kendall-Langley et al., 2021; McCubbin and Barnes, 2019; 61 McCubbin et al., 2016; McCubbin et al., 2015a; McCubbin et al., 2021; Patiño Douce and 62 Roden, 2006; Patiño Douce et al., 2011; Sarafian et al., 2017b; Tartèse et al., 2013), and it has 63 also been used to characterize the H- and Cl-isotopic compositions of numerous parent bodies 64 (e.g., Barnes et al., 2019; Barnes et al., 2020; Barrett et al., 2019; Barrett et al., 2016; Boyce et 65 al., 2015; Davidson et al., 2020; Greenwood et al., 2011; Hallis, 2017; Hu et al., 2019; 66 McCubbin and Barnes, 2020; Sarafian et al., 2017b; Sarafian et al., 2014; Smith et al., 2020; 67 Stephant et al., 2021; Tartèse et al., 2013; Tartèse et al., 2019; Williams et al., 2016). With the 68 69 exception of ordinary chondrites, much of the effort to determine and characterize apatite volatile abundances in astromaterials have focused on planetary basalts; however, apatite also occurs in 70 primitive meteorites not formed by melting, including chondrites and primitive achondrites. 71

The presence of apatite in primitive parent bodies indicates that apatite may hold a record of volatiles and their associated processes during the nascent stages of planetesimal formation and evolution. In particular, apatite in primitive solar system materials may hold a volatile record of ancient parent bodies that formed within the timespan of about 1–4 Ma after solar system formation (as defined by the formation of calcium-aluminum-rich inclusions at 4567.30  $\pm$  0.16 Ma; Connelly et al., 2012). Apatite is commonly cited as a primary condensate from nebular gas at 710–734 K (fluorapatite) to define the 50% condensation temperature of fluorine (e.g., Fegley

and Schaefer, 2010; Lodders, 2003) and at 470-472 K (chlorapatite) to define the 381-50% 79 condensation temperature for Cl (Fegley and Schaefer, 2010; Wood et al., 2019). At 850-1285 80 K, the physicochemical conditions within the nebula favor the formation of phosphides and 81 phosphorus components in Fe-rich metal (Fegley and Schaefer, 2010; Hazen and Morrison, 82 2021; Jones et al., 2014; Pasek, 2019; Zanda et al., 1994). Nebular phosphides begin to oxidize 83 to form phosphates at about 850 K (Pasek, 2019). However, not all (possibly very few) apatite 84 within chondrites are preserved condensates from the nebula. In fact, apatite in ordinary 85 86 chondrites are reported to form through metasomatic parent body processes involving the oxidation of phosphorus in metals to form merrillite followed by metasomatism of merrillite by 87 H<sub>2</sub>O-poor, Cl-rich fluids to form apatite (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 88 89 2016; McCubbin and Jones, 2015; Walton et al., 2021). Notably, reaction of whitlockite with gaseous nebular HCl is thought to be the process by which chlorapatite formed in the nebula at 90 91 470 K (Fegley and Schaefer, 2010). Nonetheless, the primary hosts for F and Cl in the most 92 primitive solar system materials remains uncertain (Brearley and Jones, 2018). However, the presence of apatite in primitive materials offers a window into volatile processing within parent 93 bodies that represent possible building blocks of the terrestrial planets, and in turn may provide 94 95 clues as to the processes that redistribute volatiles during accretion and differentiation.

Apatite in planetary basalts have ternary compositions that span nearly the full range of F-Cl-OH space, but the predominant apatite in planetary basalts from most (exclusive of Mars) differentiated parent bodies is fluorapatite (McCubbin et al., 2022; McCubbin and Jones, 2015; Meurer and Natland, 2001; Piccoli and Candela, 2002; Sarafian et al., 2013). In contrast, apatite in primitive meteorites are often reported as chlorapatite, although many studies have not reported quantitative abundances of F and Cl in apatite (e.g., Fuchs, 1969; Rubin, 1997).

Detailed studies of apatite from ordinary chondrites indicate they are predominantly chlorinerich (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; Li and Hsu, 2018; Ward et al., 2017; Wu and Hsu, 2019), but the limited data on apatite compositions in other chondrites indicate variations from Cl-rich to OH-rich apatite (McCanta et al., 2008; Piralla et al., 2021; Ward et al., 2017; Zhang et al., 2016; Zhang and Yurimoto, 2013).

The purportedly Cl- and/or OH-rich nature of apatite from chondrites contrasts with the 107 fluorine-rich nature of apatite in many planetary basalts, and this difference could have important 108 implications for the evolution of volatiles during planetary differentiation processes. However, 109 given the limited amount of apatite data from chondrites (exclusive of ordinary chondrites), it is 110 not clear as to what extent this apparent dichotomy is simply a function of a paucity of analyses 111 112 of chondritic apatite. In the present study we characterize the apatite compositions from ordinary chondrites, carbonaceous Karoonda-type (CK) chondrites, and Rumuruti-type (R) chondrites. 113 We use these data, along with chondritic apatite data from the literature, to characterize the 114 115 population of apatite compositions from chondrite parent bodies. These results are interpreted 116 through the use of published experimental data on the partitioning behavior of F, Cl, and OH between apatite and silicate melt to model apatite compositional evolution during melting of 117 118 chondritic sources. The overall aims of this study are to (1) understand the nature of apatite in chondrites and (2) to develop a model for apatite crystallization from chondritic melts to 119 establish apatite volatile compositions that would be expected from melting of undifferentiated 120 121 and undegassed (i.e., chondritic) sources and differentiated and/or degassed sources.

122

#### Methods

Apatite compositions from six R chondrites, one ordinary chondrite, and six CK chondrites were determined by electron probe microanalysis (EPMA). These data were combined with literature data on 20 additional ordinary chondrites and four other carbonaceous

chondrites, and a complete list of all the meteorites considered in this study, as well as their 126 petrologic types, is provided in Tables 1–2. Samples analyzed in this study were loaned from the 127 128 following: the meteorite collection in the Institute of Meteoritics (IOM) at the University of New Mexico (UNM) (Parnallee, Karoonda, Northwest Africa (NWA) 8186); the United States 129 Antarctic Meteorite Collection at NASA Johnson Space Center (JSC)/Smithsonian Institution 130 131 (David Glacier (DAV) 92300, Elephant Moraine (EET) 87507, Larkman Nunatak (LAR) 06872, Allan Hills (ALH) 85151, Pecora Escarpment (PCA) 91002, Mount Prestrud (PRE) 95410, 132 LaPaz Icefield (LAP) 04840, LAP 03639, and Miller Range (MIL) 11207); and the personal 133 134 collection of Dr. Lindsay Keller (Maralinga).

135 Electron probe microanalysis (EPMA)

Major and minor element compositions of apatite were acquired by electron probe 136 microanalysis at multiple electron microprobe labs. This study utilized CAMECA SX-100 137 electron microprobes from the American Museum of Natural History (MIL 11207) and NASA 138 139 Johnson Space Center (LAP 04840). Additionally, a JEOL 8530 field emission electron microprobe from NASA Johnson Space Center (DAV 92300, EET 87507, LAR 06872, ALH 140 85151, PCA 91002, PRE 95410, Maralinga, Karoonda) and a JEOL JXA 8200 electron 141 142 microprobe at the University of New Mexico (Parnallee and NWA 8186) were used during this study. In addition to collecting major and minor element compositions of apatite, these 143 144 instruments were used to attain back-scattered electron (BSE) images of apatite in select samples. All analyses include the elements P, Fe, Mg, Ca, Na, F, and Cl; however, the minor 145 elements Si, Ce, Y, Mn, and S were also included for some analyses. The beam conditions and 146 147 details on the analytical methods used for each apatite dataset is provided in the online supplementary files. 148

The apatite X-site hosts F, Cl, and OH as ESCs; however, we did not measure OH in this 149 study. A missing component in the X-site of apatite can be calculated on the basis of 150 151 stoichiometry if both F and Cl are analyzed with sufficient accuracy. Estimating a missing component with accuracy is often challenging because fluorine and chlorine X-ray count rates 152 can vary over the course of an electron microprobe analysis of apatite (Stormer et al., 1993), 153 154 although this problem seems to affect F substantially more than Cl (McCubbin et al., 2010). If a missing component is detected, it can be attributed to some combination of the anions  $OH^{-}$ ,  $O^{2-}$ , 155 CO3<sup>2-</sup>, S<sup>2-</sup>, Br<sup>-</sup>, and I<sup>-</sup> and/or structural vacancies (Pan and Fleet, 2002) and/or structural H<sub>2</sub>O 156 (Mason et al., 2009). Although OH is the most likely constituent for this missing component in 157 apatite from many planetary basalts (e.g., McCubbin et al., 2016; Sarafian et al., 2013; Tartèse et 158 159 al., 2013), both natural and synthetic Cl-rich apatite often exhibit F-Cl-OH X-site sums that are sub-stoichiometric (Jones et al., 2014; McCubbin and Ustunisik, 2018; Schettler et al., 2011). 160 This deficiency has been attributed to some combination of  $O^{2-}$  and structural vacancies in the 161 162 apatite X-site (Hovis and Harlov, 2010; Schettler et al., 2011), but additional work is needed to fully characterize the nature and cause of the observed X-site deficiencies in Cl-rich apatite. 163

The quality of apatite analyses was assessed based on stoichiometric constraints and electron microprobe totals. If analytical totals were outside of the range 96.0–102.0 wt.%, the analysis was discarded. The leniency on analytical total deficiency was due to the possibility of up to 1.79 wt.% H<sub>2</sub>O (as OH<sup>-</sup> groups) in apatite, which cannot be detected by the electron microprobe. Furthermore, if the stoichiometry of cation sites deviated by more than  $\pm 2\%$  (i.e., 0.16 structural formula units (sfu) on a 13-anion basis for the ideal cation total of 8.0 sfu), the analysis was discarded.

171

#### Results

### 172 Apatite in ordinary chondrites

173 Detailed textural studies of apatite in ordinary chondrites have been reported in previous 174 studies for all samples listed in Table 1 with the exception of the LL3.6 chondrite Parnallee. The 175 apatite in Parnallee will be described here for the first time. Apatite in ordinary chondrites exhibit a wide range of grain sizes with shortest dimensions ranging from  $<10 \mu m$  to  $>200 \mu m$ 176 177 (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; Li and Hsu, 2018; Wu and Hsu, 178 2019). Both apatite and merrillite are present in all ordinary chondrites, and merrillite is typically 179 more abundant than apatite (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; Li and 180 Hsu, 2018; Wu and Hsu, 2019). Apatite occurs in ordinary chondrites as (1) discrete grains with subhedral-anhedral habit, (2) grains associated with vein-filling material or impact melt pockets, 181 182 (3) intergrowths with merrillite where apatite seems to have replaced merrillite, or (4) anhedral 183 to euhedral grains that are intergrown with irregular Fe-Ni metal and sulfide (Jones et al., 2014; 184 Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; Li and Hsu, 2018; Wu and Hsu, 2019). In Parnallee, 185 apatite exhibits a similar range of grain sizes and textures as those in the other ordinary chondrites with at least one large >100 µm anhedral grain that hosts inclusions of plagioclase and 186 187 olivine (Figure 1a), similar to some apatite grains described by Jones et al., (2014) in Bjurböle and by Walton et al., (2021) in Chelyabinsk. 188

Apatite in non-brecciated ordinary chondrites have X-site populations that cluster in the chlorapatite portion of the apatite F-Cl-OH ternary, with slight variations in average apatite composition between each of the H, L, and LL ordinary chondrite types (Lewis and Jones, 2016; Figure 2). Direct measurement of OH by secondary ion mass spectrometry (SIMS) of apatite in ordinary chondrites have demonstrated that the missing X-site component cannot be accounted for solely by OH (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016), which is why the "OH" apex of the

195 apatite F-Cl-OH ternary in Figure 2 is labelled as a "missing component". The apatite X-site data for Parnallee are similar to apatite compositions exhibited by other LL ordinary chondrites, 196 197 perhaps with slightly higher Cl abundances, with chlorine abundances ranging from 72 to 77 mol% of the X-site, fluorine abundances ranging from 12 to 20 mol% of the X-site, and missing 198 component abundances ranging from 6 to 13 mol% of the X-site (Table S1; Figure 2). All apatite 199 200 X-site data from the ordinary chondrites considered in this study are provided in Table S1 (Parnallee) and Table S15 (previously published data), and the average major and minor element 201 composition of apatite in Parnallee is provided in Table 3. 202

203 The brecciated ordinary chondrites and an L-melt rock host apatite that exhibit more variability in X-site composition that range from the apatite compositions in non-brecciated 204 205 ordinary chondrites to F-rich compositions (Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; Li and 206 Hsu, 2018; Wu and Hsu, 2019; Table 1, S15). However, the F-rich apatite compositions in ordinary chondrites are limited to (1) an H6 clast in Zag (termed H6-1 by Jones et al., 2016), (2) 207 208 the L4 breccia matrix in the L chondrite Kendleton (Lewis and Jones, 2016), (3) impact melt 209 veins in L4 melt breccia NWA 7251 (Wu and Hsu, 2018), and (4) the L-melt rock NWA 11042 210 (Li and Hsu, 2019). All four of these lithologies exhibit evidence of partial (or complete) melting 211 due to impact processes (Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; Li and Hsu, 2018; Wu and Hsu, 2019). The F-rich apatite in all four lithologies are plotted as a separate group in Figure 2, 212 213 and their apatite X-site compositions are provided in Table S15.

#### 214 Apatite in Rumuruti-like (R) chondrites

Apatite has been reported in all R chondrites, but it makes up a small fraction of the modal mineralogy with total phosphate abundances reported to be <1.0 vol% (Bischoff et al., 1994; Bischoff et al., 2011; McCanta et al., 2008; Rubin and Kallemeyn, 1994; Schulze et al.,

1994; Weisberg et al., 1991). In addition to apatite, some R chondrites also host 218 merrillite/whitlockite, although the OH abundance, which is the primary distinguishing feature 219 220 between merrillite versus whitlockite, has not been determined. Apatite exhibits a wide range of grain sizes with shortest dimensions ranging from  $<10 \mu m$  to  $>180 \mu m$  (Bischoff et al., 1994; 221 222 McCanta et al., 2008; Figure 1). Apatite exhibits a variety of textures in R chondrites, including 223 as (1) discrete grains with subhedral-anhedral habit (Figure 1b-c), (2) anhedral-subhedral intergrowths with silicate phases like olivine (Bischoff et al., 1994), and (3) as anhedral-224 subhedral grains in close association with Fe-Ni sulfides. In the R chondrites investigated in the 225 226 present study, apatite occurs as discrete grains with subhedral to euhedral habit and grain sizes ranging from  $\sim 5 \,\mu m$  to  $\sim 100 \,\mu m$  in their shortest dimension. Many of the apatite in R chondrites 227 228 host smaller oxide and/or sulfide phases (e.g., Figure 1b).

229 Apatite in R chondrites have been reported as chlorapatite or hydroxylapatite (Bischoff et al., 1994; Bischoff et al., 2011; Gross et al., 2023; Gross et al., 2013b; McCanta et al., 2008; 230 231 Rubin and Kallemeyn, 1994; Schulze et al., 1994; Weisberg et al., 1991); however, very few studies of R chondrites have reported quantitative analyses of apatite (i.e., Gross et al., 2013b; 232 233 McCanta et al., 2008), and none have reported quantitative analyses of chlorapatite. The samples 234 reported to have hydroxylapatite come from a subgroup of amphibole- and biotite-bearing R 235 chondrites (Gross et al., 2023; Gross et al., 2013b; McCanta et al., 2008), whereas chlorapatite 236 has been reported in typical R chondrites that do not have amphibole or biotite (Bischoff et al., 1994; Bischoff et al., 2011; Rubin and Kallemeyn, 1994; Schulze et al., 1994; Weisberg et al., 237 1991). We analyzed apatite from two amphibole- and biotite-bearing R chondrites (i.e., LAP 238 04840 and MIL 11207) and four typical R chondrites (i.e., ALH 85151, PCA 91002, LAP 03639, 239 240 and PRE 95410). The two amphibole- and biotite-bearing R chondrites host apatite with X-site

241 populations that cluster in the hydroxylapatite portion of the apatite F-Cl-OH ternary (Figure 2; Table 1). The apatite X-site data for LAP 04840 and MIL 11207 indicate chlorine abundances 242 243 ranging from 27 to 32 mol% of the X-site, fluorine abundances ranging from 0 to 15 mol% of the 244 X-site, and OH abundances ranging from 55 to 73 mol% of the X-site (Table S2–S3; Figure 2). 245 The four R chondrites without amphibole or biotite host apatite with X-site populations that span 246 a range of compositions within the Cl-OH portion of the apatite ternary (Figure 2; Table 1). The apatite X-site data for ALH 85151, PCA 91002, LAP 03639, and PRE 95410 indicate chlorine 247 abundances ranging from 38 to 88 mol% of the X-site, fluorine abundances ranging from 2 to 25 248 mol% of the X-site, and missing components attributed to OH ranging from 5 to 50 mol% of the 249 X-site (Table S4–S7; Figure 2). All apatite X-site data from R chondrites considered in this study 250 251 are provided in Tables S2–S7 and Table S15, and the average major and minor element compositions of apatite in LAP 04840, MIL 11207, ALH 85151, PCA 91002, LAP 03639, and 252 PRE 95410 are provided in Table 3. Attribution of the missing component in the X-site of R 253 254 chondrite apatite to OH is presumed and will need to be verified in subsequent studies of these samples. 255

## 256 Apatite in Karoonda-like (CK) carbonaceous chondrites

Apatite has been reported as a minor phase in many CK chondrites, and it occurs in a range of textural occurrences, including (1) within magnetite-sulfide chondrules, (2) as discrete grains within CK matrix, and (3) within anorthite-olivine-spinel-magnetite CAIs in the anomalous CK4 Maralinga (Keller et al., 1992; Kurat et al., 2002; Rubin, 1993; Ward et al., 2017; Figure 1d-f). Apatite typically coexists with merrillite, and both minerals make up the dominant phosphate mineralogy in CK chondrites. All of the CK chondrite samples investigated in the present study host apatite that exhibit one or more of the three apatite textural occurrences

264 described above from previous studies (Figure 1d-f) with the exception of NWA 8186. In NWA 8186 (CK7), apatite occurs as anhedral-subhedral oikocrysts that fill the interstitial space 265 266 between olivine grains. This textural distinction may be related to the high petrologic type of NWA 8186 (Srinivasan et al., 2017) in comparison to other CK chondrites. Apatite in CK 267 chondrites exhibit a wide range of grain sizes with shortest dimensions ranging from  $\sim 1 \mu m$  to 268 269  $\sim$ 100 µm, and many of the apatite in CK chondrites host smaller oxide phases (e.g., Figure 1d-f). Notably, apatite within anorthite-olivine-spinel-magnetite CAIs in the anomalous CK4 270 Maralinga have apatite grains that span hundreds of microns in their longest dimension (Figure 271 1f). 272

Apatite in CK chondrites have been reported as chlorapatite (Keller et al., 1992; Kurat et 273 274 al., 2002; Rubin, 1993; Ward et al., 2017); however, very few studies have reported quantitative 275 analyses of both F and Cl in apatite from CK chondrites (e.g., Ward et al., 2017). The apatite Xsite data for CK chondrites analyzed in this study, exclusive of the apatite associated with CAIs 276 277 in Maralinga, indicate chlorine abundances ranging from 35 to 100 mol% of the X-site, fluorine abundances ranging from 0 to 28 mol% of the X-site, and OH abundances ranging from 0 to 54 278 mol% of the X-site (Table S8-S13; Figure 2). The X-site data for the apatite associated with 279 280 CAIs in Maralinga indicate chlorine abundances ranging from 39 to 100 mol% of the X-site, 281 fluorine abundances ranging from 0 to 10 mol% of the X-site, and missing components attributed to OH ranging from 0 to 52 mol% of the X-site (Table S14; Figure 2). All apatite X-site data 282 from CK chondrites considered in this study are provided in Tables S8-S15, and the average 283 composition of apatite in Karoonda, DAV 92300, Maralinga, Maralinga CAIs, EET 87507, LAR 284 285 06872, and NWA 8186 are provided in Table 4. Attribution of the missing component in the X-

site of CK chondrite apatite to OH is presumed and will need to be verified in subsequent studiesof these samples.

288 Apatite in other carbonaceous chondrites

Apatite has been reported as a minor to trace phase in other carbonaceous chondrites, 289 including Allende, Dar al Gani (DaG) 978, Boriskino, and Bench Crater, which is a 290 291 carbonaceous chondrite found in an Apollo 12 soil on the surface of the Moon (Dyl et al., 2015; Joy et al., 2020; Piralla et al., 2021; Zhang et al., 2016; Zhang and Yurimoto, 2013). The apatite 292 293 in DaG 978 (C3 chondrite) occurs as discrete grains ranging in size from  $\sim 10$  to 100 µm. The apatite exhibit numerous textural occurrences including (1) grains that are closely associated 294 with CAIs, (2) grains at the margins of FeNi metal grains, (3) grains that form a "chain of beads" 295 296 in the matrix, and (4) as large grains with clinopyroxene inclusions (Zhang et al., 2016). The apatite in Allende (CV3 chondrite), Boriskino (CM2 chondrite), and Bench Crater (C1 chondrite) 297 occur as grains ranging in size from  $\sim$ 3 to 20  $\mu$ m, and the apatite occurs as subhedral to euhedral 298 grains or grain clusters in all three samples (Dyl et al., 2015; Piralla et al., 2021). The apatite 299 exhibit two main textural occurrences including (1) within fine-grained matrix in Bench Crater 300 301 and Boriskino and (2) within aqueously altered chondrules in Bench Crater and Allende (Dyl et al., 2015; Piralla et al., 2021). Apatite in Boriskino also occurs as anhedral fluffy fine-grained 302 material (Piralla et al., 2021). 303

Apatite in DaG 978 are chlorapatite and plot in the portion of the apatite F-Cl-OH ternary that is shared with many CK and R chondrite apatite (Zhang et al., 2016; Zhang and Yurimoto, 2013; Figure 2). The apatite X-site data for DaG 978 indicate chlorine abundances ranging from 64 to 87 mol% of the X-site, fluorine abundances ranging from 1 to 12 mol% of the X-site, and OH abundances ranging from 3 to 24 mol% of the X-site (Table S15; Figure 2). The apatite in

Allende, Boriskino, and Bench Crater are hydroxylapatite and represent the most halogen-poor apatite reported from chondrites (Dyl et al., 2015; Piralla et al., 2021; Figure 2). The apatite Xsite data for Allende, Boriskino, and Bench Crater indicate chlorine abundances ranging from 0 to 20 mol% of the X-site, fluorine abundances ranging from 5 to 33 mol% of the X-site, and OH abundances ranging from 58 to 95 mol% of the X-site (Table S15; Figure 2). Attribution of the missing component in the X-site of apatite to OH in Allende, Boriskino, and Bench Crater has been confirmed by SIMS (Dyl et al., 2015; Piralla et al., 2021), but further work is needed to

- confirm OH in DaG 978.
- 317

### Abundance of F and Cl in chondrites and the solar system

To determine the behavior of F and Cl during melting and partial melting of chondritic 318 sources, we need to know the bulk F and Cl abundances of chondrites. Numerous studies have 319 reported bulk F and/or Cl values of individual meteorites (see Brearley and Jones, 2018) from 320 which averages can be determined. However, the reported values vary widely within studies and 321 between studies owing to differences between analytical techniques, various sources of analytical 322 error, terrestrial contamination, and sample heterogeneity (see detailed discussion in Brearley 323 324 and Jones, 2018). These considerations have been evaluated by several studies aiming to compile 325 the bulk compositions of chondrites.

CI chondrites have the most rigorously vetted compilations (typically using Orgueil) that list values of F and Cl of 54–66 ppm and 600–704 ppm, respectively, with Cl/F ratios between 10.6 and 12.6 (Anders and Ebihara, 1982; Anders and Grevesse, 1989; Lodders, 2003; Lodders and Fegley, 1998; Lodders et al., 2009; McDonough and Sun, 1995; Palme and Beer, 1993; Palme and Jones, 2003; Palme et al., 2014; Palme et al., 1981; Palme and Zipfel, 2021; Wasson and Kallemeyn, 1988). The most recent compilation is by Palme et al. (2014) for F and Palme

and Zipfel (2021) for Cl with Cl = 600 ppm, F = 58 ppm, and Cl/F = 10.34, which is similar to previous compilation values by Anders and Ebihara (1982), Palme and Beer (1993), Palme and Jones (2003), and Lodders et al. (2009). Palme and Zipfel (2021) and Palme et al. (2014) reports a precision of 11% and 15% for the Cl and F values, respectively, which is greater than the range of values provided by all CI compilations cited above.

337 For CM, CO, and CV carbonaceous chondrites, only two compilations exist: Wasson and Kallemeyn (1988) and Lodders and Fegley (1998). The F values for these two compilations are 338 identical for all three groups, 38 ppm, 24 ppm, and 30 ppm for CM, CO, and CV, respectively, 339 and they are sourced from a single study (Dreibus et al., 1979) that measured Murchison and 340 Murray. The values for Cl in CM chondrites are significantly lower for Wasson and Kallemeyn 341 342 (1988) than Lodders and Fegley (1998) (i.e., 160 ppm and 430 ppm, respectively). Lodders and Fegley (1998) use the average of three measurements from Mighei (Goles et al., 1967; Reed and 343 Allen, 1966). Wasson and Kallemeyn (1988) appear to have focused on the lower values in 344 345 Murchison and Murray (i.e., Dreibus et al., 1979), which have considerable variation. CV and CO chondrites are more consistent between the two compilations, and we use the values from 346 Lodders and Fegley (1998) for all three groups. 347

The CK chondrites are only complied by Lodders and Fegley (1998) with F and Cl abundances of 20 ppm and 260 ppm, respectively. The CK chondrites have a Cl/F ratio of 13.0. These values come from analyses of Karoonda where Cl was averaged from two measurements (Dreibus et al., 1979; Greenland and Lovering, 1965), and F abundances are based on one measurement reported in Dreibus et al. (1979). The study by Greenland and Lovering (1965) was omitted because it reports uniformly high values of F (190 ppm for Karoonda) for all meteorites (see discussion in Brearley and Jones, 2018). Reliable bulk rock abundances of F and Cl values

are not available for CR chondrites, and they have not been reported for CH chondrites. For CR
chondrites, analyses of Cl have only been reported on Antarctic samples (e.g., Clay et al., 2017),
which are known to have anomalous halogen abundances (Brearley and Jones, 2018; Kato et al.,
2000; Langenauer and Krähenbühl, 1993).

Bulk compositions of ordinary chondrites are only compiled by Wasson and Kallemeyn 359 360 (1988) and Lodders and Fegley (1998). For F and Cl, these compilations are neither consistent with each other nor with estimates from secondary minerals (Lewis and Jones, 2016). For F, 361 there is a reliance on studies such as Greenland and Lovering (1965) in which the values are 362 known to be too high (Brearley and Jones, 2018). Apatite is the only known carrier of F and Cl 363 in the equilibrated ordinary chondrites, and apatite compositions and modal abundances in 364 365 ordinary chondrites have been reported by several studies (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016). These studies report group average Cl/F ratios of 13.2, 10.3, and 6.9 for 366 non-brecciated H, L, and LL falls, respectively. Dreibus et al. (1979) is the only study that 367 368 reports ordinary chondrite F and Cl values in the same range and with similar ratios. We will adopt F and Cl averages for non-brecciated H and L chondrite falls from this study. Dreibus et al. 369 370 (1979) did not measure any LL chondrites, so we will use the analysis of the L/LL chondrite 371 Tuxtuac.

Enstatite chondrites suffer from many of the same issues as the ordinary chondrites, particularly an overreliance on poor F data. There is only one analysis of F (64 ppm) from Dreibus et al. (1979) from the EH4 chondrite Abee. Fluorine has only been measured in EL chondrites by Greenland and Lovering (1965). The Cl values compiled by Wasson and Kallemeyn (1988) appear to be more consistent with the reported data, and we will use these

values for the EH and EL chondrites (660 ppm and 210 ppm, respectively). However, without
reliable F abundances, we do not use EH chondrites to estimate the solar system Cl/F ratio.

379 On the basis of all the chondrite groups for which reliable bulk rock F and Cl data is 380 available, we estimate that the solar system has a Cl/F ratio of  $10.5 \pm 1.0$  ( $3\sigma$ ). This value was 381 determined based on the slope of a linear regression through the F and Cl data for the 382 carbonaceous, ordinary, and EH chondrites (Figure 3). From this slope and the Cl abundance we 383 are using for EL chondrites (210 ppm Cl), we estimate that the bulk rock abundance of F in EL 384 chondrites is 20 ppm F (white circle in Figure 3).

385

### Discussion

Both fluorapatite and chlorapatite are reported to form during nebular condensation 386 (Fegley and Schaefer, 2010; Lodders, 2003; Pasek, 2019). Fluorapatite is thought to have 387 condensed out of nebular gas at 710–734 K, prior to the formation of chlorapatite at about 470 K 388 (e.g., Fegley and Schaefer, 2010; Lodders, 2003). However, the results of this study show that 389 390 apatite from a broad range of chondrite meteorites are predominantly chlorapatite or hydroxylapatite (Figure 2, 4a). Consequently, if fluorapatite did condense from nebular gas, it 391 392 did not survive subsequent nebular and/or parent body processing. It is unclear whether (1) 393 apatite compositions evolved towards Cl- and/or OH-rich compositions with decreasing 394 temperature through reactions with nebular gas prior to incorporation into chondrite parent bodies and/or (2) the X-site compositions of apatite observed in chondrites are the result of 395 parent body processes (i.e., parent-body alteration of apatite that condensed from nebular gas or 396 formation of apatite within the parent body as a result of endogenous parent-body processes). 397 398 Neither scenario can be ruled out, and they are not mutually exclusive.

**399** Origin of fluorine-poor apatite in chondrites

The Cl/F compositions of apatite in chondrites are broadly similar to the Cl/F ratio in chondrite parent bodies/the solar system (Figure 4a). Despite the broad similarities with the solar system Cl/F ratio and the near constant Cl/F ratio among chondrite groups, our apatite data exhibit substantial inter- and intra-sample variations indicating that parent body processes play an important role on the composition of any particular apatite in a chondrite. Here we explore some of those parent body processes to better understand variations in apatite compositions in chondrite samples.

Apatite from chondrite parent bodies are either chlorapatite or hydroxylapatite and 407 typically have less than 33 mol% of the apatite X-site occupied by F (Figure 2, 4b, 4d). 408 However, fluorapatite is reported in portions of four brecciated ordinary chondrite samples (Zag 409 H6-1 clast, Kendleton L4 matrix, impact melt veins in NWA 7251, and L melt rock NWA 410 11042) that were likely affected by impact melting (Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; Li 411 412 and Hsu, 2018; Wu and Hsu, 2019; Figure 2). To better understand why there would be more F-413 rich apatite in these samples, we consider the effects of impact melting on apatite halogen 414 abundances using experimental data on the apatite-melt partitioning behavior of F and Cl (e.g., Boyce et al., 2014; Candela, 1986; Doherty et al., 2014; Li and Hermann, 2015; Li and Hermann, 415 416 2017; Li and Costa, 2020; Mathez and Webster, 2005; McCubbin and Ustunisik, 2018; McCubbin et al., 2015b; Riker et al., 2018; Webster et al., 2017; Webster et al., 2009). Fluorine 417 is much more compatible in apatite compared to OH and Cl, particularly for OH-poor apatite 418 (McCubbin and Ustunisik, 2018) like those in ordinary chondrites (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et 419 420 al., 2016). Consequently, as an apatite-bearing rock undergoes partial melting by impacts, the residual apatite would evolve to more F-rich compositions given the stronger affinity for Cl and 421 422 H in the melt and F in apatite. From this assessment, we infer that the more F-rich compositions

in Zag, Kendleton, NWA 7251, and NWA 11042 (Table 1) may have been caused by impactinduced partial melting. Furthermore, we infer that endogenous parent body processes and/or
nebular processes have limited apatite compositions in chondrites to be dominantly Cl-OH
apatite with less than 33 mol% F in the apatite X-site for a broad range of chondrite parent
bodies from both the inner and outer solar system geochemical reservoirs (Figure 4d).

428 Most of the apatite reported in this study come from the H, L, LL, R, and CK chondrites, all samples that experienced varying degrees of thermal metamorphism on their parent body. 429 430 Although a clear petrogenetic sequence has been developed for P-bearing Fe-rich metal, 431 merrillite, and chlorapatite in ordinary chondrites (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; McCubbin and Jones, 2015), the origin of apatite in other chondrite groups is 432 less clear, particularly for more oxidized thermally metamorphosed chondrites like R and CK 433 434 chondrites (Righter and Neff, 2007) where their precursor materials may have been sufficiently 435 oxidized to incorporate nebular apatite. Regardless of their origin, thermally metamorphosed 436 chondrites from both reduced (e.g., H, L, and LL) and oxidized (e.g., CK and R) parent bodies host apatite with Cl/F ratios that largely straddle the Cl/F ratio of the solar system (Figure 4a). 437 438 The intrasample variation exhibited by apatite X-site compositions in most samples is on the 439 order of the variation exhibited between samples of the same group (Tables S1-S15). The large intrasample variation in apatite X-site compositions in CK, R, and Maralinga CAIs may indicate 440 441 that (1) apatite with a range of X-site compositions were incorporated into the parent body and/or (2) parent body metasomatic processes occurred under low fluid-rock ratios, preventing 442 homogenization during thermal metamorphism. 443

There are two notable exceptions to the large intrasample variation in apatite X-site compositions. The amphibole- and biotite-bearing R chondrites LAP 04840 and MIL 11207 both

have apatite X-site compositions that cluster tightly compared to the other R chondrites (Figure 2; Tables S2-S7). These samples have apatite that are more OH-rich than the other R chondrites, which exhibit a wide range of Cl-OH compositions similar to the CK chondrites and apatite in Maralinga CAIs (Figure 2; Tables S4-S14). The amphibole and biotite in LAP 04840 were used to estimate total  $P_{\rm H_{2}O}$  between 250 and 500 bars (McCanta et al., 2008), indicating a high

fluid:rock ratio for that sample and by inference MIL 11207. The high  $P_{\rm H_2O}$  likely resulted in less apatite X-site variation in the amphibole- and biotite-bearing R chondrites. Notably, apatite in the amphibole- and biotite-bearing R chondrites also straddle the solar system Cl/F ratio but at higher OH than the other R chondrite apatite.

Far fewer of the apatite reported and discussed in this study come from samples that 455 experienced varying degrees of low-temperature (-20 °C to ~300 °C; e.g., Krot et al., 2021; 456 457 Velbel and Zolensky, 2021) aqueous alteration on their parent body (i.e., CM and CV chondrites). All of the apatite from samples that experienced aqueous alteration plot at lower 458 Cl/F ratios than the solar system value, but they still exhibit apatite X-site compositions with  $\leq$ 459 460 33 mol% F (Figure 2, 4a), making them all hydroxylapatite (Dyl et al., 2015; Piralla et al., 2021; 461 Table S15). Unlike apatite from the thermally metamorphosed samples, many of the apatite in 462 the aqueously altered samples exhibit Cl/F < 1 (Table S15). Allende, which experienced both 463 aqueous alteration and subsequent thermal metamorphism (Krot et al., 2021), hosts apatite that exhibit a considerable range in Cl/F ratios (Dyl et al., 2015; Table S15). Although CV and CM 464 chondrite parent bodies have similar Cl/F ratios compared to H, L, LL, and CK chondrites 465 (Figure 3), their apatite are depleted in Cl relative to the apatite from H, L, LL, and CK 466 chondrites. Consequently, apatite is not the primary Cl host in CV and CM chondrites. In fact, 467 468 other Cl-bearing phases, including the Cl-rich mineral sodalite, have been reported in CV and

CM meteorites (Brearley and Jones, 2018; Krot et al., 1998; Lee et al., 2019). The origin of Cl 469 depletion in apatite from CM and CV apatite likely results from their lower temperature of 470 471 formation in aqueous/hydrothermal fluids, which strongly favors incorporation of F in apatite 472 over Cl (Zhu and Sverjensky, 1991). In fact, the larger range in Cl/F ratio exhibited by Allende is likely a reflection of that sample having experienced both aqueous alteration at 200-250 °C and 473 474 subsequent thermal metamorphism at ~500 °C (Krot et al., 2021), the latter of which would facilitate more Cl incorporation into apatite compared to lower temperatures (Li and Hermann, 475 2015; Li and Hermann, 2017; Zhu and Sverjensky, 1991). 476

477 Igneous apatite compositions from magmatic source regions with chondritic Cl/F ratios

Numerous studies have reported the partitioning behavior of F, Cl, and OH between 478 479 apatite and silicate melt as well as apatite and fluid over a wide range of pressures, temperatures, and (apatite/melt/fluid) compositions (e.g., Boyce et al., 2014; Candela, 1986; Doherty et al., 480 2014; Li and Hermann, 2015; Li and Hermann, 2017; Li and Costa, 2020; Mathez and Webster, 481 482 2005; McCubbin and Ustunisik, 2018; McCubbin et al., 2015b; Riker et al., 2018; Webster et al., 2017; Webster and Piccoli, 2015; Webster et al., 2009; Zhu and Sverjensky, 1991). These studies 483 484 have demonstrated that apatite-melt partition coefficients for individual X-site anions are highly 485 variable, but the exchange equilibria among the anions between apatite and melt vary systematically as a function of P, T,  $X_{melt}$ ,  $X_{Apatite}$ , and  $fO_2$  (e.g., Boyce et al., 2014; Li and 486 Hermann, 2017; McCubbin and Ustunisik, 2018; McCubbin et al., 2015b), similar to the 487 behavior of Fe-Mg exchange equilibrium between olivine and melt (e.g., Filiberto and Dasgupta, 488 2011; Roeder and Emslie, 1970; Toplis, 2005). This systematic variation in apatite-melt 489 490 exchange equilibria for F, Cl, and OH enables the estimation of magmatic volatile abundances of

491 magmas and magmatic source regions from apatite, and it allows for the prediction of initial apatite compositions that would crystallize from melts with known volatile abundance ratios. 492 493 Despite apatite being a late-forming phase in many extraterrestrial igneous systems, it is often the only mineral phase with F and Cl as ESCs (McCubbin and Jones, 2015). The Cl/F 494 495 ratios of parental melts are likely to remain unchanged until the appearance of apatite because 496 the closed-system crystallization of nominally volatile-free minerals will not greatly affect the Cl/F ratio prior to apatite saturation (Aiuppa et al., 2009; McCubbin et al., 2015b). As a result, 497 the halogen compositions of the first formed apatite in an igneous system can be predicted on the 498 499 basis of source Cl/F ratios. Using the estimated Cl/F mass ratio of chondrite parent bodies of  $10.5 \pm 1.0$  (3 $\sigma$ ), we compute a range of initial apatite compositions that would crystallize from a 500 501 melt with a chondritic Cl/F ratio using the Cl-F apatite-melt exchange  $K_d$  of  $0.21 \pm 0.03$  reported by McCubbin et al. (2015b) for basaltic liquids at 950-1000 °C, 1.0-1.2 GPa, and oxygen 502 fugacity within about a log unit of the iron-wüstite buffer. This range of apatite compositions is 503 504 shown in Figure 4a and is projected from the OH/missing component apex of the ternary. The 505 Cl/F mass ratio of apatite that would form from melts with a chondritic Cl/F ratio range from 1.64–2.79, which corresponds to apatite F-Cl X-site compositions of  $Cl_{60}F_{40}$ – $Cl_{47}F_{53}$  (teal region 506 507 in Figure 4a). The initial apatite composition that would form from melts with chondritic Cl/F may shift as a function of P, T, X, and  $fO_2$ , but experimental data over a wide range of conditions 508 509 indicate that X and T likely play the largest role in affecting the apatite-melt partitioning behavior 510 of F, Cl, and OH. In particular, higher temperatures (i.e., above 1000 °C) would favor a higher 511 proportion of Cl in apatite and hence a higher Cl-F apatite-melt exchange K<sub>d</sub> (Candela, 1986; 512 Doherty et al., 2014; Li and Hermann, 2015; Li and Hermann, 2017; Li and Costa, 2020; Mathez 513 and Webster, 2005; Riker et al., 2018; Webster et al., 2017; Webster et al., 2009). In contrast,

lower temperatures (i.e., below 950 °C) and/or H<sub>2</sub>O-poor conditions (particularly at high Cl/F 514 ratios in the melt) would favor a lower proportion of Cl in apatite and hence a lower Cl-F apatite-515 516 melt exchange K<sub>d</sub> (Candela, 1986; Doherty et al., 2014; Li and Hermann, 2015; Li and Hermann, 2017; Li and Costa, 2020; Mathez and Webster, 2005; McCubbin and Ustunisik, 2018; Riker et 517 al., 2018; Webster et al., 2017; Webster et al., 2009; Zhu and Sverjensky, 1991). 518 519 The chondritic apatite crystallization field in Figure 4a only represents initial apatite compositions that would crystallize from a silicate melt with a chondritic Cl/F ratio because 520 continued equilibrium crystallization and/or fractional crystallization would drive apatite to more 521 522 Cl-rich compositions (Boyce et al., 2014; McCubbin et al., 2016). In fact, any apatite forming from a melt with an initially chondritic Cl/F ratio should only produce apatite that plot within or 523 524 above the field defined by the initial chondritic apatite compositions (Figure 4c) unless they experience open-system processes like degassing or fluid loss. Degassing or fluid loss would 525 preferentially remove Cl from the melt relative to F (Aiuppa et al., 2009; Ustunisik et al., 2011; 526 527 Ustunisik et al., 2015; Webster, 1997; Webster, 2004; Webster and De Vivo, 2002; Webster et al., 1999; Webster and Rebbert, 1998), driving the evolution of apatite compositions towards the 528

fluorine apex of the apatite F-Cl-OH ternary (McCubbin et al., 2016; Ustunisik et al., 2015).

Although this apatite crystallization model (Figure 4c) is intended to be applied to achondrites, it could also be applied to apatite that crystallizes from impact melts in chondrite samples (e.g., impact melt veins or melt rocks). In particular, this model could be used to assess whether an impact melt of a chondrite experienced degassing prior to apatite saturation, as apatite compositions from degassed impact melt could fall below the chondritic range (i.e., teal wedge in Figure 4c). Knowing whether impact melt has degassed prior to apatite saturation could be important for interpreting isotopic compositions recorded in apatite that may be attributed to

537 degassing processes. The range in composition of apatite in chondrite melt rocks or impact melts could also be used to assess for other processes such as fractional vs equilibrium crystallization 538 539 of an impact melt, as demonstrated by Wu and Hsu, (2019) in the NWA 11042 L melt rock. Detailed petrographic studies of apatite in impact melted chondrites will be crucial to making 540 accurate interpretations because F-rich apatite can form in chondrite samples either through 541 542 crystallization from a degassed impact melt or by having survived partial melting during impact processes. Other geochemical indicators like REE abundances in apatite may be important for 543 distinguishing between residual apatite and apatite that crystallized from an impact melt (e.g., 544 Wu and Hsu, 2019). 545

#### 546 Apatite as a potential indicator of planetary differentiation

547 Planetary differentiation, defined here as primary metal-silicate separation and the development of primary geochemical reservoirs in the silicate portion of a planetary body, is a 548 fundamental process that has affected many, if not most, planetary bodies (e.g., Elkins-Tanton, 549 550 2012; Elkins-Tanton et al., 2011; Greenwood et al., 2005; Righter and Drake, 1996; Rubie et al., 2011; Weiss et al., 2008). In particular, melting, either partially or through planet-scale magma 551 552 oceans, is the most common process by which the terrestrial planets and large asteroids (like 4-553 Vesta) are believed to have differentiated (e.g., Bouvier et al., 2018; Brown and Elkins-Tanton, 2009; Elardo et al., 2011; Elkins-Tanton, 2012; Elkins-Tanton et al., 2005; Elkins-Tanton et al., 554 2003; Elkins-Tanton et al., 2011; Greenwood et al., 2005; McCubbin et al., 2021; Righter and 555 556 Drake, 1997; Riner et al., 2009; Stolper, 1977; Taylor et al., 1993; Wood et al., 2006).

In the context of preserving initial bulk silicate Cl/F ratios in differentiated mantle sources, the style and degree of melting will have important implications for the abundance, distribution, and possible fractionation of Cl from F in a mantle source. Chlorine is more

24

560 incompatible than F in the nominally volatile-free minerals that typically comprise cumulate mantle sources that form from magma ocean crystallization (Baker et al., 2022; Beyer et al., 561 562 2012; Hauri et al., 2006; O'Leary et al., 2010; Potts et al., 2021) or are left behind as restites/residues from partial melting. The consequence of this partitioning relationship is that the 563 primary crustal reservoir (i.e., first generation of melt) of a parent body will exhibit a more 564 565 accurate reflection of the initial bulk silicate Cl/F ratio of a differentiated parent body than its corresponding mantle source, particularly if the halogen abundances of that mantle source are 566 controlled by the partitioning behavior of Cl and F between nominally volatile-free minerals and 567 melt (as opposed to being controlled by trapped and/or residual melt or apatite). 568

On the Moon, it has been demonstrated that the mantle and primary crustal reservoirs 569 570 (i.e., KREEP) have distinct Cl/F with a mantle that is highly depleted in Cl relative to its primary 571 crust because the hybridized cumulate lunar mantle did not retain sufficient trapped melt to have a Cl/F ratio reflective of its bulk silicate composition (Boyce et al., 2018; McCubbin et al., 572 573 2015a; Potts et al., 2021). If the lunar mantle is a reasonable analogy to other large, differentiated 574 parent bodies, it indicates that mantle sources that have undergone multiple episodes of melting 575 will have lower Cl/F ratios than their initial (un-melted) starting compositions unless they were 576 able to retain considerably more trapped melt than mantle sources on the Moon. Consequently, the initial apatite that crystallizes from melts or partial melts of previously melted sources (i.e., 577 mantles that have volatile abundances that reflect the partitioning behavior of F and Cl between 578 579 nominally volatile-free minerals and melt) will plot below the chondritic apatite crystallization 580 field (teal wedge in Figure 4a, 4c), even if the parent body has a chondritic Cl/F ratio. Equilibrium crystallization of that apatite would keep it below the chondritic apatite 581 582 crystallization field, but fractional crystallization (where apatite is part of the fractionating

assemblage) could drive subsequent apatite compositions into and beyond that field (Boyce et

al., 2014; McCubbin et al., 2016).

585 Apatite as a potential indicator of volatile depletion

Moderately volatile elements are those that, at nebular pressures of  $10^{-4}$  bars, have 50% 586 condensation temperatures between 1290 K and 664 K, and volatile elements are those with 50% 587 588 condensation temperatures below 664 K (Lodders, 2003). Many achondrite parent bodies and all of the terrestrial planets are depleted in moderately volatile and volatile elements relative to 589 chondrites to varying degrees (Davis, 2006; McCubbin et al., 2012). The depletions in volatile 590 elements could have been inherited by the primary building blocks of differentiated parent 591 bodies, resulted from primary accretion processes, and/or occurred through later parent body 592 593 processes (e.g., Albarede, 2009; Boyce et al., 2015; Davis, 2006; Hirschmann et al., 2021; 594 Jackson et al., 2018; Lichtenberg and Krijt, 2021; Sharp and Draper, 2013). Volatile depletion can have a substantial impact on the Cl/F ratios of differentiated planetary bodies because F is a 595 596 moderately volatile element (50%  $T_C = 710-734$  K; Fegley and Schaefer, 2010; Lodders, 2003) and Cl is a volatile element (50%  $T_C = 420$  K; Fegley and Schaefer, 2010), so volatile depletion 597 processes tend to result in sub-chondritic Cl/F ratios (e.g., Boyce et al., 2018; Dreibus et al., 598 599 1977; McCubbin et al., 2022; McCubbin et al., 2021; McDonough and Sun, 1995).

Apatite from parent bodies that have sub-chondritic Cl/F ratios would plot below the chondritic apatite crystallization field (Figure 4a, 4c), even if the sample containing apatite represents a primary melt of that differentiated body (e.g., eucrites on the differentiated asteroid 4 Vesta; McCubbin et al., 2021). Consequently, both volatile depletion and differentiation would drive the formation of apatite on differentiated bodies to be more F-rich than apatite that would form from a melt with chondritic Cl/F ratios. Given that volatile-element depletion is typically more pronounced on differentiated parent bodies than undifferentiated parent bodies (Davis, 2006), these two processes (i.e., planetary differentiation and volatile-depletion) should work in tandem to cause a prevalence of F-rich apatite in planetary basalts, which matches published apatite compositions from numerous differentiated parent bodies, with the exception of Mars (Filiberto et al., 2016a; McCubbin and Jones, 2015).

611

### Implications

612 In this contribution, we report the first comprehensive dataset on the compositions of apatite from R and CK chondrites. In contrast to apatite in Ordinary chondrites, our data indicate 613 614 a substantial missing component in the X-site of CK and R chondrite apatite that could be 615 attributed to OH. One of the most fundamental questions in planetary science is the origin and 616 abundance of H<sub>2</sub>O and how it was distributed within the circumstellar disk within the first 4 Ma 617 of the birth of our solar system. To answer this question, we need to investigate the earliest-618 formed samples of our solar system, which includes a variety of chondrites and achondrites 619 (Alexander, 2017; Alexander et al., 2012; Deligny et al., 2021; Marrocchi et al., 2018; 620 McCubbin and Barnes, 2019; Piani and Marrocchi, 2018; Piani et al., 2020; Piani et al., 2015; 621 Piani et al., 2018; Sarafian et al., 2017a; Sarafian et al., 2014; Vacher et al., 2020). Given the 622 likely record of H<sub>2</sub>O in apatite from R and CK chondrites, these samples have untapped potential 623 to provide important constraints on the origin of H<sub>2</sub>O within the inner (R chondrite) and outer 624 (CK chondrite) solar system reservoirs through H-isotopic analyses.

Although encouraging, the missing components in CK and R chondrite apatite has not been measured and is only presumed to be OH. Such caution is particularly warranted because the missing component detected in the X-site of apatite from ordinary chondrites was much larger than the measured abundances of OH (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016). Nonetheless, there is reason to be cautiously optimistic about the attribution of the missing X-site components

of CK and R chondrite apatite to OH. In particular, the H<sub>2</sub>O-rich nature of fluids on the R 630 chondrite parent body is supported by the presence of H<sub>2</sub>O-rich amphibole and biotite within a 631 632 subgroup of R chondrites (Gross et al., 2023; Gross et al., 2013b; McCanta et al., 2008). Moreover, both CK and R chondrites are more oxidized than ordinary chondrites. The R 633 chondrites exhibit fO<sub>2</sub> values as high as the fayalite-magnetite-quartz (FMQ) buffer, and the CK 634 635 chondrites exhibit fO<sub>2</sub> values up to FMQ +4.5 (Righter and Neff, 2007). These fO<sub>2</sub> values would 636 correspond to high  $fH_2O/fH_2$  ratios of any parent body fluids (e.g., Sharp et al., 2013), making oxidized hydrogen available for incorporation into minerals during thermal metamorphism. In 637 contrast, the metal-rich ordinary chondrites likely had parent body fluids with low  $fH_2O/fH_2$ 638 ratios (Alexander, 2017; McCubbin and Barnes, 2019; Sutton et al., 2017), which would limit 639 640 OH incorporation into minerals during thermal metamorphism. In summary, the apatite in CK 641 and R chondrites are prime targets for gaining additional information about the origin of H<sub>2</sub>O in 642 our solar system.

643

#### Acknowledgements

We are grateful to the Meteorite Working Group, now the Antarctic Meteorite Review 644 645 Panel of the Astromaterials Allocation Review Board, for carefully evaluating our sample 646 requests, and we thank the curatorial staff at NASA Johnson Space Center for allocation of the Antarctic meteorites used in this study. The US Antarctic meteorite samples are recovered by the 647 Antarctic Search for Meteorites (ANSMET) program which has been funded by NSF and NASA 648 and characterized and curated by the Department of Mineral Sciences of the Smithsonian 649 Institution and Astromaterials Acquisition and Curation Office at NASA Johnson Space Center, 650 651 respectively. We also thank Carl Agee of the Institute of Meteoritics at the University of New 652 Mexico in Albuquerque, NM, USA for the allocation of Parnallee, Karoonda, and NWA 8186,

and we thank Lindsay Keller at NASA JSC for allowing us to use sections of Maralinga. FMM 653 654 wishes to thank Jim Webster for inspiring and encouraging him to work on apatite, both 655 experimentally and in natural samples, during his formative years as a PhD student at Stony Brook University. Jim was a dear friend, colleague, and mentor, and he is deeply missed. We are 656 grateful to Daniel Harlov for the editorial handling of this manuscript and to Craig Walton and 657 658 an anonymous reviewer for providing constructive and helpful comments that improved the overall quality of this work. F.M.M., J.W.B., and L.P.K. were supported by NASA's Planetary 659 660 Science Research Program during this work. J.A.L. and J.J.B. were supported by the NASA Postdoctoral Program during this work. J.J.B also recognizes support from start-up funds from 661 the University of Arizona. S.M.E. acknowledges support from NASA Solar System Workings 662 663 grant 80NSSC19K0752. B.A.A. was supported by a grant from the NASA Emerging Worlds Program awarded to F.M.M. T.C.P acknowledges support from the JETS contract at NASA 664 665 Johnson Space Center.

666

#### References

- Aiuppa, A., Baker, D.R., and Webster, J.D. (2009) Halogens in volcanic systems. Chemical
   Geology, 263, 1-18.
- Albarede, F. (2009) Volatile accretion history of the terrestrial planets and dynamic implications.
   Nature, 461, 1227-1233.
- Alexander, C.M.O.D. (2017) The origin of inner solar system water. Philosophical Transactions
   of the Royal Society a-Mathematical Physical and Engineering Sciences, 375.
- Alexander, C.M.O.D., Bowden, R., Fogel, M.L., Howard, K.T., Herd, C.D.K., and Nittler, L.R.
  (2012) The provenances of asteroids, and their contributions to the volatile inventories of
  the terrestrial planets. Science, 337, 721-723.
- Anders, E., and Ebihara, M. (1982) Solar system abundances of the elements. Geochimica et
   Cosmochimica Acta, 46, 2363-2380.
- Anders, E., and Grevesse, N. (1989) Abundances of the elements: Meteoritic and solar.
  Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 53, 197-214.
- Baker, D.R., Callegaro, S., De Min, A., Whitehouse, M.J., and Marzoli, A. (2022) Fluorine
   partitioning between quadrilateral clinopyroxenes and melt. American Mineralogist, 107,
   167-177.

- Barnes, J.J., Franchi, I.A., McCubbin, F.M., and Anand, M. (2019) Multiple volatile reservoirs
  on the Moon revealed by the isotopic composition of chlorine in lunar basalts.
  Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 266, 144-162.
- Barnes, J.J., McCubbin, F.M., Santos, A.R., Day, J.M.D., Boyce, J.W., Schwenzer, S.P., Ott, U.,
  Franchi, I.A., Messenger, S., Anand, M., and Agee, C.B. (2020) Multiple early-formed
  water reservoirs in the interior of Mars. Nature Geoscience, 13, 260-264.
- Barrett, T.J., Barnes, J.J., Anand, M., Franchi, I.A., Greenwood, R.C., Charlier, B.L.A., Zhao,
  X., Moynier, F., and Grady, M.M. (2019) Investigating magmatic processes in the early
  Solar System using the Cl isotopic systematics of eucrites. Geochimica et Cosmochimica
  Acta, 266, 582-597.
- Barrett, T.J., Barnes, J.J., Tartèse, R., Anand, M., Franchi, I.A., Greenwood, R.C., Charlier,
  B.L.A., and Grady, M.M. (2016) The abundance and isotopic composition of water in
  eucrites. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 51, 1110-1124.
- Beyer, C., Klemme, S., Wiedenbeck, M., Stracke, A., and Vollmer, C. (2012) Fluorine in nominally fluorine-free mantle minerals: Experimental partitioning of F between olivine, orthopyroxene and silicate melts with implications for magmatic processes. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 337, 1-9.
- Bischoff, A., Geiger, T., Palme, H., Spettel, B., Schultz, L., Scherer, P., Loeken, T., Bland, P.,
  Clayton, R.N., Mayeda, T.K., Herpers, U., Meltzow, B., Michel, R., and Dittrich-Hannen,
  B. (1994) Acfer 217-A new member of the Rumuruti chondrite group (R). Meteoritics,
  29, 264-274.
- Bischoff, A., Vogel, N., and Roszjar, J. (2011) The Rumuruti chondrite group. Geochemistry, 71,
   101-133.
- Bouvier, L.C., Costa, M.M., Connelly, J.N., Jensen, N.K., Wielandt, D., Storey, M., Nemchin,
  A.A., Whitehouse, M.J., Snape, J.F., Bellucci, J.J., Moynier, F., Agranier, A., Gueguen,
  B., Schonbachler, M., and Bizzarro, M. (2018) Evidence for extremely rapid magma
  ocean crystallization and crust formation on Mars. Nature, 558, 586-589.
- Boyce, J.W., Kanee, S.A., McCubbin, F.M., Barnes, J.J., Bricker, H., and Treiman, A.H. (2018)
  Chlorine isotopes in the low-Ti Basalts, and the early loss of volatiles from the EarthMoon system. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 500, 205-214.
- Boyce, J.W., Tomlinson, S.M., McCubbin, F.M., Greenwood, J.P., and Treiman, A.H. (2014)
  The Lunar Apatite Paradox. Science, 344, 400-402.
- Boyce, J.W., Treiman, A.H., Guan, Y., Ma, C., Eiler, J.M., Gross, J., Greenwood, J.P., and
  Stolper, E.M. (2015) The chlorine isotope fingerprint of the lunar magma ocean. Science
  Advances, 1.
- Brearley, A.J., and Jones, R.H. (2018) Halogens in Chondritic Meteorites. In Role of Halogens in
   Terrestrial and Extraterrestrial Geochemical Processes: Surface, Crust, and Mantle, D. E.
   Harlov & L. Aranovich, Eds. Springer Geochemistry, 871-958.
- Brounce, M., Boyce, J., McCubbin, F.M., Humphreys, J., Reppart, J., Stolper, E., and Eiler, J.
  (2019) The oxidation state of sulfur in lunar apatite. American Mineralogist, 104, 307-312.
- Brown, S.M., and Elkins-Tanton, L.T. (2009) Compositions of Mercury's earliest crust from
   magma ocean models. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 286, 446-455.
- Candela, P.A. (1986) Toward a thermodynamic model for the halogens in magmatic systems an
   application to melt vapor apatite equilibria. Chemical Geology, 57, 289-301.

- Černok, A., White, L.F., Darling, J., Dunlop, J., and Anand, M. (2019) Shock-induced
   microtextures in lunar apatite and merrillite. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 54, 1262 1282.
- Clay, P.L., Burgess, R., Busemann, H., Ruzié-Hamilton, L., Joachim, B., Day, J.M.D., and
  Ballentine, C.J. (2017) Halogens in chondritic meteorites and terrestrial accretion.
  Nature, 551, 614.
- Connelly, J.N., Bizzarro, M., Krot, A.N., Nordlund, A., Wielandt, D., and Ivanova, M.A. (2012)
   The absolute chronology and thermal processing of solids in the solar protoplanetary
   disk. Science, 338, 651-655.
- Davidson, J., Wadhwa, M., Hervig, R.L., and Stephant, A. (2020) Water on Mars: Insights from
  apatite in regolith breccia Northwest Africa 7034. Earth and Planetary Science Letters,
  552, 116597.
- Davis, A.M. (2006) Volatile Evolution and Loss. In D.S. Lauretta, and H.Y. McSween, Eds.
   Meteorites and the Early Solar System II, p. 295-307. University of Arizona Press,
   Tucson.
- Deligny, C., Füri, E., and Deloule, E. (2021) Origin and timing of volatile delivery (N, H) to the
   angrite parent body: Constraints from in situ analyses of melt inclusions. Geochimica et
   Cosmochimica Acta, 313, 243-256.
- Doherty, A.L., Webster, J.D., Goldoff, B.A., and Piccoli, P.M. (2014) Partitioning behavior of
  chlorine and fluorine in felsic melt-fluid(s)-apatite systems at 50 MPa and 850-950
  degrees C. Chemical Geology, 384, 94-111.
- Dreibus, G., Kruse, H., Spettel, B., and Wänke, H. (1977) The bulk composition of the Moon
  and eucrite parent body. Proceedings of the 8th Lunar Science Conference, 8, p. 211-227.
  Lunar and Planetary Institute, Houston, TX.
- Dreibus, G., Spettel, B., and Wänke, H. (1979) Halogens in meteorites and their primordial
  abundances. Physics and Chemistry of the Earth, 11, 33-38.
- Dyl, K.A., Boyce, J.W., Guan, Y., Bland, P.A., Eiler, J.M., and Reddy, S.M. (2015) OH, Fbearing apatite, merrillite, and halogen-poor fluids in Allende (CV3). Proceedings of the
  46th Lunar and Planetary Science Conference, p. #2927. Lunar and Planetary Institute,
  Woodlands, TX.
- Elardo, S.M., Draper, D.S., and Shearer, C.K. (2011) Lunar magma ocean crystallization
   revisited: Bulk composition, early cumulate mineralogy, and the source regions of the
   highlands Mg-suite. Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta, 75, 3024-3045.
- Elkins-Tanton, L.T. (2012) Magma Oceans in the Inner Solar System. In R. Jeanloz, Ed. Annual
   Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Vol 40, 113-139.
- Elkins-Tanton, L.T., Hess, P.C., and Parmentier, E.M. (2005) Possible formation of ancient crust
   on Mars through magma ocean processes. Journal of Geophysical Research-Planets, 110,
   doi.org/10.1029/2005JE002480.
- Elkins-Tanton, L.T., Parmentier, E.M., and Hess, P.C. (2003) Magma ocean fractional
   crystallization and cumulate overturn in terrestrial planets: Implications for Mars.
   Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 38, 1753-1771.
- Elkins-Tanton, L.T., Weiss, B.P., and Zuber, M.T. (2011) Chondrites as samples of
   differentiated planetesimals. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 305, 1-10.
- Fegley, B., and Schaefer, L. (2010) Cosmochemistry, p. 347-377. Springer Berlin Heidelberg,
   Berlin, Heidelberg.

- Filiberto, J., and Dasgupta, R. (2011) Fe<sup>2+</sup>-Mg partitioning between olivine and basaltic melts:
   Applications to genesis of olivine-phyric shergottites and conditions of melting in the
   Martian interior. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 304, 527-537.
- Filiberto, J., Baratoux, D., Beaty, D., Breuer, D., Farcy, B.J., Grott, M., Jones, J.H., Kiefer, W.S.,
  Mane, P., McCubbin, F.M., and Schwenzer, S.P. (2016a) A review of volatiles in the
  Martian interior. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 51, 1935-1958.
- Filiberto, J., Gross, J., and McCubbin, F.M. (2016b) Constraints on the water, chlorine, and
   fluorine content of the Martian mantle. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 51, 2023-2035.
- Fleet, M.E., Liu, X.Y., and King, P.L. (2004) Accommodation of the carbonate ion in apatite: An
   FTIR and X-ray structure study of crystals synthesized at 2-4 GPa. American
   Mineralogist, 89, 1422-1432.
- Fuchs, L.H. (1969) The Phosphate Mineralogy of Meteorites, p. 683-695. Springer Netherlands,
   Dordrecht.
- Goldoff, B., Webster, J.D., and Harlov, D.E. (2012) Characterization of fluor-chlorapatites by
   electron probe microanalysis with a focus on time-dependent intensity variation of
   halogens. American Mineralogist, 97, 1103-1115.
- Goles, G.G., Greenland, L.P., and Jérome, D.Y. (1967) Abundances of chlorine, bromine and iodine in meteorites. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 31, 1771-1787.
- Greenland, L.P., and Lovering, J.F. (1965) Minor and trace element abundances in chondritic
   meteorites. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 29, 821-858.
- Greenwood, J.P., Itoh, S., Sakamoto, N., Warren, P., Taylor, L., and Yurimoto, H. (2011)
   Hydrogen isotope ratios in lunar rocks indicate delivery of cometary water to the Moon.
   Nature Geoscience, 4, 79-82.
- Greenwood, R.C., Franchi, I.A., Jambon, A., and Buchanan, P.C. (2005) Widespread magma
   oceans on asteroidal bodies in the early Solar System. Nature, 435, 916-918.
- Gross, J., Filiberto, J., and Bell, A.S. (2013a) Water in the martian interior: Evidence for
   terrestrial MORB mantle-like volatile contents from hydroxyl-rich apatite in olivine–
   phyric shergottite NWA 6234. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 369–370, 120-128.
- Gross, J., Treiman, A.H., Connolly, H.C., and Abreu, N. (2023) Water in Asteroids: Amphibole
   bearing R-chondrite Miller Range 11207, and implications for water-rich asteroids.
   Meteoritics & Planetary Science, In Review.
- Gross, J., Treiman, A.H., and Connolly, H.C., Jr. (2013b) A new subgroup of amphibole-bearing
  R chondrites: Evidence from the new R Chondrite MIL 11207. Proceedings of the 44th
  Lunar & Planetary Science Conference, 44, p. #2212. Lunar & Planetary Institute,
  Woodlands, TX.
- Hallis, L.J. (2017) D/H ratios of the inner solar system. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal
   Society a-Mathematical Physical and Engineering Sciences, 375.
- Hauri, E.H., Gaetani, G.A., and Green, T.H. (2006) Partitioning of water during melting of the
  Earth's upper mantle at H<sub>2</sub>O-undersaturated conditions. Earth and Planetary Science
  Letters, 248, 715-734.
- Hazen, R.M., and Morrison, S.M. (2021) An evolutionary system of mineralogy, Part V:
  Aqueous and thermal alteration of planetesimals (~4565 to 4550 Ma). American
  Mineralogist, 106, 1388-1419.
- Hirschmann, M.M., Bergin, E.A., Blake, G.A., Ciesla, F.J., and Li, J. (2021) Early volatile
  depletion on planetesimals inferred from C–S systematics of iron meteorite parent bodies.
  Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 118, e2026779118.

- Hovis, G.L., and Harlov, D.E. (2010) Solution calorimetric investigation of fluor-chlorapatite
   crystalline solutions. American Mineralogist, 95, 946-952.
- Hu, S., Lin, Y., Zhang, J., Hao, J., Xing, W., Zhang, T., Yang, W., and Changela, H. (2019)
  Ancient geologic events on Mars revealed by zircons and apatites from the Martian
  regolith breccia NWA 7034. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 54, 850-879.
- Hughes, J.M., and Rakovan, J.F. (2015) Structurally Robust, Chemically Diverse: Apatite and
   Apatite Supergroup Minerals. Elements, 11, 165-170.
- Hughes, J.M., Cameron, M., and Crowley, K.D. (1989) Structural variations in natural F, OH,
  and Cl apatites. American Mineralogist, 74, 870-876.
- -. (1990) Crystal-structures of natural ternary apatites solid-solution in the Ca<sub>5</sub>(PO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>X (X= F, OH, Cl) system. American Mineralogist, 75, 295-304.
- Jackson, C.R.M., Bennett, N.R., Du, Z., Cottrell, E., and Fei, Y. (2018) Early episodes of high pressure core formation preserved in plume mantle. Nature, 553, 491-495.
- Jones, R.H., McCubbin, F.M., Dreeland, L., Guan, Y.B., Burger, P.V., and Shearer, C.K. (2014)
  Phosphate minerals in LL chondrites: A record of the action of fluids during
  metamorphism on ordinary chondrite parent bodies. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta,
  132, 120-140.
- Jones, R.H., McCubbin, F.M., and Guan, Y. (2016) Phosphate minerals in the H group of
  ordinary chondrites, and fluid activity recorded by apatite heterogeneity in the Zag H3-6
  regolith breccia. American Mineralogist, 101, 2452-2467.
- Joy, K.H., Tartèse, R., Messenger, S., Zolensky, M.E., Marrocchi, Y., Frank, D.R., and Kring,
  D.A. (2020) The isotopic composition of volatiles in the unique Bench Crater
  carbonaceous chondrite impactor found in the Apollo 12 regolith. Earth and Planetary
  Science Letters, 540, 116265.
- Kato, F., Ozaki, H., and Ebihara, M. (2000) Distribution of halogens in an Antarctic ordinary
  chondrite, Y-74014 (H6). Antarctic Meteorite Research, 13, 121-134.
- Keller, L.P., Clark, J.C., Lewis, C.F., and Moore, C.B. (1992) Maralinga, a metamorphosed
  carbonaceous chondrite found in Australia. Meteoritics, 27, 87-91.
- Kendall-Langley, L.A., Kemp, A.I.S., Hawkesworth, C.J., Craven, J., Talavera, C., Hinton, R.,
  Roberts, M.P., and Eimf. (2021) Quantifying F and Cl concentrations in granitic melts
  from apatite inclusions in zircon. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 176, 58.
- Krot, A.N., Petaev, M.I., and Nagashima, K. (2021) Infiltration metasomatism of the Allende
   coarse-grained calcium-aluminum-rich inclusions. Progress in Earth and Planetary
   Science, 8, 61.
- Krot, A.N., Petaev, M.I., Scott, E.R.D., Choi, B.G., Zolensky, M.E., and Keil, K. (1998)
  Progressive alteration in CV3 chondrites: More evidence for asteroidal alteration.
  Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 33, 1065-1085.
- Kurat, G., Zinner, E., and Brandstatter, F. (2002) A plagioclase-olivine-spinel-magnetite
   inclusion from Maralinga (CK): Evidence for sequential condensation and solid-gas
   exchange. Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta, 66, 2959-2979.
- Langenauer, M., and Krähenbühl, U. (1993) Halogen contamination in Antarctic H5 and H6
  chondrites and relation to sites of recovery. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 120,
  431-442.
- Lee, M.R., Cohen, B.E., and King, A.J. (2019) Alkali-halogen metasomatism of the CM carbonaceous chondrites. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 54, 3052-3063.

- Lewis, J.A., and Jones, R.H. (2016) Phosphate and feldspar mineralogy of equilibrated L
   chondrites: The record of metasomatism during metamorphism in ordinary chondrite
   parent bodies. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 51, 1886-1913.
- Li, H., and Hermann, J. (2015) Apatite as an indicator of fluid salinity: An experimental study of
  chlorine and fluorine partitioning in subducted sediments. Geochimica et Cosmochimica
  Acta, 166, 267-297.
- Li, H.J., and Hermann, J. (2017) Chlorine and fluorine partitioning between apatite and sediment
   melt at 2.5 GPa, 800 °C: A new experimentally derived thermodynamic model. American
   Mineralogist, 102, 580-594.
- Li, W.R., and Costa, F. (2020) A thermodynamic model for F-Cl-OH partitioning between
  silicate melts and apatite including non-ideal mixing with application to constraining melt
  volatile budgets. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 269, 203-222.
- Li, Y., and Hsu, W. (2018) Multiple impact events on the L-chondritic parent body: Insights
  from SIMS U-Pb dating of Ca-phosphates in the NWA 7251 L-melt breccia. Meteoritics
  & Planetary Science, 53, 1081-1095.
- Lichtenberg, T., and Krijt, S. (2021) System-level Fractionation of Carbon from Disk and
   Planetesimal Processing. The Astrophysical Journal Letters, 913, L20.
- Lodders, K. (2003) Solar system abundances and condensation temperatures of the elements.
   Astrophysical Journal, 591, 1220-1247.
- Lodders, K., and Fegley, B. (1998) The Planetary Scientist's Companion. Oxford University
   Press, New York.
- Lodders, K., Palme, H., and Gail, H.-P. (2009) Abundances of the Elements in the Solar System.
  In J.E. Trümper, Ed. Landolt- Börnstein, VI/4B, p. 560-630. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- Marrocchi, Y., Bekaert, D.V., and Piani, L. (2018) Origin and abundance of water in
  carbonaceous asteroids. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 482, 23-32.
- Mason, H.E., McCubbin, F.M., Smirnov, A., and Phillips, B.L. (2009) Solid-state NMR and IR
   spectroscopic investigation of the role of structural water and F in carbonate-rich
   fluorapatite. American Mineralogist, 94, 507-516.
- Mathez, E.A., and Webster, J.D. (2005) Partitioning behavior of chlorine and fluorine in the
   system apatite-silicate melt-fluid. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 69, 1275-1286.
- McCanta, M.C., Treiman, A.H., Dyar, M.D., Alexander, C.M.O., Rumble, D., and Essene, E.J.
  (2008) The LaPaz Icefield 04840 meteorite: Mineralogy, metamorphism, and origin of an
  amphibole- and biotite-bearing R chondrite. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 72,
  5757-5780.
- McCubbin, F.M., and Barnes, J.J. (2019) Origin and abundances of H<sub>2</sub>O in the terrestrial planets,
   Moon, and asteroids. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 526, 115771.
- -. (2020) The chlorine-isotopic composition of lunar KREEP from magnesian-suite troctolite
   76535. American Mineralogist, 105, 1270-1274.
- McCubbin, F.M., and Jones, R.H. (2015) Extraterrestrial Apatite: Planetary Geochemistry to
   Astrobiology. Elements, 11, 183-188.
- McCubbin, F.M., and Ustunisik, G. (2018) Experimental investigation of F and Cl partitioning
   between apatite and Fe-rich basaltic melt at 0 GPa and 950-1050 °C: Evidence for steric
   controls on apatite-melt exchange equilibria in OH-poor apatite. American Mineralogist,
   103, 1455-1467.
- McCubbin, F.M., Barnes, J.J., Ni, P., Hui, H., Klima, R.L., Burney, D., Day, J.M.D., Magna, T.,
  Boyce, J.W., Tartese, R., Vander Kaaden, K.E., Steenstra, E.S., Elardo, S.M., Zeigler,

- R.A., Anand, M., and Liu, Y. (2022) Endogenous lunar volatiles. Reviews in Mineralogy
  & Geochemistry, in press.
- McCubbin, F.M., Boyce, J.W., Srinivasan, P., Santos, A.R., Elardo, S.M., Filiberto, J., Steele,
  A., and Shearer, C.K. (2016) Heterogeneous distribution of H<sub>2</sub>O in the martian interior:
  Implications for the abundance of H<sub>2</sub>O in depleted and enriched mantle sources.
  Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 51, 2036-2060.
- McCubbin, F.M., Kaaden, K.E.V., Tartèse, R., Klima, R.L., Liu, Y., Mortimer, J., Barnes, J.J.,
  Shearer, C.K., Treiman, A.H., Lawrence, D.J., Elardo, S.M., Hurley, D.M., Boyce, J.W.,
  and Anand, M. (2015a) Magmatic volatiles (H, C, N, F, S, Cl) in the lunar mantle, crust,
  and regolith: Abundances, distributions, processes, and reservoirs. American
  Mineralogist, 100, 1668-1707.
- McCubbin, F.M., Lewis, J.A., Barnes, J.J., Elardo, S.M., and Boyce, J.W. (2021) The
  abundances of F, Cl, and H<sub>2</sub>O in eucrites: Implications for the origin of volatile depletion
  in the asteroid 4 Vesta. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 314, 270-293.
- McCubbin, F.M., Riner, M.A., Vander Kaaden, K.E., and Burkemper, L.K. (2012) Is Mercury a
   volatile-rich planet? Geophysical Research Letters, 39.
- McCubbin, F.M., Steele, A., Nekvasil, H., Schnieders, A., Rose, T., Fries, M., Carpenter, P.K.,
  and Jolliff, B.L. (2010) Detection of structurally bound hydroxyl in fluorapatite from
  Apollo mare basalt 15058,128 using TOF-SIMS. American Mineralogist, 95, 1141-1150.
- McCubbin, F.M., Vander Kaaden, K.E., Tartèse, R., Boyce, J.W., Mikhail, S., Whitson, E.S.,
  Bell, A.S., Anand, M., Franchi, I.A., Wang, J.H., and Hauri, E.H. (2015b) Experimental
  investigation of F, Cl, and OH partitioning between apatite and Fe-rich basaltic melt at
  1.0-1.2 GPa and 950-1000 °C. American Mineralogist, 100, 1790-1802.
- McDonough, W.F., and Sun, S.S. (1995) The composition of the Earth. Chemical Geology, 120,
   223-253.
- Meurer, W.P., and Natland, J.H. (2001) Apatite compositions from oceanic cumulates with
   implications for the evolution of mid-ocean ridge magmatic systems. Journal of
   Volcanology and Geothermal Research, 110, 281-298.
- O'Leary, J.A., Gaetani, G.A., and Hauri, E.H. (2010) The effect of tetrahedral Al(3+) on the
   partitioning of water between clinopyroxene and silicate melt. Earth and Planetary
   Science Letters, 297, 111-120.
- Palme, H., and Beer, H. (1993) Abundances of the Elements in the Solar System. In H.H. Voigt,
  Ed. Landolt-Börnstein, Group VI: Astronomy and Astrophysics, p. 196-221. Springer,
  Berlin.
- Palme, H., and Jones, A. (2003) Solar system abundances of the elements. In H. Holland, and
  K.K. Turekian, Eds. Treatise on Geochemistry, 1, p. 41-41. Elsevier, New York.
- Palme, H., and Zipfel, J. (2021) The composition of CI chondrites and their contents of chlorine
  and bromine: Results from instrumental neutron activation analysis. Meteoritics &
  Planetary Science, 57, 317-333.
- Palme, H., Lodders, K., and Jones, A. (2014) Solar System Abundances of the Elements. In A.M.
  Davis, Ed. Planets, Asteriods, Comets and The Solar System, p. 15-36.
- Palme, H., Suess, H.E., and Zeh, H.D. (1981) Abundances of the elements in the Solar System.
  In K.-H. Hellwege, Ed. Landolt-Bornstein, Group VI: Astronomy, Astrophysic, Extension and Supplement 1, Subvolume A, p. 257-272. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.

- Pan, Y.M., and Fleet, M.E. (2002) Compositions of the apatite-group minerals: Substitution
   mechanisms and controlling factors. Phosphates: Geochemical, Geobiological, and
   Materials Importance, 48, p. 13-49.
- Pasek, M.A. (2019) Phosphorus volatility in the early solar nebula. Icarus, 317, 59-65.
- Patiño Douce, A.E., and Roden, M.F. (2006) Apatite as a probe of halogen and water fugacities
  in the terrestrial planets. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 70, 3173-3196.
- Patiño Douce, A.E., Roden, M.F., Chaumba, J., Fleisher, C., and Yogodzinski, G. (2011)
  Compositional variability of terrestrial mantle apatites, thermodynamic modeling of
  apatite volatile contents, and the halogen and water budgets of planetary mantles.
  Chemical Geology, 288, 14-31.
- Patrick, D.R., and Martine, C. (2015) The etymology of the mineral name "Apatite": A clarification. Irish Journal of Earth Sciences, 33, 71-75.
- Piani, L., and Marrocchi, Y. (2018) Hydrogen isotopic composition of water in CV-type
   carbonaceous chondrites. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 504, 64-71.
- Piani, L., Marrocchi, Y., Rigaudier, T., Vacher, L.G., Thomassin, D., and Marty, B. (2020)
  Earth's water may have been inherited from material similar to enstatite chondrite
  meteorites. Science, 369, 1110-1113.
- Piani, L., Robert, F., and Remusat, L. (2015) Micron-scale D/H heterogeneity in chondrite
  matrices: A signature of the pristine solar system water? Earth and Planetary Science
  Letters, 415, 154-164.
- Piani, L., Yurimoto, H., and Remusat, L. (2018) A dual origin for water in carbonaceous asteroids revealed by CM chondrites. Nature Astronomy, 2, 317-323.
- Piccoli, P.M., and Candela, P.A. (2002) Apatite in igneous systems. Phosphates: Geochemical,
   Geobiological, and Materials Importance, 48, p. 255-292.
- Piralla, M., Tartèse, R., Marrocchi, Y., and Joy, K.H. (2021) Apatite halogen and hydrogen isotope constraints on the conditions of hydrothermal alteration in carbonaceous chondrites. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 56, 809-828.
- Potts, N.J., Bromiley, G.D., and Brooker, R.A. (2021) An experimental investigation of F, Cl and
   H2O mineral-melt partitioning in a reduced, model lunar system. Geochimica et
   Cosmochimica Acta, 294, 232-254.
- Reed, G.W., and Allen, R.O. (1966) Halogens in chondrites. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta,
   30, 779-800.
- Righter, K., and Drake, M.J. (1996) Core formation in Earth's Moon, Mars, and Vesta. Icarus,
  124, 513-529.
- -. (1997) A magma ocean on Vesta: Core formation and petrogenesis of eucrites and diogenites.
   Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 32, 929-944.
- Righter, K., and Neff, K.E. (2007) Temperature and oxygen fugacity constraints on CK and R
   chondrites and implications for water and oxidation in the early solar system. Polar
   Science, 1, 25-44.
- Riker, J., Humphreys, M.C.S., Brooker, R.A., De Hoog, J.C.M., and EIMF. (2018) First
   measurements of OH-C exchange and temperature-dependent partitioning of OH and
   halogens in the system apatite silicate melt. American Mineralogist, 103, 260-270.
- Riner, M.A., Lucey, P.G., Desch, S.J., and McCubbin, F.M. (2009) Nature of opaque
   components on Mercury: Insights into a Mercurian magma ocean. Geophysical Research
   Letters, 36.

- Roeder, P.L., and Emslie, R.F. (1970) Olivine-liquid equilibrium. Contributions to Mineralogy
  and Petrology, 29, 275-289.
- Rubie, D.C., Frost, D.J., Mann, U., Asahara, Y., Nimmo, F., Tsuno, K., Kegler, P., Holzheid, A.,
  and Palme, H. (2011) Heterogeneous accretion, composition and core-mantle
  differentiation of the Earth. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 301, 31-42.
- Rubin, A.E. (1993) Magnetite-sulfide chondrules and nodules in CK carbonaceous chondrites:
   Implications for the timing of CK oxidation. Meteoritics, 28, 130-135.
- 1006 -. (1997) Mineralogy of meteorite groups. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 32, 231-247.
- Rubin, A.E., and Kallemeyn, G.W. (1994) Pecora Escarpment 91002: A member of the new
   Rumuruti (R) chondrite group. Meteoritics, 29, 255-264.
- Sarafian, A.R., Hauri, E.H., McCubbin, F.M., Lapen, T.J., Berger, E.L., Nielsen, S.G.,
  Marschall, H.R., Gaetani, G.A., Righter, K., and Sarafian, E. (2017a) Early accretion of
  water and volatile elements to the inner Solar System: Evidence from angrites.
  Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and
  Engineering Sciences, 375.
- Sarafian, A.R., John, T., Roszjar, J., and Whitehouse, M.J. (2017b) Chlorine and hydrogen
   degassing in Vesta's magma ocean. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 459, 311-319.
- Sarafian, A.R., Nielsen, S.G., Marschall, H.R., McCubbin, F.M., and Monteleone, B.D. (2014)
   Early accretion of water in the inner solar system from a carbonaceous chondrite-like
   source. Science, 346, 623-626.
- Sarafian, A.R., Roden, M.F., and Patino-Douce, A.E. (2013) The volatile content of Vesta: Clues
   from apatite in eucrites. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 48, 2135-2154.
- Schettler, G., Gottschalk, M., and Harlov, D.E. (2011) A new semi-micro wet chemical method
   for apatite analysis and its application to the crystal chemistry of fluorapatite-chlorapatite
   solid solutions. American Mineralogist, 96, 138-152.
- Schulze, H., Bischoff, A., Palme, H., Spettel, B., Dreibus, G., and Otto, J. (1994) Mineralogy and
   chemistry of Rumuruti: The first meteorite fall of the new R chondrite group. Meteoritics,
   29, 275-286.
- Sharp, Z.D., and Draper, D.S. (2013) The chlorine abundance of Earth: Implications for a habitable planet. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 369-370, 71-77.
- Sharp, Z.D., McCubbin, F.M., and Shearer, C.K. (2013) A hydrogen-based oxidation mechanism
   relevant to planetary formation. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 380, 88-97.
- Smith, A., Hallis, L.J., Nagashima, K., and Huss, G.R. (2020) Volatile abundances and hydrogen
   isotope ratios of apatite in Martian basaltic breccia NWA 11522—A paired stone of
   NWA 7034. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 55, 2587-2598.
- Srinivasan, P., McCubbin, F.M., Lapen, T.J., Righter, M., and Agee, C.B. (2017) Reassessing the
   formation of CK7 Northwest Africa (NWA) 8186. Proceedings of the 48th Lunar &
   Planetary Science Conference, p. #1995. Lunar and Planetary Institute, Woodlands, TX.
- Stephant, A., Wadhwa, M., Hervig, R., Bose, M., Zhao, X., Barrett, T.J., Anand, M., and
  Franchi, I.A. (2021) A deuterium-poor water reservoir in the asteroid 4 Vesta and the
  inner solar system. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 297, 203-219.
- Stock, M.J., Humphreys, M.C.S., Smith, V.C., Johnson, R.D., Pyle, D.M., and Eimf. (2015) New
  constraints on electron-beam induced halogen migration in apatite. American
  Mineralogist, 100, 281-293.
- Stolper, E. (1977) Experimental petrology of eucritic meteorites. Geochimica et Cosmochimica
   Acta, 41, 587-611.

- Stormer, J.C., Pierson, M.L., and Tacker, R.C. (1993) Variation of F-X-ray and Cl-X-ray
  intensity due to anisotropic diffusion in apatite during electron-microprobe analysis.
  American Mineralogist, 78, 641-648.
- Sutton, S., Alexander, C.M.O.D., Bryant, A., Lanzirotti, A., Newville, M., and Cloutis, E.A.
  (2017) The bulk valence state of Fe and the origin of water in chondrites. Geochimica Et
  Cosmochimica Acta, 211, 115-132.
- Tartèse, R., Anand, M., Barnes, J.J., Starkey, N.A., Franchi, I.A., and Sano, Y. (2013) The abundance, distribution, and isotopic composition of Hydrogen in the Moon as revealed by basaltic lunar samples: implications for the volatile inventory of the Moon. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 122, 58-74.
- Tartèse, R., Anand, M., and Franchi, I.A. (2019) H and Cl isotope characteristics of indigenous
  and late hydrothermal fluids on the differentiated asteroidal parent body of Grave
  Nunataks 06128. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 266, 529-543.
- Taylor, G.J., Keil, K., McCoy, T., Haack, H., and Scott, E.R.D. (1993) Asteroid differentiation:
   Pyroclastic volcanism to magma oceans. Meteoritics, 28, 34-52.
- Toplis, M.J. (2005) The thermodynamics of iron and magnesium partitioning between olivine
   and liquid: criteria for assessing and predicting equilibrium in natural and experimental
   systems. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 149, 22-39.
- Ustunisik, G., Nekvasil, H., and Lindsley, D.H. (2011) Differential degassing of H<sub>2</sub>O, Cl, F, and
   S: Potential effects on lunar apatite American Mineralogist, 96, 1650-1653.
- Ustunisik, G., Nekvasil, H., Lindsley, D.H., and McCubbin, F.M. (2015) Degassing pathways of
   Cl-, F-, H-, and S-bearing magmas near the lunar surface: Implications for the
   composition and Cl isotopic values of lunar apatite. American Mineralogist, 100, 1717 1727.
- Vacher, L.G., Piani, L., Rigaudier, T., Thomassin, D., Florin, G., Piralla, M., and Marrocchi, Y.
  (2020) Hydrogen in chondrites: Influence of parent body alteration and atmospheric
  contamination on primordial components. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 281, 5366.
- 1073 Velbel, M.A., and Zolensky, M.E. (2021) Thermal metamorphism of CM chondrites: A
   1074 dehydroxylation-based peak-temperature thermometer and implications for sample return
   1075 from asteroids Ryugu and Bennu. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 56, 546-585.
- Walton, C.R., Baziotis, I., Černok, A., Ferrière, L., Asimow, P.D., Shorttle, O., and Anand, M.
   (2021) Microtextures in the Chelyabinsk impact breccia reveal the history of Phosphorus-Olivine-Assemblages in chondrites. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 56, 742-766.
- Ward, D., Bischoff, A., Roszjar, J., Berndt, J., and Whitehouse, M.J. (2017) Trace element
   inventory of meteoritic Ca-phosphates. American Mineralogist, 102, 1856-1880.
- Wasson, J.T., and Kallemeyn, G.W. (1988) Compositions of chondrites. Philosophical
   Transactions of the Royal Society of London A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering
   Sciences, 325, 535-544.
- Webster, J.D. (1997) Chloride solubility in felsic melts and the role of chloride in magmatic
   degassing. Journal of Petrology, 38, 1793-1807.
- -. (2004) The exsolution of magmatic hydrosaline chloride liquids. Chemical Geology, 210(1-4),
   33-48.
- 1088 Webster, J.D., and De Vivo, B. (2002) Experimental and modeled solubilities of chlorine in
   1089 aluminosilicate melts, consequences of magma evolution, and implications for exsolution

1090 1091	of hydrous chloride melt at Mt. Somma-Vesuvius. American Mineralogist, 87, 1046-
1002	Webster ID and Piccoli P.M. (2015) Magmatic Anatite: A Powerful Vet Decentive Mineral
1092	Flements 11 177-182
1093	Webster ID and Rebbert C. R. (1008) Experimental investigation of H-O and Cl <sup>-</sup> solubilities in
1094	E anriched giliagta liquida implications for veletile saturation of tanga rhyalita magnes
1095	Contributions to Mineral and Detrology 122, 108, 207
1090	Webster LD Coldoff D A Elevel D N Nedeev D A and Silbert 7 W (2017) Hydrowyl Cl.
1097	webster, J.D., Goldon, B.A., Flesch, K.N., Nadeau, F.A., and Shbert, Z.W. (2017) Hydroxyl, Cl, and E partitioning between high gilies revealitie malte anotic fluid(g) at 50 200 MDs and
1098	700 1000 dogroop C. American Minanologist 102 61 74
1099	Webster LD Kingler D L and Mathez E A (1000) Chlorida and water solvhility in baselt and
1100	webster, J.D., Kinzler, R.J., and Mathez, E.A. (1999) Chloride and water solubility in basalt and
1101	andesite mens and implications for magmatic degassing. Geochimica et Cosmochimica
1102	Acta, $03$ , $729-738$ . Webster LD. Tenner C.M. and Mandarille C.W. (2000) Destitioning hebridge of alloging and
1103	webster, J.D., Tappen, C.M., and Mandeville, C.W. (2009) Partitioning benavior of chlorine and
1104	fluorine in the system apatite-melt-fluid. II: Felsic silicate systems at 200 MPa.
1105	Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 73, 559-581.
1106	Weisberg, M.K., Prinz, M., Kojima, H., Yanai, K., Clayton, R.N., and Mayeda, T.K. (1991) The
1107	Carlisle Lakes-type chondrites: A new grouplet with high $\Delta I/O$ and evidence for nebular
1108	oxidation. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 55, 2657-2669.
1109	Weiss, B.P., Berdahl, J.S., Elkins-Tanton, L., Stanley, S., Lima, E.A., and Carporzen, L. (2008)
1110	Magnetism on the Angrite Parent Body and the Early Differentiation of Planetesimals.
1111	Science, 322, 713-716.
1112	Williams, J.T., Shearer, C.K., Sharp, Z.D., Burger, P.V., McCubbin, F.M., Santos, A.R., Agee,
1113	C.B., and McKeegan, K.D. (2016) The chlorine isotopic composition of martian
1114	meteorites Part 1: Chlorine isotope composition of martian mantle and crustal reservoirs
1115	and their interactions. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 51, 2092-2110.
1116	Wood, B.J., Smythe, D.J., and Harrison, T. (2019) The condensation temperatures of the
1117	elements: A reappraisal. American Mineralogist, 104, 844-856.
1118	Wood, B.J., Walter, M.J., and Wade, J. (2006) Accretion of the Earth and segregation of its core.
1119	Nature, 441, 825-833.
1120	Wu, Y., and Hsu, W. (2019) Petrogenesis and in situ U-Pb geochronology of a strongly shocked
1121	L-melt rock Northwest Africa 11042. Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets, 124,
1122	893-909.
1123	Zanda, B., Bourot-Denise, M., Perron, C., and Hewins, R.H. (1994) Origin and metamorphic
1124	redistribution of silicon, chromium, and phosphorus in the metal of chondrites. Science,
1125	265, 1846-1849.
1126	Zhang, AC., and Yurimoto, H. (2013) Petrography and mineralogy of the ungrouped type 3
1127	carbonaceous chondrite Dar al Gani 978. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 48, 1651-
1128	1677.
1129	Zhang, AC., Li, QL., Yurimoto, H., Sakamoto, N., Li, XH., Hu, S., Lin, YT., and Wang,
1130	RC. (2016) Young asteroidal fluid activity revealed by absolute age from apatite in
1131	carbonaceous chondrite. Nature Communications, 7, 12844.
1132	Zhu, C., and Sverjensky, D.A. (1991) Partitioning of F-Cl-OH between minerals and
1133	hydrothermal fluids. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 55, 1837-1858.
1134	

## 1135

## **Figure Captions**

Figure 1. High-resolution back-scattered electron images of apatite from chondrites a) Parnallee
(LL3.6) b) LAP 04840 (R5) c) PCA 91002 (R3.8-6) d) Karoonda (CK4) e) DAV 92300 (CK4) f)
Maralinga (CK4). All phases present are identified, and the phase abbreviations are indicated as
follows: Amp = amphibole, An = anorthite, Ap = apatite, Bt = biotite, Chr = chromite, Cpx =
clinopyroxene, Fas = fassaite, Mag = magnetite, Opx = orthopyroxene, Ol = olivine, Pl =
plagioclase, Pn = pentlandite, Po = pyrrhotite, Spl = spinel.

1142

Figure 2. Ternary plot of apatite X-site components (mol%) from all chondrites analyzed in the 1143 present study (data points in color) as well as from the literature (data points in gray and/or 1144 black; Dyl et al., 2015; Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; Li and Hsu, 1145 2018; McCanta et al., 2008; Piralla et al., 2021; Ward et al., 2017; Wu and Hsu, 2019; Zhang et 1146 al., 2016; Zhang and Yurimoto, 2013). The missing component was calculated based on 1 - F - F1147 Cl = missing component. All new data plotted in the ternary are tabulated in Tables S1–S14, and 1148 all published data, along with their corresponding sources, are listed in Table S15. IM – impact 1149 melt. 1150

1151

Figure 3. Bulk rock F and Cl mass abundances for various chondrite meteorite groups based on literature data compilations (Dreibus et al., 1979; Lodders and Fegley, 1998; Palme et al., 2014; Palme and Zipfel, 2021; Wasson and Kallemeyn, 1988). Abundance of F in EL (white symbol) was estimated by the slope of a linear regression through the F and Cl data for the other chondrites in the plot.

1157

Figure 4. Ternary plots of apatite X-site components (mol%), a) Plot showing the Cl/F ratio of 1158 the solar system (orange wedge) and Cl/F ratio of initial apatite that would crystallize from a 1159 silicate melt with a chondritic Cl/F ratio (turquoise wedge) superimposed on the apatite X-site 1160 compositions from chondrites (gray symbols with chondrite types indicated by legend) from 1161 Figure 2, exclusive of apatite from chondrite samples known to be affected by impact melting. 1162 The dotted line represents an empirically determined limit on F occupancy in chondrite apatite 1163 exclusive of samples known to be affected by impact melting. b) Plot showing the Cl/F ratio of 1164 the solar system (orange wedge) superimposed on the apatite X-site compositions from 1165 chondrites (gray symbols with chondrite types indicated by legend in panel a) from Figure 2, 1166 inclusive of samples known to be affected by impact melting (yellow symbols). The dotted line 1167 near  $\sim 30\%$  F is the same one that appears in panel a and represents an empirically determined 1168 limit on F occupancy in chondrite apatite exclusive of samples known to be affected by impact 1169 melting. A second dotted line represents an empirically determined limit on F occupancy in 1170 chondrite apatite inclusive of samples known to be affected by impact melting. c) Model for 1171 using apatite to understand volatile depletion or differentiation of samples from achondrite<sup>‡</sup> 1172 1173 parent bodies on the basis of their apatite X-site compositions. The turquoise wedge is the same wedge from panel a and represents the Cl/F ratio of initial apatite that would crystallize from a 1174 silicate melt with a chondritic Cl/F ratio. Apatite that plots below that wedge (dark green region) 1175 indicates apatite that formed through equilibrium or fractional crystallization<sup>\*</sup> from a melt or 1176 partial melt derived from a volatile depleted source or a differentiated source with volatile 1177 abundances controlled by the F and Cl partitioning relationships between nominally volatile-free 1178 1179 minerals (NVFM) and silicate melt. Apatite that plots above the turquoise wedge (dark blue

region) indicates equilibrium or fractional crystallization from a melt or partial melt derived from 1180 a chondritic source (i.e., not volatile depleted) that has not undergone prior melting. \*Fractional 1181 crystallization can cause apatite to evolve into and beyond the chondritic apatite wedge even if 1182 the initial apatite compositions would plot below the wedge (Boyce et al., 2014; McCubbin et al., 1183 2016), so caution must be used for samples with petrogenetic histories that may have included 1184 fractional crystallization where apatite was part of the fractionating assemblage. <sup>‡</sup>Achondrite 1185 parent bodies, exclusive of primitive achondrites. d) Plot showing the empirically determined 1186 boundaries for apatite compositions in chondrite meteorites. The Cl/F ratio of the solar system 1187 (orange wedge) is superimposed on the empirically determined field of apatite compositions that 1188 arise from either nebular condensation or endogenous parent body processes exclusive of melting 1189 (purple field). The field between the two dotted lines is the empirically determined range of 1190 apatite compositions that have arisen through partial melting by impacts (light blue field). The 1191 white field represents the portion of apatite X-site ternary space where apatite compositions have 1192 not been reported. The two dotted lines are the same ones that appear in panel b and define the 1193 empirically-determined boundaries discussed in this panel. 1194

1195

1196

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>i</sup> Fegley and Schafer (2010) report a 50% condensation temperature of 420 K for Cl because only ~38% of Cl is condensed at 470 K as chlorapatite, and 50% condensation is reached at 420 K during the formation of halite.

**Table 1**. List of inner solar system chondrite samples in which apatite was analyzed during this study, including apatite data published in previous studies (Jones et al., 2014; Jones et al., 2016; Lewis and Jones, 2016; Li and Hsu, 2018; McCanta et al., 2008; Ward et al., 2017; Wu and Hsu, 2019). The class, group, and petrologic type of each sample along with average structural occupancies of fluorine, chlorine, and hydroxyl in the apatite X-site from each sample are provided. All data are provided in Tables S1–S7 and Table S15.

Name	Class	Group & Type	Avg. F <sup>a</sup> in X-site	Avg. Cl in X-site	Avg. missing in X-site <sup>b</sup>	
Devgaon		H3.8	0.14 (2)	0.81 (3)	0.05 (4)	
Ybbsitz		H4	0.15 (6)	0.73 (3)	0.12 (4)	
Avanhandava		H4	0.16 (2)	0.80 (2)	0.04 (2)	
Zag		H4 Matrix	0.05 (2)	0.87 (3)	0.09 (2)	
Richardton		Н5	0.09 (3)	0.90 (3)	0.01 (2)	
Oro Grande		Н5	0.21 (3)	0.73 (3)	0.05 (2)	
Estacado		H6	H6 0.11 (3)		0.08 (4)	
Portales Valley		H6 0.08 (3) 0.81 (2)		0.81 (2)	0.11 (1)	
Zag		H6-1 Clast 0.39 (9) 0.54 (8)		0.54 (8)	0.07 (2)	
Zag		H6-2 Clast	0.07 (5)	0.84 (6)	0.09 (2)	
Kendleton		L3 Clast	0.14 (3)	0.73 (6)	0.13 (3)	
Santa Barbara		L4	0.12 (2)	0.78 (3)	0.10 (4)	
Kendleton	Ordinary	L4 Matrix	0.31 (4)	0.57 (3)	0.12 (5)	
NWA 7251	Chondrites	L4 Host	0.19 (5)	0.70 (5)	0.11 (5)	
Elenovka		L5	0.14 (4)	0.78 (3)	0.08 (2)	
Kendleton		L5 Clast	0.16 (3)	0.74 (3)	0.10 (3)	
Bruderheim		L6	0.15 (4)	0.76 (4)	0.09 (3)	
Villalbeto de la Peña		L6	0.21 (4)	0.75 (5)	0.05 (6)	
NWA 7251		L Melt Clasts	0.3 (2)	0.6 (2)	0.1 (1)	
NWA 11042		L Melt Rock	0.2 (2)	0.7 (2)	0.1 (1)	
Parnallee		LL3.6	0.16 (2)	0.75 (1)	0.10(2)	
Bo Xian		LL3.9	0.19 (2)	0.68 (5)	0.13 (5)	
Bjurböle		L/LL4	0.14 (4)	0.71 (6)	0.16 (5)	
Tuxtuac		LL5	0.22 (4)	0.60 (3)	0.19 (3)	
St. Séverin		LL6	0.19 (6)	0.62 (7)	0.19 (3)	
Adzhi-Bogdo		LL3-6	0.05 (1)	0.88 (4)	0.08 (4)	
PRE 95410		R3	0.12 (3)	0.7(1)	0.2 (1)	
ALH 85151		R3.6	0.12(3) 0.09(4)	0.7(1)	0.2(1)	
PCA 91002	Rumuruti	R3.8-6	0.11 (5)	0.7 (1)	0.2 (1)	
LAP 03639	Chondrites	R4	0.18(3)	0.67 (8)	0.15 (9)	
LAP 04840	_	R5	0.00(1)	0.29(1)	0.70(1)	
MIL 11207		R6	0.06 (4)	0.29(1)	0.65 (5)	

All parenthetical values represent 1-sigma standard deviation of the mean (10SDOM)

<sup>a</sup>If X-site sum exceeds 1 sfu, F was computed assuming  $X_F = 1 - X_{C1}$ 

<sup>b</sup>Missing component computed based on stoichiometry assuming  $X_{Missing} = 1 - (X_F + X_{CI})$  unless otherwise noted

**Table 2**. List of outer solar system chondrite samples from which apatite was analyzed during this study, including apatite data published in previous studies (Dyl et al., 2015; Piralla et al., 2021; Zhang et al., 2016; Zhang and Yurimoto, 2013). The class, group, and petrologic type of each sample along with average structural occupancies of fluorine, chlorine, and hydroxyl in the apatite X-site from each sample are provided. All data are provided in Tables S8–S15.

Name Class		Group & Type	Avg. F <sup>a</sup> in X-site	Avg. Cl in X-site	Avg. missing in X-site <sup>b</sup>
Karoonda		CK4	0.09 (5)	0.7 (1)	0.23 (9)
DAV 92300	<u>er</u>	CK4	0.13 (3)	0.6 (1)	0.3 (1)
Maralinga		CK4 Anomalous	0.06 (4)	0.6 (2)	0.4 (1)
Maralinga CAI	CK Chondrites	CK4 Anomalous	0.04 (3)	0.7 (2)	0.2 (1)
EET 87507	chondrites	CK5	0.14 (3)	0.6 (1)	0.3 (1)
LAR 06872		CK6	0.13 (4)	0.6 (1)	0.3 (1)
NWA 8186		CK7	0.08 (4)	0.73 (6)	0.19 (5)
Boriskino	0.1	CM2	0.07 (2)	0.003 (2)	0.93 (2)
Allende	Other	CV3	0.22 (5)	0.07 (6)	0.71 (6)
DaG 978	Chondrites	C3	0.05 (4)	0.78 (7)	0.17 (6)
Bench Crater		C1	0.23 (5)	0.006 (2)	0.76 (5)

All parenthetical values represent 1-sigma standard deviation of the mean ( $1\sigma$ SDOM)

<sup>a</sup>If X-site sum exceeds 1 sfu, F was computed assuming  $X_F = 1 - X_{Cl}$ 

<sup>b</sup>Missing component computed based on stoichiometry assuming  $X_{Missing} = 1 - (X_F + X_{CI})$  unless otherwise noted

	LL Chondrites			R Chondrites			
Oxide	Parnallee	LAP 04840	MIL 11207	ALH 85151	PCA 91002	PRE 95410	LAP 03639
P <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub>	41.0 (3)	42.1 (4)	41.6 (8)	41.7 (5)	41.6 (5)	41.8 (6)	40.7 (5)
$SiO_2$	n.d.	0.1 (2)	0.04 (4)	0.1 (2)	0.1 (1)	0.07 (8)	0.1 (3)
$Ce_2O_3$	0.02 (2)	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.
$Y_2O_3$	0.01 (1)	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.
FeO	0.5 (3)	0.7 (5)	0.5 (2)	0.5 (4)	0.6 (3)	1.0 (6)	1.1 (3)
MnO	n.d.	0.06(1)	0.04 (2)	0.02(1)	0.02 (2)	0.02(1)	0.03 (1)
MgO	0.07 (5)	0.13 (4)	0.16 (2)	0.04 (5)	0.11 (8)	0.03 (4)	0.09 (9)
CaO	52.5 (7)	52.9 (9)	55.7 (9)	53.0 (6)	53.1 (6)	52.9 (8)	52 (1)
Na <sub>2</sub> O	0.47 (3)	0.14 (8)	0.14 (5)	0.43 (7)	0.42 (5)	0.44 (2)	0.45 (3)
F	0.57(7)	0.02 (3)	0.2 (2)	0.3 (1)	0.4 (2)	0.4 (1)	0.6(1)
Cl	5.1 (1)	2.02 (8)	2.07 (7)	4.9 (8)	5.0 (9)	4.8 (9)	4.6 (5)
S	n.d.	0.01 (1)	0.01 (1)	0.03 (4)	0.06 (5)	0.06 (8)	0.10(7)
$-O \equiv F + Cl + S$	1.39	0.47	0.56	1.26	1.33	1.30	1.34
Total	98.85	97.71	99.90	99.76	100.08	100.22	98.43
N	18	42	30	26	25	19	19
		Stru	ctural formulae	based on 13 anic	ons		
Р	3.01	3.03	2.94	3.02	3.01	3.02	2.99
Si	-	0.01	0.00	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.01
Ce	0.00	-	-	-	-	-	-
Y	0.00	-	-	-	-	-	-
Fe	0.04	0.05	0.03	0.04	0.05	0.07	0.08
Mn	-	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Mg	0.01	0.02	0.02	0.01	0.02	0.00	0.01
Ca	4.87	4.82	5.07	4.85	4.85	4.84	4.88
Na	0.08	0.02	0.02	0.07	0.07	0.07	0.08
$\sum Cations$	8.01	7.96	8.08	8.00	8.01	8.01	8.05
$\mathrm{F}^{\mathrm{a}}$	0.16	0.00	0.06	0.09	0.11	0.12	0.18
Cl	0.75	0.29	0.29	0.71	0.72	0.69	0.67
S	-	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.01	0.01	0.02
$OH^{\mathfrak{b}}$	0.09	0.70	0.65	0.2	0.16	0.18	0.14
$\sum Anions$	1.00	0.99	1.00	1.01	1.00	1.00	1.01

**Table 3.** Average electron microprobe analyses of apatite analyzed in inner solar system chondrites. All individual analyses from which the mean apatite composition was computed for each sample are reported in Tables S1–S7.

N – number of analyses

- signifies that a value was not computed

*n.d.* – abundance was not determined

All parenthetical values represent 1-sigma standard deviation of the mean (1 $\sigma$ SDOM)

<sup>a</sup>If sum of  $X_F$  and  $X_{CI}$  exceeds 1 sfu, F was computed assuming  $X_F = 1 - X_{CI}$ .

<sup>b</sup>Calculated assuming that  $X_F + X_{Cl} + X_{OH} = 1$  sfu

Table 4. Average electron microprobe analyses of apatite analyzed in outer solar system chondrites. All individual analyses from

which the mean apatite composition was computed for each sample are reported in Tables S8–S14.

	CK Chondrites						CAI in
Oxide	Karoonda	NWA 8186	DAV 92300	EET 87507	LAR 06872	Maralinga	Maralinga
P <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub>	41.4 (6)	41.5 (5)	42.0 (4)	41.3 (8)	41.4 (6)	41.5 (5)	41.3 (4)
$SiO_2$	0.1 (2)	0.3 (1)	0.1 (2)	0.5 (5)	0.4 (4)	0.1 (2)	0.1 (2)
$Ce_2O_3$	0.02(1)	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.
$Y_2O_3$	0.00(0)	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.	n.d.
FeO	0.9 (6)	0.3 (2)	0.4 (3)	1.1 (2)	1.4 (2)	1.1 (4)	0.5 (3)
MnO	0.05 (2)	n.d.	0.02(1)	0.02(1)	0.01 (1)	0.02(1)	0.02 (3)
MgO	0.09 (9)	0.02(7)	0.02(7)	0.2 (2)	0.2 (2)	0.0(1)	0.03 (7)
CaO	53.2 (6)	53.4 (8)	53.6 (3)	53.0 (9)	53.3 (7)	52.8 (6)	52.6 (6)
Na <sub>2</sub> O	0.16 (2)	0.52 (7)	0.31 (2)	0.32 (3)	0.36 (4)	0.33 (2)	0.34 (2)
F	0.3 (2)	0.3 (2)	0.5 (1)	0.5 (1)	0.5 (2)	0.2 (1)	0.1 (1)
Cl	4.7 (8)	5.0 (4)	4.1 (8)	3.9 (8)	4(1)	4 (1)	5(1)
S	0.06 (6)	n.d.	0.02 (2)	0.07 (5)	0.1 (2)	0.02 (2)	0.01 (1)
$-O \equiv F + Cl + S$	1.20	1.26	1.13	1.12	1.13	1.00	1.18
Total	<b>99.78</b>	100.08	99.94	<b>99.79</b>	100.54	<b>99.07</b>	<b>98.82</b>
N	21	46	45	23	18	35	93
		Stru	ictural formulae	based on 13 ani	ons		
Р	3.00	3.00	3.02	2.98	2.97	3.01	3.02
Si	0.01	0.02	0.01	0.04	0.04	0.01	0.01
Ce	0.00	-	-	-	-	-	-
Y	0.00	-	-	-	-	-	-
Fe	0.06	0.03	0.03	0.08	0.10	0.08	0.04
Mn	0.00	-	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Mg	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.03	0.03	0.01	0.00
Ca	4.89	4.88	4.88	4.84	4.84	4.85	4.86
Na	0.03	0.09	0.05	0.05	0.06	0.06	0.06
$\sum Cations$	8.00	8.02	7.99	8.02	8.04	8.02	<b>7.99</b>
$F^{a}$	0.09	0.08	0.13	0.14	0.13	0.06	0.04
Cl	0.68	0.73	0.59	0.56	0.56	0.58	0.72
S	0.01	-	0.00	0.01	0.02	0.00	0.00
$OH^b$	0.22	0.19	0.29	0.29	0.30	0.36	0.24
$\sum Anions$	1.00	1.00	1.01	1.00	1.01	1.00	1.00

N – number of analyses

- signifies that a value was not computed

n.d. – abundance was not determined

All parenthetical values represent 1-sigma standard deviation of the mean ( $1\sigma$ SDOM)

<sup>a</sup>If sum of  $X_F$  and  $X_{Cl}$  exceeds 1 sfu, F was computed assuming  $X_F = 1 - X_{Cl}$ .

 $^{b}\text{Calculated}$  assuming that  $X_{F}+X_{Cl}+X_{OH}$  = 1 sfu



Always consult and cite the final, published document. See http://www.minsocam.org or GeoscienceWorld



This is the peer-reviewed, final accepted version for American Mineralogist, published by the Mineralogical Society of America. The published version is subject to change. Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. DOI: https://doi.org/10.2138/am-2022-8623. http://www.minsocam.org/



Always consult and cite the final, published document. See http://www.minsocam.org or GeoscienceWorld



Always consult and cite the final, published document. See http://www.minsocam.org or GeoscienceWorld