1	Revision 1
2	
3	Micro- and Nano-Size Hydrogarnet Clusters and Proton Ordering in Calcium Silicate
4	Garnet: Part I. The Quest to Understand the Nature of "Water" in Garnet Continues
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	Charles A. Geiger <sup>*,1</sup> and George R. Rossman <sup>2</sup>
10	
11	<sup>1</sup> Department of Chemistry and Physics of Materials
12	Section Materials Science and Mineralogy, Salzburg University
13	Jakob Haringer Strasse 2a
14	A-5020 Salzburg, Austria
15	
16	<sup>2</sup> Division of Geological and Planetary Sciences
17	California Institute of Technology
18	Pasadena, CA 91125-2500, USA
19	
20	
21	*Corresponding author
22	Tel. (0431) 662-8044-6226
23	E-mail: ca.geiger@sbg.ac.at
24	
25	Submitted to American Mineralogist: 12.11.2019
26	

### ABSTRACT

The calcium-silicate garnets, grossular -  $Ca_3Al_2Si_3O_{12}$ , and radite -  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2Si_3O_{12}$  and their solid 28 solutions  $Ca_3(Al_x,Fe^{3+}_{1-x})_2Si_3O_{12}$ , can incorporate various amounts of structural OH<sup>-</sup>. This has 29 30 important mineralogical, petrological, rheological and geochemical consequences and extensive 31 experimental investigations have focused on the nature of "water" in these phases. However, it 32 was not fully understood how OH was incorporated and this has seriously hampered the 33 interpretation of different research results. IR single-crystal spectra of a number of nominally 34 anhydrous calcium silicate garnets, both "end-member" and solid-solution compositions, were 35 recorded at room temperature and 80 K between 3000 and 4000 cm<sup>-1</sup>. Five synthetic hydrogarnets in the system  $Ca_3Al_2(SiO_4)_3$ - $Ca_3Al_2(H_4O_4)_3$ - $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2(SiO_4)_3$ - $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2(H_4O_4)_3$  were also measured 36 37 via IR ATR powder methods. The various spectra are rich in complexity and show a number of OH<sup>-</sup> stretching modes at wavenumbers between 3500 and 3700 cm<sup>-1</sup>. The data, together with 38 39 published results, were analyzed and modes assigned by introducing atomic-vibrational and 40 crystal-chemical models to explain the energy of the OH<sup>-</sup> dipole and the structural incorporation 41 mechanism of OH<sup>-</sup>, respectively. It is argued that OH<sup>-</sup> is located in various local microscopic- and nano-size  $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$ - and  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}$ -like clusters. The basic substitution mechanism is 42 the hydrogarnet one, where  $(H_4O_4)^{4-} \Leftrightarrow (SiO_4)^{4-}$ , and various local configurations containing 43 different numbers of  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$  groups define the cluster type. Some spectra also possibly indicate 44 the presence of tiny hydrous inclusion phases, as revealed by OH<sup>-</sup> modes above about 3670 cm<sup>-1</sup>. 45 46 They were not recognized in earlier studies. Published proposals invoking different hypothetical "defect" and coupled-substitution mechanisms involving H<sup>+</sup> are not needed to interpret the IR 47 spectra, at least for OH<sup>-</sup> modes above about 3560 cm<sup>-1</sup>. Significant mineralogical, petrological, and 48 49 geochemical consequences result from the analysis and are discussed in the accompanying Part II (this volume) of the investigation. 50

51 Key words: Grossular, andradite, nominally anhydrous minerals, H<sub>2</sub>O, hydrogarnet clusters, nano
52 scale, IR spectroscopy

## INTRODUCTION

# 54 Garnet Crystal Chemistry and "Water-rich" Hydrogarnet

55 Garnet is a remarkable phase for a number of reasons (Geiger 2013). One of them is its 56 ability to adapt its crystal structure to accommodate radically different compositions. Indeed, 57 garnet, as both a synthetic phase and as a mineral, exhibits vast chemical variability. One 58 interesting system is the loosely termed "hydrogarnets" or "water"-bearing garnets. The general 59 crystal-chemical formula of anhydrous or "water-free" garnet is  $\{X_3\}[Y_2](Z_3)O_{12}$ , where 60 dodecahedral {X}, octahedral [Y], and tetrahedral (Z) represent the three special crystallographic cation sites and their polyhedral coordination in space group Ia3d. In most rock-forming garnets 61  $Z = Si^{4+}$ . In true "hydrogarnet", however, the crystallographically single Z cation is absent and, 62 63 instead, it is replaced and charge balanced locally by four protons. The resulting general crystal-64 chemical formula can be written as  $\{X_3\}[Y_2](H_{12})O_{12}$  or  $\{X_3\}[Y_2](H_4O_4)_3$ . The former expression 65 is more suitable for describing the vibrational behavior of hydrogarnet and the latter the static 66 crystal chemistry (see discussion below).

67 Cornu (1905; 1906) was the first to discover hydrogarnet, which he termed hibschite. Other 68 reports of hydrogarnet followed (e.g., Foshag 1920; Belyankin and Petrov 1939; Belyankin and 69 Petrov 1941a) and Foshag introduced the name plazolite for his specimen. Belyankin and Petrov 70 (1941a; 1941b), in their studies, offered the first simplified and correct formula for hibschite as 71  $3CaO \cdot Al_2O_3 \cdot 2SiO_2 \cdot 2H_2O$ . Passaglia and Rinaldi (1984) analyzed the situation and proposed that 72 the term katoite should be reserved for Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(SiO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>-Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(H<sub>4</sub>O<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub> garnets with more than 50 73 mol % of the latter component and hibschite for those with less than 50%. These two workers, as 74 well as Ferro et al. (2003), described new katoite localities and investigated the garnet crystal 75 structures.

It may well have been that Thorvaldson and Grace (1929) and Thorvaldson et al. (1929)
were the first to synthesize and characterize Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(H<sub>4</sub>O<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>. It can be easily synthesized by
reacting Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>6</sub> with water at 1 atm. The reaction is highly exothermic and it is important in the

79 crystallization sequence of some cements including portlandite. Flint et al. (1941) showed that 80 there can be complete solid solution between  $Ca_3Al_2(H_4O_4)_3$  and  $Ca_3Al_2(SiO_4)_3$  (see also Flint and Wells 1941; Carlson 1956; Kobayashi and Shoji 1983; Dilnesa et al. 2014). The exchange  $(H_4O_4)^{4-1}$ 81  $\Leftrightarrow$  (SiO<sub>4</sub>)<sup>4-</sup> or (4H)<sup>+</sup>  $\Leftrightarrow$  (Si)<sup>4+</sup> was, thus, indicated. Crystal structure determinations of synthetic 82 83 Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(H<sub>4</sub>O<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub> using diffraction experiments proved this (Cohen-Addad et al. 1967; Foreman 84 1968; Lager et al. 1987). Such complete exchange between four protons and a single Si<sup>+</sup> cation in 85 a silicate is unique in the mineralogical kingdom, as best we know. More recent synthesis results 86 have proposed that the degree of solid solution is temperature dependent and that a miscibility gap 87 can exist along the Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(H<sub>4</sub>O<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>-Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(SiO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub> join (Jappy and Glasser 1991/92). Water-rich 88 hydrogrossular occurs in relatively low-temperature geologic environments consistent with its P-T 89 phase stability (Flint et al. 1941; Carlson 1956; Dilnesa et al. 2014). Yoder (1950) investigated the 90 high P-T phase relations of grossular under dry and hydrothermal conditions and discussed the stability of Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(SiO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub> and Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(H<sub>4</sub>O<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub> solid solutions. His study was extended by Pistorius 91 92 and Kennedy (1960) in their experimental high *P*-*T* investigation of grossular and hydrogrossular. 93 Other hydrogarnets, both end-member and solid-solution compositions, have been prepared 94 in the laboratory (e.g., Ito and Frodel 1967; Albrecht et al. 2019), but none of them have been 95 found in nature. The binary and radite  $(Ca_3Al_2(SiO_4)_3)$ -"hydroand radite"  $(Ca_3Al_2(H_4O_4)_3)$  has been 96 demonstrated by laboratory synthesis experiments to show an extensive degree of substitutional 97 solid solution (Flint et al. 1941; Dilnesa et al. 2014). The precise phase relations are difficult to determine because of kinetic issues. The synthesis of end-member  $Ca_3Fe_{2}^{3+}H_{12}O_{12}$  has apparently 98 99 not yet been fully achieved (e.g. Kuzel 1968) and its thermodynamic stability appears to be 100 restricted to below roughly 60 °C (Lothenbach pers. comm.). Kresten et al. (1982) reported the 101 occurrence of a hydroandradite from Sweden and Armbruster (1995) refined the crystal structure a 102 hydrous andradite from South Africa. 103

105 An initial report (Wilkins and Sabine 1973) of various rock-forming silicates containing 106 small concentrations of H<sub>2</sub>O, including garnet, was largely ignored for years and probably was 107 viewed as a "mineralogical curiosity" by the broader community. However, following reports of 108 the presence of OH<sup>-</sup> in different rock-forming garnet species (e.g., Beran et al. 1983; Aines and 109 Rossman 1984), which, moreover, could be measured straightforwardly with IR single-crystal 110 methods, research in this area intensified. Study has been directed at number of other so-called 111 "NAMs", which is short for nominally anhydrous minerals. Interest increased greatly and scientists began discussing, for example, how many "oceans of water" could be contained in 112 113 Earth's upper mantle (Bell and Rossman 1992) and the geochemical and geophysical 114 ramifications. Important mineral groups like olivine, pyroxene, and feldspar, for example, were 115 studied in various ways and in terms of their minor water contents (see reviews of Ingrin and 116 Skogby 2000 and Peslier 2010). The state of research on NAMs is now rather mature. 117 To determine the presence of OH<sup>-</sup> in garnet, or any other nominally anhydrous mineral for 118 that matter, IR spectroscopy has been the method of choice. Legions of single-crystal IR spectra 119 (and some Raman spectra as well) have been recorded on various garnet species and compositions, 120 both natural and synthetic. They show a plethora of different energy vibrational OH<sup>-</sup> stretching 121 modes. However, in spite of the great amount of study, conclusive assignments of the protons to 122 exact structural sites in the crystals have remained elusive. The nature of these minor 123 concentration OH<sup>-</sup> groups in garnet is not well understood in a crystal-chemical sense, with a few 124 exceptions (see Geiger and Rossman 2018). It is not understood if the OH<sup>-</sup> groups are just some 125 ill-defined defect(s) or whether they occupy more than one crystallographic position in an ordered 126 manner (e.g., Basso et al. 1984; Basso and Cabella 1990). Or does their presence represent some atomic-coupled-substitution mechanism, for example,  $(Al^{3+}-H^{+})^{4+} = (Si^{4+})$  or are they linked to 127 "nonstandard garnet" elements  $\{Li^+-H^+\} = \{Ca, Mg, Fe^{2+}, Mn^{2+}\}$  - see references and discussion in 128 Part II (Geiger and Rossman this volume)? Most astonishingly, considering the degree of study 129 and the "stage of the game", it is not known how structural OH<sup>-</sup> is incorporated in most natural 130

131	garnets (e.g., as $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ groups or not). Proton NMR study of synthetic katoite and three natural
132	grossulars showed, depending on the exact garnet in question, the presence of four H-atom clusters
133	(hydrogarnet) and/or two H-atom clusters (Cho and Rossman 1993).
134	Present thinking or the "ruling scientific mindset" considers that, because the IR spectra of
135	nearly all natural silicate garnets do not match the IR spectra of their synthetic analogues, both in
136	terms of the number of OH <sup>-</sup> modes as well as their energies, the two types of crystals must have
137	different OH <sup>-</sup> substitutional mechanisms. With regards to the common silicate garnets, a match in
138	IR spectra has only been found between synthetic and natural andradite (Geiger and Rossman
139	2018). However, the "ruling scientific mindset" that has operated over, say, the past three decades
140	may be wrong. Radical new insight is needed in order to move beyond what has been observed,
141	analyzed and proposed over the last three decades in terms of OH <sup>-</sup> in garnet.
142	Both this investigation and that in Part II (Geiger and Rossman this volume) attempts to do
143	this. The long quest to understand the nature of "water" garnet, and researching the possible
144	occurrence of the hydrogarnet substitution in natural garnets, continues. In order to do this, we
145	studied the OH <sup>-</sup> substitution in the four component system Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> (SiO <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>3</sub> -Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> (H <sub>4</sub> O <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>3</sub> -
146	$Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2(SiO_4)_3$ - $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2(H_4O_4)_3$ by examining both synthetic and natural garnets. The main
147	experimental input is from IR spectroscopy. An analysis of the results is undertaken that is based
148	on the atomic-vibrational and crystal-chemical properties of calcium silicate garnets.
149	
150	SAMPLES USED FOR STUDY AND EXPERIMENTAL METHODS
151	The garnets measured via IR single-crystal and powder ATR spectroscopy are from the
152	personal collections of CAG and GRR. The various samples are described in Table 1. Many of the
153	single crystals have been characterized via microprobe analysis and studied in some form before,
154	including by IR spectroscopy in the energy range between 3000 and 4000 cm <sup>-1</sup> . For example, the
155	large collection of grossular spectra of Rossman and Aines (1991) were measured with a grating
156	spectrometer, whereas other spectra shown herein were measured with various Fourier-transform

157	IR spectrometers. Newer and better spectrometers allow more spectral detail to be revealed.
158	Moreover, several garnet crystals were measured at low temperatures ultimately down to 80 K.
159	The experimental set-up in terms of the more recent measurements has been described before
160	(e.g., Geiger and Rossman 2018).
161	Infrared spectra of synthetic hydrogarnet powders (courtesy of B. Lothenbach to CAG)
162	were obtained on a Nicolet iS50 FTIR spectrometer with the ATR method using a
163	SensIR Technologies DuraScope diamond ATR accessory. Before each measurement,
164	the diamond crystal was cleaned with ethanol and the diamond surface was fully covered with
165	sample powder that was pressed against the diamond with a rod that was terminated in aluminum
166	foil. All spectra were corrected with a built in ATR correction that compensated for
167	the penetration depth of the IR radiation into the sample as a function of wavelength.
168	Spectral results were curve fit using the WiRE program of Renishaw that is part of their
169	Raman systems. Spectra with sloping baselines were first manually baseline-corrected using
170	WiRE.
171	
172	RESULTS
173	IR spectra (Figs. 3 and 5 to 12) from our latest measurements, as well as some taken from
174	the literature, will be shown in the course of the discussion (see also Part II – Geiger and Rossman
175	this volume, where, for example, H <sub>2</sub> O contents of various water-poor nominally anhydrous garnets
176	are given and discussed). Several words regarding OH <sup>-</sup> mode wavenumbers are in order. Because
177	different IR spectrometers with differing experimental set-ups were used to measure the spectra of
178	the various garnets analyzed here, there can be slight a variation in the wavenumber for a certain
179	mode. In addition, the curve fits of a spectrum give the peak center wavenumber, whereas other
180	spectra give the wavenumber at the peak maximum. Fit results also may depend slightly on several
181	factors such as the nature of the baseline correction and band overlap, for example. All these

182	factors lead to slight variations in the precise wavenumber for a given OH <sup>-</sup> mode. We think, in
183	general, that the uncertainty is better than $\pm 2 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ and possibly in some cases within $\pm 1 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ .
184	We note, further, that our spectral fits are subjective to a certain degree. The issue is
185	complex, in detail, because some spectra contain a fairly large number of modes and band overlap
186	is present. Moreover, there can be considerable differences in band intensities.
187	
188	DISCUSSION
189	An understanding of the IR spectra of most natural, water-bearing nominally anhydrous
190	"end-member" garnet species, and especially intermediate solid-solution compositions, in terms of
191	assigning observed OH <sup>-</sup> stretching modes, is not at hand (we use quotation marks around the term
192	end-member, because the presence of any amount of OH <sup>-</sup> must cause deviations from exact garnet
193	stoichiometry and also because most natural garnets are never compositionally "pure" and
194	stoichiometric).
195	At this point, with respect to silicate garnets, only certain "end-member" and radite crystals
196	are understood in terms of their OH <sup>-</sup> incorporation at least at the first level. It represents the
197	simplest IR spectroscopic case and both natural and synthetic crystals can apparently contain a
198	hydroandradite component, $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}$ (Geiger and Rossman 2018) via the presence of local

We concentrate our efforts in this Part I on the four component system shown in Fig. 1, where the currently accepted garnet terminology is taken from Grew et al. (2013). The IR spectra of these garnets are rich and complex in terms of the number of different energy OH<sup>-</sup> bands (or "band patterns") that they exhibit (e.g., Rossman and Aines 1986; Rossman and Aines 1991;

and isolated  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$  groups. The vibrational spectrum of synthetic  $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$  is also - at least

down to about 80 K - well described and understood (Kolesov and Geiger 2005). Our analysis in

this study builds upon the conclusions of our earlier work, which proposed criteria to identify the

hydrogarnet substitution in terms of IR and Raman spectra and primarily in anhydrous nominally

199

200

201

202

203

end-member garnets.

208	Armbruster and Geiger 1993; Amthauer and Rossman 1998; Withers et al. 1998; Maldener et al.
209	2003; Kurka et al. 2005; Phichaikamjornwut et al. 2012; Dachs et al. 2012; Dilnesa et al 2014;
210	Reynes et al. 2018). However, the observed OH <sup>-</sup> bands have not been assigned and relatively little
211	is understood in terms of the detailed vibrational and crystal-chemical behavior. Before an analysis
212	of the IR results can begin, it is first necessary to describe the crystal chemistry of garnet and
213	understand what vibrational spectra of crystals measure.
214	
215	Garnet crystal chemistry, general OH <sup>-</sup> -stretching mode behavior, and stability of the
216	hydrogarnet substitution
217	Vibrational spectroscopy, here IR and Raman, measures local vibrations of atoms and
218	atomic groups in molecules and crystals (Nakamoto 2009). The IR and Raman spectra of different
219	garnet species and intermediate composition solid solutions in the energy region of the lattice
220	vibrations (1200 to 100 cm <sup>-1</sup> ) have been measured and analyzed based on their crystal chemistry
221	(e.g., Moore et al. 1971; Hofmeister and Chopelas 1991; McAloon and Hofmeister 1993; Kolesov
222	and Geiger 1998; Geiger 1998). The crystal-structure properties of garnet have been investigated
223	and described many times and in great detail, as made possible by a multitude of diffraction
224	studies (e.g., Novak and Gibbs 1971; Armbruster and Geiger 1993; Geiger and Armbruster 1997).
225	Consider the local crystal chemistry around the crystallographic Wyckoff 24d position,
226	space group Ia-3d, and the cation-oxygen bonding arrangement. The (Z) cation at 24d, site
227	symmetry -4, is Si <sup>4+</sup> for most natural garnets. In garnet containing a hydrogarnet component a Si <sup>4+</sup>
228	atom is absent and proxied locally by four $H^+$ (or $D^+$ ) atoms, as shown by several neutron
229	diffraction investigations (Cohen-Addad et al. 1967; Foreman 1968; Lager et al. 1987; Lager and
230	Dreele 1996). The protons bisect and lie slightly above the four surfaces of a tetrahedron that is
231	defined by four oxygen atoms to which they are bonded with an OH <sup>-</sup> bond length of
232	0.906(2)/0.925(12) Å (Lager and Dreele 1996). The crystallographic positions of the four H <sup>+</sup>
233	cations result from the atomic forces acting in the garnet and the necessity to maintain local

234 charge balance in the vicinity of the 24d site. Crystallographically, there is just a single O atom 235 located at a general position (x,y,z) in garnet. Thus, there are just single OH groups that vibrate 236 and there are no  $(H_4O_4)^4$ -type vibrations. There are only individual OH-stretching vibrations in the energy region around 3600 cm<sup>-1</sup>  $\pm$  100 cm<sup>-1</sup> (Kolesov and Geiger 2005; Orlando et al. 2006). 237 There is little reason to consider  $(H_4O_4)^4$ -cluster-like vibrations (i.e., Harmon et al. 1982), because 238 239 they should not exist. This is a good reason to express the general formula of hydrogarnets as 240  $\{X_3\}[Y_2](H_{12})O_{12}$ . Furthermore, it has been argued that there is very weak, if any hydrogen bonding present (Orlando et al. 2006; Geiger and Rossman 2018; cf. Harmon et al. 1982). Thus, 241 242 this potential complication to OH<sup>-</sup> vibrational behavior can probably be ignored, based on the 243 existing results.

The relevant local atomic configuration is shown in Fig. 2. The  $H^+$  atom is bonded to a 244 245 single oxygen atom that is also chemically bonded to a single Y-cation (Wyckoff 16a position) 246 and two X-cations (Wyckoff 24c position) with different X-O chemical bond lengths. Because of 247 this arrangement, there must be OH<sup>-</sup>-mode coupling and/or mixing with Y- and X-cation-related vibrations. For the common silicate garnets, X can be Ca, Mg, Fe<sup>2+</sup> and Mn<sup>2+</sup> and Y can be Al<sup>3+</sup>, 248 Fe<sup>3+</sup> and Cr<sup>3+</sup> and they can exchange with one another to various degrees at the X- and Y-sites, 249 respectively, giving a range of compositionally complex substitutional solid solutions (Geiger 250 251 2008). There are considerable differences in ionic radii, masses and electronic states among these 252 various cations and, therefore, the associated chemical bonds must be different in nature. Adopting 253 a harmonic oscillator to describe the vibration of an atom pair (A and B), the frequency is given 254 by:

255 
$$\nu = \frac{1}{2\pi} \sqrt{\frac{k}{\mu}}$$
(1)

where *k* is the force constant (i.e., in simple terms the bond strength) and  $\mu_{AB}$  is the reduced mass of the system ( $\mu_{AB} = \frac{m_A m_B}{m_A + m_B}$ ). It is obvious that an O-H stretching mode will have a different vibrational frequency depending on the precise local atomic configuration and the nature of the 259 various chemical bonds involving the common oxygen atom (Fig. 2) and also possibly beyond. 260 Geiger and Rossman (2018) discussed the case for various OH-bearing "end-member" garnet 261 species. They all show a single OH<sup>-</sup> stretching mode whose energy is a function of the atomic 262 masses and strengths of the different chemical bonds of the "extended vibrational system". The 263 greater the mass, the lower will be the wavenumber of the OH<sup>-</sup> stretching mode, ignoring other 264 factors. This reasoning explains, for example, the lower energy of the OH<sup>-</sup> stretching mode in the IR spectra (Albrecht et al. 2019) of the synthetic hydrogarnets  $Ca_3Cr^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}$ ,  $Sr_3Cr^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}$  and 265  $Ca_3Rh^{3+}_{2}H_{12}O_{12}$  (i.e., 3616, 3625 and 3592 cm<sup>-1</sup>, respectively) compared to that for  $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$ 266 267 (i.e., 3662 cm<sup>-1</sup>). The OH<sup>-</sup> stretching mode observed in RT spectra is generally broad in OH<sup>-</sup>-268 bearing garnets because of the large vibrational amplitudes of the H<sup>+</sup> atom (Lager et al. 1987). 269 Cooling the crystal dampens significantly the amplitudes of vibration and the single OH<sup>-</sup> band at 270 RT narrows greatly and ultimately at about 80 K or slightly below two modes are observable in IR 271 spectra (Kolesov and Geiger 2005; Geiger and Rossman 2018). 272 Of course, pure end-member composition silicate garnets are rare, if they even exist in 273 nature. There is almost always some degree of solid solution at the X- and Y-sites. This means 274 there can be various local cation configurations around a given oxygen atom in a solid-solution

275 crystal (Fig. 2). Their concentration depends on the garnet bulk composition. The precise local

crystal-chemical situation (i.e., atomic order-disorder and structural relaxation) is complex and it

is not fully understood at this time. Suffice it to say, here, that the intensities of the different OH

stretching modes will depend on the relative amounts of the various local cation configurations.

279 Different vibrational possibilities could exist in a solid-solution garnet. One is that each local

atomic configuration will result in a representative OH<sup>-</sup> mode with its characteristic energy, as in

the respective end-member garnets grossular, and radite or katoite, for example. Another possible

282 behavior is that a distribution of relatively closely spaced OH<sup>-</sup> modes, each with not too different

283 energies, occurs. This latter situation can give rise to OH-band broadening and varying the

temperature of the IR measurement will not significantly affect OH<sup>-</sup> band widths. This effect is

called chemical-mode broadening in comparison to pure vibrational-mode broadening. In terms of
many natural OH<sup>-</sup>-bearing garnets both can occur.

Finally, it must be stressed, as a key basis for our analysis that the substitution  $(H_4O_4)^{4-} \Leftrightarrow$ 287  $(SiO_4)^{4-}$  or  $(H_4)^{4+} \Leftrightarrow (Si)^{4+}$  is energetically favorable for grossular-katoite crystals, as shown by 288 289 synthesis experiments (Flint et al. 1941; Carlson 1956; Kobayashi and Shoji 1983) and also to a large, but not complete, degree in Ca<sub>3</sub>Fe<sup>3+</sup><sub>2</sub>(SiO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>-Ca<sub>3</sub>Fe<sup>3+</sup><sub>2</sub>(H<sub>4</sub>O<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub> garnets (Flint et al. 1941; 290 291 Dilnesa et al. 2014). No other common silicate binary garnet system shows such complete 292 exchange. Phase equilibrium studies on  $Ca_3Al_2(SiO_4)_3$ - $Ca_3Al_2(H_4O_4)_3$  solid solutions at high P and 293 T under hydrothermal conditions indicate that thermal stability increases with decreasing  $H_2O$  in 294 the garnet (Yoder 1950; Pistorius and Kennedy 1960). Finally, empirical pair potential 295 calculations show that the reaction grossular + water  $\rightarrow$  katoite is thermodynamically favored 296 (Wright et al. 1994). 297 A simple question is then: why are the IR spectra of nominally anhydrous grossular and 298 other calcium silicate garnets so variable and complex compared to those of other natural silicate 299 garnets (e.g., pyrope, almandine, spessartine) in terms of their OH<sup>-</sup> incorporation?

300

# 301 IR spectra, OH<sup>-</sup> stretching modes and their assignment, hydrogarnet domains and clusters

302 Katoite and water-rich katoite-grossular solid solutions

We start our analysis with synthetic end-member katoite, Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>H<sub>12</sub>O<sub>12</sub>, with a well-known 303 304 crystal structure (Cohen-Addad et al. 1967; Foreman 1968; Lager et al. 1987) and IR and Raman 305 spectrum (Kolesov and Geiger 2005). At RT its IR spectrum shows a broad, single asymmetric OH<sup>-</sup> stretching mode at 3662 cm<sup>-1</sup>. It can be fit with two components with energies of about 3681 306 and 3666 cm<sup>-1</sup> at about 80 K. At even lower temperatures, both the IR and Raman spectra become 307 308 complex in the OH<sup>-</sup> stretching region with the appearance of many new, weak OH<sup>-</sup> modes, but this 309 aspect is not considered further here. The OH<sup>-</sup> "doublet" at roughly 80 K is asymmetric, whereby 310 the higher energy OH<sup>-</sup> band is considerably more intense than the lower energy one. Geiger and

Rossman (2018) argued that this spectroscopic behavior of OH<sup>-</sup>mode splitting characterizes the
hvdrogarnet substitution in most "end-member" silicate garnets.

Consider now the IR single-crystal spectra of intermediate Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>Si<sub>3</sub>O<sub>12</sub>-Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>H<sub>12</sub>O<sub>12</sub>, 313 both natural and synthetic, garnets (Fig. 3 - replotted from Rossman and Aines 1991) containing 314 315 major H<sub>2</sub>O contents. From these five spectra, it is immediately apparent that the band at about 3660 cm<sup>-1</sup> does not vary greatly in wavenumber, but it decreases in intensity with increasing 316 317 number of Si atoms in the formula unit (or grossular component). We conclude, therefore, that this mode must represent the presence of katoite-like domains in the solid-solution composition 318 garnets (a strong OH<sup>-</sup> band at 3660 cm<sup>-1</sup>, as well as a couple of others with high wavenumber, 319 320 were observed in the IR powder in KBr spectra of a series of synthetic Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>Si<sub>3</sub>O<sub>12</sub>-Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>H<sub>12</sub>O<sub>12</sub> 321 garnets – Kobayashi and Shoji 1983. However, the quality of the published spectra does not 322 permit a precise analysis). The local crystal-chemical situation is shown in Fig. 4a. It can also be 323 observed in a couple of IR spectra (GRR 1329 and GRR 1358) that there is a strong OH<sup>-</sup> band between 3595 cm<sup>-1</sup> and 3660 cm<sup>-1</sup> that increases in intensity with increasing grossular component 324 in the solid solution (Fig. 3). Rossman and Aines (1991) wrote in their IR study of grossular 325 garnets, "We assign the band at 3598 cm<sup>-1</sup>, which is dominant in the silica-rich hydrogrossular 326 samples, to  $(O_4H_4)^{4-}$  groups, adjacent to SiO<sub>4</sub> groups." We accept this proposal. The local crystal-327 chemical situation is illustrated in Fig. 4b and it shows a single, isolated  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$  group imbedded 328 329 in an anhydrous grossular "matrix". The wavenumber of the associated OH<sup>-</sup> mode is about 60 cm<sup>-1</sup> 330 less than in end-member katoite and could be a function of two effects. The first is related to bond 331 strengths. In end-member grossular the two different Ca-O bond lengths (Fig. 2) are Ca(1)-O(4) = 332 2.322(1) Å and Ca(2)-O(4) = 2.487(1) Å (Geiger and Armbruster 1997). They are shorter, and 333 thus stronger, than in end-member katoite, where Ca(1)-O(4) = 2.465(2) Å and Ca(2)-O(4) = 2.465(2)2.511(1) Å (Lager et al. 1987). It can be expected that local Ca-O bonds in a water-bearing 334 grossular vary in length depending on the precise structural state within a solid solution. Stronger 335 336 Ca-O bonds translate to weaker O-H bonds (Geiger and Rossman 2018). Second, it could be

expected that there is extended mode coupling and/or mixing beyond the fragment shown in Fig. 2

338	that affects O-H bonding. The presence of heavier $Si^{4+}$ cations compared to $H^+$ atoms in a garnet
339	solid solution could act to lower the OH <sup>-</sup> stretching vibration energy.
340	The IR and Raman spectra indicate, therefore, two "end-member type" H <sub>4</sub> O <sub>4</sub> substitution
341	mechanisms. Obvious questions arise however. One is apparent in the spectrum of garnet GRR
342	1058 (Fig. 3). The broad OH <sup>-</sup> mode envelope has structure and shows a peak maximum at roughly
343	3620 cm <sup>-1</sup> . How is it to be assigned? More generally, published IR spectra of water-poor grossular
344	show a varying number of OH <sup>-</sup> bands located between 3660 and 3600 cm <sup>-1</sup> . How are they to be
345	assigned?
346	
347	"End-member" or nearly end-member grossular
348	In order to answer this question, we consider the IR spectra of several "end-member" or
349	closely end-member composition grossulars, both synthetic and natural. The spectra of a
350	hydrothermally synthesized grossular (Geiger and Armbruster 1997 - grown from the oxides CaO
351	- from CaCO <sub>3</sub> , Al <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> , and SiO <sub>2</sub> ) and a nearly end-member composition natural garnet (GRR 53 -
352	Table 1) are shown together in Fig. 5a. The two spectra are remarkably similar in appearance and
353	give the first "spectroscopic match" between a synthetic and a natural crystal (We interject, here,
354	that the IR powder spectra on synthetic grossular recorded by Hsu (1980) show weak absorption
355	features at about 3620 and 3660 cm <sup>-1</sup> that could be interpreted as indicating structural OH <sup>-</sup> , as well
356	as a broad and intense absorption band centered at 3420 cm <sup>-1</sup> that can be assigned to liquid water.
357	It is our experience, though, that IR powder spectra are normally insufficient for characterizing
358	precisely small amounts of OH <sup>-</sup> in minerals.). The spectra of both the synthetic crystal and GRR
359	53 show three intense OH <sup>-</sup> -bands at 3666, 3633 and 3623 cm <sup>-1</sup> . Consider, furthermore, the IR
360	spectra of the synthetic and natural grossulars shown in Fig. 6. They show different OH <sup>-</sup> spectral
361	features from those garnets in Fig. 5a and have intense modes at 3623 ( $\pm 1$ ) and 3603 cm <sup>-1</sup> . The

362 two garnets give a second spectral "match" between a synthetic and natural end-member

363 composition crystal.

364 The spectrum of the synthetic grossular in Fig. 5a shows fine structure (e.g., shoulders on 365 the main peaks) indicating the presence of additional OH<sup>-</sup> modes and, therefore, it was curve fit to describe them (Fig. 5b). Additional bands at 3688, 3660, 3645, 3613, 3604, 3578, and 3561 cm<sup>-1</sup> 366 367 result. This gives a total of ten possible OH<sup>-</sup> modes for this synthetic grossular. We analyze and assign them. First, however, we note that the weak modes at 3561, 3579 and 3688 cm<sup>-1</sup> may be 368 369 experimental artefacts arising from the difficultly in collecting a spectrum with a smooth baseline 370 on the tiny synthetic crystal. On the other hand, they could also be real and possible assignments 371 are discussed below. Summarizing for the present discussion, here, this gives seven OH<sup>-</sup> modes at about 3666, 3660, 3645, 3633, 3623, 3613, and 3604 cm<sup>-1</sup>. There appears appear to be an 372 373 approximate regularity in the wavenumber spacing between the modes.

374 It turns out that these various modes, in various combinations and with differing intensities, 375 are observed in most, if not all, published IR spectra of natural grossular crystals. To be sure, the 376 large number of spectra in Rossman and Aines (1991) show intense OH<sup>-</sup> bands at about 3612, 3622, 3633, and 3641 cm<sup>-1</sup> depending on the specific crystal in question. Indeed, the presence or 377 378 absence and the intensity of these modes (i.e., the spectral pattern) was used to define or to 379 characterize their different classes of OH<sup>-</sup>-bearing grossulars. Phichaikamjornwut et al. (2012) in 380 their IR study of different natural grossular-andradite garnets also measured intense modes at 381 about 3602, 3612, 3631, and 3641 cm<sup>-1</sup>.

All the IR results, analyzed together, indicate a spectral systematics defined by OH<sup>-</sup>-bands with similar wavenumbers between 3595 and 3670 cm<sup>-1</sup>. Not every band is present in the spectra of every garnet, but systematic OH<sup>-</sup>-mode behavior is observable. Thus, we propose that OH<sup>-</sup> stretching modes at about 3599, 3612, 3622, 3633, 3641 and 3657 cm<sup>-1</sup> could arise from the

- 386 presence of various, local hydrogrossular-like clusters occurring in an anhydrous grossular
- 387 "matrix". Table 2 lists the different modes (Note: Based on our analysis of many spectra, the mode

at about 3657 cm<sup>-1</sup> appears to be the most problematic in the sense that it often does not occur 388 389 and/or that it is weak in intensity in the spectra of many garnets. We have no good explanation for 390 this, except to state that this mode is related to a six-membered  $(H_4O_4)^{-1}$  cluster - Fig. 4g - that is 391 structurally, and thus probably energetically, similar to a katoite-like cluster - Fig. 4a - having an OH<sup>-</sup> mode around 3660 cm<sup>-1</sup>. Thus, the latter type of cluster may more preferentially occur). From 392 this analysis, seven types of local  $(H_4O_4)^4$ -clusters (and/or domain in the case of water-rich 393 hydrogarnets) can be constructed by having different numbers of  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$  groups in them and they 394 395 can assigned to the different energy OH<sup>-</sup> modes. Fig. 4c-f shows the respective atomic 396 configurations for the different cluster types. According to our model analysis, the OH<sup>-</sup> mode wavenumber increases with the number of  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$  groups in a given cluster. 397 398 Summarizing our analysis, the observed OH<sup>-</sup>stretching modes between 3595 and 3670 399 cm<sup>-1</sup> in the IR spectra for many different OH<sup>-</sup>-bearing grossulars and katoites can be interpreted and assigned in a completely new context. Figure 7 shows IR spectra including one-water rich 400 401 grossular and six water-poor samples having an intense OH<sup>-</sup> mode at one or more of the 402 characteristic wavenumbers. It must be noted, though, that other OH<sup>-</sup> bands can be also observed 403 above and below this wavenumber range (Rossman and Aines 1991; Phichaikamjornwut et al. 404 2012; Dachs et al. 2012; Reynes et al. 2018). This aspect is now considered.

405

406 Other possible OH substitution mechanisms in "end-member" grossular and hydrous inclusions

The IR spectra of water-poor natural grossular can often show OH<sup>-</sup> bands that are not listed above and lie at energies above 3670 cm<sup>-1</sup>. Their assignments are not known and remain to be made. Consider, first, the high-energy OH<sup>-</sup> mode at 3684-3688 cm<sup>-1</sup> at RT that has often been observed (Fig. 8 and see spectra in Rossman and Aines 1991; Kurka et al. 2005; Dachs et al. 2012; Phichaikamjornwut et al. 2012). This mode has stronger O-H bonding compared to those OH<sup>-</sup> modes between 3595 and 3662 cm<sup>-1</sup> and it cannot be assigned based on the model analysis given

413 above. One speculative possibility is that it arises from the substitution  $\{2H^+ \Leftrightarrow Ca^{2+}\}$ . A H<sup>+</sup> atom,

414 as part of an OH<sup>-</sup> dipole directed towards the interior of an X-cation-free (site 24d) oxygen 415 coordinated dodecahedron, should have relatively little interaction with other atoms in the garnet 416 structure. It could be expected to be the "freest OH<sup>-</sup> dipole" of any in grossular and thereby have 417 the strongest O-H bond. 418 Alternatively, this high wavenumber mode might be related to the presence of tiny 419 inclusions of a foreign OH<sup>-</sup>-bearing phase. High wavenumber OH<sup>-</sup> bands (greater than 3670 cm<sup>-1</sup>) 420 in the spectra of andradite and pyrope have been argued to be due to the presence of inclusions of 421 minute layer silicates such as talc and phlogopite (Geiger et al. 2018; Geiger and Rossman 422 submitted – 2019c). What about grossular? The spectra of serpentine minerals (i.e., chrysotile, 423 lizardite, antigorite) are characterized by OH<sup>-</sup> bands with high energies. Schroeder (2002) gives 3686 cm<sup>-1</sup> for the strong OH<sup>-</sup> band for the spectrum of lizardite and Mellini et al. (2002) measured 424 3684 cm<sup>-1</sup> for lizardite from Elba Island. Band energies depend on the precise compositions of the 425 426 phases (Heller-Kallai et al. 1975). The absorption features can be broad in nature and show fine 427 structure and are variable depending on the precise serpentine mineral. A band at about 3674-3677 428 cm<sup>-1</sup> can also be observed in some spectra of grossular (Fig. 8). Antigorite can show a strong OH<sup>-</sup> band (asymmetric in shape) with a peak maxima of 3674-3678 cm<sup>-1</sup> (Heller-Kallai et al. 1975; 429 Mellini et al. 2002). Talc, as well, shows an intense OH<sup>-</sup> band at 3677 cm<sup>-1</sup> (Schroeder 2002). It is 430 431 important to note that nearly end-member grossular crystals can often be found in rhodingites 432 associated with serpentinites (see the discussion in Part II on grossulars from Asbestos, Canada). 433 Therefore, in light of the evidence, the high energy bands at about 3684-3688 and 3674-3677 cm<sup>-1</sup> 434 in the spectra of grossular are best assigned, at least at this time, to the presence of tiny inclusions 435 of hydrous Mg-rich layer silicates. 436 In addition to these high wavenumber OH<sup>-</sup> modes, other OH<sup>-</sup> modes with energies less than about 3595 cm<sup>-1</sup> have been observed in the spectra of many natural grossulars (Rossman and 437

438 Aines 1991; Kurka et al. 2005; Phichaikamjornwut et al. 2012; Dachs et al. 2012; this work). We

439 address them below, but first we consider the IR spectra of synthetic  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}$ -bearing 440 hydrogarnet solid solutions and natural end-member andradite.

441

442 Water-rich 
$$Ca_3Fe^{3+}{}_2Si_3O_{12}$$
- $Ca_3Fe^{3+}{}_2H_{12}O_{12}$ - $Ca_3Al_2Si_3O_{12}$ - $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$  solid solutions

- 443 End-member  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_{2}H_{12}O_{12}$  has yet to be synthesized and, therefore, its OH<sup>-</sup> mode energy
- 444 cannot be measured directly, as was done with  $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$ . However, water-rich hydrogarnets
- 445 in the four-component system  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2Si_3O_{12}-Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}-Ca_3Al_2Si_3O_{12}-Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$  have
- been synthesized (Dilnesa et al. (2014). Thus, we made IR ATR powder measurements on five
- 447 garnets of nominal composition  $Ca_3Al_2(Si_{1.0},H_{8.0})O_{12}, Ca_3[Al_{1.4},Fe^{3+}_{0.6}]_2(Si_{1.0},H_{8.0})O_{12},$
- $448 \qquad Ca_3[Al_{1.0},Fe^{3+}{}_{1.0}]_2(Si_{1.0},H_{8.0})O_{12},\ Ca_3[Al_{0.6},Fe^{3+}{}_{1.4}]_2(Si_{1.0},H_{8.0})O_{12},\ and\ Ca_3[Fe^{3+}{}_{2.0}](Si_{0.75},H_{9.0})O_{12},\ Ca_3[Al_{0.6},Fe^{3+}{}_{1.4}]_2(Si_{1.0},H_{8.0})O_{12},\ Ca_3[Al_{0.6},Fe^{3+}{}_{1.4}]_2(Si_{1.4},H_{8.0})O_{12},\ Ca_3[Al_{0.6},Fe^{3+}{}_{1.4}]_2(Si_{1.4},H_{8.0})O_{12},\ Ca_3[Al_{0.6},Fe^{3+}{}_{1.4}]_2(Si_{1.4},H_{8.0})O_{12},\ Ca_3[Al_{0.6},Fe^{3+}{}_{1.4}]_2(Si_{1.4},H_{8.0})O_{12},\ Ca_3[Al_{0.6},Fe^{3+}{}_{1.4}]_2(Si_{1.4},H_{8.0})O_{12},\ Ca_3[Al_{0.6},Fe^{3+}{}_{1.4}]_2(Si_{$
- 449 (Table 1). The spectra are shown in Fig. 9. Two main absorption features occur at 3611 cm<sup>-1</sup> and
- 450 3658 cm<sup>-1</sup>. We think these two energies describe the presence of  $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$  and
- 451  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_{2}H_{12}O_{12}$ -like domains in these garnets, respectively. The former mode energy agrees with
- 452 the spectroscopic results discussed above. Spectral variations as a function of garnet composition
- 453 are apparent. The  $OH^{-}$  mode (also expressed as a band or a shoulder) at about 3658 cm<sup>-1</sup> decreases
- 454 in relative intensity with decreasing  $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$  component in the garnet, as expected.
- 455 Concurrently, the OH<sup>-</sup> mode at 3611 cm<sup>-1</sup> increases in relative intensity with increasing

456  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_{2}H_{12}O_{12}$  component in the garnet (Fig. 9) - (there also appears to be a weaker OH<sup>-</sup> mode at

457 about 3534 cm<sup>-1</sup> in the spectra of these garnets, but it should have another origin and is not

- 458 considered in this work).
- 459

## 460 "End-member" or nearly end-member and radite

461 The RT IR spectra of a number of "end-member" and radites have been recorded

462 (Amthauer and Rossman 1998; Adamo et al. 2011; Zhang et al. 2015; Geiger et al. 2018). The

- 463 low-temperature IR spectra of several natural crystals and one synthetic were measured down to
- 464 80 K by Geiger and Rossman (2018). The IR spectra of most, but not all, "end-member"

465 andradites are simpler compared to the situation for grossular in terms of the number of observed 466 OH<sup>-</sup> modes. Many spectra of andradite contain just one or two OH<sup>-</sup> modes at RT. Most natural and hydrothermally synthesized crystals show the most intense OH<sup>-</sup> band, which is broad and 467 asymmetric, at or near 3563 cm<sup>-1</sup>. It splits into two bands at 3575 cm<sup>-1</sup> and 3557 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 80 K 468 (Geiger and Rossman 2018). Or it possibly splits into three modes including the one at 3543 cm<sup>-1</sup> 469 470 for andradite GRR 1263 (Fig. 10 and Table 1). At any rate, we consider these bands to represent the presence of single, isolated  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$  groups (Fig. 4b) in andradite (Table 2). 471 The lower OH<sup>-</sup> stretching energy compared to the analogous situation for single, isolated 472  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$  groups in grossular is largely due to the fact that the mass of Fe<sup>3+</sup> (55.85 amu) is twice 473 that of  $Al^{3+}$  (26.98 amu). Eqn. (1) describes the general situation. The mass effect is clearly 474 475 demonstrated by the energies of the IR-active translational (T) vibrations of both cations in garnet. The wavenumber range for  $T(Fe^{3+})$  modes lies between 130 and 360 cm<sup>-1</sup> for andradite and for 476  $T(Al^{3+})$  modes in grossular between about 240 and 470 cm<sup>-1</sup> (McAloon and Hofmeister 1993). 477 478 Other higher wavenumber OH<sup>-</sup> bands can be observed in the spectra some water-poor andradites such as that shown in Fig. 9 given by the mode that 3605 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 333 K. Moreover, an 479 OH<sup>-</sup>-band with a wavenumber of 3612 ( $\pm$ 1) cm<sup>-1</sup> can be observed as part of a very broad OH<sup>-</sup> 480 481 absorption feature in the RT spectra of andradite crystals that contain a significant amount of the  $Ca_3Fe_{12}^{3+}H_{12}O_{12}$  component (see Fig. 2 in Amthauer and Rossman 1998). We propose that the OH<sup>-</sup> 482 band at roughly 3612 cm<sup>-1</sup> at RT in andradite-rich garnets (Table 2) could be related to the 483 presence of finite-sized  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_{2}O_{12}H_{12}$ -like clusters (Fig. 4a). 484 485 Finally, we propose, because and radite and grossular are so similar structurally that, in an 486 analogous manner to the situation discussed above for hydrogrossular-like clusters in water-poor

487 grossular, a series of different hydroandradite-like clusters may be present in some andradite

- 488 crystals. They should be characterized by having OH<sup>-</sup> stretching modes with energies between
- 489 3563 and 3606-3612 cm<sup>-1</sup>. Consider, for example, the RT IR spectrum of "end-member" and radite
- 490 4282 (Fig. 11) that contains only 0.02 wt. % Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> (Geiger et al. 2018 see also similar spectrum

of andradite in Zhang et al. 2015). It is "untypical". Starting with the intense mode at 3561 cm<sup>-1</sup> and moving to higher wavenumbers, one observes two OH<sup>-</sup> modes at 3582 and 3595 cm<sup>-1</sup>. We think they could represent the presence of two different hydroandradite-like clusters, whose exact  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ -group configuration (Fig. 4c-f) cannot be presently determined. Finally, in terms of this andradite garnet, the three modes at 3610, 3621 and 3633 cm<sup>-1</sup> can be assigned to three

496 hydrogrossular-like-clusters (Table 2).

497 We close this section by noting that many andradites and grossulars are not of "end-

498 member" composition. There is often some degree of solid solution between the two and also to

499 lesser degree with other common garnet components (e.g.,  $Fe^{2+}_{3}Al_{2}Si_{3}O_{12}$ ,  $Mn^{2+}_{3}Al_{2}Si_{3}O_{12}$ ,

500 Mg<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>Si<sub>3</sub>O<sub>12</sub>). In order to address the issue of OH<sup>-</sup> incorporation in calcium silicate garnets more

501 fully, we need to consider the IR spectra of intermediate composition water-poor grossular-

502 andradite crystals.

503

## 504 Intermediate composition and water-poor grossular-andradite garnets

505 Many, if not most, Ca-rich silicate garnets in Earth's crust are grossular-andradite solid 506 solutions that crystallize during metamorphism. There can be complete  $Al \Leftrightarrow Fe^{3+}$  exchange at [Y] 507 across the join and the thermodynamic mixing behavior has been studied (Dachs and Geiger

508 2019). The cation mixing behavior can be complex because varying partial degrees in the long

range order can occur, decreasing the space group symmetry below cubic (Takéuchi et al. 1982).

510 At any rate, water-poor grossular-andradite garnets offer an additional system for investigation,

511 because their temperatures of crystallization are well above those where many water-rich crystals

are stable. What do their IR spectra show?

513 A number of IR spectra have been published (i.e., Rossman and Aines 1991;

514 Phichaikamjornwut et al. 2012) and several garnets have been investigated in this work.

- 515 Conceivably, it could be expected that spectral complexity could increase compared to the
- 516 situation for end-member garnet species. The crystal chemistry of solid-solution garnets is more

complex because of  $Al^{3+}$ -Fe<sup>3+</sup> mixing at [Y]. Local OH<sup>-</sup> vibrational behavior could be affected, as 517 discussed above (Fig. 2). Assuming statistically random  $Al^{3+}$ -Fe<sup>3+</sup> mixing, there can be five 518 possible local Y-cation configurations around a single, common  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$  group. They are: Al-Al-519 Al-Al.  $Fe^{3+}$ -Al-Al-Al.  $Fe^{3+}$ - $Fe^{3+}$ 520 521 strict random mixing, the probability for each of the five configurations is a function of the bulk composition of the crystal. The situation becomes more complex, if additional  $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$  groups are 522 523 brought into the analysis. Suffice it to note that a number of different energy OH<sup>-</sup>-stretching modes could potentially occur. 524

525 What is observed in the available IR spectra? To begin, many binary composition, water-

526 poor,  $Ca_3(Al_x, Fe^{3+}_{1-x})_2Si_3O_{12}$ , garnets show an OH<sup>-</sup> mode at 3563 cm<sup>-1</sup> at RT. Following the

analysis for the case of "end-member" and radite, it can be assigned to single, isolated  $(H_4O_4)^{4-1}$ 

528 group surrounded by  $Fe^{3+}$  cations. Clearly, the spectra of a number of the  $Fe^{3+}$ -bearing grossulars

529 in Rossman and Aines (1991) show the presence of an OH<sup>-</sup> band at about 3563 cm<sup>-1</sup> (Their figures

530 4, 5, 6, 8, 9, 10 and samples 1125, 936, 1042, 1051, 1430, 938, 1327, 1357, and 1411, for

example). The same is true for the IR spectra of several grossular-andradite garnets in

532 Phichaikamjornwut et al. (2012). In addition, OH<sup>-</sup> modes at 3581 and 3594 cm<sup>-1</sup> are also observed

533 in the spectra of some these grossular-andradite composition garnets with the assignments given

above and in Table 2.

535 Take two specific examples, the first being garnet 6741 (Table 1) of approximate

536 composition Gro73And23. Its IR spectrum was recorded at RT and 80 K (Fig. 12a). At RT three

distinct and relatively strong OH<sup>-</sup> bands are observable (i.e., 3688, 3666, and 3629  $\text{ cm}^{-1}$ ) and at 80

538 K four bands (i.e., 3694, 3672, 3634, and 3615 cm<sup>-1</sup>). Weak bands (i.e., 3565 cm<sup>-1</sup> at RT and 3562

539 cm<sup>-1</sup> at 80 K) and shoulders can also be discerned. In the case of this garnet, it is important to bear

540 in mind that, although it has a considerable 25% and radite component, nearly all of the OH<sup>-</sup> is

- 541 contained in various hydrogrossular-like clusters. The simplest interpretation is that the energetics
- sociated with the formation of hydrogrossular-like clusters are more favorable than for

543 hydroandradite-like clusters. This proposal is consistent with synthesis experiment results (Flint et 544 al. 1941; Dilnesa et al. 2014) for garnets in the system Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(SiO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>-Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(H<sub>4</sub>O<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>-545  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2(SiO_4)_3$ - $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2(H_4O_4)_3$  as shown in Fig. 1. Only the binary  $Ca_3Al_2(SiO_4)_3$ -546  $Ca_3Al_2(H_4O_4)_3$  shows complete solid solution from end-member to end-member. 547 Finally, consider the RT spectrum of an andradite garnet of composition And76Gr23 548 (sample KPK 56-12-9 of Phichaikamjornwut et al. 2012) shown in Fig. 12b. It shows three strong OH<sup>-</sup> bands with the two lowest wavenumber ones occurring at 3562 and 3582 cm<sup>-1</sup>. They are 549 associated with hydroandradite-like clusters (Table 2). The mode at 3611 cm<sup>-1</sup> is difficult to assign 550 551 and could represent an end-member katoite-like or a hydroandradite-like cluster (Table 2). The 552 various weak bands, observable at higher wavenumbers, probably represent hydrogrossular 553 clusters present in small amounts. At any rate, the bulk of the OH<sup>-</sup> in this solid-solution garnet is 554 partitioned into hydroandradite-like clusters. Research needs to be done to determine the nature of 555 H<sub>2</sub>O partitioning and hydrogarnet cluster formation in the nominally anhydrous system 556  $Ca_3(Al_x,Fe^{3+}l_x)_2Si_3O_{12}$ . In other words, the role of garnet composition with regards to the nature of structural "water" needs to be investigated as a function of  $P_{\text{H}_{2}\text{O}}$  and T. 557 558 559 **IMPLICATIONS** 560 Considerable and diverse research has been undertaken on various "water"-bearing garnets 561 over the last approximate three decades. And, here, it should be noted that in terms of the many 562 "end-member" grossular samples that have been studied by IR spectroscopy, that we are not aware 563 of any "water"-free crystals. This is an important observation. Much has been learned, but much is 564 still not understood. What is presently the state of the field and what needs to be done? 565 Previously, the IR and Raman spectra of different composition calcium silicate garnets 566 could not be interpreted in any systematic and rational manner. Spectroscopic interpretation was 567 often speculative with no rigorous scientific basis or it was simply not undertaken. It appears that 568 proposals linking the large number of observed OH<sup>-</sup> bands to different atomic mechanisms

569 involving "defects" or "non-standard" garnet elements (see Part II – Geiger and Rossman, this 570 volume) are probably not fully correct. That is, chemistry and various defects were taken as the 571 deciding factor in the nature of OH<sup>-</sup> incorporation in many garnets. The model analysis presented 572 here, if correct, simplifies the nature of OH-substitution, by returning back to the central importance of the well-known hydrogarnet substitution, namely  $(H_4O_4)^{4-} \Leftrightarrow (SiO_4)^{4-}$  or  $(4H)^+ \Leftrightarrow$ 573 574 (Si)<sup>4+</sup>. The varying and complex IR spectra of different calcium silicate garnets reflect the presence of various local microscopic- and nano-size  $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$ - and  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}$ -like 575 576 clusters. Inclusion phases, probably hydrous layer silicates, can also give rise to OH<sup>-</sup> bands. This is 577 not to say, and we want to emphasize, that other OH<sup>-</sup> substitutional mechanisms cannot occur in 578 silicate garnet.

579 Open questions regarding spectroscopy remain. Intense OH<sup>-</sup> bands at wavenumbers less than 3560 cm<sup>-1</sup> are often observed in IR spectra of garnet. Further research is needed to interpret 580 581 and assign them. It is needs to be determined if there are different IR absorption coefficients 582 associated with the different modes. A crystal-chemical question that arises, is how OH<sup>-</sup> can be 583 incorporated in certain, other nominally anhydrous silicates? Could proton clustering play a role in any of them as well? A number of more mineralogical, petrological and geochemical issues 584 585 remain to be studied. Concluding, it goes without saying that research on garnet has entered a new 586 phase. Further issues relating to "water" in Ca silicate garnets are discussed in Part II (Geiger and 587 Rossman this volume) of this investigation.

- 588
- 589

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

- 590 Dr. B. Lothenbach kindly supplied the synthetic hydrogarnets and Dr. B. Phichaikamjornwut
- 591 provided her IR data on grossular and andradite garnets for analysis. Dr. E. Grew assisted in
- 592 constructing Fig. 1. This research was supported by grants from the Austrian Science Fund (FWF:
- 593 P 30977-NBL) to C.A.G. and NSF (EAR-1322082) to G.R.R. C.A.G. also thanks the "Land

- 594 Salzburg" for financial support through the initiative "Wissenschafts- und Innovationsstrategie
- 595 Salzburg 2025". Dr. E. Libowitzky made constructive comments that improved the manuscript.

596 597	REFERENCES
598	Adamo, I., Gatta, G.D., Rotiroti, N., Diella, V., and Pavese, A. (2011) Green andradite stones:
599	gemmological and mineralogical characterisation. European Journal of Mineralogy, 23, 91-
600	100.
601	Aines, R.D. and Rossman, G.R. (1984) The hydrous component in garnets: pyralspites. American
602	Mineralogist, 69, 1116-1126.
603	Albrecht, R., Hunger, J., Doert, T., and Ruck, M. (2019) Syntheses, crystal structures and physical
604	properties of chromium and rhodium hydrogarnets Ca[Cr(OH) <sub>6</sub> ] <sub>2</sub> , Sr[Cr(OH) <sub>6</sub> ] <sub>2</sub> , and
605	Sr[Rh(OH) <sub>6</sub> ] <sub>2</sub> . European Journal of Inorganic Chemistry, 10, 1398-1405.
606	Amthauer, G. and Rossman, G.R. (1998) The hydrous component in andradite garnet. American
607	Mineralogist, 83, 835-840.
608	Armbruster, T. (1995) Structure refinement of hydrous andradite Ca <sub>3</sub> Fe <sub>1.54</sub> Mn <sub>0.20</sub> Al <sub>0.26</sub> (SiO <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>1.65</sub>
609	(O <sub>4</sub> H <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>1.35</sub> , from the Wessels mine, Kalahari manganese field, South Africa. European
610	Journal of Mineralogy, 7, 1221-1225.
611	Armbruster, T. and Geiger, C.A. (1993) Andradite crystal chemistry, dynamic X-site disorder and
612	strain in silicate garnets. European Journal of Mineralogy, 5, 59-71.
613	Basso, R. and Cabella R. (1990) Crystal chemical study of garnets from metarodingites in the
614	Voltri Group metaophiolites (Ligurian Alps, Italy). Neues Jahrbuch für Mineralogie –
615	Monatshefte, 3, 127-136.
616	Basso, R. Cimmino, F., and Messiga, B. (1984) Crystal chemistry of hydrogarnets from three
617	different microstructural sites of a basaltic metarodingite from the Voltri Massif (Western
618	Liguria, Italy). Neues Jahrbuch für Mineralogie – Abhandlungen, 148, 246-258.
619	Bell, D.R. and Rossman, G.R. (1992) Water in Earth's mantle: The role of nominally anhydrous
620	minerals. Science, 255, 1391-1397.
621	Belyankin D.S. and Petrov, V.P. (1939) Hibschite in Georgia. Doklady of the Academy of
622	Sciences, U.S.S.R. 24, 349-352.

- 623 Belyankin, D.S. and Petrov, V.P. (1941a) Reexamining the chemical formula of hibschite.
- Doklady of the Academy of Sciences, U.S.S.R. 30, 66-68.
- Belyankin, D.S. and Petrov, V.P. (1941b) The grossularoid group (hibschite, plazolite). American
  Mineralogist, 26, 450-453.
- 627 Beran, A., Sturma, R. and Zemann, J. (1983) Ultrarotspektroskopische Untersuchungen über den
- 628 OH-Gehalt einiger Granate. Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, Mathmatisch-
- 629 naturwissenschafte Klasse, 75-79.
- Birkett, T.C. and Trzcienski, Jr., W.E. (1984) Hydrogarnet: Multi-site hydrogen occupancy in the
  garnet structure. Canadian Mineralogist, 22, 675-680.
- 632 Carlson, E.T. (1956) Hydrogarnet formation in the system lime-alumina-silica-water. Journal of
  633 Research of the National Bureau of Standards, 56, 327-335.
- Cho, H. and Rossman, G.R. (1993) Single-crystal NMR studies of low-concentration hydrous
  species in minerals: Grossular garnet. American Mineralogist, 78, 1149-1164.
- 636 Cohen-Addad, C., Ducros, P., and Bertaut, E.F. (1967) Étude de la substitution du groupement
- 637 SiO<sub>4</sub> par (OH)<sub>4</sub> dans les composés Al<sub>2</sub>Ca<sub>3</sub>(OH)<sub>12</sub> et Al<sub>2</sub>Ca<sub>3</sub>(SiO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2.16</sub>(OH)<sub>3.36</sub> de type
- 638 grenat. Acta Crystallographica, 23, 220-230.
- 639 Cornu, F. (1905) "Hibschit" aus Einschlüssen des oberturonen Kalkmergels der Cuvieristufe im
- 640 Phonolit des Marienberges bei Aussig. Tschermaks mineralogische und petrographische
  641 Mitteilungen, 24, 327-328.
- 642 Cornu, F. (1906) Hibschit, ein neues Kontaktmineral. Tschermaks mineralogische und
  643 petrographische Mitteilungen, 25, 249-268.
- 644 Dachs, E. and Geiger, C.A. (2019) Thermodynamic behaviour of grossular-andradite,
- 645  $Ca_3(Al_xFe^{3+}_{1-x})_2Si_3O_{12}$ , garnets: a calorimetric study. European Journal of Mineralogy, 31, 646 443-451.
- Dachs, E., Geiger, C.A., Benisek, A., and Grevel, K-D. (2012) Grossular: A crystal-chemical,
- calorimetric, and thermodynamic study. American Mineralogist, 97, 1299-1313.

649	Dilnesa, B.Z., Lothenbach, B., Renaudin, G., Wichser, A., and Kulik, D. (2014) Synthesis and				
650	characrterization of $Ca_3(Al_xFe_{1-x})_2(SiO_4)_y(OH)_{4(3-y)}$ . Cement and Concrete Research, 59,				
651	96-111.				
652	Ferro, O., Galli, E., Papp, G., Quartieri, S., Szakáll, S., and Vezzalini, G. (2003) A new occurrence				
653	of katoite and re-examination of the hydrogrossular group. European Journal of				
654	Mineralogy, 15, 419-426.				
655	Flint, E.P. and Wells, L.S. (1941) Relationship of the garnet-hydrogarnet series to the sulfate				
656	resistance of portland cement. Journal of Research of the National Bureau of Standards, 27,				
657	Research Paper RP 1411, 171-180.				
658	Flint, E.P., McMurdie, H.F., and Wells, L.S. (1941) Hydrothermal and X-ray studies of the garnet-				
659	hydrogarnet series and the relationship of the series to hydration products of portland				
660	cement. National Bureau of Standards, Research, 26, Paper RP 1335, 13-33.				
661	Foreman, D.W., Jr. (1968) Neutron and X-ray diffraction study of Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> (O <sub>4</sub> D <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>3</sub> , a garnetoid. The				
662	Journal of Chemical Physics, 48, 3037-3041.				
663	Foshag, W.F. (1920) Plazolite, a new mineral. American Mineralogist. 5, 183-185.				
664	Geiger, C.A. (1998) A powder infrared spectroscopic investigation of garnet binaries in the system				
665	$Mg_{3}Al_{2}Si_{3}O_{12}\text{-}Fe_{3}Al_{2}Si_{3}O_{12}\text{-}Mn_{3}Al_{2}Si_{3}O_{12}\text{-}Ca_{3}Al_{2}Si_{3}O_{12}\text{.} European \ Journal \ of \ Mineralogy,$				
666	3, 407-422.				
667	Geiger, C.A. (2008) Silicate garnet: A micro to macroscopic (re)view. American Mineralogist. 93,				
668	360-372.				
669	Geiger, C.A. (2013) Garnet: A key phase in nature, the laboratory and in technology. Elements, 9,				
670	447-452.				
671	Geiger, C.A. and Armbruster, T. (1997) Mn <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> Si <sub>3</sub> O <sub>12</sub> spessartine and Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> Si <sub>3</sub> O <sub>12</sub> grossular				
672	garnet: dynamical structural and thermodynamic properties. American Mineralogist, 82,				
673	740-747.				
674	Geiger, C.A. and Rossman, G.R. (2018) IR spectroscopy and OH <sup>-</sup> in silicate garnet: The long				
675	quest to document the hydrogarnet substitution. American Mineralogist, 103, 384-393.				

- 676 Geiger, C.A. and Rossman, G.R. (this volume) Micro- and nano-size hydrogarnet clusters in
- 677 calcium silicate garnet: Part II. mineralogical, petrological and geochemical aspects.678 American Mineralogist.
- 679 Geiger, C.A. and Rossman, G.R. (submitted 2019c) Pyrope from the Dora Maira Massif,
- 680 Western Alps: Water in the hydrogrossular. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology.
- 681 Geiger, C.A. and Rossman, G.R. (in prep. 2019d) Hydrogarnet clusters and proton ordering in

 $682 \qquad \qquad \text{spessartine: The continuing quest to understand $H_2O$ in garnet.}$ 

- 683 Geiger, C.A., Dachs, E., Vielreicher, N., and Rossman, G.R. (2018) Heat capacity and entropy
- behavior of andradite: A multi-sample and -methodological investigation. European
  Journal of Mineralogy, 30, 681-694.
- 686 Grew, E.S., Locock, A.J., Mills, S.J., Galuskina, I.O., Galuskin, and E.V., Hålenius, U. (2013)
- 687 Nomenclature of the garnet supergroup. American Mineralogist, 98, 785-811.
- Harmon, K.M., Gabriele, J.M., and Nuttall, A.S. (1982) Hydrogen bonding in the tetrahedral

 $O_4H_4^{4-}$ -cluster in hydrogrossular. Journal of Molecular Structure, 82, 213-219.

690 Heller-Kallai, L., Yariv, S., and Gross, S. (1975) Hydroxyl-stretching frequencies of serpentine

691 minerals. Mineralogical Magazine, 40, 197-200.

- 692 Hofmeister, A.M. and Chopelas, A. (1991) Vibrational spectroscopy of end-member silicate
- 693 garnets. Physics and Chemistry of Minerals, 17, 503-526.
- Hsu, L.C. (1980) Hydration and phase relations of grossular-spessartine garnets at  $P_{\rm H_2O} = 2$  Kb.

695 Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 71, 407-415.

- 696 Ingrin, J. and Skogby, H. (2000) Hydrogen in nominally anhydrous upper-mantle minerals:
- 697 concentration levels and implications. European Journal of Mineralogy, 12, 543-570.
- Ito, J. and Frondel, C. (1967) New synthetic hydrogarnets. American Mineralogist, 52, 1105-1109
- Jappy, T.G. and Glasser, F.P. (1991/92) Synthesis and stability of silica-substituted hydrogarnet
- 700  $Ca_3Al_2Si_{3-x}O_{12-4x}(OH)_{4x}$ . Advances in Cement Research, 4, 1-8.
- 701 Kobayashi, S. and Shoji, T. (1983) Infrared analysis of the grossular-hydrogrossular series.
- 702 Mineralogical Journal, 11, 331-343.

- 703 Kolesov, B.A. and Geiger, C.A. (1998) Raman spectra of silicate garnets. Physics and Chemistry
- 704 of Minerals, 25, 142-151.
- 705 Kolesov, B.A. and Geiger, C.A. (2005) The vibrational spectrum of synthetic hydrogrossular
- 706 (Katoite)  $Ca_3Al_2(O_4H_4)_3$ : A low temperature IR and Raman spectroscopic study. American
- 707 Mineralogist, 90, 1335-1341.
- 708 Kresten, P., Nairis, H.J., and Wadsten, T. (1982) Hydroandradite from Alnö Island, Sweden.
- 709 Geologiska Föreningens i Stockholm Förhandlingar, 104, 240.
- Kurka, A., Blanchard, M., and Ingrin, J. (2005) Kinetics of hydrogen extraction and deuteration in
  grossular. Mineralogical Magazine, 69, 359-371.
- 712 Kuzel, H.-J. (1968) Über die Diadochie von  $Al^{3+}$ ,  $Cr^{3+}$ , und  $Fe^{3+}$  in  $3CaO \cdot Al_2O_3 \cdot 6H_2O$  oberhalb
- 713 50° C. Neues Jahrbuch für Mineralogie, Monatshefte. 87-96.
- Lager, G.A. and von Dreele, R.B. (1996) Neutron powder diffraction study of hydrogarnet to 9.0
  GPa. American Mineralogist, 81, 1097-1104.
- Lager, G.A., Armbruster, T., and Faber, G. (1987) Neutron and X-ray diffraction study of
   hydrogarnet Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(O<sub>4</sub>H<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>. American Mineralogist, 72, 756-765.
- 718 Lager, G.A., Downs, R.T., Origlieri, M., and Garoutte, R. (2002) High-pressure single-crystal X-
- 719 ray study of katoite hydrogarnet: Evidence for a phase transition from  $Ia3d \rightarrow I43d$
- symmetry at 5 GPa. American Mineralogist, 87, 642-647.
- 721 Maldener, J., Hösch, A., Langer, K., and Rauch, F. (2003) Hydrogen in some natural garnets
- studied by nuclear reaction analysis and vibrational spectroscopy. Physics and Chemistryof Minerals, 30, 337-344.
- 724 McAloon, B.P. and Hofmeister, A.M. (1993) Single-crystal absorption and reflection infrared
- spectroscopy of birefringent grossular-andradite garnets. American Mineralogist, 78, 957967.
- Mellini, M., Fuchs, Y., Viti, C., Lemaire, C., and Linarès, J. (2002) Insights into the antigorite
  structure from Mössbauer and FTIR spectroscopies. European Journal of Mineralogy, 14,
  97-104.

- 730 Moore, R.K., White, W.B., and Long, T. (1971) Vibrational spectra of the common silicates: I.
- The garnets. American Mineralogist, 56, 54-71.
- 732 Nakamoto, K. (2009) Infrared and Raman Spectra of Inorganic and Coordination Compounds,
- Part A: Theory and Applications in Inorganic Chemistry. John Wiley and Sons, Inc. 6thedition, 419 p.
- Novak, G.A. and Gibbs, G.V. (1971) The crystal chemistry of the silicate garnets. American
  Mineralogist, 56, 791-825.
- 737 Orlando, R., Torres, F.J., Pascale, F., Ugliengo, P., Zicocvich-Wilson, C., and Dovesi, R. (2006)
- 738 Vibrational spectrum of katoite  $Ca_3Al_2[(OH)_4]_3$ : A periodic ab initio study. Journal of
- 739 Physical Chemistry B, 110, 692-701.
- Pabst, A. (1942) Reexamination of hibschite. American Mineralogist, 27, 783-792.
- Passaglia, E. and Rinaldi, R. (1984) Katoite, a new member of the Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(SiO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>-Ca<sub>3</sub>Al<sub>2</sub>(OH)<sub>12</sub>
- series and a new nomenclature for the hydrogrossular group of minerals. Bulletin deMinéralogie, 107, 605-618.
- 744 Peslier, A.H. (2010) A review of water contents of nominally anhydrous natural minerals in the
- mantles of Earth, Mars and the Moon. Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research,197, 239-258.
- 747 Phichaikamjornwut, B., Skogby, H., Ounchanum, P., Limtrakun, P., and Boonsoong, A. (2012)
- Hydrous components of grossular-andradite garnets from Thailand: thermal stability and
  exchange kinetics. European Journal of Mineralogy, 24, 107-121.
- 750 Pistorius, C.W.F.T and Kennedy, G.C. (1960) Stability relations of grossularite and
- hydrogrossularite at high temperatures and pressures. American Journal of Science, 258,247-257.
- Reynes, J., Jollands, M., Hermann, J., and Ireland (2018) Experimental constraints on hydrogen
  diffusion in garnet. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 173, 23.
- 755 Rossman, G.R. and Aines, R.D. (1986) Spectroscopy of a birefringent grossular from Asbestos,
- 756 Quebec, Canada. American Mineralogist, 71, 779-780.

- 757 Rossman, G.R. and Aines, R.D. (1991) The hydrous components in garnets: Grossular-
- hydrogrossular. American Mineralogist, 76, 1153-1164.
- 759 Schroeder, P.A. (2002) Infrared Spectroscopy in clay science. In CMS Workshop Lectures, Vol.
- 760 11, Teaching Clay Science, A. Rule and S. Guggenheim, eds., The Clay Mineral Society,761 181-206.
- Takéuchi, Y., Haga, N., Umizu, S., and Sato, G. (1982) The derivative structure of silicate garnets
  in grandite. Zeitschrift für Kristallographie, 158, 53-99.
- Thorvaldson, T. and Grace, N.S. (1929) The hydration of the aluminates of calcium. I. A new
- crystalline form of hydrated tricalcium aluminate. Canadian Journal of Research, 1, 36-47.
- 766 Thorvaldson, T., Grace, N.S., and Vigfusson, V.A. (1929) The hydration of the aluminates of
- 767 calcium. II. The hydration products of tricalcium aluminate. Canadian Journal of Research,768 1, 201-213.
- Wilkins, R.W.T. and Sabine, W. (1973) Water content of some nominally anhydrous silicates.
  American Mineralogist, 58, 508-516.
- Withers, A.C., Wood, B.J., and Carroll, M.R. (1998) The OH content of pyrope at high pressure.
  Chemical Geology, 147, 161-171.
- Woodford, A.O., Crippen, R.A., and Garner, K.B. (1941) Section across Commercial quarry,
- 774 Crestmore, California. American Mineralogist, 26, 351-381.
- Wright, K., Freer, R., and Catlow, C.R.A. (1994) The energetics and structure of the hydrogarnet
  defect in grossular: A computer simulation study. Physics and Chemistry of Minerals, 20,
  500-503.
- Yoder, H.S., Jr. (1950) Stability relations of grossularite. The Journal of Geology, 58, 221-253.
- Zhang, P., Ingrin, J., Depecker, C., and Xia, Q. (2015) Kinetics of deuteration in andradite and
  garnet. American Mineralogist, 100, 1400-1410.

781	Table 1. Description of nature	ral and synthetic grossular	, andradite, grossular-andradite	e, and hydrogarnet sample	es measured or used in this study.
-----	--------------------------------	-----------------------------	----------------------------------	---------------------------	------------------------------------

Garnet Type &	Type/Locality (Source)	Sample Description	Approximate Garnet
Sample Label		( <i>P-T</i> , color, thickness, source)	Composition
Grossular	Synthetic grossular	$T = 800 \text{ °C and } P_{\text{H}_{2}\text{O}} = 0.2 \text{ GPa; } 0.38 \text{ mm;}$	Gross100
	(C.A. Geiger)	Geiger & Armbruster (1997)	
Gr83	Synthetic grossular	$T = 1000 \text{ °C and } P_{\text{H}_{2}\text{O}} = 3.0 \text{ GPa};$	Gross100
		Digitalized data from Fig. 1 in Withers et al.	
		(1998) normalized to 1 mm thickness	
Grossular GRR 53	Asbestos, Quebec, Canada	Pale orange, "Hessonite", 0.139 mm;	Gross94Andr06
	(Shale's Lapidary)	Rossman & Aines (1991)	
Grossular GRR 1038	Jeffrey Mine, Asbestos, Quebec, Canada	Colorless rim, green colored core (Cr <sup>3+</sup> ),	Gross96Andr04
	(Rock H. Currier, Jewel Tunnel Imports)	0.276 mm;	
		Rossman & Aines (1991)	
Grossular GRR 1042	Vesper Peak, Snohomish Co., WA, USA	Orange-brown, 1.156 mm;	Gross86Andr14
	(Caltech collection, CIT-8197)	Rossman & Aines (1991)	

Grossular GRR 1058	Synthetic hydrogrossular	Synthetic (#GL IV 2Sia), KBr pellet;	$Ca_3Al_2(O_4H_4)_3$
	(G. Lager)	Lager et al. (1987); Rossman & Aines (1991)	
Grossular GRR 1059	Synthetic hydrogrossular	Synthetic (#Gl VII 1), KBr pellet;	Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> (SiO <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>2.28</sub> (O <sub>4</sub> H <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>0.72</sub>
	(G. Lager)	Lager et al. (1987); Rossman & Aines (1991)	
Grossular GRR 1285	Jeffrey Mine, Asbestos, Quebec, Canada	0.030 mm; light orangish pink; Cho	Gross98Andr02
	(F. Allen)	& Rossman (1993); Allen and Buseck (1998)	
Grossular GRR 1329	Commercial Quarry, Crestmore, CA, USA	Near-colorless "plazolite". Braided veins	-
	(Pomona College, R.A. Crippen, #RAC U-	between gehlenite, ~12 um thick;	
	29)	Woodford et al. (1941), Rossman & Aines	
		(1991)	
Grossular GRR 1358	Commercial Quarry Crestmore, CA, USA	Colorless "Plazolite", 0.024 mm thick;	Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> (SiO <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>1.82</sub> (O <sub>4</sub> H <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>1.18</sub>
	(R. Basso - orginally from A. Pabst)	Pabst (1942); Rossman & Aines (1991)	
Grossular 1386	Merelani Hills, Lelatema Mountains, Umba	Nearly colorless, ~5 mm gemmy, water-worn,	Gross99Andr01
	Valley, Aursha Region, Tanzania (Peter	crystal fragment; Cho & Rossman (1993);	
	Flusser, Overland Gems, Los Angeles)	Palke et al. (2015)	
Grossular 1420	Rauris Valley, Salzburger-Land, Austria	Orange crystals, 0.186 mm thick;	Gross75Andr25

This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. DOI: https://doi.org/10.2138/am-2020-7256				
	(Caltech collection CIT-12534)	Rossman & Aines (1991)		
Grossular 1424	Garnet Queen Mine (?), Santa Rosa	Orange crystals, 0.518 mm thick;	Gross88Andr12	
	Mountains, San Diego County,	Rossman & Aines (1991)		
	CA, USA (Caltech collection, CIT-8804)			
Grossular GRR 1430.2	Belvidere Mountain, Eden Mills, Vermont	Moderate orange crystals, 1.381 mm thick;	Gross94Andr06	
	(F. Allen)	Rossman & Aines (1991)		
Grossular GRR 1444	Pietra Massif, Montalto di Castro, Viterbo,	Katoite, micro KBr pellet;	$Ca_{2.96}(Al_{1.85}Mg_{0.01})(Si_{0.69}S_{0.11})$	
	Lazio, Italy	Passaglia & Rinaldi (1984)*; Rossman & Aines	O <sub>2.93</sub> (OH)9.07*	
	(E. Passaglia)	(1991)		
Andradite GRR 1263	San Benito Co., CA, USA	Black, serpentinite, 0.260 mm;	Andr99	
	(collected by GRR)	Amthauer & Rossman (1998)		
Andradite 4282	Madagascar?	Light green transparent crystal, anisotropic,	Andr99	
	(Ebay – Zoultier.com)	0.606 mm;		
		Geiger et al. (2018)		
Grossular-Andradite	Africa	Greenish yellow, Anisotropic sector zoning and	Gross73Andr23	
6741	(Ebay)	bands observed under crossed, 0.617 mm;		

		Dachs & Geiger (2019)		
Andradite-Grossular	Phu Kha Hill, Mueang District, Lop Buri	Yellowish green to brownish green, 0.5-3 mm	Andr73Gross26	
KPK 56-12-9	Province, Thailand	diameter crystals, skarn;		
	(IR results B. Phichaikamjornwut)	Phichaikamjornwutet et al. (2012)		
Synthetic Hydrogarnet	(B. Lothenbach)	Very fine-grain;	Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> (SiO <sub>4</sub> )(O <sub>4</sub> H <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>2</sub>	
		Dilnesa et al. (2014)		
Synthetic Hydrogarnet	(B. Lothenbach)	Very fine-grain;	Ca <sub>3</sub> (Al <sub>1.4</sub> ,Fe <sup>3+</sup> <sub>0.6</sub> ) <sub>2</sub> (SiO <sub>4</sub> )(O <sub>4</sub> H <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>2</sub>	
		Dilnesa et al. (2014)		
Synthetic Hydrogarnet	(B. Lothenbach)	Very fine-grain;	$Ca_3(Al_{1.0}, Fe^{3+}_{1.0})_2(SiO_4)(O_4H_4)_2$	
		Dilnesa et al. (2014)		
Synthetic Hydrogarnet	(B. Lothenbach)	Very fine-grain;	$Ca_3(Al_{0.6}, Fe^{3+}_{1.4})_2(SiO_4)(O_4H_4)_2$	
		Dilnesa et al. (2014)		
Synthetic Hydrogarnet	(B. Lothenbach)	Very fine-grain;	Ca <sub>3</sub> Fe <sup>3+</sup> <sub>2</sub> (SiO <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>0.75</sub> (O <sub>4</sub> H <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>2.25</sub>	
		Dilnesa et al. (2014)		

702	Table 2 OU <sup>-</sup> stratching modes (	aroutar than 2560 am <sup>-1</sup>	observed for coloium silicate	cornate at room tomporatura	their aggigmment and eluster type
102	Table 2. Off stretching modes (		observed for calcium sincale	gamets at room temperature,	then assignment and cluster type

Natural	Natural	Synthetic Grossular-	Synthetic	Synthetic	Assignment	Crystal Chemistry
Grossulars*	Andradite§	Andradite-Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> H <sub>12</sub> O <sub>12</sub> -	Grossular <sup>#</sup>	Hydro/Andradite <sup>+</sup>		Cluster Type
$(cm^{-1})$	$(cm^{-1})$	$Ca_3(Al,Fe^{3+})_2H_{12}O_{12} \text{ Garnets}$	$(cm^{-1})$	$(cm^{-1})$		
		$(cm^{-1})$				
3684-3688	-	-	(3688)?	-	Hydrous inclusion phase	-
3674-3678	~3678	-	-	-	Hydrous inclusion phase	-
~3660	-	~3658	3666	-	Finite size katoite cluster	Fig. 4a
~3657	-	-	3660	-	Six $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ Hydrogrossular cluster (?)	Fig. 4g
~3641	-	-	3645	-	Five $(H_4O_4)^4$ - Hydrogrossular cluster	Fig. 4f
~3634	~(3632)	-	3633	-	Four $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ Hydrogrossular cluster	Fig. 4e
~3622	~(3621)	-	3623	-	Three $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ Hydrogrossular cluster	Fig. 4d
~3612	~(3611)?	-	3613	-	Two $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ Hydrogrossular cluster	Fig. 4c
~3599	-	-	3604	-	One $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ Hydrogrossular cluster	Fig. 4b
-	~3611?	~3611	-	3612	Finite size $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2O_{12}H_{12}$ cluster (?)	Fig. 4a
~(3594)	~3594	-	-	-	Unspecified Hydroandradite cluster	?
~(3581)	~3581	-	(3579)?	-	Unspecified Hydroandradite cluster	?

\*Varies from garnet to garnet and can be absent, <sup>§</sup>Geiger and Rossman (2018) and sample 4282, <sup>#</sup>this work from curve fit, <sup>+</sup>Geiger and Rossman

784 (2018) and Amthauer and Rossman (1998) for synthetic  $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2(4H_{0.19}Si_{2.81})O_{12}$ .

785	FIGURE CAPTIONS
786	
787	Figure 1. The four-component system $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}-Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}-Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2Si_3$
788	Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> Si <sub>3</sub> O <sub>12</sub> and the respective garnet nomenclature. The thick solid black lines indicate the
789	degree of possible solid solution and the black dotted lines indicate uncertainty. There can be
790	complete solid solution along the andradite-grossular and grossular-katoite binaries, but the
791	full degree of solid solution along the $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}$ -andradite and katoite- $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2H_{12}O_{12}$
792	joins is not known. The two gray dashed lines mark the 50:50 compositions of the four binary
793	systems. The solid-solution behavior of the $Ca_3Fe^{3+}_2Si_3O_{12}$ - $Ca_3Al_2H_{12}O_{12}$ and $Ca_3Al_2Si_3O_{12}$ -
794	Ca <sub>3</sub> Fe <sup>3+</sup> <sub>2</sub> H <sub>12</sub> O <sub>12</sub> binaries (gray dotted lines), as well as higher-order ternary or quaternary
795	compositions, is also not understood.
796	
797	Figure 2. Local atomic environment involving a single OH <sup>-</sup> dipole in the case of calcium
798	hydrogarnet (no Si cation). The oxygen anion is bonded to one $Y(Al \text{ or } Fe^{3+})$ cation (blue),
799	two X(Ca) cations (yellow - with bond lengths of Ca1-O(1) = $2.462(3)$ Å and Ca(2)-O(4) =
800	2.520(3) Å in hydrogrossular - Lager et al. 2002) and a H atom (pink).
801	
802	Figure 3. IR single-crystal spectra in the energy range of the OH <sup>-</sup> stretching vibrations for five
803	natural and synthetic garnets along the join Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> (H <sub>4</sub> O <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>3</sub> -Ca <sub>3</sub> Al <sub>2</sub> (SiO <sub>4</sub> ) <sub>3</sub> as replotted from
804	Rossman and Aines (1991). The sample labels (Table 1) and the number of Si atoms per
805	formula unit (pfu) are given.
806	
807	Figure 4. Various possible hydrogarnet-like clusters in grossular or andradite. H atoms are
808	pink, SiO <sub>4</sub> groups are red and YO <sub>6</sub> groups with $Y = Al^{3+}$ or Fe <sup>3+</sup> are blue. Hydrogarnet (H <sub>4</sub> O <sub>4</sub> )
809	"tetrahedra" are shown in green. The oxygen atoms located at the corners of the polyhedra

810 and the X-cation are not shown for the sake of clarity. a.) Crystal-chemical environment for

811	end-member katoite hydrogarnet or a finite-sized katoite-like cluster, as given by the OH
812	stretching mode at about 3662 cm <sup>-1</sup> . b.) Cluster arrangement involving a single $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ group
813	and the rest by $SiO_4$ groups, as given by the OH <sup>-</sup> stretching mode at about 3600 cm <sup>-1</sup> . c.)
814	Cluster arrangement involving two $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ groups and the rest SiO <sub>4</sub> groups, as given by the
815	mode at about 3611 cm <sup>-1</sup> . d.) Cluster arrangement involving three $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ groups and the rest
816	SiO <sub>4</sub> groups, as given by the mode at about 3622 cm <sup>-1</sup> . e.) Cluster arrangement involving four
817	$(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ groups and the rest SiO <sub>4</sub> groups, as given by the mode at about 3633 cm <sup>-1</sup> . f.) Cluster
818	arrangement involving five $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ groups and a single SiO <sub>4</sub> group, as given by the mode at
819	about 3644 cm <sup>-1</sup> and g.) Hypothetical cluster arrangement involving six $(H_4O_4)^{4-}$ groups, as
820	possibly given by the mode at about $3657 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ .
821	
822	Figure 5. a.) IR single-crystal spectra in the wavenumber range of the OH <sup>-</sup> stretching
823	vibrations of synthetic "end-member" grossular normalized to 1 mm thickness (Geiger and
824	Armbruster 1997) and natural nearly end-member grossular GRR 53 (Table 1). b.) Fitted
825	spectrum of synthetic grossular.
826	
827	Figure 6. IR single-crystal spectra in the energy range of the OH <sup>-</sup> stretching vibrations at RT
828	of natural grossular GRR 1285 (intensity 3x) and synthetic grossular Gr83 (normalized to 1
829	mm thickness) of Withers et al. (1998). Samples described in Table1.
830	
831	Figure 7. Stacked plot of different spectra of natural grossulars (Table 1) and the synthetic
832	hydrogarnet GRR 1059 showing OH <sup>-</sup> modes at about 3560, 3583, 3599, 3612, 3622, 3633,
833	3643, 3657 and 3662 cm <sup>-1</sup> . They are related to different microscopic- to nano-size
834	hydrogarnet clusters (see text). The mode at 3688 cm <sup>-1</sup> may be due to tiny "serpentine
835	mineral" inclusions (see text).

837	Fig 8	Supplementary figure	IR spectrum of grossular GRR 1386 (	Fable 1) and its ci	urve fit
037	1 1g. o.	Supplementary figure.	in specific of grossular OKK 1500 (	able 1) and its c	uive m.

- 838 Note the OH<sup>-</sup> modes at 3688 and 3674 cm<sup>-1</sup>. They are possibly related to the presence of tiny
- 839 inclusion phases of hydrous layer silicates and probably a "serpentine mineral" (see text).

840

- Figure 9. Stacked plot of IR ATR powder spectra of five synthetic hydrogarnets as
- synthesized and described by Dilnesa et al. (2014).

843

- Figure 10. IR single-crystal spectra in the energy range of the OH<sup>-</sup> stretching vibrations at 333
- K and 80 K of a natural "end-member" and radite GRR 1263 (Table 1).

846

- Figure 11. IR single-crystal spectrum in the energy range of the OH<sup>-</sup> stretching vibrations at
- 848 RT of natural "end-member" and radite 4282 (Table 1) with fitted bands.
- 849
- 850 Figure 12. IR single-crystal spectra in the energy range of the OH<sup>-</sup> stretching vibrations for:
- a.) sample 6741 of composition grossular73-andradite23 at 273 K and 80 K and b.) sample
- 852 KPK 56-12-9 of composition andradite73-grossular26 at RT. Sample description in Table 1.

853



860 Figure 1.









This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. DOI: https://doi.org/10.2138/am-2020-7256



900 b.)

901 Figure 5.

903





This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. DOI: https://doi.org/10.2138/am-2020-7256



915

917

918 Figure 8.

919

920





This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. DOI: https://doi.org/10.2138/am-2020-7256



Figure 11. 



946



949 Figure 12.