# 1 The validity of plagioclase-melt geothermometry for degassing-driven magma

- 2 **crystallisation**.
- 3

4 Humphreys, Madeleine C. S.<sup>1</sup>, Edmonds, Marie<sup>2</sup> and Klöcking, Marthe S.<sup>2</sup>

5

6 <sup>1</sup> Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, Science Labs, Durham, DH1 3LE, UK. Tel: +44

7 (0)191 334 2343. Email: madeleine.humphreys@durham.ac.uk

8  $^{2}$  Department of Earth Sciences, University of Cambridge, Downing Street, Cambridge, CB2 3EQ, UK

- 9
- 10

## Abstract

11 Any quantitative interpretation of the formation conditions of igneous rocks 12 requires methods for determining crystallisation temperature. Accurate application 13 of such thermobarometers relies on the attainment of equilibrium in the system to 14 be studied. This may be particularly difficult in silicic magmas, where diffusivities 15 are low and crystallisation kinetics sluggish. Moreover, progressive degassing of 16 volatile-rich magmas during ascent can result in continuous changes in effective 17 undercooling, causing particular problems in achieving equilibrium between melt 18 and crystals that grow in response to decompression. We consider these problems 19 in the context of plagioclase-melt equilibria for magmas undergoing decompression 20 and degassing-driven crystallisation, using two published thermometers. The two 21 thermometers show similar trends with key parameters but absolute temperatures 22 can vary significantly. Analysis of decompression experiments conducted at 23 constant temperature shows systematic variations in calculated temperature and equilibrium constant with varying decompression rate and quench pressure. This 24

25 indicates that an unrecognised lack of equilibration could result in significant 26 temperature overestimates and potentially spurious results. This highlights the 27 need to assess for equilibrium, and we discuss problems associated with some 28 commonly used indicators of equilibration. Finally, retrospective analysis of 29 published plagioclase-hosted melt inclusion suites from five subduction zone 30 volcanoes shows systematic increases in calculated temperature and decreases in 31 equilibrium constant with decreasing H<sub>2</sub>O concentration. While this could represent 32 the signature of latent heat of crystallisation, we suggest that such patterns should 33 be treated with caution unless there is clear evidence of sustained equilibrium 34 between plagioclase and melt during decompression.

- 35
- 36

#### Introduction

37 Thermometry and thermobarometry underpin igneous petrology as a quantitative 38 science. An ability to place quantitative estimates of temperature and pressure on 39 mineral ± melt assemblages observed in igneous rocks is fundamental to 40 understanding the conditions of magma storage, fractionation, ascent and eruption, 41 as well as melt generation processes, in any tectonic setting. For example, 42 clinopyroxene-melt thermobarometry was used to demonstrate that individual 43 eruptions in the Springerville volcanic field, Arizona, USA were derived from 44 different source regions in a vertically extensive mush reservoir, with magma 45 ponding levels influenced by changes in crustal rheology or density (Putirka and 46 Condit 2003). Cashman and Blundy (2013) used knowledge of plagioclase-melt 47 equilibria to reconstruct the pressure-temperature histories of individual, complexly zoned plagioclase phenocrysts from Mount St Helens, USA. Hornblende
thermobarometry also appears to define vertically extensive crystallisation
conditions for magmas from Redoubt volcano (Alaska) and El Reventador
(Ecuador), amongst others (Ridolfi et al. 2010).

52 Although application of thermobarometry is now routine, it still has the 53 potential to prompt new interpretations about the ways that magmas evolve and 54 migrate. For example, Blundy et al. (2006) used the plagioclase-liquid thermometer 55 of Putirka (2005) to determine entrapment temperatures for suites of plagioclase-56 hosted melt inclusions. The results showed strong increases in calculated 57 temperature with decreasing melt  $H_2O$  contents, interpreted as the result of latent 58 heat release during exothermic, decompression-driven crystallisation of volatile-59 saturated silicic magmas. This is significant because such release of latent heat could 60 produce commonly observed petrographic features, such as reversely zoned 61 phenocryst rims, that might otherwise be ascribed to late-stage mingling with hotter 62 magma (Blundy et al. 2006). With the increasing availability of relatively large mineral and/or melt datasets from electron microprobe and other analytical 63 64 techniques, thermometers are now routinely applied to whole datasets instead of 65 carefully chosen individual analyses. This has the potential to uncover subtle details 66 that are only apparent at the population level, but brings a risk of inadequate 67 interrogation of equilibration within the full dataset.

68 An important limitation is that in volcanic systems, where the timescales of 69 melt crystallisation, chemical diffusion or magma movement may be short, 70 geochemical equilibration between melt and mineral may be kinetically inhibited. 71 For example, both the major element composition and the trace element contents of 72 crystals are highly dependent on the degree of undercooling below the liquidus 73 temperature (e.g. Gamble and Taylor 1980; Kennedy et al. 1993; Dunbar et al. 1995; 74 Mollo et al. 2010, 2011b). Chemical diffusion rates can also be strongly dependent 75 on the concentrations of species that are involved in the reaction(s). This is not a 76 new problem and has been addressed by several authors historically, but is 77 particularly important in the context of degassing-driven processes in volatile-rich 78 magmas. In the context of thermobarometry, these factors represent varying 79 degrees of disequilibrium and have the potential to produce biased or spurious 80 temperatures if this is not recognised (e.g. Putirka 2008; Mollo et al. 2011b). In 81 particular, Mollo et al. (2010) and Mollo et al. (2011b) showed that increasing the 82 cooling rate of anhydrous basaltic melt from 0.5 to 15 °C/min could generate an 83 overestimate in calculated temperature of up to 150 °C.

84 Here, we highlight the problems of not recognising incomplete equilibration 85 in H<sub>2</sub>O-bearing magmas, many of which crystallise due to decompression rather than cooling (e.g. Geschwind and Rutherford 1995; Blundy and Cashman 2001), 86 87 where diffusivities are low and crystallisation kinetics may be very sluggish. In this 88 scenario, the *thermal* undercooling driving crystallisation may be negligible but 89 substantial effective undercoolings are still readily achieved by decompression and 90 water loss. We focus on plagioclase-melt thermometry and degassing-driven magma 91 crystallisation, which is particularly sensitive to the kinetics of crystal nucleation 92 and growth. Drawing on previously published natural datasets and experimental 93 studies, we demonstrate that disequilibrium crystallisation during degassing can result in large errors in thermometry, and that this can lead to potentially very
significant problems with obtaining a unique interpretation of the resultant P-T
conditions.

- 97
- 98

# **Plagioclase-melt thermobarometry**

99 Plagioclase-melt thermometers are based on equilibrium exchange of albite (Ab)

100 and anorthite (An) components between solid (s) and melt (m):

101 
$$An_{(m)} + Ab_{(s)} = An_{(s)} + Ab_{(m)}$$
 [1]

102 with the equilibrium constant for An-Ab exchange expressed as (Putirka 2005;103 Putirka 2008):

104 
$$K_D = (X_{An}^{pl*}Ca^{L*}Al^L) / (X_{Ab}^{pl*}Na^{L*}Si^L)$$
 [2]

105 where (e.g.)  $Ca^{L}$  refers to the anhydrous cation fraction of Ca in the liquid and  $X_{An}$  is 106 the mole fraction of anorthite in plagioclase. The composition of plagioclase 107 crystallising from a melt is controlled by temperature, melt composition and melt 108 H<sub>2</sub>O concentration. In anhydrous melts, the equilibrium plagioclase composition 109 shifts systematically towards albite with decreasing temperature (e.g. (Bowen 1913; 110 Kudo and Weill 1970; Drake 1976). In hydrous melts, the shape of the albite-111 anorthite binary loop in T-X space is broadened and shifted to lower temperature 112 relative to anhydrous compositions (Kudo and Weill 1970; Drake 1976; Johannes 113 1984). This may be because OH tends to complex with Na and SiO<sub>4</sub> groups in 114 preference to Ca and AlO<sub>4</sub>, particularly at higher temperature (Lange et al. 2009). 115 This means that addition of H<sub>2</sub>O causes a decrease in activity of the albite 116 component of the melt, aAb(m), relative to aAn(m) and the liquidus plagioclase

- 117 composition therefore becomes more calcic (e.g. Arculus and Wills 1980; Housh and
- Luhr 1991; Sisson and Grove 1993; Panjasawatwong et al. 1995).
- 119

120 We focus on two of the most recently published plagioclase-melt thermometers: 121 model A of Putirka (2005) and the plagioclase-melt hygrometer of Lange et al. 122 (2009). The latter has been recalibrated and updated by Waters and Lange (in 123 press). Both models are based on empirical regression of thermodynamically 124 derived expressions. Calibration of both models was done using large databases of 125 phase equilibrium experiments that crystallised plagioclase over a range of 126 pressures, temperatures and  $H_2O$  concentrations. A second set of experiments was 127 used to test each model. The Putirka model (model A) was calibrated on basaltic to 128 rhyolitic liquids that crystallised plagioclase from 0.001-13 kbar, 998-1623 K and 129  $H_2O$  concentrations up to 15 wt%. According to the test data, the model returns 130 temperature with a standard error estimate of  $\pm$  23 K (Putirka 2005). A later 131 independent test using a larger dataset of additional experiments gave an average 132 absolute deviation of ±19 °C and propagated uncertainty of ± 7 MPa for experiments 133 on hydrous rhyolite at 750-995 °C and 15-313 MPa (Blundy et al. 2006). The Lange 134 et al. (2009) hygrometer was calibrated on rhyolitic melts with <30 vol% crystals at 135 925-1100 °C, 48-300 MPa and 2.2-7.0 wt% H<sub>2</sub>O. Temperatures were recovered for 136 the test data with an average uncertainty of  $\pm$  14 °C, while the standard error 137 estimate for  $H_2O$  was  $\pm 0.32$  wt% (Lange et al. 2009).

- 138
- 139

#### **Comparison of the thermobarometers**

140 We first used each of the two thermometers to predict the shape of constant- $X_{An}$ 141 contours in  $H_2O-T$  space (figure 1) for a representative rhyolitic matrix glass 142 composition from Soufrière Hills volcano, Montserrat (table 1), for comparison with 143 the experimental study of Couch et al. (2003). For the Lange thermometer, this 144 involved supplying X<sub>An</sub>, T, P and melt composition to the model and retrieving melt 145  $H_2O$  over a range of temperatures. We ran these calculations using pressures of 10 146 MPa and 200 MPa, but this made little difference to the absolute H<sub>2</sub>O concentrations 147 retrieved and had no effect on the shape of the X<sub>An</sub> contours. We therefore 148 subsequently assumed  $H_2O$ -saturated conditions and calculated  $P_{tot} = pH_2O$  using 149 VolatileCalc (Newman and Lowenstern 2002) (we define pH<sub>2</sub>O as the partial 150 pressure of  $H_2O$ , which for a pure  $H_2O$  magmatic component is the total confining 151 pressure at volatile saturation for a given H<sub>2</sub>O concentration). For the Putirka 152 thermometer we supplied X<sub>An</sub>, H<sub>2</sub>O content, P and melt composition and retrieved 153 temperature, again assuming that  $P_{tot} = pH_2O$ .

154

155 Both models calculate an increase in temperature with decreasing H<sub>2</sub>O 156 concentration at constant X<sub>An</sub> and fixed melt composition (figure 1a), as expected. 157 Equivalent calculations using a basaltic-andesite melt from Hamada & Fujii (2007; 158 see table 1) produce parallel curves offset to higher temperature at the same  $H_2O$ 159 concentration. However, the overall results are highly model-dependent, 160 particularly at low  $H_2O$  concentrations where there are big disparities between 161 temperatures predicted for a given X<sub>An</sub>. For example, at 20 MPa (1.3 wt% H<sub>2</sub>O, 162 volatile-saturated) plagioclase of composition  $An_{70}$  is predicted to occur in H<sub>2</sub>O-

saturated melt at 951 °C using Putirka (2005) but at >1300 °C using Lange et al.
(2009) (figure 1a). This indicates that application of plagioclase-melt equilibria to
give *absolute* temperature estimates must be subject to at least some uncertainty.
Data from the phase equilibrium experiments of Couch et al. (2003), which were
used as a calibration dataset for Lange et al. (2009) but not for Putirka (2005), lie
between the two models (figure 1a).

169

170 Figure 1

171

172 Secondly, we calculated temperature contours in  $H_2O - X_{An}$  space, which show a 173 positive correlation of X<sub>An</sub> with H<sub>2</sub>O concentration at constant temperature (figure 174 1b). The results are similarly model-dependent, with only minor variations in slope 175 of the temperature contours but significant variations in the absolute H<sub>2</sub>O 176 concentration predicted to be in equilibrium with a given plagioclase composition. 177 In comparison, RhyoliteMELTS (Gualda et al. 2012) isothermal decompression runs 178 and the data from Couch et al. (2003) show a much steeper variation of X<sub>An</sub> with H<sub>2</sub>O 179 (figure 1b).

180

181 Figure 2

182

Finally, we calculated isobaric contours for H<sub>2</sub>O-saturated rhyolite in T-X<sub>An</sub> space; these define a positive correlation of temperature with X<sub>An</sub> (figure 2). The two models agree well at lower temperature and more sodic plagioclase compositions but diverge with increasing temperature and  $X_{An}$ . RhyoliteMELTS isobaric cooling runs are offset towards lower temperature and lower  $X_{An}$ , and with steeper slope in T-X<sub>An</sub> space, than either of the other two thermobarometers (figure 2). The data from Couch et al. (2003) are offset to higher  $X_{An}$  relative to the Lange model and have a steeper slope than the Putirka model (figure 2).

191

192 Figure 3

193

As a possible test for equilibrium in the system  $Ca_2Al_2Si_2O_8$  –  $NaAlSi_3O_8$  –  $H_2O$  – 194 195 silicate melt, the equilibrium constant for Ab-An exchange, K<sub>D</sub> (equation [2]) is 196 reported to be normally distributed with values of 0.10  $\pm$  0.05 for T < 1050 °C 197 (mostly hydrous) and 0.27  $\pm$  0.11 for T  $\geq$  1050 °C, for a global compilation of test 198 data (Putirka 2008). To assess the significance of individual external parameters in 199 contributing to this variation, we retrieved  $K_D$  from the equilibrium calculations 200 described above, using the Putirka thermometer. Importantly, the results show that 201 for a fixed melt composition and fixed H<sub>2</sub>O concentration *at equilibrium conditions*, 202 variations in X<sub>An</sub> cause K<sub>D</sub> to decrease systematically with increasing temperature 203 (figure 3a). Similarly, for a fixed melt composition at equilibrium at a constant 204 calculated temperature, the link between X<sub>An</sub> and pH<sub>2</sub>O means that K<sub>D</sub> decreases 205 systematically with increasing X<sub>An</sub> or increasing pH<sub>2</sub>O (figure 3b,c). These variations 206 mean that the equilibrium constant cannot easily be used to assess whether 207 equilibrium has been achieved.

208

209

#### pH<sub>2</sub>O – T profiles of decompression experiments

210 Both thermobarometers were originally calibrated and tested using phase 211 equilibrium studies at fixed P, T conditions. However, many of their potential 212 applications are for magmas that have experienced more dynamic conditions, 213 including degassing-induced crystallisation. To test the applicability of the 214 thermobarometers for these conditions in natural volatile-rich magmas, we used the 215 results of three sets of decompression experiments that crystallised plagioclase 216 from hydrous, silicic melt at variable decompression rates representative of typical 217 intermediate magma ascent. Cichy et al. (2011) performed isothermal 218 decompression experiments on a synthetic, H<sub>2</sub>O-bearing Unzen rhyodacite melt 219 composition at 850 °C and at decompression rates from 0.0002 to 20 MPa/s. Glass 220  $H_2O$  contents were analysed by FTIR but represent incomplete (disequilibrium) 221 degassing due to retarded bubble nucleation (Cichy et al. 2011). Secondly, Martel 222 and Schmidt (2003) ran both isobaric and decompression experiments on  $H_2O$ -223 saturated, synthetic rhyolitic melt at 860 °C and 15-170 MPa, at decompression 224 rates from 0.000017 – 16 MPa/s. Thirdly, Brugger and Hammer (2010) performed 225 two series of experiments using used a crushed natural rhyodacitic starting 226 material: one set of experiments was quenched along a decompression path ('snapshots') and the other set was allowed to anneal at the final pressure. 227 228 Decompression rates varied between 0.008 and 0.17 MPa/s. For each experimental 229 dataset, we took the glass composition,  $H_2O$  concentration of the glass (either calculated as volatiles by difference or from published measurements, see 230 231 supplementary data table) and coexisting plagioclase composition to calculate the

Always consult and cite the final, published document. See http://www.minsocam.org or GeoscienceWorld

232	equilibrium temperature ( $T_{calc}$ , see supplementary data table). Except for mixed
233	volatile ( $H_2O+CO_2$ ) experiments we assumed melt $H_2O$ saturation, and used
234	VolatileCalc (Newman and Lowenstern 2002) to convert $H_2O$ concentration to $pH_2O$
235	in MPa. This is important because in all three experimental studies, $H_2O$ degassing
236	was retarded relative to equilibrium, showing higher concentrations in the glass
237	than the solubility at the experimental quench pressure (figure 4). Treating the data
238	in this way as volatile-saturated 'unknowns' therefore results in anomalously high
239	estimates of P <sub>tot</sub> .

240

241 Figure 4

242

243 Application of the Putirka thermometer to data from the Martel and Schmidt 244 (2003) and Brugger and Hammer (2010) experimental series shows a general pattern of increasing  $T_{calc}$  and decreasing  $K_D$  with decreasing  $pH_2O$  (figure 5), even 245 246 though the experiments were run at controlled temperature. Temperatures 247 calculated from the 'low pressure' experiments of Martel and Schmidt (2003) are 248 scattered within  $\pm 45$  °C of the experimental run temperature (860  $\pm 5$  °C, Martel 249 and Schmidt 2003), whereas the 'high pressure' experiments are systematically 250 offset to significantly higher calculated temperatures, up to 84 °C greater than the 251 experimental run temperature (figure 5). Their isobaric experiments also show an 252 increase of  $T_{calc}$  with lower H<sub>2</sub>O measurements (see supplementary data table). In 253 contrast, temperatures for data from the Brugger and Hammer (2010) experiments 254 are typically lower than the experimental run temperature (figure 5). The glass compositions in all experiments show clear trends of increasing K<sub>2</sub>O and decreasing CaO content as pH<sub>2</sub>O decreases due to progressive decompression, degassing and crystallisation (see supplementary data table). The annealed experiments from Brugger and Hammer (2010) had a more Al-poor, K-rich and Si-rich residual melt composition and crystallised more albitic plagioclase; consequently temperatures calculated from these data are slightly lower at a given pH<sub>2</sub>O than the snapshot experiments.

262

263 Figure 5

264

Temperatures calculated from Martel and Schmidt (2003) generally show an increase with increasing decompression rate except at the very highest decompression rates (>10 MPa/s); calculated K<sub>D</sub>s increase systematically with increasing decompression rate (figure 6) and with  $T_{calc}$  (supplementary data table). In contrast, the Brugger & Hammer data show no variation of either  $T_{calc}$  or K<sub>D</sub> with decompression rate (figure 6), and no variation of K<sub>D</sub> with  $T_{calc}$ , over the more limited range of decompression rates (see supplementary data table).

272

273 Figure 6

274

Fewer data are available for the Cichy et al. (2011) experiments but the available data give higher (and more scattered) calculated temperatures and lower K<sub>D</sub> at lower pH<sub>2</sub>O (figure 5). In contrast, there are clear increases in both T<sub>calc</sub> and K<sub>D</sub> with 278 increasing decompression rate, similar to calculations from the experiments of 279 Martel & Schmidt (figure 6), and  $K_D$  increases systematically with  $T_{calc}$  (see 280 supplementary data table). The glass compositions also change systematically as a 281 function of both pH<sub>2</sub>O and decompression rate (supplementary data table).

282

283 The same patterns of  $T_{calc}$  are also seen using the Lange et al. (2009) 284 thermometer. The two sets of calculated temperatures correlate reasonably well but 285 those calculated using Lange et al. (2009) are typically significantly higher. 286 Meaningful temperatures commonly cannot be returned for evolved melts with low 287  $H_2O$  content. This is due to an instability in the calculation of aAb(m) for 288 temperatures  $\geq$ 1200 °C, which has been corrected by the recalibrated version of the 289 hygrometer (Waters and Lange in press; Lange & Waters, personal communication). 290 For this reason, and because the same trends were observed with both models, we 291 only used the Putirka thermometer for subsequent analysis of natural datasets (see 292 below).

293

294

# pH<sub>2</sub>O-T profiles of magmas recorded in melt inclusions

We applied a similar approach to populations of plagioclase-hosted melt inclusions where the composition of coexisting melt and feldspar and the H<sub>2</sub>O content of the melt are both known, following Blundy et al. (2006). This allowed us to calculate the apparent equilibrium temperature of entrapment for each melt inclusion and plagioclase host pair, resulting in arrays of pH<sub>2</sub>O-T coordinates (see supplementary data table) and thus apparent magma ascent paths in pH<sub>2</sub>O-T space. We examined

301 suites of melt inclusion data from the literature for Mount St Helens, USA (Blundy et 302 al. 2006); Shiveluch Volcano, Kamchatka (Blundy et al. 2006); Soufrière Hills, 303 Montserrat (Humphreys et al. 2009a, 2010); Unzen, Japan (Botcharnikov et al. 304 2008) and Izu-Oshima, Japan (Hamada and Fujii 2007). All datasets show a clear 305 increase in  $T_{calc}$  with decreasing melt  $H_2O$  (figure 7), approximately parallel to 306 constant- $X_{An}$  contours shown in figure 1, as previously reported for Mount St Helens 307 and Shiveluch by Blundy et al. (2006). There is a slight positive correlation of  $T_{calc}$ 308 with X<sub>An</sub> for the dataset as a whole (figure 7). For the rhyolitic melts (Soufrière Hills, 309 Mount St Helens and Shiveluch), calculated  $K_{DS}$  are low and typically decrease 310 systematically with increasing X<sub>An</sub> in the host plagioclase and increase 311 systematically with increasing melt H<sub>2</sub>O concentration (figure 8); the latter is the 312 opposite to the trend observed for the equilibrium calculations (see figure 3). 313 Calculated K<sub>D</sub>s are higher for the andesitic (Unzen) and basaltic andesite (Izu 314 Oshima) melts but the same trends are observed (figure 8).

315

316 Figure 8

317

Regression of  $T_{calc}$  for each dataset with the individual parameters that contribute to the temperature calculation typically gives  $R^2 \le 0.92$  for correlation of  $T_{calc}$  with  $H_2O$ and low to insignificant  $R^2$  (typically  $\le 0.25$ ) for other parameters (figures 9, 10). This indicates that up to 92% of the total variability in  $T_{calc}$  from each case study results from variability in melt  $H_2O$  concentrations, typically with little effect of changing melt or plagioclase composition. This is reinforced by the fact that

324	'ruptured' melt inclusions (those known from their major element composition to
325	have leaked $H_2O$ , Blundy and Cashman 2005; Blundy et al. 2008) give anomalously
326	high calculated temperatures, some in excess of 1000 °C (figure 7; supplementary
327	data table). In fact, the full range of $T_{calc}$ recorded by each dataset can be reproduced
328	by manually changing the $H_2O$ concentration of any individual inclusion, whereas
329	the host plagioclase composition has relatively little effect on $T_{\mbox{\scriptsize calc}}$

330

331 Figures 9, 10

- 332
- 333

# Discussion

#### 334 Degassing-induced crystallisation under disequilibrium conditions?

335 Our analysis shows that many arc magmas (all those examined) show evidence of 336 apparent heating during degassing-induced crystallisation driven by 337 decompression. Decreasing melt H<sub>2</sub>O concentration is the primary factor that drives 338 the increase in calculated temperature, accounting for up to 92% of the observed 339 variations in T<sub>calc</sub>. Experimental studies where volatile-saturated melt is 340 decompressed at constant temperature also show the same effect, giving systematic 341 increases in  $T_{calc}$  with decreasing melt  $H_2O$  concentration. Studies that covered a 342 wide range of decompression rates also show a systematic increase of T<sub>calc</sub> with 343 increasing decompression rate, although the Brugger & Hammer dataset shows that 344 absolute temperature may not always be overestimated (see below). Finally, the 345 equilibrium constant for reaction of plagioclase and melt also varies systematically 346 with both melt H<sub>2</sub>O concentration and decompression rate. These observations

347 suggest that the calculated temperatures in the systems examined may reflect a 348 disequilibrium process of volatile degassing and melt crystallisation. This could 349 arise because crystal and bubble nucleation and growth at low pH<sub>2</sub>O is hindered by 350 the increasing diffusivities of components within the melt, which are intimately 351 linked to degassing kinetics and temperature (e.g. Cashman and Blundy 2000; 352 Hammer and Rutherford 2002; Couch et al. 2003b; Brugger and Hammer 2010). A 353 lack of equilibrium in the decompression experiments is evidenced by variations in 354 crystal size distribution and degree of plagioclase saturation, and progressive 355 changes towards disequilibrium crystal morphologies with increasing 356 decompression rate (Brugger and Hammer 2010). The slow equilibration process is 357 also indicated by the slightly lower calculated temperatures retrieved (see figure 5) 358 and more Ab-rich plagioclase crystallised in their series of experiments that were 359 annealed at constant temperature following decompression, and by the failure of 360 the MELTS algorithm to predict melt compositions for experiments quenched at 361 <45 MPa (Brugger and Hammer 2010). Finally, the systematic variations of K<sub>D</sub> with 362 temperature,  $pH_2O$  and decompression rate in the experimental studies clearly 363 show that these do not represent equilibrium conditions.

364

All the experimental studies examined here report a range of plagioclase compositions for each run. Plagioclase compositions closest to equilibrium are typically found at the crystal rim, with early-formed, more calcic plagioclase preserved in the cores (Martel and Schmidt 2003; Brugger and Hammer 2010; Waters 2013). This is explained by crystallisation during increasing extents of effective undercooling,  $\Delta T_{eff}$  (defined as  $T_{liquidus} - T_{magma}$ , see Crabtree and Lange 2011). Initially, crystallisation is inhibited relative to the equilibrium case, resulting in lower volumes of plagioclase growth; insufficient time available for complete reequilibration means that as melt H<sub>2</sub>O continues to change, new growth is added as more Ab-rich plagioclase, closer to equilibrium compositions (Brugger and Hammer 2010).

376

# 377 How accurate are calculated temperatures?

378 There is poor agreement between the two thermometers examined here, except for 379 H<sub>2</sub>O-rich melts and more albitic plagioclase (see figures 1 and 2). This means that it 380 is difficult to be confident about the significance of absolute calculated 381 temperatures, although relative variations appear robust. Secondly, crystallisation 382 temperatures can be significantly over-estimated in the system plagioclase-melt-383  $H_2O$  if disequilibrium is not recognised. This is consistent with observations of 384 (Mollo et al. 2010, 2011) for both plagioclase and clinopyroxene in anhydrous 385 basalt. Such disequilibrium would most likely take the form of hindered H<sub>2</sub>O 386 degassing into vesicles, disequilibrium crystallisation of anomalously An-rich 387 plagioclase, or (for melt inclusions) variable loss of H from the inclusions after 388 entrapment (see later). Our analysis shows that increases in  $T_{calc}$  can reflect 389 increasing  $\Delta T_{eff}$  due to changes in melt H<sub>2</sub>O during decompression, as the melt 390 viscosity increases and the kinetics of crystallisation become sluggish, rather than 391 real increases in magma temperature. This means that, without an independent 392 measure of  $\Delta T_{eff}$ , it is difficult to interpret significant increases in calculated

temperature during magma ascent as unequivocally due to latent heat ofcrystallisation (Blundy et al. 2006).

395

396 Substantial release of latent heat is, however, predicted on theoretical grounds, 397 because the primary driving force for crystallisation during decompression of 398 volatile-saturated magma is  $H_2O$  loss from the melt (Blundy et al. 2006). 399 Thermodynamic calculations indicate that plagioclase crystallisation from an anhydrous melt would result in temperature increase of  $\sim 2.3$  °C per 1% 400 401 crystallisation (Couch et al. 2001), while the assemblage plagioclase + 402 orthopyroxene + oxides would give  $\sim 3.2$  °C per 1% (Blundy et al. 2006). For the 403 natural datasets studied here, the temperatures estimated from plagioclase-liquid 404 thermometry are typically well matched by two-oxide temperatures, including for 405 Mount St Helens and Shiveluch (Blundy et al. 2006) and Soufrière Hills, Montserrat 406 (two-oxide microphenocryst or microlite temperatures 958-1017 °C, Humphreys et 407 al. 2009b; temperatures up to  $\sim$ 968 °C from plagioclase-liquid thermometry, this 408 study). For Unzen, oxide equilibria indicate that the pre-eruptive magma was stored 409 at ~790 °C whereas groundmass oxides give temperatures of ~890 °C (Venezky & 410 Rutherford 1999), and plagioclase-liquid temperatures are significantly higher 411 (900–1080 °C, see figure 10). However, we note that even though in some cases 412 plagioclase-liquid temperatures calculated from Putirka (2005) and 2-oxide 413 temperatures are very similar, the available two-oxide temperatures would not be 414 in agreement with any of the plagioclase-liquid temperatures calculated using the 415 Lange et al. (2009) model. Variably high 2-oxide temperatures may otherwise be

416 ascribed to magma mixing immediately prior to eruption (e.g. Devine et al. 2003;417 Blundy et al. 2006).

418

419 We are not aware of any further temperature estimates for Izu Oshima volcano, but 420 Hamada and Fujii (2007) interpreted the variations in  $H_2O$  concentration in their 421 melt inclusion suite as the result of variable H<sub>2</sub>O loss from the inclusions. A similar 422 interpretation has been proposed to explain the variable  $H_2O$  contents of 423 plagioclase-hosted melt inclusions from Soufriere Hills Volcano, as a result of rapid 424 diffusional re-equilibration of  $H_2O$  through the phenocryst host (Mann et al. 2013). 425 If this were the case, then the significant increase in calculated temperature seen in 426 both datasets would result from disequilibrium driven by diffusive H loss from the 427 inclusions, with the inclusion and host unable to re-equilibrate except on much 428 longer timescales. This is effectively equivalent to the 'ruptured' melt inclusions from Mount St Helens (Blundy et al. 2008), which are known to have undergone 429 430 syneruptive leakage of H<sub>2</sub>O and which give anomalously high calculated 431 temperatures (see figure 7).

432

Although overall the data from the decompression experiments show similar patterns of calculated temperature, there are also clear differences between studies. The experiments of Martel and Schmidt (2003) and Cichy et al. (2011) give calculated temperatures that are mostly too high, and are consistent with experimental run conditions only at high pH<sub>2</sub>O (figure 5c, e) and for the 'low pressure' series of Martel & Schmidt (2003). However, the Brugger and Hammer 439 (2010) dataset consistently underestimates the known experimental run 440 conditions, even though the same pattern of increasing temperature with 441 decreasing  $pH_2O$  is still observed (figure 5a). A potentially significant difference 442 between these studies is that Brugger and Hammer (2010) used a crushed natural 443 starting material while both Martel and Schmidt (2003) and Cichy et al. (2011) used 444 synthetic starting materials made from mixed powders. The use of different starting materials could affect the degree of approach to equilibrium during the 445 446 experiments, particularly for experiments that cover a broad range of P-T-H<sub>2</sub>O 447 conditions (Pichavant et al. 2007).

448

449 An important final question is how to assess the accuracy of calculated 450 temperatures, or  $\Delta T_{\text{eff}}$ , in natural magmas. For the experiments, accuracy is simple 451 to gauge by comparison with the known experimental temperature. However, for 452 natural melt inclusion datasets (or crystal rim - host melt pairs) this is impossible 453 without an independent measure of temperature and/or  $\Delta T_{eff}$ . Any calculated 454 temperature using the plagioclase-liquid thermometer should therefore be 455 considered as a maximum unless there is clear evidence of equilibrium (see below). 456 Ideally,  $\Delta T_{eff}$  should be constrained independently, but in practice this is difficult. 457 Integration of quantitative or qualitative textural studies with minor or trace 458 element partitioning, which is known to be strongly dependent on  $\Delta T$  (e.g. Gamble 459 and Taylor 1980), may represent one path towards obtaining a less equivocal 460 measure of the degree of disequilibrium in natural systems. However, we suggest 461 that calculated  $K_D$  that are within the 'equilibrium range' of 0.10 ± 0.05 (for

temperatures < 1050 °C, Putirka 2008) are not sufficient to indicate complete</li>
equilibration. Even the isobaric experiments of Martel and Schmidt (2003) show a
small but systematic decrease in K<sub>D</sub> from 0.06 to 0.03 for a pressure range of 170 to
50 MPa, and this also reflects our calculations at fixed pH<sub>2</sub>O and melt composition
(see figure 3; supplementary data table).

467

# 468 **Broader constraints on determining equilibrium in melt inclusions**

469 It is commonly assumed that melt inclusion glass is in equilibrium with the host 470 mineral, based on observing whether the inclusions have euhedral 'negative crystal' 471 shapes or are rounded. The faceted negative crystal shapes are typically interpreted 472 as equilibrated, but in fact the texturally equilibrated shape moves towards rounded 473 surfaces with constant mean curvature in an attempt to minimise interfacial energy 474 (e.g. Bulau et al. 1979). Chemically, equilibrium in melt inclusions is commonly 475 tested by calculating the apparent mineral-melt K<sub>D</sub> for the inclusion and its host phenocryst, as described above for plagioclase-hosted melt inclusions. For slowly 476 477 equilibrating crystals, complex zoning textures in the host phase around the 478 inclusion may be clearly obvious using light microscopy or scanning electron 479 microscopy. However, in more rapidly equilibrating systems (e.g. olivine-hosted 480 inclusions) the major element Mg-Fe profiles may appear equilibrated while 481 significant chemical zoning of minor or trace components (e.g. Cr, Ni, P, Al) may still 482 be present, either within the host grain (e.g. Milman-Barris et al. 2008) or at the 483 margins of the melt inclusions (Newcombe et al. 2014). This is demonstrated by P 484 mapping of slowly cooled cumulate olivines that retained compositional zoning

This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. (DOI will not work until issue is live.) DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2138/am-2016-5314

features from a primary dendritic crystal architecture (Welsch et al. 2014).
Depending on whether the thermometer of choice involves major elements or trace
components, these issues may be significant or unimportant.

488

489 *Figure 11* 

490

491 For plagioclase, diffusivities are overall much lower than in olivine, so major 492 element zonation is usually clearly evident (figure 11). Melt inclusions in plagioclase 493 commonly appear to be linked to periods of partial dissolution of the crystal, 494 suggesting that formation of a rough interface predisposes the crystals towards melt 495 entrapment. The main problem is usually to to deduce which part of the host crystal 496 most likely represents 'equilibrium' host plagioclase; in some cases this may be 497 possible from careful examination of the plagioclase zoning textures (figure 11; 498 Blundy and Cashman 2005; Humphreys et al. 2008). In other cases, petrographic 499 examination shows that melt inclusions form an irregular, interconnected network 500 in 3D, linked to either significant partial dissolution of the crystal during its 501 evolution (reaction-controlled entrapment), or skeletal or hopper growth forms 502 (growth entrapment). It may be very difficult to distinguish these two processes, 503 particularly in crystals where partial textural equilibration has occurred leading to 504 rounding of primary skeletal facets. Similar textures to those observed in plagioclase 505 are also seen in both hornblende-hosted and pyroxene-hosted melt inclusions, and 506 we suggest that further careful X-ray mapping in olivine is likely to show that these 507 same processes are also present in olivine-hosted melt inclusions.

508

509

# Implications

510 An analysis of variations in temperature calculated using two published plagioclase-511 liquid thermometers shows that disequilibrium conditions can result in significant 512 temperature overestimates for the system melt-plagioclase- $H_2O$ . Differences in 513 temperature calculated by the different models imply that *absolute* temperatures 514 returned by the models should not be used with too much certainty. Systematic 515 variations in both calculated temperature and  $K_D$  are observed with increasing 516 decompression rate in isothermal decompression experiments. This implies that 517 disequilibrium degassing of H<sub>2</sub>O from the melt is an important control on calculated 518 temperatures, and/or that growth of the equilibrium feldspar composition becomes 519 impeded during H<sub>2</sub>O degassing as melt viscosity and species diffusivities increase. 520 Several natural melt inclusions datasets were examined and each shows a clear 521 trend of apparent heating with decreasing melt  $H_2O$  content. This could imply that 522 significant latent heating during degassing-induced crystallisation is a generic 523 feature of subduction zone volcanoes, or that syn-eruptive or post-entrapment  $H_2O$ 524 loss from melt inclusions during disequilibrium crystallisation is a significant 525 process in degassing magmas. We suggest that the calculated temperatures should 526 be treated as maxima unless there is direct evidence of equilibrium between 527 plagioclase and melt.

528

529

#### Acknowledgements

530	MCSH acknowledges support from a Royal Society University Research Fellowship.
531	We are grateful to Caroline Martel for provision of unpublished glass compositional
532	data and to Becky Lange and Laura Waters for discussion and advance access to
533	their recalibrated hygrometer. We acknowledge useful discussions with Jon Blundy,
534	Kathy Cashman, Keith Putirka, Tom Sisson and Julia Hammer, and journal reviews
535	from Fidel Costa and an anonymous reviewer.
536	
537	References
538 539	Arculus, R.J., and Wills, K.J.A. (1980) The petrology of plutonic blocks and inclusions from the Lesser Antilles Island Arc. Journal of Petrology, 21, 743–799.
540 541 542	Blundy, J., and Cashman, K. (2001) Ascent-driven crystallisation of dacite magmas at Mount St Helens, 1980–1986. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 140, 631–650.
543 544	——— (2005) Rapid decompression-driven crystallization recorded by melt inclusions from Mount St. Helens volcano. Geology, 33, 793–796.
545 546	Blundy, J., Cashman, K., and Humphreys, M. (2006) Magma heating by decompression- driven crystallization beneath andesite volcanoes. Nature, 443, 76–80.
547 548 549 550	Blundy, J., Cashman, K.V., and Berlo, K. (2008) Evolving magma storage conditions beneath Mount St. Helens inferred from chemical variations in melt inclusions from the 1980-1986 and current (2004-2005) eruptions. In A volcano rekindled: The renewed eruption of Mount St. Helens, 2004-2006 Vol. 1750, pp. 755–790.
551 552 553 554	Botcharnikov, R.E., Holtz, F., Almeev, R.R., Sato, H., and Behrens, H. (2008) Storage conditions and evolution of andesitic magma prior to the 1991–95 eruption of Unzen volcano: Constraints from natural samples and phase equilibria experiments. Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research, 175, 168–180.
555 556	Bowen, N.L. (1913) The melting phenomena of the plagioclase feldspar. American Journal of Science, 35, 577–599.
557 558 559	Brugger, C.R., and Hammer, J.E. (2010) Crystallization Kinetics in Continuous Decompression Experiments: Implications for Interpreting Natural Magma Ascent Processes. Journal of Petrology, 51, 1941–1965.

560	Bulau, J.R., Waff, H.S., and Tyburczy, J.A. (1979) Mechanical and thermodynamic
561	constraints on fluid distribution in partial melts. Journal of Geophysical Research,
562	84, 6102–6108.
563	Cashman, K., and Blundy, J. (2000) Degassing and crystallization of ascending andesite
564	and dacite. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series A:
565	Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences, 358, 1487–1513.
566	——— (2013) Petrological cannibalism: the chemical and textural consequences of
567	incremental magma body growth. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology,
568	166, 703–729.
569	Cichy, S.B., Botcharnikov, R.E., Holtz, F., and Behrens, H. (2011) Vesiculation and
570	Microlite Crystallization Induced by Decompression: a Case Study of the 1991-
571	1995 Mt Unzen Eruption (Japan). Journal of Petrology, 52, 1469–1492.
572 573 574	Couch, S., Sparks, R.S.J., and Carroll, M.R. (2001) Mineral disequilibrium in lavas explained by convective self-mixing in open magma chambers. Nature, 411, 1037–1039.
575 576 577	Couch, S., Harford, C.L., Sparks, R.S.J., and Carroll, M.R. (2003a) Experimental constraints on the conditions of formation of highly calcic plagioclase microlites at the Soufrière Hills Volcano, Montserrat. Journal of Petrology, 44, 1455–1475.
578 579 580	Couch, S., Sparks, R.S.J., and Carroll, M.R. (2003b) The kinetics of degassing-induced crystallization at Soufriere Hills Volcano, Montserrat. Journal of Petrology, 44, 1477–1502.
581	Crabtree, S.M., and Lange, R.A. (2011) Complex Phenocryst Textures and Zoning
582	Patterns in Andesites and Dacites: Evidence of Degassing-Induced Rapid
583	Crystallization? Journal of Petrology, 52, 3–38.
584	Devine, J.D., Rutherford, M.J., Norton, G.E., and Young, S.R. (2003) Magma storage
585	region processes inferred from geochemistry of Fe-Ti oxides in andesitic magma,
586	Soufriere Hills Volcano, Montserrat, W.I. Journal of Petrology, 44, 1375–1400.
587 588	Drake, M.J. (1976) Plagioclase-melt equilibria. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 40, 457–465.
589	Dunbar, N.W., Jacobs, G.K., and Naney, M.T. (1995) Crystallization processes in an
590	artificial magma: variations in crystal shape, growth rate and composition with
591	melt cooling history. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 120, 412–425.
592 593	Gamble, R.P., and Taylor, L.A. (1980) Crystal/ liquid partitioning in augite: Effects of cooling rate. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 47, 21–33.

594 595 596	Geschwind, CH., and Rutherford, M.J. (1995) Crystallization of microlites during magma ascent: the fluid mechanics of 1980–1986 eruptions at Mount St Helens. Bulletin of Volcanology, 57, 356–370.
597	Gualda, G.A.R., Ghiorso, M.S., Lemons, R.V., and Carley, T.L. (2012) Rhyolite-
598	MELTS: a Modified Calibration of MELTS Optimized for Silica-rich, Fluid-
599	bearing Magmatic Systems. Journal of Petrology, 53, 875–890.
600	Hamada, M., and Fujii, T. (2007) H2O-rich island arc low-K tholeiite magma inferred
601	from Ca-rich plagioclase-melt inclusion equilibria. Geochemical Journal, 41, 437–
602	461.
603 604 605	Hammer, J.E., and Rutherford, M.J. (2002) An experimental study of the kinetics of decompression-induced crystallization in silicic melt. Journal of Geophysical Research, 107.
606	Housh, T.B., and Luhr, J.F. (1991) Plagioclase-melt equilibria in hydrous systems.
607	American Mineralogist, 76, 477–492.
608	Humphreys, M., Blundy, J., and Sparks, R. (2008) Shallow-level decompression
609	crystallisation and deep magma supply at Shiveluch Volcano. Contributions to
610	Mineralogy and Petrology, 155, 45–61.
611 612 613 614	Humphreys, M., Edmonds, M., Christopher, T., and Hards, V. (2009a) Chlorine variations in the magma of Soufriere Hills Volcano, Montserrat: Insights from Cl in hornblende and melt inclusions. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 73, 5693–5708.
615 616 617	Humphreys, M., Christopher, T., and Hards, V. (2009b) Microlite transfer by disaggregation of mafic inclusions following magma mixing at Soufriere Hills volcano, Montserrat. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 157, 609–624.
618	Humphreys, M., Edmonds, M., Christopher, T., and Hards, V. (2010) Magma
619	hybridisation and diffusive exchange recorded in heterogeneous glasses from
620	Soufriere Hills Volcano, Montserrat. Geophysical Research Letters, 37.
621	Johannes, W. (1984) Beginning of melting in the granite system Qz-Or-Ab-An-H2O.
622	Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 86, 264–273.
623 624 625 626	Kennedy, A., Lofgren, G.E., and Wasserburg, G.J. (1993) An experimental study of trace element partitioning between olivine, orthopyroxene and melt in chondrules: equilibrium values and kinetic effects. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 115, 177–195.
627 628	Kudo, A.M., and Weill, D.F. (1970) An igneous plagioclase thermometer. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 25, 52–65.

629 630	Lange, R.A., Frey, H.M., and Hector, J. (2009) A thermodynamic model for the plagioclase-liquid hygrometer/thermometer. American Mineralogist, 94, 494–506.
631 632 633 634	Mann, C.P., Wallace, P.J., and Stix, J. (2013) Phenocryst-hosted melt inclusions record stalling of magma during ascent in the conduit and upper magma reservoir prior to vulcanian explosions, Soufriere Hills volcano, Montserrat, West Indies. Bulletin of Volcanology, 75, 687.
635 636 637	Martel, C., and Schmidt, B.C. (2003) Decompression experiments as an insight into ascent rates of silicic magmas. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 144, 397–415.
638 639 640	Milman-Barris, M.S., Beckett, J.R., Baker, M.B., Hofmann, A.E., Morgan, Z., Crowley, M.R., Vielzeuf, D., and Stolper, E. (2008) Zoning of phosphorus in igneous olivine. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 155, 739–765.
641 642 643	Mollo, S., Del Gaudio, P., Ventura, G., Iezzi, G., and Scarlato, P. (2010) Dependence of clinopyroxene composition on cooling rate in basaltic magmas: Implications for thermobarometry. Lithos, 118, 302–312.
644 645 646	Mollo, S., Putirka, K., Iezzi, G., Del Gaudio, P., and Scarlato, P. (2011) Plagioclase–melt (dis)equilibrium due to cooling dynamics: Implications for thermometry, barometry and hygrometry. Lithos, 125, 221–235.
647 648 649	Newcombe, M.E., Fabbrizio, A., Zhang, Y., Ma, C., Voyer, M.L., Guan, Y., Eiler, J.M., Saal, A.E., and Stolper, E.M. (2014) Chemical zonation in olivine-hosted melt inclusions. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 168, 1–26.
650 651 652	Newman, S., and Lowenstern, J.B. (2002) VolatileCalc: a silicate melt–H2O-CO2 solution model written in Visual Basic for excel. Computers & Geosciences, 28, 597–604.
653 654 655 656	Panjasawatwong, Y., Danyushevsky, L.V., Crawford, A.J., and Harris, K.L. (1995) An experimental study of the effects of melt composition on plagioclase-melt equilibria at 5 and 10 kbar: implications for the origin of magmatic high-An plagioclase. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 118, 420–432.
657 658 659	Pichavant, M., Costa, F., Burgisser, A., Scaillet, B., Martel, C., and Poussineau, S. (2007) Equilibration Scales in Silicic to Intermediate Magmas Implications for Experimental Studies. Journal of Petrology, 48, 1955–1972.
660 661	Putirka, K., and Condit, C.D. (2003) Cross section of a magma conduit system at the margin of the Colorado Plateau. Geology, 31, 701–704.
662 663 664	Putirka, K.D. (2005) Igneous thermometers and barometers based on plagioclase + liquid equilibria: Tests of some existing models and new calibrations. American Mineralogist, 90, 336–346.

665 666	——— (2008) Thermometers and barometers for volcanic systems. In Minerals, Inclusions, and Volcanic Processes Vol. 69, pp. 61–120.
667 668	Ridolfi, F., Renzulli, A., and Puerini, M. (2010) Stability and chemical equilibrium of amphibole in calc-alkaline magmas: an overview, new thermobarometric
669 670	formulations and application to subduction-related volcanoes. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 160, 45–66.
671 672 673	Rutherford, M.J., and Devine, J.D. (2003) Magmatic conditions and magma ascent as indicated by hornblende phase equilibria and reactions in the 1995-2002 Soufriere Hills magma. Journal of Petrology, 44, 1433–1454.
674 675 676	Sisson, T.W., and Grove, T.L. (1993) Experimental investigations of the role of H2O in calc-alkaline differentiation and subduction zone magmatism. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 113, 143–166.
677 678 679	Waters, L.E. (2013) The effect of degassing of H2O on crystallization and oxidation in highly evolved magmas: Implications for the origin of rhyolite liquids. PhD, University of Michigan.
680 681 682	Waters, L.E., and Lange, R.A. (n.d.) An updated calibration of the plagioclase-liquid hygrometer-thermometer applicable to basalts through rhyolites. American Mineralogist (in press).
683 684	Welsch, B., Hammer, J., and Hellebrand, E. (2014) Phosphorus zoning reveals dendritic architecture of olivine. Geology, 42, 867–870.
685	
<i></i>	

686

687 Figure 1

Equilibrium relationships between rhyolitic melt  $H_2O$ ,temperature and plagioclase XAn, calculated using Putirka (2005) and Lange et al. (2009). (a) Contours of constant plagioclase composition in  $H_2O$ -T space. Large grey diamonds are interpolated from the phase diagram of Couch et al. (2003). (b) Contours of constant temperature in  $H_2O$ -X<sub>An</sub> space. Also shown is RhyoliteMELTS modelling of isothermal decompression for rhyolitic melt (bold lines, 825-875 °C) and basaltic andesite melt (thin black lines, 1000-1100 °C).

695

696 Figure 2

697 Contours of constant pressure (assuming  $H_2O$  saturation, i.e.  $P_{tot} = pH_2O$ ) in T–X<sub>An</sub> 698 space, calculated for rhyolitic melt using Putirka (2005) and Lange et al. (2009). 699 Large circles are interpolated from the phase diagram of Couch et al. (2003) for 160 700 MPa (black) and 200 MPa (grey). Also shown is RhyoliteMELTS modelling of 701 isobaric cooling in rhyolitic melt (25-200 MPa).

702

Figure 3

Theoretical variation of plagioclase-liquid  $K_D$  for rhyolitic melt (as defined by Putirka 2005; 2008) with calculated temperature ( $T_{calc}$ ) as a function of pressure (assuming H<sub>2</sub>O saturation, i.e.  $P_{tot} = pH_2O$ ) (a), and with pH<sub>2</sub>O as a function of temperature (b). Points in (a) represent increments of 10 mol% X<sub>An</sub>.

708

Figure 4

710	$H_2O$ concentration in experimentally decompressed glasses from Martel & Schmidt
711	(2003), Brugger & Hammer (2010) and Cichy et al. (2011), in comparison with
712	isobaric (solubility) data from Mangan & Sisson (2000). Also shown is rhyolite
713	solubility curve from VolatileCalc (Newman & Lowenstern 2002). All data have $H_2O$
714	concentrations in excess of the solubility limit for the experimental quench
715	pressure, indicating kinetically inhibited degassing.

716

717 Figure 5

718 Variation of calculated temperature (T<sub>calc</sub>, using model A from Putirka, 2005) and K<sub>D</sub>

vith pH<sub>2</sub>O in experimentally decompressed glasses from Brugger & Hammer (2010;

a, b), Cichy et al. (2011; c, d) and Martel & Schmidt (2003; e, f). Grey bar with black

line shows the experimental run temperature in each case ± 5 °C. See supplementary
data table for original data and calculated values.

723

Figure 6

Variation of calculated temperature (T<sub>calc</sub>, using model A from Putirka, 2005) and K<sub>D</sub>
with decompression rate in experimentally decompressed glasses from Brugger &
Hammer (2010; a, b), Cichy et al. (2011; c, d) and Martel & Schmidt (2003; e, f). Grey
bar with black line shows the experimental run temperature in each case ± 5 °C. See
supplementary data table for original data and calculated values.

730

731 Figure 7

8/12

732	(a) Variation of calculated temperature ( $T_{calc}$ , using model A from Putirka, 2005)
733	with $H_2O$ concentration reported for plagioclase-hosted melt inclusions from
734	Soufrière Hills, Montserrat (Humphreys et al. 2009); Mt Unzen, Japan (Botcharnikov
735	et al. 2007); Mount St Helens, USA (Blundy et al. 2006); Shiveluch, Kamchatka
736	(Blundy et al. 2006) and Izu Oshima (Hamada & Fujii 2007). Constant- $X_{An}$ contours
737	are shown for comparison (symbols as figure 1). (b) Variations of calculated
738	temperature with reported $X_{\mbox{\sc An}}$ of the host plagioclase phenocryst for the same melt
739	inclusion suites. Constant-pH $_2O$ contours are shown for comparison (symbols as
740	figure 2). See supplementary data table for original data and calculated values.

741

Figure 8

Variation of calculated K<sub>D</sub> with (a) plagioclase X<sub>An</sub> and (b) glass H<sub>2</sub>O concentration
reported for melt inclusion datasets from the literature. Dark circles – Mount St
Helens (Blundy et al. 2006); grey squares – Shiveluch (Blundy et al. 2006); dashes –
Soufrière Hills, Montserrat (Humphreys et al. 2009); crosses - Izu Oshima (Hamada
& Fujii 2007); dark triangles - Mt Unzen (Botcharnikov et al. 2007). See
supplementary data table for original data and calculated values.

749

750 Figure 9

Regression of calculated temperature with each of the parameters that make up the 'model A' calculation (Putirka 2005), (a)  $Ca_L$ , (b)  $Na_L$ , (c)  $Al_L$ , (d)  $Si_L$ , (e)  $H_2O$  and (f)

- 753 X<sub>An</sub>. Dark circles Mount St Helens, grey squares Shiveluch (Blundy et al. 2006).
- Linear regression trends and equations are given for any significant regressions (R<sup>2</sup>

> 0.15), with Mount St Helens regressions in black and Shiveluch in grey. The most significant parameter controlling T<sub>calc</sub> is the H<sub>2</sub>O content of the glass. See supplementary data table for original data and calculated values.

758

759 Figure 10

760 Regression of calculated temperature with each of the parameters that make up the 761 'model A' calculation (Putirka 2005), (a)  $Ca_{L_1}$  (b)  $Na_{L_2}$  (c)  $Al_{L_2}$  (d)  $Si_{L_2}$  (e)  $H_2O$  and (f) 762 X<sub>An</sub>. Dashes – Soufriere Hills, Montserrat (Humphreys et al. 2009); crosses - Izu 763 Oshima (Hamada & Fujii 2007); dark triangles - Mt Unzen (Botcharnikov et al. 764 2008). Linear regression trends and equations are given for any significant 765 regressions ( $R^2 \ge 0.15$ ) in each dataset. The most significant parameter controlling  $T_{calc}$  is the H<sub>2</sub>O content of the glass. See supplementary data table for original data 766 767 and calculated values.

768

769 Figure 11

Back-scattered SEM image illustrating the complexity of plagioclase zoning that is
common in intermediate calc-alkaline lavas. Melt inclusions are dark blebs (some
annotated 'MI'). White dashed lines outline clear resorptive zoning 'events' that
leave irregular boundaries and may entrap melt inclusions.

774

This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. (DOI will not work until issue is live.) DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2138/am-2016-5314





Figure 2



Figure 3



Figure 4

This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. (DOI will not work until issue is live.) DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2138/am-2016-5314



Always consult and cite the final, published document. See http://www.minsocam.org or GeoscienceWorld

Figure 5



Figure 6

8/12







Figure 8



Figure 9





Figure 11

8/12

	MVO1524b_112	ol101mi1
SiO <sub>2</sub>	73.32	52.20
TiO <sub>2</sub>	0.26	0.86
$AI_2O_3$	11.66	15.80
FeO⊤	1.56	12.40
MgO	0.28	5.72
MnO	0.07	0.22
CaO	1.34	10.34
Na <sub>2</sub> O	4.28	1.82
K <sub>2</sub> O	2.54	0.31
CI	0.26	0.04
H <sub>2</sub> O	3.16	1.24
Total	98.73	100.95

Table 1.

Composition of rhyolite melt inclusion (MV01524b\_112, from Humphreys et al. 2009) and basaltic andesite melt (ol101mi1, from Hamada & Fujii 2007) used for MELTS modelling and calculations shown in figures 1-4.