Clinopyroxene geothermometry of spinel-lherzolites

CLAUDE T. HERZBERG
Department of Geology, University of Western Ontario
London, Ontario, Canada N6A 5B7

AND NEIL A. CHAPMAN
Department of Earth Sciences, University of Leeds
Leeds, England LS2 9JT

Abstract

Experiments in the system CaO-MgO-Al₂O₃-SiO₂ have shown that the calcium tschermak's molecule (CaAl₂SiO₆) content of clinopyroxene in the spinel-lherzolite assemblage (forsterite + clinopyroxene + orthopyroxene + spinel) varies sympathetically with the MgSiO₃ content with changes in temperatures and pressure. Such variations are predominantly temperature-dependent, although both pyroxene end-members decrease slightly in amount with increases in pressure at constant temperature. Contrary to O'Hara (1967), the isopleths of CaAl₂SiO₆ and MgSiO₃ of clinopyroxene in temperature-pressure space are parallel, rendering these two pyroxene molecules indicators only of the temperature of equilibrium of spinel-lherzolites. No information on the pressures of equilibrium can be obtained.

Using simple thermodynamic mixing models of the solid solution phases participating in the subsolidus exchange reactions, two temperature estimations can be made of natural spinel-lherzolites from the experimental data of the synthetic system. The first temperature estimation is based on the equilibrium exchange of Mg₅Si₅O₁₄ between clinopyroxene and orthopyroxene at 12 kbar (equilibrium constant K₁) and the second temperature estimation is based on the equilibrium exchange of CaAl₂SiO₆ between clinopyroxene, olivine, and spinel at 12 kbar (equilibrium constant K₂).

Two temperature estimations were made from each of the analyses of the coexisting minerals of spinel-lherzolites from alpine-type intrusions and nodules in basalt (analyses obtained from the literature). The estimated temperatures for the spinel-lherzolite nodules in basalt range from the water-undersaturated peridotite solidus to the anhydrous solidus, indicating a close genetic relationship with the host basalts or those of the same fractionation suite. The temperatures estimated for most spinel-lherzolite intrusions indicate solidus temperatures followed by a cooling history of partial reequilibration to subsolidus temperatures. These temperatures probably bear little, if any, relationship to those of a normal geothermal gradient.

Introduction

Advances made in the experimental study of pyroxene solid-solution equilibria during the last decade have recently revived an interest in the direct measurement of paleogeothermal regimes in the upper mantle. Estimations of the paleogeothermal gradient beneath South Africa (Boyd, 1973; Boyd and Nixon, 1973) and the Norwegian Caledonides (Carswell, 1974), based on the enstatite and alumina solubility of pyroxenes in garnet-lherzolites, will undoubtedly be modified as experimental data become more refined; however, it is unlikely that they will depart significantly from the normal shield geotherms as originally defined by Ringwood (1966).

More recently similar attempts at determining paleogeothermal gradients at higher upper-mantle levels have been made from pyroxene geothermometry and geobarometry of spinel-lherzolites (MacGregor, 1974; MacGregor and Basu, 1974). It is the purpose of this work to reevaluate these estimates on the basis of new experimental results.
on clinopyroxene solid solution geothermometry and geobarometry of spinel–lherzolites in the system CaO–MgO–Al₂O₃–SiO₂.

The immediate problem encountered in the pursuit of this task involves applying experimental data on synthetic systems to the chemistry of the natural peridotite system. Experimental data on the join Mg₆Si₄O₁₄–CaMgSi₂O₆ at 30 kbar (Davis and Boyd, 1966) have conventionally been used as the geothermometer and the alumina content of enstatite in the system MgO–Al₂O₃–SiO₂ (MacGregor, 1974) as the geobarometer for determining upper mantle geotherms (Boyd, 1973; Boyd and Nixon, 1973). The 1600°C and 30 kbar data of O’Hara and Schairer (1963), however, indicate that significant amounts of Al³⁺ in the pyroxene phases may appreciably affect the solubility of Mg₆Si₄O₁₄ in clinopyroxene. O’Hara (1967) later emphasized the necessity for advancing from simple two-pyroxene end-member systems of three components to three-pyroxene end-member systems of four components involving CaO–MgO–Al₂O₃–SiO₂ in order to adequately represent the major reaction relationships of four-phase lherzolites.

The task of this experimental work has been to investigate the change in the solubility of both CaAl₂SiO₆ and MgSiO₃ in clinopyroxenes of the spinel–lherzolite assemblage (forsterite + clinopyroxene + orthopyroxene + spinel) in the system CaO–MgO–Al₂O₃–SiO₂ with changes in temperature and pressure. In order to apply these experimental results to natural spinel–lherzolites, simple thermodynamic models, similar to those of Wood and Banno (1973), were constructed. These models enable the temperatures of equilibration of spinel–lherzolites to be estimated, providing that the compositions of all four phases are known. Wood (1974) later demonstrated experimentally the validity of these simple models in correcting for the presence of the components of the natural system not used in the experiments.

Experimental and analytical methods

All experiments were carried out using a single-stage, half-inch piston-cylinder apparatus similar to that described by O’Hara et al. (1971). The piston-out technique, as described by Richardson et al. (1968), was used with an over-pressure of 5 kbar. No friction correction was made to the nominal pressures reported in the tables and figures. The furnace cell was similar to that used by Richardson et al., but without the ceramic disc between the thermocouple tip and capsule, and with the lower pyrophyllite spacer replaced by ceramic. Pt/Pt13Rh thermocouples were used to measure and control the temperatures of the furnace cell. Pressure-uncorrected temperatures were recorded and are presented in the tables and figures.

The compositions used in these experiments were:

\[
\begin{align*}
AF &= \text{anorthite (CaAl}_{2}\text{Si}_{2}\text{O}_{8}) + \text{forsterite (MgSiO}_{3} \text{) gel} \\
\text{crystallized at } 1200^\circ\text{C for 28 days at atmospheric} \\
\text{pressure (<0.10 } \mu\text{m grain size).} \\
A3F &= \text{anorthite (CaAl}_{2}\text{Si}_{2}\text{O}_{8}) + 3 \text{ forsterite (MgSiO}_{3} \text{) gel} \\
\text{crystallized as above.} \\
GP &= \text{anorthite (CaAl}_{2}\text{Si}_{2}\text{O}_{8}) + 3 \text{ forsterite (MgSiO}_{3} \text{) +} \\
\text{diopside (CaMgSi}_{2}\text{O}_{6}) \text{ + enstatite (MgSiO}_{3} \text{) gel} \\
\text{crystallized as above.}
\end{align*}
\]

For experiments at temperatures near the solidus the charges were dried in order to avoid partial melting. For low-temperature experiments the charge was either left undried or it was dampened with a minor quantity of distilled water (<0.1 wt%) in order to flux the reaction and promote crystal growth. The drying technique used for each experiment is listed with the results in Table 1.

The experimental charges after the runs usually contained individual crystal sizes of less than 3 to 4 microns, whether or not trace amounts of water were used to promote crystal growth. Individual clinopyroxene crystals were commonly intergrown with orthopyroxene and spinel. Because of these textural complications, due to the nature of the finely crystalline starting materials, electron microprobe analyses of the clinopyroxenes proved too inaccurate to be of value. Consequently an X-ray diffraction method was developed in order to determine the amount of MgSiO₃ and CaAl₂SiO₆ in the clinopyroxene. This experimental method was used in preference to the traditional method of synthesis from glass starting materials (which usually produces crystals big enough to analyze by the electron microprobe) in order to minimize the possibility of synthesizing highly disordered metastable pyroxenes (Biggar and O’Hara, 1969; Howells and O’Hara, 1975).

The cell dimensions of the CaMgSi₂O₆–MgSiO₃–
\[
\text{CaAl}_{2}\text{SiO}_{6} \text{ solid solution series vary with composition}
\]
(Clark et al., 1962). From these cell dimensions, the clinopyroxene CuKα 221 and 310 diffraction angles were calculated; these are presented in Figure 1 by broken lines. The grid shown by the broken lines was then adjusted to the diffraction angles of three synthesized clinopyroxenes whose compositions are indicated by the solid lines. The goniometer
was allowed to oscillate 8 to 10 times at a scan speed of 1/4° 2θ per minute across the clinopyroxene diffraction peaks as well as the standard sodium chloride 200 diffraction angle (31.718° 2θ). Sharp and well-defined diffraction peaks and a variation about the mean of ± 0.004° 2θ indicated chemical homogeneity of the synthesized clinopyroxenes. A comparison of X-ray diffraction data from Clark et al. (1962) and Biggar (1969) with Figure 1 (solid lines) indicates an interlaboratory agreement of ± 3 weight percent CaAl₂SiO₆ and ± 2 weight percent MgSiO₃ in the determination of a stoichiometric clinopyroxene composition.

All experimental charges were inspected optically and by X-ray diffraction for glass and metastable phases. Nickel-filtered CuKα radiation generated at 28 mA and 44 kV from a Philips machine was used. A 0.2 mm receiving slit, a 4° scatter slit, and a 1° divergence slit were used. A small quantity of laboratory sodium chloride was mixed with each run product as an X-ray internal standard. From the mean clinopyroxene 22T and 310 diffraction angles, measured to 0.002° 2θ for each oscillation, and Figure 1 (solid lines), the composition of the clinopyroxene synthesized with forsterite, orthopyroxene, and spinel was obtained. This composition was assumed to be stoichiometric with respect to CaAl₂SiO₆ and MgSiO₃, or the chemically equivalent end-members CaMg₂Si₂O₆-MgAl₂SiO₆.

Discussion of results

The experimental results are listed in Table 1. The clinopyroxene 22T and 310 X-ray diffraction angles for each experiment were plotted on the X-ray diffraction-composition grid of Figure 1 and are shown in Figure 2. All the measurements plot along a common curve. From Figure 2 the CaAl₂SiO₆ and MgSiO₃ contents of clinopyroxene for each experiment were obtained, and these are shown in Figure 3.

Thirteen runs on A3F at 1100°C and 1200°C (not shown in Figure 3) were rejected due to the presence of incompletely reacted anorthite coexisting with the spinel–lherzolite phase assemblage. Excess anorthite in these charges resulted in anomalously high CaAl₂SiO₆ and MgSiO₃ contents of clinopyroxene for each experiment were obtained, and these are shown in Figure 3.

We have no proof that these data are equilibrium results, and know of no method whereby equilibrium
can be unequivocally established. Indeed, we found no problem in reversing some of the nonequilibrated A3F charges from 1100°C to 1200°C.

Figure 3 shows that the CaAl₂SiO₆ content varies sympathetically with the MgSiO₃ content of clinopyroxene. This variation is predominantly temperature-dependent, although both pyroxene end-members decrease slightly with increasing pressure at constant temperature. Unfortunately, the parallel nature of the CaAl₂SiO₆ and MgSiO₃ isopleths of clinopyroxene in temperature-pressure space renders the composition of the mineral an indicator only of the temperature of equilibration of spinel-lherzolites. No information on the pressures of equilibration can be obtained from these data.

Application of results

The application of experimentally-determined pyroxene solid-solution variability in a simple synthetic system to the natural system has been discussed by Wood and Banno (1973) and Wood (1974). Their method of establishing simple mixing models of the solid solution phases participating in the reactions, which determine the pyroxene composition at any one temperature and pressure, will be adopted here.

In Figure 3 it was shown that the CaAl₂SiO₆ and MgSiO₃ end-members of clinopyroxene vary sympathetically with variations in temperature and pressure. This indicates that the two reactions controlling the contents of the two end-members are mutually interdependent. For simplicity, however, each reaction will be treated independently of the other.

MacGregor (1965) suggested the following reaction to account for the variations in the CaAl₂SiO₆ content of clinopyroxenes in spinel-peridotites with temperature and pressure:

\[
\text{CaMgSi}_{2}O_{6} + \text{MgAl}_{2}O_{4} \rightarrow \text{CaAl}_{2}\text{SiO}_{6} + \text{Mg}_{2}\text{SiO}_{4} \quad \Delta V = +0.96\%
\]

The very small positive volume change of reaction (1) is consistent with the observed small decrease in the
CaAl$_2$Si$_2$O$_6$ content of clinopyroxene with increasing pressure at constant temperature (Fig. 3).

The condition for equilibrium of reaction (1) is:

$$\mu_{CaMgSi_2O_6} + \mu_{MgAl_2O_4} = \mu_{CaAl_2SiO_6} + \mu_{Mg_2SiO_4}$$

where $\mu$ refers to the chemical potential of the component in the clinopyroxene, spinel, and olivine phases. Where the standard state of each component is the pure phase at the temperature and pressure of interest, equation (2) becomes:

$$\mu_{CaMgSi_2O_6} + RT \ln \gamma_{CaMgSi_2O_6} + \mu_{MgAl_2O_4} + RT \ln \gamma_{MgAl_2O_4} = \mu_{CaAl_2SiO_6} + RT \ln \gamma_{CaAl_2SiO_6} + \mu_{Mg_2SiO_4} + RT \ln \gamma_{Mg_2SiO_4}$$

where $RT\ln \gamma_i$ refers to $RT\ln$ activity of component $i$ in phase $y$. Rearranging (3) gives the familiar expression for equilibrium:

$$\Delta G^{\circ}_{298} = -RT \ln \left( \frac{\gamma_{CaAl_2SiO_6} \gamma_{Mg_2SiO_4}}{\gamma_{CaMgSi_2O_6} \gamma_{MgAl_2O_4}} \right)$$

In determining the activities of the various components in the solid phases it has been necessary to assume that the phases behave in an ideal manner. For two-site clinopyroxene solutions in which Mg$^{2+}$, Fe$^{2+}$, Ca$^{2+}$, Na$^{+}$, and Mn$^{2+}$ are randomly mixed in the $M_2$ site, and Mg$^{2+}$, Fe$^{2+}$, Al$^{3+}$, Fe$^{3+}$, and Ti$^{4+}$ are randomly mixed in the $M_1$ site, the component activities can be approximated:

$$\gamma_{CaMgSi_2O_6} = X_{Ca}^{M_2} X_{Mg}^{M_1}$$

$$\gamma_{CaAl_2SiO_6} = X_{Ca}^{M_2} X_{Al}^{M_1}$$

where $X_{Ca}^{M_2}$ refers to the mole fraction of cation $i$ in the $z$ site. It has been shown, however, that Fe$^{2+}$ and Mg$^{2+}$ are not randomly distributed between the $M_1$ and $M_2$ sites (Hafner et al., 1971; Fleet, 1974a, b). The preference of Fe$^{2+}$ over Mg$^{2+}$ for the $M_2$ site of clinopyroxene appears most pronounced at intermediate to high mole fractions of FeSiO$_3$ (0.1 to 0.3), which are attained in clinopyroxenes of charnockites and layered igneous rocks (Fleet, 1974a, b). The clinopyroxenes of spinel–peridotites, however, commonly contain less than 0.12 mole percent FeSiO$_3$ due to high bulk Mg/Mg+Fe values of these rocks. From calculated $M_1$ and $M_2$ site occupancies of
From the 16 kbar interpolations shown in Figure 3 and from the assumption that $a_{\text{ol}} \text{Mg}_3\text{SiO}_4$ and $a_{\text{sp}} \text{MgAl}_2\text{O}_4$ were equal to one in these experiments, the relationship of

$$\ln \left( \frac{a_{\text{cpx}} \text{CaAl}_2\text{SiO}_5 \cdot a_{\text{ol}} \text{Mg}_3\text{SiO}_4}{a_{\text{cpx}} \text{CaMg}_2\text{Si}_2\text{O}_6 \cdot a_{\text{sp}} \text{MgAl}_2\text{O}_4} \right)$$

to $1/T$ (°K) was plotted and is shown in Figure 4. The experimental data fall very close to a straight line. A least-squares fit of the data in the temperature interval 1100°C to 1300°C yields the following relationship between activity ratio and temperature:

$$\ln \left( \frac{a_{\text{cpx}} \text{CaAl}_2\text{SiO}_5 \cdot a_{\text{ol}} \text{Mg}_3\text{SiO}_4}{a_{\text{cpx}} \text{CaMg}_2\text{Si}_2\text{O}_6 \cdot a_{\text{sp}} \text{MgAl}_2\text{O}_4}_{16 \text{ kbar}} \right) = \ln (K_2)_{16 \text{ kbar}} = - \frac{\Delta H^0}{RT} + \frac{\Delta S^0}{R} = \frac{-9231}{T} + 4.43$$

(9)

Where $\Delta H^0$ and $\Delta S^0$ refer to the standard states of the pure phases at 16 kbar and $T$ is in °K. A least-squares fit of the 12 kbar data in the temperature interval from 1100°C to 1270°C is also shown in Figure 4 in order to illustrate the magnitude of the effect of pressure on the activity ratios. The 12 kbar data yield the following relationship:

$$\ln (K_2)_{12 \text{ kbar}} = - \frac{\Delta H^0}{RT} + \frac{\Delta S^0}{R} = \frac{-8540}{T} + 4.06$$

(10)

The high $\Delta S^0$ at 12 kbar (8.06cal/mole°K) and 16 kbar (8.80cal/mole°K) illustrates that this mixing model is probably an oversimplification.

Equation (10) establishes a temperature estimate of natural spinel-lherzolites based on the experimentally determined solubility of $\text{CaAl}_2\text{Si}_2\text{O}_6$ in clinopyroxene in the system $\text{CaO-MgO-Al}_2\text{O}_3-\text{SiO}_2$, corrected for the remaining oxide species occurring in the natural rock. This temperature estimate can be cross-checked with that estimated from the $\text{MgSiO}_3$ solubility in the same clinopyroxene crystal from the experimental data shown in Figure 3. It has been assumed that the chemical potential of $\text{Mg}_3\text{SiO}_4$ in clinopyroxene was equal to that of $\text{MgAl}_2\text{O}_4$ in orthopyroxene for those experiments in which equilibrium is thought to have been established. The expression of this equilibrium is:

$$(\Delta G^o)_T^p = -RT \ln \left( \frac{a_{\text{cpx}} \text{Mg}_3\text{SiO}_4}{a_{\text{cpx}} \text{CaAl}_2\text{SiO}_5} \right)$$

$$= -RT \ln (K_3)$$

(11)

where the relationship between activity ratio and
temperature, again assuming that both pyroxenes behave as ideal two-site solutions, may be approximated:

$$\ln (K_i) = \frac{-\Delta H^0}{RT} + \frac{\Delta S^0}{R}$$  \hspace{1cm} (12)$$

The activity of $\text{Mg}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_8$ in clinopyroxene can be estimated from Figure 3 and is approximated by the expression:

$$a_{\text{cpx} \text{Mg}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_8} = X M2 \text{Ca} \cdot X M1 \text{Mg}$$  \hspace{1cm} (13)$$

An approximation of the activity of $\text{Mg}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_8$ in orthopyroxene is given by the following expression:

$$a_{\text{opx} \text{Mg}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_8} = X M2 \text{Mg} \cdot X M1 \text{Mg}$$  \hspace{1cm} (14)$$

Because no data on orthopyroxene compositions were obtained in this study, the activity of $\text{Mg}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_8$ in orthopyroxene in the spinel-lherzolite assemblage was estimated from available experimental data. The mole fraction of magnesium in the M2 site of orthopyroxene at 12 and 16 kbar was taken from experimentally derived values of diopside solubility in orthopyroxene coexisting with clinopyroxene in the system CaO-MgO-SiO$_2$ (Mori and Green, 1975). The similarity of the results of Akella (1974) with those of Nehru and Wyllie (1974) and Mori and Green (1975) suggests that the presence of an aluminous phase in equilibrium with clinopyroxene and orthopyroxene does not appreciably affect the diopside solubility in orthopyroxene. The mole fraction of magnesium in the M1 site of orthopyroxene was estimated from the assumption that $(X M1 \text{Al})_{\text{opx}} = (X M1 \text{Al})_{\text{cpx}}$ in the spinel-lherzolite assemblage at the same temperature and pressure.

In Figure 4 the relationship of $\ln K_i$ vs. $1/T$ at 12 and 16 kbar is also plotted. Least-squares fits of the data yield the following expressions:

$$\ln (K_i)_{12 \text{ kbar}} = -\frac{8392}{T} + 3.64$$  \hspace{1cm} (16)$$

and

$$\ln (K_i)_{16 \text{ kbar}} = -\frac{8494}{T} + 3.58$$  \hspace{1cm} (17)$$

where $\Delta S^0$ at 12 kbar and 16 kbar are 7.25 kcal/mole°K and 7.12 kcal/mole°K respectively. These values of the entropy change for the transfer of $\text{Mg}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_8$ from orthopyroxene to clinopyroxene are lower than that for the 30 kbar Davis and Boyd (1966) results (10.63 kcal/mole°K), but they are higher than those for the 10 and 30 kbar Mori and Green (1975) results (5.60 and 5.66 kcal/mole°K respectively) and the Nehru and Wyllie (1974) 30 kbar results in the interval 1000°c to 1500°C(5.32 kcal/mole°K). All of these entropy change values, which are probably too high, testify to the simplicity of the ideal solid-solution models. The values at 12 kbar and 16 kbar from this work may differ from the Mori and Green results because of the presence of Al$_2$O$_3$ in the system of this work, differences in analytical technique, or because of the assumptions used in estimating the activity of $\text{Mg}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_8$ in orthopyroxene. It is significant to note that at any given temperature, the solubility of $\text{Mg}_2\text{Si}_3\text{O}_8$ in clinopyroxene noted from our experiments in the alumina-bearing system at 12 kbar is considerably less than that from the experiments of Mori and Green in the alumina-free system at 10 kbars. The solubility difference is such that the temperature estimated from any one value of $K_i$ from our data may be up to 150°C higher than that estimated from the Mori and Green data.

**Estimation of equilibrium temperatures**

Using published and available unpublished mineral analyses of coexisting olivine, clinopyroxene, orthopyroxene, and spinel phases from spinel-lherzolites from alpine-type intrusions and nodules in basalts, temperature estimations have been made from the calculated values of $K_i$ and $K_2$ at 12 and 16 kbar. The calculations of the activities of CaAl$_2$SiO$_4$,
CaMgSi$_2$O$_6$, and Mg$_2$Si$_2$O$_6$ in the natural clinopyroxenes were simplified by calculating first the ferrous-ferric proportions as presented by Mysen and Heier (1972) (for those analyses where Fe$_3$O$_4$ was not determined), and second the pyroxene end-member molecules as proposed by Kushiro (1962) and Cawthorn and Collerson (1974). A breakdown of each clinopyroxene analysis into its end-members provided a simple method of estimating $X$ M$_2$Ca, $X$ M$_1$Al, and $X$ M$_1$Mg independently of the silicon analysis. Wood and Banno (1973) discussed the alternative methods of establishing $a$ opx Mg$_2$Si$_2$O$_6/a$ opx Mg$_2$Si$_2$O$_6$ that may be used to correct for the marked increase in the orthopyroxene (enstatite + ferrosilite) solubility in clinopyroxene with increasing Fe$^{+2}$ in the system. Fortunately, this is not a serious problem in the natural spinel-lherzolite system because of low amounts of ferrosilite in clinopyroxene. However, the correction scheme that was adopted here involved projecting the clinopyroxene analysis from ferrosilite to the remaining pyroxene end-members. The method of calculating $a$ opx Mg$_2$Si$_2$O$_6$ used here was described by Wood (1974).

The calculated temperatures are given in Table 2. Figure 5 shows the frequency distribution of the $K_1$ and $K_2$ temperature estimations for alpine-type intrusions, nodules in basalts, and the two spinel-lherzolite occurrences together. The important points which emerge from this treatment of the data are:

1. The mean of 38 $K_2$ temperatures and the standard deviation for both occurrences is 1193°C (i.e. about 50°C below the anhydrous peridotite solidus) and 94°C, respectively. The mean $K_2$ temperature for the 23 nodule analyses is 1194°C, and the standard deviation is 75°C. The mean $K_2$ temperature for the 15 intrusion analyses is 1190°C, and the standard deviation is 188°C. Whereas the means are essentially the same for both occurrences, there is a greater spread of $K_2$ intrusion temperatures. The highest frequency of $K_2$ nodule temperatures coincides with the anhydrous solidus temperature, whereas the highest frequency of the $K_2$ intrusion temperatures lies between the anhydrous solidus and the solidus with a water content of 0.2 percent. Most $K_2$ temperatures are between those of the two solidi.

2. The mean of 43 $K_1$ temperatures and the standard deviation for both peridotite occurrences is 1095°C and 131°C, respectively. For the nodules the mean of 23 $K_1$ temperatures is 1151°C, and the standard deviation is 100°C. For the intrusions the mean of 20 $K_1$ temperatures is 1030°C, and the standard deviation is 132°C. Again note the greater spread of $K_1$ intrusion temperatures. The highest frequency of $K_1$ nodule temperatures is between the two solidi, and the mean is within 40°C of the mean $K_2$ nodule temperatures. The mean and highest frequency of $K_1$ intrusion temperatures, however, are much lower ($<150°C$) than those of the $K_2$ intrusion temperatures.

At pressures greater than 12 kbar but within the spinel-lherzolite stability field (O'Hara et al., 1971), the relationships between the solidi, the mean $K_1$ and $K_2$ temperatures of the nodules and intrusion, and the degree of incongruity between the $K_1$ and $K_2$ temperatures are similar to those discussed at 12 kbar.

With the exception of the Scourian spinel-lherzolite, which has clearly been recrystallized under granulite facies conditions (O'Hara, 1961), the remainder of the nodules and intrusions crystallized from solidus temperature conditions without substantial intercrystalline cationic reequilibration to temperatures along normal suboceanic or subcontinental mantle geothermal gradients (Ringwood, 1966). We would like to present for consideration a hypothesis which may explain the incongruous nature of the $K_1$ and $K_2$ temperature estimations in terms of variable cooling rates from solidus temperatures, the rates of which determine the extent to which chemical reequilibration can be attained at all stages in the cooling history. If the rate of exchange of Mg$_2$Si$_2$O$_6$ from clinopyroxene to orthopyroxene is greater than that for the reaction of aluminous clinopyroxene with olivine to produce a less aluminous clinopyroxene and spinel, then $K_1$ quenching temperatures should be consistently lower than $K_2$ quenching temperatures during rapid cooling of the intrusions from solidus temperatures to cooler lower crustal or upper mantle temperatures. These data suggest that solidus $K_2$ temperatures were quenched, whereas $K_1$ temperatures tended to partially reequilibrate to subsolidus temperatures. The greater degree of congruity and the lesser statistical spread of $K_1$ and $K_2$ temperatures of the nodules in basalt suggest that little time for partial $K_1$ reequilibration to subsolidus temperatures may have been available prior to quenching by eruption to the surface; a condition indicating a close genetic relationship between the nodules and the volcanic activity.

The possibility of differential reequilibration rates between the $K_1$ and $K_2$ equilibria is best illustrated by the southwestern Oregon spinel-lherzolites (Medaris, 1972). $K_1$ temperatures calculated for the coexisting primary augen and recrystallized matrix pyroxenes are all similar (966°C to 1031°C) and lower than the
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>References</th>
<th>Specimen</th>
<th>$a_{CDP}$</th>
<th>$a_{CpK}$</th>
<th>$a_{CpX}$</th>
<th>$a_{Cpx}$</th>
<th>$a_{CpX}$</th>
<th>$a_{CpK}$</th>
<th>$a_{CpK}$</th>
<th>$a_{Cpx}$</th>
<th>$a_{Cpx}$</th>
<th>$a_{Cpx}$</th>
<th>$a_{Cpx}$</th>
<th>$a_{Cpx}$</th>
<th>$a_{Cpx}$</th>
<th>$a_{Cpx}$</th>
<th>$a_{Cpx}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTRUSIONS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>90683</td>
<td>0.105</td>
<td>0.598</td>
<td>0.106</td>
<td>0.638</td>
<td>0.766</td>
<td>0.442</td>
<td>-1.795</td>
<td>-1.190</td>
<td>1268</td>
<td>1351</td>
<td>1306</td>
<td>1368</td>
<td>645</td>
<td>645</td>
<td>645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>90681</td>
<td>0.101</td>
<td>0.615</td>
<td>0.133</td>
<td>0.638</td>
<td>0.778</td>
<td>0.434</td>
<td>-1.568</td>
<td>-1.223</td>
<td>1334</td>
<td>1341</td>
<td>1375</td>
<td>1358</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>37.330</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-3.049</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>992</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>M5-186</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>VIT-Augen</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td>0.675</td>
<td>0.036</td>
<td>0.696</td>
<td>0.810</td>
<td>0.556</td>
<td>-2.965</td>
<td>-1.979</td>
<td>999</td>
<td>1139</td>
<td>1024</td>
<td>1166</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>VIT-Matrix</td>
<td>0.040</td>
<td>0.685</td>
<td>0.033</td>
<td>0.762</td>
<td>0.810</td>
<td>0.556</td>
<td>-3.139</td>
<td>-2.464</td>
<td>966</td>
<td>1034</td>
<td>990</td>
<td>1065</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>C-Augen</td>
<td>0.075</td>
<td>0.754</td>
<td>0.043</td>
<td>0.705</td>
<td>0.810</td>
<td>0.559</td>
<td>-2.797</td>
<td>-1.516</td>
<td>1031</td>
<td>1256</td>
<td>1058</td>
<td>1278</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>C-Matrix</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td>0.769</td>
<td>0.034</td>
<td>0.738</td>
<td>0.810</td>
<td>0.559</td>
<td>-2.843</td>
<td>-2.115</td>
<td>1022</td>
<td>1108</td>
<td>1104</td>
<td>1116</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>SB-Augen</td>
<td>0.069</td>
<td>0.733</td>
<td>0.039</td>
<td>0.738</td>
<td>0.812</td>
<td>0.478</td>
<td>-2.940</td>
<td>-1.833</td>
<td>1003</td>
<td>1174</td>
<td>1029</td>
<td>1199</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>SB-Matrix</td>
<td>0.054</td>
<td>0.760</td>
<td>0.044</td>
<td>0.764</td>
<td>0.812</td>
<td>0.478</td>
<td>-2.854</td>
<td>-2.114</td>
<td>1020</td>
<td>1108</td>
<td>1068</td>
<td>1116</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>SC</td>
<td>0.075</td>
<td>0.798</td>
<td>0.043</td>
<td>0.751</td>
<td>0.819</td>
<td>0.277</td>
<td>-2.860</td>
<td>-0.881</td>
<td>1019</td>
<td>1452</td>
<td>1045</td>
<td>1463</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**References:**
Fig. 5. Histograms of temperature estimations of spinel-lherzolites from alpine-type peridotites and nodules in basalt. Explanation of the $K_1$ and $K_2$ equilibrium constants in the text. Anhydrous peridotite solidus from Kornprobst (1970) and Green and Ringwood (1967). Water-undersaturated (0.2%) peridotite solidus from Millhollen et al. (1974).

$K_2$ temperatures by 68°C to 225°C. $K_2$ temperatures from the augen clinopyroxenes are at least 100°C higher than $K_2$ temperatures from the recrystallized matrix clinopyroxenes. A correlation is apparent between the degree of subsolidus recrystallization, which is reflected texturally by the degree of grain-size reduction, and the temperatures indicated by the $K_2$ equilibrium, which are reflected chemically by the alumina contents of the pyroxenes.

We realize the limitations of any hypothesis generated from the utilization of analyses in the literature. It is hoped, however, that the geological implications of these experimental data will stimulate future detailed studies on the textural and geochemical interrelationships of spinel-lherzolites. Special attention must now be placed upon the textural control of the chemistry of coexisting solid solution phases, the chemical homogeneity (or heterogeneity) within any one crystal, and the variations in the mineral chemistry from one location of an intrusion to another or one textural class of nodules to another (Mercier and Nicolas, 1975). The kinetic problems discussed pose the necessity of establishing equilibrium before any temperature estimations become geologically meaningful.

Conclusions

Experiments in the system CaO-MgO-Al$_2$O$_3$SiO$_2$ have shown that the CaAl$_2$SiO$_6$ content of clinopyroxenes in the spinel-lherzolite assemblage varies sympathetically with the MgSiO$_3$ content with variations in temperature and pressure. Such variations are predominantly temperature-dependent, although both pyroxene end-members decrease slightly in amount with increasing pressure at constant temperature. Contrary to O'Hara (1967), the isopleths of CaAl$_2$SiO$_6$ and MgSiO$_3$ of clinopyroxene in temperature-pressure space were found to be parallel, rendering these two pyroxene molecules indicators only of the temperature of equilibrium of spinel-lherzolites. No information on the pressures of equilibration can be obtained. A comparison of these results with those of Mori and Green (1975) in the system CaO-MgO-SiO$_2$ suggests that the activity of Mg$_2$Si$_2$O$_7$ in clinopyroxene is considerably reduced with increasing activity of CaAl$_2$SiO$_6$ at any one temperature and pressure. Temperatures of equilibration of spinel-lherzolites determined from experimental data of the diopside-enstatite solvus in the alumina-free system may be up to 150°C too low.

From these experimental data and by using simple ideal mixing models of the solid solution phases participating in the exchange reactions, two temperature estimates were made on spinel-lherzolites from nodules in basalts and alpine-type intrusions. The temperatures indicated by the alumina and enstatite contents of the clinopyroxenes in the spinel-lherzolite nodules range from those of the anhydrous peridotite solidus to those of the water-undersaturated peridotite solidus. No subsolidus reequilibration took place, suggesting a close genetic relationship between the nodules and either the host basalts or the basalts of the same fractionation suite. The temperatures estimated by the alumina contents of the clinopyroxenes in the spinel-lherzolite intrusions, which have not
been affected by post-intrusion metamorphism, also indicating solidus temperatures. However, the temperatures indicated by the MgSiO$_3$ contents of the same clinopyroxenes of these intrusions range from the anhydrous solidus to several hundred degrees in the subsolidus. These incongruous temperatures are attributed to differential intercrystalline cationic exchange rates between the reaction governing the enstatite content and the reaction governing the alumina content of the clinopyroxene. In view of the low subsolidus reequilibration rates the subsolidus temperatures may bear no relation to the temperatures of a geotherm (MacGregor, 1974; MacGregor and Basu, 1974); indeed, they may only represent a 'quench' temperature below which further reequilibration became retarded in the absence of metamorphic reworking. In contrast to ‘thermally quiescent’ deeper-level garnet-lherzolites, which appear to have been in chemical equilibrium along normal subcontinental mantle geothermal gradients (Boyd, 1973; Boyd and Nixon, 1973; Carswell, 1974), most spinel-lherzolites appear to be the vestiges of complex mantle thermal perturbations and/or partial melting events.

**Acknowledgments**

This work was supported by an Edinburgh University Studentship and a National Research Council of Canada postgraduate scholarship. We are grateful to Professor M. J. O’Hara who kindly provided the experimental facilities and useful criticisms during the research period of the senior author at the Grant Institute of Geology, Edinburgh, Scotland.

**References**


Clark, S. P., J. F. Schairer and J. De Neufville (1962) Phase relations in the system CaMgSi$_3$O$_6$–CaAl$_2$Si$_2$O$_6$–SiO$_2$ at low and high pressure. Carnegie Inst. Wash. Yearbook, 61, 59-68.


Mercier, J-C. C. AND A. NICOLAS (1975) Textures and fabrics of
upper mantle peridotites as illustrated by xenoliths from basalts. *J. Petrol.* 16, 454-487.


Mori, T. and D. H. Green (1975) Pyroxenes in the system 

\[ \text{MgSi}_2\text{O}_4-\text{CaMgSi}_2\text{O}_4 \]  


Richardson, S. W., P. M. Bell and M. C. Gilbert (1968) Kyanite-sillimanite equilibrium between 700°C and 1500°C. *Am. J. Sci.* 266, 513-541.


