1

## **REVISION II**

# 2 Partitioning of V and 19 other trace elements between rutile and silicate melt as a function

**3** of oxygen fugacity and melt composition: Implications for subduction zones

4 Megan Holycross<sup>1</sup>, Elizabeth Cottrell<sup>1</sup>

<sup>5</sup> <sup>1</sup>National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian Institution

### 6 Abstract

Vanadium is a multivalent element that can speciate as  $V^{2+}$ ;  $V^{3+}$ ;  $V^{4+}$  and  $V^{5+}$  over a range of 7 geologically relevant oxygen fugacities ( $fO_2$ ). The abundance of V in planetary materials can be 8 exploited as a proxy for  $fO_2$  when its partitioning behavior is known. The mineral rutile (TiO<sub>2</sub>) is 9 an important carrier of the high field strength elements Nb and Ta in the solid Earth, but it can 10 also incorporate substantial quantities of vanadium (up to ~2,000 ppm; e.g., Zack et al. 2002). 11 However, little work has been done to systematically investigate how the partitioning of V in 12 rutile-bearing systems changes as a function of both  $fO_2$  and composition. We measured the 13 partitioning of V and 19 other trace elements (Sc, Cr, Y, Zr, Nb, La, Ce, Pr, Nd, Sm, Eu, Gd, Dy, 14 Ho, Er, Yb, Lu, Hf and Ta) between rutile and three silicate melt compositions equilibrated at 1 15 16 atmosphere pressure, 1300 °C and fO<sub>2</sub>s from two log units below the quartz-fayalite-magnetite 17 oxygen buffer (QFM-2) to air (QFM+6.5). Rutile/melt partition coefficients ( $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ ) change dynamically over an eight-log unit range of  $fO_2$  and are greatest at  $fO_2$ =QFM-2 in all 18 compositions. Vanadium solubility in rutile declines continuously as fO<sub>2</sub> increases from QFM-2 19 and approaches unity in air. Trace element partitioning between rutile and melt is also correlated 20 with melt composition, with the greatest values of  $D^{\text{rt/melt}}$  measured in the most polymerized melt 21 22 systems containing the least TiO<sub>2</sub>. We do not find any circumstances where V becomes

23 incompatible in rutile. Our results indicate that rutile is a considerable sink for V at terrestrial 24  $fO_{2s}$  and will contribute to the retention of V in refractory slab residues in subduction zones. In agreement with previous work, we find that D<sub>Ta</sub><sup>rt/melt</sup>>D<sub>Nb</sub><sup>rt/melt</sup> under all conditions investigated, 25 suggesting that rutile fractionation does not lead to low Nb/Ta ratios in Earth's continental crust. 26 1. Introduction 27 Oxygen fugacity  $(fO_2)$  is a thermodynamic parameter that influences, to a first order, the 28 structure of the planet, the chemistry of rocks and ores, and mass transfer between terrestrial 29 30 reservoirs (Frost and McCammon 2008). Oxygen fugacity also controls the speciation of 31 multivalent elements in planetary materials and their distribution between phases, which can be used as a proxy for  $fO_2$ . Vanadium (V) is a trace element that may have up to four valence states 32  $(V^{2+}; V^{3+}; V^{4+} \text{ and } V^{5+})$  in silicate materials (Fig. 1). Vanadium oxygen barometers 33 (oxybarometers) have been experimentally calibrated for a wide variety of mineral-melt systems 34 35 to investigate how V partitioning shifts as a function of  $fO_2$  (Arató and Audétat 2017; Canil 1997; Canil 2002; Canil and Fedortchouk 2000; 2001; Mallmann and O'Neill 2009; Laubier et 36 al. 2014; Shishkina et al. 2018; Sossi et al. 2018; Toplis and Corgne 2002; Wang et al. 2019) 37 38

The partitioning of vanadium between rutile (TiO<sub>2</sub>) and other phases has excellent potential to serve as an oxybarometer for metamorphic rocks. Tetravalent vanadium is dominant in silicate melts at oxygen fugacities relevant to the Earth's upper mantle and crust (Borisov 2013; Lanzirotti et al. 2018; Sutton et al. 2005) and has the same valence and an ionic radius similar to Ti<sup>4+</sup> (0.58 and 0.605 Å in octahedral coordination, respectively; Shannon 1976). Tetravalent vanadium may readily substitute for Ti<sup>4+</sup> in rutile and the incorporation of "bulk" or total V in rutile should vary as the amount of V<sup>4+</sup> changes. However, only two previous studies have investigated the partitioning of V between rutile and silicate melt under controlled oxygen

46	fugacity (Klemme et al. 2005 and Mallmann et al. 2014). The combined data set of Klemme et
47	al. (2005) and Mallmann et al. (2014) show V solubility in rutile is redox-controlled over a 12
48	log-unit range in fO <sub>2</sub> , but scatter in their experimental data suggests a secondary influence on the
49	behavior of vanadium that was not investigated as an experimental variable.
50	Overtificing the negativising of these elements between mutils and malt is also empired for
50	Quantifying the partitioning of trace elements between rutile and melt is also crucial for
51	evaluating the flux of cations through the subduction factory. Rutile is known to concentrate the
52	high field strength elements (HFSE) Nb and Ta in the solid Earth (e.g., Meinhold 2010; Rudnick
53	et al. 2000; Tang et al. 2019; Xiao et al. 2006; Zack et al. 2002). The strong compatibility of
54	these elements in rutile produces complementary liquids depleted in the HFSE during melting or
55	dehydration-a common feature of arc magmas in subduction zones (e.g., Elliott 2003; Gill
56	1981; Kelemen et al. 2003; Rudnick et al. 2000; Tang et al. 2019; Turner and Langmuir 2015).
57	This observation has motivated an abundance of studies investigating the partitioning of Nb and
58	Ta between rutile and melt (Bromiley and Redfern 2008; Foley et al. 2000; Green 2000; Green
59	and Pearson 1987; Horng and Hess 2000; Jenner et al. 1993; John et al. 2011; Klemme et al.
60	2005; Mallmann et al. 2014; McCallum and Charette 1978; Ryerson and Watson 1987; Schmidt
61	et al. 2004; Wendlandt 1990; Xiong et al. 2005; Xiong et al. 2011). However, rutile can
62	concentrate vanadium in quantities that rival those of Nb and Ta (up to 2,000 ppm; Barth et al.
63	2002; Guo et al. 2017; Hermann 2002; Liu et al. 2014; Zack et al. 2002), which suggests that
64	rutile may preferentially retain V as well as the HFSE during slab melting or dehydration. The
65	pioneering study of Shervais (1982) showed the Ti/V ratios of arc basalts are lower than the Ti/V
66	ratios of mid-ocean ridge basalts. We suggest that this tectonic control on Ti and V in volcanic
67	rocks may be in part due to retention of these elements by residual rutile in subduction
68	environments.

This contribution reports experiments to calibrate the partitioning of V and 19 other trace elements between rutile and three silicate melt compositions over an eight and a half log-unit range in oxygen fugacity. Our experiments were executed at ambient pressure in a system where  $fO_2$  can be directly controlled to build intuition for how V behavior correlates with both redox state and melt composition in higher-pressure conditions relevant to rutile growth in nature.

74 **2. Methods** 

### 75 2.1 Experimental

76 Three systems with a range of melt structures were selected to measure the partitioning of trace elements between rutile and melt as a function of oxygen fugacity and composition. Two 77 78 synthetic compositions, a dacite and a mid-ocean ridge basalt, were prepared by mixing reagent 79 oxides and silicate mineral powders under ethanol. The third composition was mixed from crushed and powdered natural Lake County obsidian (LCO). Compositional data for all starting 80 81 materials is listed in Table 1. The three base compositions were subsequently doped with a trace 82 element oxide mix so the final compositions contained ~2,500 ppm V and ~60 ppm each of Sc, 83 Cr, Y, Zr, Nb, La, Ce, Pr, Nd, Sm, Eu, Gd, Dy, Ho, Er, Yb, Lu and Ta. Melts also contained 84 trace amounts of Ni and Hf, likely present as minor contaminants in the silicate mineral powders used in the synthetic mixes. 85

The pressure, temperature, and compositional conditions for rutile saturation in silicate melts are well-constrained. Rutile solubility is inversely correlated with pressure (*P*) and melt polymerization and positively correlated with temperature (*T*) (i.e., TiO<sub>2</sub> is most soluble in depolymerized melts at low *P* and high *T*; e.g., Gaetani et al. 2008; Ryerson and Watson 1987; Xiong et al. 2005; Xiong et al. 2009). To avoid any complications from extrapolating rutile

91	solubility data at high pressure to ambient conditions, we determined the relationship between
92	rutile solubility and the ratio of non-bridging oxygens to tetrahedrally coordinated cations in the
93	melt (NBO/T; Mysen 1983) from previous studies conducted at $P=1$ atm (see discussion in
94	Section 3.1). Additional TiO <sub>2</sub> was added to powdered mixes to saturate each melt composition in
95	rutile. Powdered rutile (Alfa Aesar; 99.9 % $TiO_2$ ) was added to the LCO, dacite and MORB
96	mixes to form bulk compositions containing 11, 17 and 31 wt% TiO <sub>2</sub> , respectively.
97	All experiments were run in a vertical Deltech furnace plumbed with CO and CO2 gas
98	lines. Experiment $fO_2s$ were monitored using a $ZrO_2$ sensor referenced to pure $O_2$ . The hot spot
99	of the furnace was mapped using the technique of Walker et al. (1988) and the thermocouple
100	temperature was calibrated relative to the melting point of Au at one atmosphere.
101	Experiment starting materials were blended with liquid polyvinyl alcohol and hung from
101 102	Experiment starting materials were blended with liquid polyvinyl alcohol and hung from Pt loops. All Pt loops were pre-equilibrated with the starting material to mitigate loss of Fe from
102	Pt loops. All Pt loops were pre-equilibrated with the starting material to mitigate loss of Fe from
102 103	Pt loops. All Pt loops were pre-equilibrated with the starting material to mitigate loss of Fe from the melt to the loop during partitioning experiments (Grove 1982). Pre-equilibration runs were
102 103 104	Pt loops. All Pt loops were pre-equilibrated with the starting material to mitigate loss of Fe from the melt to the loop during partitioning experiments (Grove 1982). Pre-equilibration runs were held at 1300 °C and the targeted $fO_2$ for 24 hours. Loops were cleaned in HF and reloaded with
102 103 104 105	Pt loops. All Pt loops were pre-equilibrated with the starting material to mitigate loss of Fe from the melt to the loop during partitioning experiments (Grove 1982). Pre-equilibration runs were held at 1300 °C and the targeted $fO_2$ for 24 hours. Loops were cleaned in HF and reloaded with starting material for partitioning experiments. Rutile/melt partitioning experiments were fused at
102 103 104 105 106	Pt loops. All Pt loops were pre-equilibrated with the starting material to mitigate loss of Fe from the melt to the loop during partitioning experiments (Grove 1982). Pre-equilibration runs were held at 1300 °C and the targeted $fO_2$ for 24 hours. Loops were cleaned in HF and reloaded with starting material for partitioning experiments. Rutile/melt partitioning experiments were fused at 1500 °C for ~1 h to create a homogeneous melt and cooled at 6 °C/h for equilibration at 1300
102 103 104 105 106 107	Pt loops. All Pt loops were pre-equilibrated with the starting material to mitigate loss of Fe from the melt to the loop during partitioning experiments (Grove 1982). Pre-equilibration runs were held at 1300 °C and the targeted $fO_2$ for 24 hours. Loops were cleaned in HF and reloaded with starting material for partitioning experiments. Rutile/melt partitioning experiments were fused at 1500 °C for ~1 h to create a homogeneous melt and cooled at 6 °C/h for equilibratation at 1300 °C. Experiment conditions are recorded in Table 2. All runs were terminated by drop-quenching

We confirmed the presence of rutile in our run products with Raman spectroscopy.Raman spectra were collected on all experiments using a Horiba LabRAM HR Evolution

confocal microscope equipped with Synapse detector at the National Museum of Natural History (NMNH), Smithsonian Institution. Spectra were collected at the 532 nm wavelength using a 600 µm grating and a 5 µm focused spot size for all experiments except the LCOTi series, where a 2.5 µm spot was used. Collected spectra were reduced in the LabSpec6 software and compared to entries in the RRUFF online database (Downs 2006) to confirm the presence of rutile in our experiments. Examples of collected Raman spectra are reported in the Supplemental Material.

119 The major and minor element compositions of all experiments were determined using the 120 JEOL 8530F Hyperprobe at NMNH. A correction was used to account for the overlap of the Ti 121  $K_{\beta}$  peak with the V  $K_{\alpha}$  peak on the LIF crystal (Snetsinger 1964). A Ti-Cr-V metal alloy (NIST 122 SRM-649) was used as a secondary standard during EPMA analysis. Repeated analyses of pure 123 Ti metal using our correction returned values of "0" for vanadium. Experimental glasses were 124 measured at an accelerating voltage of 15 kV and 10 nA current using a defocused 20 µm spot to reduce Na loss. Experimental rutile was measured at 15 kV and 20 nA current using a 1 µm spot 125 126 size. Counting times were 60 s for V and 20 s for all other elements. Concentrations of V in all 127 experimental materials were well above the EPMA detection limit (~100 ppm) for our analytical 128 routine. Multiple analyses on single grains and rim-to-rim traverses showed no signs of crystal 129 zoning in our experiments (reported in the Supplemental Material).

The trace element compositions of three experiments were determined via laser ablation
ICP-MS in the Corman Center for Mass Spectroscopy at Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute. The
RPI LA-ICP-MS consists of a Photon Machines Analyte 193 nm ultra-short pulse excimer
workstation coupled to a Bruker 820 quadrupole ICP-MS. We applied a laser fluence of 7.19
J/cm<sup>2</sup> and 6 Hz rep rate. For all analyses, the sample was ablated for 30 s, followed by 30 s
where the shutter was closed to measure the background. All experimental glasses were analyzed

136	using a 40 $\mu$ m laser spot. Rutile was analyzed with a 40 or 20 $\mu$ m laser spot, depending on rutile
137	grain size. NIST612 glass (Pearce et al. 1997) was used as the standard for glass analyses.
138	USGS-GS1D glass was used as the standard for rutile analyses and as a secondary standard for
139	analyses of experimental glasses. Trail et al. (2018) demonstrates matrix-matched mineral
140	standards are not necessary for laser spot sizes $\geq 20 \ \mu m$ . LA-ICP-MS data were reduced using the
141	Iolite software package for Igor Pro (Paton et al. 2011) with <sup>29</sup> Si and <sup>49</sup> Ti as the internal
142	standards for glasses and rutile, respectively, in the trace element data reduction scheme. We
143	monitored major element ratios (i.e., <sup>27</sup> Al: <sup>49</sup> Ti) to filter out any glass signal in our rutile spectra.
144	The small size of rutile in most experiments precluded LA-ICP-MS measurements. Complete
145	chemical data for all experiments are collated in the Supplemental Material.
146	3. Results
146 147	<b>3. Results</b> Sixteen partitioning experiments saturated in rutile. One experiment conducted in air
147	Sixteen partitioning experiments saturated in rutile. One experiment conducted in air
147 148	Sixteen partitioning experiments saturated in rutile. One experiment conducted in air saturated in an armacolite (Ti-Mg-Fe-Al) solid solution (Anderson et al. 1970) in addition to
147 148 149	Sixteen partitioning experiments saturated in rutile. One experiment conducted in air saturated in an armacolite (Ti-Mg-Fe-Al) solid solution (Anderson et al. 1970) in addition to rutile (chemical data may be found in Supplemental Material). Basaltic melt experiments
147 148 149 150	Sixteen partitioning experiments saturated in rutile. One experiment conducted in air saturated in an armacolite (Ti-Mg-Fe-Al) solid solution (Anderson et al. 1970) in addition to rutile (chemical data may be found in Supplemental Material). Basaltic melt experiments crystallized large, subhedral rutile grains while more polymerized melts (DacTi and LCOTi
147 148 149 150 151	Sixteen partitioning experiments saturated in rutile. One experiment conducted in air saturated in an armacolite (Ti-Mg-Fe-Al) solid solution (Anderson et al. 1970) in addition to rutile (chemical data may be found in Supplemental Material). Basaltic melt experiments crystallized large, subhedral rutile grains while more polymerized melts (DacTi and LCOTi experiments) promoted the growth of euhedral, acicular rutile crystals (Fig. 2). Rutile needles
147 148 149 150 151 152	Sixteen partitioning experiments saturated in rutile. One experiment conducted in air saturated in an armacolite (Ti-Mg-Fe-Al) solid solution (Anderson et al. 1970) in addition to rutile (chemical data may be found in Supplemental Material). Basaltic melt experiments crystallized large, subhedral rutile grains while more polymerized melts (DacTi and LCOTi experiments) promoted the growth of euhedral, acicular rutile crystals (Fig. 2). Rutile needles formed clusters and were oriented similarly in the more polymerized melt compositions (Figures
147 148 149 150 151 152 153	Sixteen partitioning experiments saturated in rutile. One experiment conducted in air saturated in an armacolite (Ti-Mg-Fe-Al) solid solution (Anderson et al. 1970) in addition to rutile (chemical data may be found in Supplemental Material). Basaltic melt experiments crystallized large, subhedral rutile grains while more polymerized melts (DacTi and LCOTi experiments) promoted the growth of euhedral, acicular rutile crystals (Fig. 2). Rutile needles formed clusters and were oriented similarly in the more polymerized melt compositions (Figures 2b and 2c), indicating Ti may have structural influence as a nucleating agent for crystal growth

# Rutile/melt partition coefficients were calculated from chemical data according to theequation

158 
$$D^{rt/melt} = \frac{concentration in rutile}{concentration in melt}$$
 (1)

159 Reported standard deviations were calculated from

160 
$$\sigma = \sqrt{SD_{melt}^2 + SD_{rt}^2}$$
(2)

161 Rutile/melt partition coefficients for V are listed in Table 2. All other trace element partition162 coefficients are presented in Table 3.

163 Element diffusion in silicate melts is dependent on melt polymerization. The experiments 164 of Holycross and Watson (2016; 2018) show vanadium diffusion in dry basaltic melts at 1300 °C is almost twice as fast as V diffusion in hydrous rhyolitic melts at the same temperature (no 165 166 diffusion data has been published for V in dry rhyolitic melts, but it is likely slower than V 167 diffusion in hydrous rhyolitic melts). We employed the same experimental cooling rate for all 168 melt compositions. This raises the possibility that rutile in our most polymerized melt compositions did not crystallize in equilibrium with the bulk melt and may instead sample a melt 169 region surrounding the crystal that has not diffusively equilibrated (see contributions by 170 171 Albarede and Bottinga 1972; Holycross and Watson 2016; 2018; Sossi and O'Neill 2016; and 172 Watson and Müller 2009 among others for discussion on how diffusive boundary layers in the melt impact the disequilibrium incorporation of cations in rapidly growing minerals). However, 173 174 EPMA traverses across rutile/melt interfaces and rutile grains from all compositions (reported in 175 the Supplemental Material) confirm V concentrations in rutile are homogeneous from rim-to-rim, as are melt regions surrounding the crystal interface. In addition, two experiments of different 176 duration (231 and 40 hours) in the DacTi system at QFM+1 produce the same values of  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ 177 within  $2\sigma$ , indicating our experiment durations were sufficient to attain equilibrium. 178

#### 179 **4. Discussion**

#### 180 *4.1 Rutile defect equilibria and relationship to oxygen fugacity*

181	Rutile is a non-stoichiometric phase (TiO <sub>2-x</sub> , where $x=0-0.02$ ) with semiconducting and
182	photocatalytic properties that are closely related to its concentration of point defects (e.g., Bak et
183	al. 2012, Kofstad 1972, Nowotny et al. 2008). A decrease in oxygen fugacity results in the
184	formation of two main "donor" point defects in rutile: oxygen vacancies (dominant; $v_0^{"}$ in
185	Kröger-Vink notation) and interstitial titanium sites (minor; $Ti_i^{m}$ and $Ti_i^{m}$ for Ti <sup>4+</sup> and Ti <sup>3+</sup>
186	interstitials, respectively) (Kofstad 1972). Formation of point defects increases the population of
187	free electrons; thus as $fO_2$ decreases, the rutile structure can accommodate a greater array of ions
188	with different valence states and electronegativities to charge balance. According to the defect
189	model of Bak et al. (2012), both $v_0^{"}$ and $Ti_i^{""}$ are constant in rutile at our experimental conditions
190	(absolute logfO <sub>2</sub> =-9.21 to -0.6 bar at 1300 °C), which suggests the main substitution mechanism
191	for V in our experiments is exchange of V <sup>4+</sup> for Ti <sup>4+</sup> . Our system is not reducing enough to
192	stabilize any significant amount of trivalent titanium (e.g., Borisov 2012; Leitzke et al. 2018) and
193	$Ti_i^{i}$ is orders of magnitude less than $v_0^{i}$ and $Ti_i^{i}$ . However, $Ti_i^{i}$ increases substantially with
194	decreasing $fO_2$ and we anticipate that the exchange of V <sup>3+</sup> with Ti <sup>3+</sup> sites may become important
195	for the incorporation of V in TiO <sub>2</sub> under more reducing conditions.

We note that the model of Bak et al. (2012) describes the defect structure of rutile
crystals equilibrated with gas atmospheres, while our experimental rutile equilibrated with TiO<sub>2</sub>bearing silicate melt. Additional defects in our experimental rutile may result from the
substitution of major cations like Si, Fe or Al (e.g., Cherniak and Watson 2019; Hoff 2019) or
may be correlated with the activity of TiO<sub>2</sub> in the melt.

201 4.2 Vanadium partitioning between rutile and melt

202 4.2.1 Redox dependence of partitioning

.

The partitioning of "bulk" vanadium between rutile and melt is driven by the shift in V 203 valence state over the eight and a half log-unit range in  $fO_2$  investigated here (Figure 4). Divalent 204 205 vanadium is negligible at fO<sub>2</sub>=QFM-2 and above (Sutton et al., 2005) and we only consider the 206 oxidation reactions

207 
$$V^{3+}O_{1.5} + \frac{1}{2}O_2 = V^{5+}O_{2.5}$$
 (3a)

208 
$$V^{4+}O_2 + \frac{1}{4}O_2 = V^{5+}O_{2.5}$$
 (3b)

in our experimental system. The equilibrium constants (K) for redox reactions 3a and 3b are 209 210 given by

211 
$$K_{3a} = \frac{V^{5+}O_{2.5}}{(V^{3+}O_{1.5})(fO_2)^{1/2}}$$
(4a)

212 
$$K_{3b} = \frac{V^{5+}O_{2.5}}{(V^{4+}O_2)(fO_2)^{1/4}}$$
(4b)

. .

.

1 11

The thermodynamic treatment of Mallmann and O'Neill (2009) calculates the bulk partition  
coefficient, 
$$D_V^{min/melt}$$
, from the partition coefficients for individual V species,  $D_{V^{3+}}^{min/melt}$ ,  
 $D_{V^{4+}}^{min/melt}$  and  $D_{V^{5+}}^{min/melt}$  and the equilibrium constants  $K_{3a}$  and  $K_{3b}$ . We used the  
parameterization of Mallmann and O'Neill (2009) to determine the relationship between  $D_V^{rt/melt}$   
and oxygen fugacity for each melt composition from the equation

218 
$$D_{V}^{rt/melt} = \frac{\left(D_{V^{3+}}^{rt/melt} \cdot (K_{3a})^{-1} \cdot (fO_{2})^{-1/2}\right) + \left(D_{V^{4+}}^{rt/melt} \cdot (K_{3b})^{-1} \cdot (fO_{2})^{-1/4}\right) + D_{V^{5+}}^{rt/melt}}{\left((K_{3a})^{-1} \cdot (fO_{2})^{-1/2}\right) + \left((K_{3b})^{-1} \cdot (fO_{2})^{-1/4}\right) + 1}$$
(5)

Mallmann and O'Neill (2009) note that values of *K* are less sensitive to melt composition than values of *D*. We apply the equilibrium constants ( $K_{3a}$ =3.03 x 10<sup>-5</sup> and  $K_{3b}$ =3.09 x 10<sup>-3</sup>) of Mallmann and O'Neill (2009) to model redox reactions in our rutile-melt systems (note that other studies have found different *K*s for magnetite/melt partitioning of V, e.g., Sossi et al. 2018; Toplis and Corgne 2002). More details on this modeling approach may be found in Mallmann and O'Neill (2009). Rutile/melt partition coefficients for each valence state of V are reported in our Supplemental Material.

Each melt system produces distinct partition coefficients for V<sup>3+</sup>, V<sup>4+</sup> and V<sup>5+</sup> and values of  $D_{V^{4+}}^{rt/melt} > D_{V^{3+}}^{rt/melt} > D_{V^{5+}}^{rt/melt}$  in all compositions (Supplemental Material). Tetravalent

vanadium is most abundant in our system at *f*O<sub>2</sub>s near QFM-2 (Sutton et al. 2005), has the same

valence and an ionic radius very similar to  $Ti^{4+}$  in octahedral coordination (Shannon, 1976).

230 Rutile/melt partition coefficients for bulk V are greatest when  $V^{4+}$  is the dominant species—

231  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$  peaks at QFM-2 in all melt compositions.  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$  decreases continuously as  $fO_2$ 

232 increases and  $V^{5+}$  becomes prevalent. Rutile/melt partition coefficients approach unity near

233  $fO_2=QFM+6.5$ , but V never becomes incompatible in rutile in our experiments.

It is unclear from our experiments how  $V^{3+}$  behaves in the rutile-melt system. Mismatch between the ionic radii of  $V^{3+}$  and  $Ti^{4+}$  (Shannon, 1976) indicates  $D_V^{rt/melt}$  should decrease as  $V^{3+}$ becomes abundant at  $fO_2$ <QFM-2. However, the solubility of  $V^{3+}$  may be enhanced by coupled substitution with pentavalent ions like Nb and Ta, which are highly compatible in rutile (see Section 4.3). Trivalent vanadium is also expected to exchange with  $Ti^{3+}$  in systems under very reducing conditions (Bak et al. 2012; Borisov 2013; Papike et al. 2016). Substitution mechanisms for  $V^{3+}$ , while of crystal-chemical interest, are less important for terrestrial systems 241 where  $V^{4+}$  and  $V^{5+}$  are dominant and further consideration is beyond the scope of this

242 contribution.

243 4.2.2 Compositional dependence of partitioning

244	Rutile/melt partition coefficients for V vary systematically between the three melt
245	compositions at a given $fO_2$ (Figure 6). Partition coefficients obtained for the MORB system are
246	the lowest at all $fO_2$ s investigated and are close to an order of magnitude less than $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ in
247	LCO at $fO_2 \leq QFM$ . The dacite system produced intermediate values of $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ at all $fO_2$
248	conditions. The behavior of V at a given $fO_2$ is clearly dependent on melt composition and is
249	influenced by both melt polymerization (i.e., NBO/T) and the $TiO_2$ content of the melt.
250	Early experimental work by Watson (1976) and Ryerson and Hess (1978) predicted
251	mineral/melt partition coefficients for elements with high charge densities (i.e., the HFSE) will
252	increase with increasing polymerization of the melt. Subsequent studies by Green and Pearson
253	(1987), Wendlandt (1990), Horng and Hess (2000), Green (2000), Schmidt et al. (2004),
254	Klemme et al. (2005), Xiong et al. (2005), Xiong et al. (2011), and this contribution, show strong
255	correlations between rutile/melt partitioning of the HFSE and melt polymerization. Our new
256	experiments demonstrate vanadium behaves similarly to the HFSE: $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ increases as NBO/T
257	decreases in the three melt compositions (Fig. 6a).
258	Vanadium partitioning between rutile and melt may also be correlated with the
259	coordination of Ti in the melt. The role of titanium in silicate melt structures is concentration-

- 260 dependent, and it's in both the numerator and denominator of the "NBO/T" ratio (Mysen 1983).
- 261 X-ray absorption near edge structure (XANES) spectroscopy of silicate glasses shows the
- relationship between Ti coordination and melt composition, as well as pressure and temperature,

is highly complex (e.g., Farges et al. 1996; Farges and Gordon 1997; Greegor et al. 1983;
Romano et al. 2000). Titanium may be coordinated as <sup>[5]</sup>Ti and <sup>[6]</sup>Ti in depolymerized melts but
becomes coordinated as <sup>[4]</sup>Ti as NBO/T decreases (Dingwell et al. 1992; Farges et al. 1996;
Farges and Gordon 1997). Highly coordinated Ti can form Ti-O-Ti rutile-structured complexes
in depolymerized melts, while <sup>[4]</sup>Ti is predicted to form Ti-O-Si linkages in more polymerized
compositions (Farges et al. 1996). Greegor et al. (1983) observed six-fold coordinated Ti in
silicate glasses only when they contained >7 wt% TiO<sub>2</sub>; fourteen of our sixteen experimental

270 glasses contain >7 wt% TiO<sub>2</sub> (Table 2).

271 Octahedrally-coordinated Ti structures in the melt may form rutile-like complexes that 272 bind rutile-compatible cations, leading to lower rutile/melt partition coefficients for these 273 elements in Ti-rich melt systems. This effect likely contributed to the compositional trends in our 274 rutile/melt partitioning data. It is well-established that highly polymerized melts require less bulk 275 TiO<sub>2</sub> to saturate in rutile (e.g., Fig. 3 and Dickinson and Hess 1985; Gaetani et al. 2008; Ryerson 276 and Watson 1987; Schmidt et al. 2004; Xiong et al. 2005; Xiong et al. 2009). Our basaltic system 277 contained more TiO<sub>2</sub> to saturate in rutile than the dacitic system, which contained more TiO<sub>2</sub> 278 than the rhyolitic system (Fig. 6b). Depolymerized melts contain more, and more highly 279 coordinated, TiO<sub>2</sub> in equilibrium with rutile. Consequently,  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$  at a given fO<sub>2</sub> can be expressed as a function of both NBO/T and melt TiO<sub>2</sub> content (Fig. 6). The relationship between 280 281 rutile solubility and melt polymerization, in addition to the influence of melt TiO<sub>2</sub> on 282 polymerization itself (Mysen 1983) dictates that these parameters cannot be changed 283 independently in our experimental series. No published work has systematically investigated the 284 relationship between  $fO_2$ ,  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$  and composition in higher pressure systems that saturate in rutile at lower TiO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. 285

286	Previous studies by Xirouchakis et al. (2001), Schmidt et al. (2004), Dygert et al. (2014)
287	and Leitzke et al. (2016) have also noted that D values for other mineral/melt systems are
288	inversely correlated with melt TiO <sub>2</sub> content.

4.2.3 Comparison to other studies

290 Klemme et al. (2005) and Mallmann et al. (2014) have also examined the partitioning of V between rutile and silicate melt as a function of oxygen fugacity. Those two studies were 291 conducted at the same conditions (P=1 atm, T=1250-1300 °C), used identical melt compositions, 292 and yielded similar results (Figure 5). A notable exception is that some of the experiments of 293 294 Klemme et al. (2005) suggest V is more compatible in rutile under oxidizing conditions than the experiments of Mallmann et al. (2014). Our new data agree with their previous work at 295 296 logfO<sub>2</sub><QFM+1 but deviate significantly at more oxidizing conditions (Figure 5). This discrepancy is most likely due to the difference in the melt compositions used here and those of 297 Klemme et al. (2005) and Mallmann et al. (2014), which contained more TiO<sub>2</sub> and were less 298 polymerized (see Section 4.2.2). Mallmann et al. (2014) reported a progressive increase in 299  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$  even as  $fO_2$  was reduced to QFM-5. This behavior may be expected as  $fO_2$  decreases due 300 to both an increased number of point defects in rutile (Bak et al. 2012) and increased exchange of 301  $V^{3+}$  with Ti<sup>3+</sup> species formed at reducing conditions (Borisov 2012). However, Mallmann et al. 302 (2014) interpreted this trend to reflect the enhanced stabilization of  $V^{4+}$  to lower  $fO_2$  than 303 previously expected and did not find any evidence for the presence of  $V^{3+}$  in their experiments. 304 305 In contrast to Klemme et al. (2005) and Mallmann et al. (2014), we do not find any conditions where V becomes incompatible in rutile (Fig. 5). 306

307 4.2.4 What controls V incorporation in terrestrial rutile?

In this experimental series, we varied  $fO_2$  and melt composition. In these 1-atmosphere 308 309 experiments, by necessity, the concentration of  $TiO_2$  greatly exceeds what we expect in nature. 310 Further, variation in TiO<sub>2</sub> directly influences the melt's NBO/T ratio, such that TiO<sub>2</sub> and NBO/T cannot be varied independently (they co-vary with  $R^2 = 0.95$ ). Multiple regressions of fO<sub>2</sub>. 311 NBO/T and TiO<sub>2</sub> therefore results in multicollinearity. Melt TiO<sub>2</sub> concentration and NBO/T do 312 not provide independent information, and one must be dropped from the regression. As expected 313 314 with multicollinearity, the result of the regression is the same whether cast in terms of NBO/T or TiO2 – each variable accounts for ~ 30% of the variance in  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ . Because  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$  is likely to 315 316 correlate with any component that alters NBO/T, and because  $TiO_2$  does not vary widely in terrestrial melts, we choose to cast the dependent variable in terms of  $fO_2$  and NBO/T (for n=16) 317 experiments,  $R^2 = 0.67$ , and p-value =0.002 for both NBO/T and  $fO_2$ ). 318

319 In sum, the partitioning of V between rutile and melt in our experiments is controlled equally by  $fO_2$  and melt composition, over the range of  $fO_2$  and melt composition investigated. It 320 321 is uncertain how these influences are borne out in terrestrial environments because our 322 experiments employed unnatural melt compositions. Rutile saturation is dependent on melt 323 polymerization (investigated here) as well as pressure and temperature. Terrestrial magmas 324 contain a limited amount of TiO<sub>2</sub> (often 0.5-3 wt% with a maximum of 5.5 wt%; e.g., Arndt et al. 325 1995; Dasgupta et al. 2010; Gale et al. 2013; Turner and Langmuir 2015) and do not precipitate 326 rutile unless they are fairly polymerized (e.g., Ryerson and Watson 1987; Xiong et al. 2009). In contrast, the available data suggest that rutile saturation is not directly limited by fO<sub>2</sub>, and can 327 328 occur over a wide extent of Earth-relevant redox conditions (e.g., this contribution as well as 329 Guo et al. 2017; Klemme et al. 2005; Liu et al. 2014; Mallmann et al. 2014).

330	Terrestrial rutile equilibrates with silicate melts over a narrow range of NBO/T and $TiO_2$
331	but a potentially large and uncertain range of $fO_2$ . It's noteworthy that our most polymerized
332	experimental system with the least TiO <sub>2</sub> returned the highest partition coefficients, and also
333	produced the greatest dynamic range of $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ —i.e., $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ was most sensitive to changes in
334	redox in this melt composition. We suggest that in natural systems with reasonable melt
335	compositions, $fO_2$ will be the dominant free parameter controlling the incorporation of V in
336	natural rutile.
337	4.2.5 Anticipated effects of pressure and temperature on vanadium partitioning between rutile
338	and melt
339	Two previous studies have measured the partitioning of V between rutile and melt at
222	Two previous studies have measured the partitioning of v between futtie and ment at
340	higher pressures and lower temperatures but have not controlled or monitored $fO_2$ . However, we
341	can use their results to make qualitative predictions about the behavior of V-in-rutile under $P$ and
342	T conditions more relevant to natural rutile saturation scenarios.
343	Foley et al. (2000) reported the results of three experiments to measure the partitioning of
344	trace elements between rutile and tonalite melt at $P=18-25$ kbar and $T=900-1100$ °C. They
345	estimated their experimental assembly imposed fO2s close to the Fe-FeO buffer (~QFM-5 at this
346	<i>P</i> and <i>T</i> range). Foley et al. (2000) produced $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}} = 46.5-124$ . Xiong et al. (2005) ran eclogite
347	melting experiments to measure trace element partitioning between rutile and hydrous silicic
348	melt at $P=10-25$ kbar and $T=925-1075$ °C. They estimated their experimental $fO_{2}s$ to be between
349	the Fe <sub>3</sub> O <sub>4</sub> -FeO and Ni-NiO and buffers (~QFM+0.5 to ~QFM-2.5). Xiong et al. (2005) found
350	$D_V^{\text{rt/melt}} = 40-141$ , with no clear trend between $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ , T or P in their experiments.

351	Values of $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ measured by Foley et al. (2000) and Xiong et al. (2005) are 2 to 6 times
352	greater than any value of $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ measured in this study (22, at QFM-2 in LCOTi) and near 1.5
353	orders of magnitude greater than all values of $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ returned in the MORBTi system (Table 2).
354	Clearly, increasing pressure and/or decreasing temperature substantially increases the
355	compatibility of V in rutile. Foley et al. (2000) and Xiong et al. (2005) also measured $D_{\rm Nb}^{\rm rt/melt}$
356	and $D_{\text{Ta}}^{\text{rt/melt}}$ in the same experiments as $D_{\text{V}}^{\text{rt/melt}}$ ; in runs that produced the highest values of
357	$D_V^{\text{rt/melt}} \geq 100$ , vanadium compatibility in rutile is similar to the HFSE ( $D^{\text{rt/melt}}$ also ~100).
358	Considering our new data in concert with the previous work of Foley et al. (2000) and Xiong et
359	al. (2005), we predict rutile may be a substantial carrier of V in addition to the HFSE in
360	subduction zone environments, especially at $fO_2s$ at or below the QFM buffer.
361	4.3 Other trace elements
362	Three of our experiments produced rutile large enough for laser ablation analysis. Our
363	trace element partition coefficients (Table 3) agree qualitatively with previous studies conducted
364	under similar conditions (Klemme et al. 2005; Mallmann et al. 2014). Increasing melt
365	polymerization drives an increase in the compatibility of all trace elements in rutile (Fig. 8). All
366	rare earth elements are broadly incompatible in rutile. Rutile/melt partitioning of multivalent Cr
367	and Fe increases as $fO_2$ increases from QFM-2 to QFM-1 in the MORBTi system, which may

368 indicate a coupled substitution mechanism for  $Fe^{3+}$  and  $Cr^{3+}$  with  $Nb^{5+}$  or  $Ta^{5+}$ .

369	We find that niobium and tantalum are extremely compatible in rutile ( $D^{\text{rt/melt}}$ =50 to 230).
370	Variations in the partitioning of Nb and Ta between rutile and melt may be linked to changes in
371	either melt polymerization or melt $TiO_2$ content (Section 4.2.2). In agreement with previous
372	work, we find that $D_{Ta}^{rt/melt} > D_{Nb}^{rt/melt}$ under all conditions investigated (Bromiley and Redfern
373	2008; Foley et al. 2000; Green 2000; Green and Pearson 1987; Horng and Hess 2000; Jenner et

al. 1993; John et al. 2011; Klemme et al. 2005; Mallmann et al., 2014; Schmidt 2004; Wendlandt
1990; Xiong et al. 2005; Xiong et al. 2011). However, we note that analyses of Ta in our
experimental rutile exhibit a slightly higher standard deviation than our Nb values (~11% S.D.
compared to ~3% S.D., respectively; see Supplemental Material). This may be due to either
poorer counting statistics for the less abundant Ta, or the due to the slower diffusivity of Ta
relative to Nb in rutile (Dohmen et al., 2018; Marschall et al. 2013).

#### **380 5. Implications**

Shervais (1982) found arc basalts have lower Ti/V ratios than MORB (Ti/V=10-20 and 381 382 Ti/V=20-50, respectively, after filtering for magnetite fractionation) but asserts the lower Ti/V of arcs cannot be due to retention of Ti-rich phases in refractory residues unless the Ti-rich phase 383 384 also strongly retains vanadium. Our new data show that the Ti-phase rutile, which commonly forms in MORB subducted to eclogite facies, strongly retains vanadium and its compatibility in 385 386 rutile is dependent on the oxygen fugacity of the system. This raises the possibility the Ti/V 387 signature of arc magmas may be in part inherited from a low Ti/V component that has been transferred from a rutile-bearing slab and subsequently mixed with the overlying arc. 388

Dynamic and thermochemical models indicate that slab-surface temperatures reach or 389 390 exceed the hydrous basalt + sediment solidus for roughly half of the world's subduction zones 391 (e.g., Cooper et al. 2012; Hermann and Rubatto 2009; Plank et al. 2009; Syracuse et al. 2010; 392 van Keken et al. 2002); recent work by Sisson and Kelemen (2018) suggests eclogite partial 393 melts constitute 1/10 to 1/3 of the final parental arc magmas. Eclogite melting is thus not only a common phenomenon during subduction but also plays a critical role in controlling the flux of 394 elements from the slab to the overlying arc. Here, we model partitioning of Ti and V during 395 396 eclogite melting as a function of  $fO_2$  and phase assemblage (garnet, clinopyroxene  $\pm$  rutile) to

determine the impact of residual rutile on the Ti/V ratios of slab melts and their potentialcontribution to parental arc magmas.

399	We have produced rutile/melt partition coefficients for V over varying fO <sub>2</sub> . Several
400	previous studies have measured the partitioning of V between garnet/melt (Canil 2001;
401	Mallmann and O'Neill 2009 following Mallmann et al. 2007; Righter et al. 2011) and
402	clinopyroxene/melt (Canil 2001; Canil and Fedortchouk 2000; Laubier et al. 2014; Mallmann
403	and O'Neill 2009; Wang et al., 2019) under controlled oxygen fugacity. At present there are no
404	reported data sets examining partitioning of V between these phases as function of fO2 at
405	pressures, temperatures and compositions relevant to slab melting. This necessitates we model V
406	partitioning in our system using available coefficients assuming $fO_2$ , rather than P, T or x, is the
407	most important variable controlling V behavior. We modeled partitioning of V between rutile
408	and slab melts using $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ for our LCOTi system at one atm pressure and 1300 °C—conditions
409	that are plainly outside the realm of possibility for natural eclogite melting scenarios. However,
410	$D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ may increase significantly at higher <i>P</i> and lower $T(D_V^{\text{rt/melt}} \ge 40 \text{ and can exceed } 100; \text{ see})$
411	discussion in Section 4.2.5), thus our partition coefficients are realistically minimums for
412	modeling V incorporation in rutile during slab melting. We used $D_{V}^{cpx/melt}$ from Mallmann and
413	O'Neill (2009) measured at 1300 °C and 1 atm pressure. Comparison of the studies by Mallmann
414	and O'Neill (2007) and Mallmann and O'Neill (2009) indicate $D_V^{\text{cpx/melt}}$ at 1300 °C and 1 atm
415	overlaps with $D_V^{\text{grt/melt}}$ at 3 GPa and 1400-1450 °C at the same $fO_2$ , and we make the simplifying
416	assumption that $D_V^{\text{grt/melt}} = D_V^{\text{cpx/melt}}$ in our model. The experiments of Mallmann and O'Neill
417	2007 and 2009 both used mafic melt compositions, but again, it is currently unknown how V
418	partitions between clinopyroxene, garnet and more evolved melt compositions under varying
419	$fO_2$ .

420	We calculated partitioning of Ti between rutile, clinopyroxene, garnet and melt using the
421	data of Klemme et al. (2002) and Xiong et al. (2009). Partitioning of Ti is constant over changing
422	$fO_2$ . We stress that, although the partition coefficients we input in our model have been measured
423	at temperatures that are significantly hotter than the conditions of eclogite melting on the slab
424	geotherm (solidus at 700-800 °C, e.g., Sisson and Kelemen 2018), we expect the compatibility of
425	V in all eclogitic minerals to increase down-temperature due to the increased free energy of
426	fusion at lower $T$ (Blundy and Wood 2003). Rutile saturation is dependent on temperature;
427	evolved melts at lower temperatures contain less TiO <sub>2</sub> because it precipitates out as rutile (e.g.,
428	Klimm et al. 2008; Ryerson and Watson 1987; Xiong et al. 2005). Thus, the compatibilities of V
429	and Ti in eclogite melts may extrapolate down-temperature in a similar way. Even though the
430	conditions of our model are offset from the conditions of slab melting in nature, our data provide
431	first-order results and context for future experiments conducted at high P, lower T and controlled
432	$fO_2$ . More information about our model can be found in the Supplementary Material.
433	Figure 8 shows the V content (8a) and Ti/V ratios (8b) of eclogite slab melts at 5% batch
434	melting as a function of $fO_2$ and mineral assemblage. The three modeled eclogite mineral
435	assemblages contain equal amounts of garnet and clinopyroxene and are either rutile-free or
436	contain 1 or 2% rutile. Rutile is an accessory mineral and its modal percentage in exhumed slabs
437	globally may be closer to 1% (e.g., Hills and Haggerty 1989). However, many subduction-related
438	UHP terranes contain up to 2-4 vol% rutile (e.g., Liou et al., 1998; Kylander-Clark et al. 2008)
439	and eclogites often contain relict rutile that has broken down to ilmenite, titanite or other phases
440	during alteration or exhumation (e.g., Meinhold 2010; Xiao et al., 1998; Zack et al. 2002; Zack
441	and Kooijman 2017 and references therein), which indicates the original proportion of rutile in
442	the rock was possibly greater at the time of prograde eclogite facies metamorphism.

443	The average concentrations of both Ti and V individually, as well as Ti/V ratios, are
444	lower in arcs than in MORB, but the relative decrease in Ti ( $\sim$ 50%) is much greater than the
445	decrease in V (~10%) between MORB and arcs (e.g., compare arc magmas reported in Turner
446	and Langmuir 2015 with MORB from Gale et al. 2013 for compositions with the same MgO).
447	Figure 8a shows the addition of 1-2% rutile to the slab residue can deplete V in slab melts by up
448	to 20% at $fO_2s$ where V is most compatible in rutile. This modest effect is likely to be more
449	pronounced at higher pressures and lower temperatures, where previous experimental data
450	suggest $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$ can reach over 100 (Section 2.5.2). Titanium is incompatible in clinopyroxene
451	and garnet-subsequent additions of 1% rutile to our model assemblage decreases the Ti content
452	of the complementary melt from ~3 wt% to 0.78 wt% to 0.44 wt% (Supplementary Material).
453	At a specified mineral assemblage and melt fraction, the Ti content of the slab melt is
454	constant while the V content changes as a function of $fO_2$ . Increasing quantities of rutile in the
455	slab residue drives an offset in the Ti/V of melts of each assemblage, but the slope of the line is
456	driven by the decreasing compatibility of V in the mineral residue as <i>f</i> O <sub>2</sub> increases. If slab melts
457	do in fact contribute a Ti/V component to the overlying arc that is less than MORB, this
458	component may only be produced by melting of refractory slab residues containing >1 wt%
459	rutile at $fO_2 \ge QFM$ . In all other modeled scenarios, the slab melt would contribute a component
460	with much greater Ti/V than MORB, which would require a considerable decrease of Ti/V
461	through another process at convergent margins.
462	Rutile influences the concentration of both Ti and V in eclogite melts and the presence of
463	rutile in slab residues may in part explain the lower ratio of Ti/V in arc rocks observed by

464 Shervais (1982). The high solubility of V in rutile may also impact trace element ratios like V/Sc
465 (Aulbach and Stagno 2016; Lee et al. 2005; Stolper and Bucholz 2019) and V/Yb (Laubier et al.

466	2014) that have been used as proxies for $fO_2$ in subduction zone settings, particularly if the arc
467	crust is thick enough to stabilize rutile-bearing "arclogites" at its base (e.g., Ducea et al. 2015;
468	Lee et al. 2006; Rodriguez-Vargas et al. 2005; Tang et al. 2019).

Our experiments indicate rutile is a considerable sink for vanadium in the solid Earth. 469 470 Vanadium is most soluble in rutile at fO<sub>2</sub>s at or below QFM and in high-SiO<sub>2</sub> systems, but we emphasize that the partitioning of V between rutile and melt is greater than unity at all fO<sub>2</sub>s 471 investigated. This suggests rutile will contribute to the retention of V in refractory residues 472 473 during eclogite melting under all but the most oxidizing conditions, where it becomes neutral. The strong compatibility of V in rutile and the dynamic variation of  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$  as function of  $fO_2$ 474 suggests a rutile-based V-oxybarometer may be robust to even small changes in system redox 475 476 state.

In agreement with previous work, we find that  $D_{Ta}^{rt/melt} > D_{Nb}^{rt/melt}$  under all conditions investigated (Bromiley and Redfern 2008; Foley et al. 2000; Green 2000; Green and Pearson 1987; Horng and Hess 2000; Jenner et al. 1993; John et al. 2011; Klemme et al. 2005; Mallmann et al., 2014; Schmidt 2004; Wendlandt 1990; Xiong et al. 2005; Xiong et al. 2011). Current evidence indicates that rutile fractionation does not lead to low Nb/Ta ratios in Earth's continental crust, as was recently suggested by Tang et al. (2019). However, confirmation under the colder, high-pressure, conditions relevant to arcs awaits further experimental investigation.

- 484 Acknowledgements
- 485 We thank T. Gooding for his assistance with sample preparation and lab maintenance, R.
- 486 Wardell for help on the Raman and T. Rose for his oversight of the analytical laboratories.
- 487 Conversations with M. Ackerson helped shape our discussion of TiO<sub>2</sub>. We are grateful for

- 488 editorial handling by K. Kiseeva and thorough reviews by P. Sossi, R. Arató and anonymous
- reviewer, which improved the quality of this manuscript. This study was made possible by a
- 490 Smithsonian Peter Buck Fellowship to M.H. and a gift from the Lyda Hill Foundation to E.C.

## 491 **References**

- Albarede, F., and Bottinga, Y. (1972) Kinetic disequilibrium in trace element partitioning
  between phenocrysts and host lava. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 36, 141-156.
- 494 Anderson, A.T., Boyd, F.R., Bunch, T.E., Cameron, E.N., El Goresy, A., Finger, L.W.,
- Haggerty, S.E., James, O.B., Keil, K., Prinz, M., and Ramdohr, P. (1970) Armalcolite: a new
   mineral from the Apollo 11 samples. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta Supplement, 1, 55.
- Arató, R., and Audétat, A. (2017) Experimental calibration of a new oxybarometer for silicic
   magmas based on vanadium partitioning between magnetite and silicate melt. Geochimica et
- 499 Cosmochimica Acta, 209, 284-295.
- Arndt, N., Lehnert, K., and Vasilev, Y. (1995) Meimechites—highly magnesian lithosphere
  contaminated alkalkine magmas from deep subcontinental mantle. Lithos, 34, 41-59.
- Aulbach, S., and Stagno, V. (2016) Evidence for a reducing Archean ambient mantle and its
  effects on the carbon cycle. Geology, 44, 751-754.
- Bak, T, Bogdanoff, P., Fiechter, S., and Nowotny, J. (2012) Defect engineering of titanium
  dioxide: full defect disorder. Advanced Applied Ceramics, 111, 62-71.
- 506 Barth, M.G., Rudnick, R.L., Horn, I., McDonough, W.F., Spicuzza, M.J., Valley, J.W., and
- 507 Haggerty, S.E. (2001) Geochemistry of xenolithic eclogites from West Africa, Part I: A link
- between low MgO eclogites and Archean crust formation. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta,65, 1499-1527.
- 510 Borisov, A.A. (2012) The  $Ti^{4+}/Ti^{3+}$  ratio of magmatic melts: application to the problem of the 511 reduction of lunar basalts. Petrology, 20, 391-398.
- 512 Borisov, A.A. (2013) Mutual interaction of redox pairs in silicate melts:  $V^{5+}/V^{4+}/V^{3+}/V^{2+}$  tetrad 513 and other equilibria. Petrology, 21, 305-315.
- Bromiley, G.D., and Redfern, S.A.T. (2007) The role of TiO<sub>2</sub> phases during melting of
- subduction-modified crust: implications for deep mantle melting. Earth and Planetary Science
   Letters, 267, 301-308.
- 517 Canil, D. (1997) Vanadium partitioning and the oxidation state of Archean komatiite magmas.
- 518 Nature, 389, 842-845. Canil, D. (2002) Vanadium in peridotites, mantle redox and tectonic
- environments: Archean to present. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 195, 75-90.
- 520 Canil, D., and Fedortchouk, Y. (2000) Clinopyroxene-liquid partitioning for vanadium and the
- 521 oxygen fugacity during formation of cratonic and oceanic lithosphere. Journal of Geophysical
- 522 Research: Solid Earth, 105, B11, 26003-26016.

- 523 Canil, D., and Fedortchouk, Y. (2001) Olivine-liquid partitioning of vanadium and other trace
- elements, with applications to modern and ancient picrites. The Canadian Mineralogist, 39, 319-330.
- 526 Cherniak, D.J., and Watson, E.B. (2019) Al and Si diffusion in rutile. American Mineralogist, in527 press.
- 528 Cooper, L.B., Ruscitto, D.M., Plank, T., Wallace, P.J., Syracuse, E.M., and Manning, C.E.
- 529 (2012) Global variations in H2O/Ce: I. Slab surface temperatures beneath volcanic arcs.
- 530 Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems, 13, 1-27.
- Cottrell, E., and Kelley, K.A. (2011) The oxidation state of Fe in MORB glasses and the oxygen
  fugacity of the upper mantle. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 305, 270-282.
- 533 Dasgupta, R., Jackson, M.G., and Lee, C.T.A. (2010) Major element chemistry of ocean island
- basalts—conditions of mantle melting and heterogeneity of mantle source. Earth and Planetary
- 535 Science Letters, 289, 377-392.
- 536 Dickenson, M.P., and Hess, P.C. (1986) The structural role and homogeneous redox equilibria of 537 iron in peraluminous, metaluminous and peralkaline silicate melts. Contributions to Mineralogy
- 538 and Petrology, 92, 207-217.
- Dingwell, D.B. (1992) Density of some titanium-bearing silicate liquids and the compositional
  dependence of the partial molar volume of TiO2. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 56, 34033407.
- 542 Dohmen, R., Marschall, H.R., Ludwig, T., and Polednia, J. (2018) Diffusion of Zr, Hf, Nb and
- Ta in rutile: effects of temperature, oxygen fugacity, and doping level, and relation to rutile point defect chemistry. Physics and Chemistry of Minerals, 1-22.
- 545 Donaldson, C.H. (1979) Composition changes in a basalt melt contained in a wire loop of
- Pt80Rh20: effects of temperature, time and oxygen fugacity. Mineralogical Magazine 43, 115119.
- 548 Downs, R.T. (2006) The RRUFF Project: an integrated study of the chemistry, crystallography,
- Raman and infrared spectroscopy of minerals. Program and Abstracts of the 19<sup>th</sup> General
- 550 Meeting of the International Mineralogical Association; Kobe, Japan.
- Ducea, M.N., Saleeby, J.B., and Bergantz, G. (2015) The architecture, chemistry and evolution
  of continental magmatic arcs. Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences, 43, 299-331.
- 553 Dygert, N., Liang, Y., and Hess, P. (2013) The importance of melt TiO<sub>2</sub> in affecting major and
- trace element partitioning between Fe-Ti oxides and lunar picritic glass melts. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 106, 134-151.
- Elliott, T. (2003) Tracers of the slab. AGU Geophysical Monograph 138, 23-45.
- 557 Farges, F., Brown, G.E., and Rehr, J.J. (1996) Coordination chemistry of Ti (IV) in silicate
- glasses and melts: I. XAFS study of titanium coordination in oxide model compounds.
- 559 Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 60, 3023-3038.

- 560 Farges, F., and Brown, G.E. (1997) Coordination chemistry of titanium (IV) in silicate glasses
- and melts: IV. XANES studies of synthetic and natural volcanic glasses and tektites at ambient
- temperature and pressure. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 61, 1863-1870.
- Frost, D.J., and McCammon, C.A. (2008) The redox state of the Earth's mantle. Annual Reviews in Earth and Planetary Science, 36, 389-420.
- 565 Foley, S.F., Barth, M.G., and Jenner, G.A. (2000) Rutile/melt partition coefficients for trace
- elements and an assessment of the influence of rutile on the trace element characteristics of
- subduction zone magmas. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 64, 933-938.
- 568 Gaetani, G.A., Asimow, P.D., and Stolper, E.M. (2008) A model for rutile saturation in silicate
- 569 melts with applications to eclogite partial melting in subduction zones and mantle plumes. Earth
- and Planetary Science Letters, 272, 720-729.
- Gale, A., Dalton, C.A., Langmuir, C.H., Su, Y., and Schilling, J. (2013) The mean composition
  of ocean ridge basalts. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 14, 489-518.
- 573 Gill, J. B. (1981) Orogenic Andesites and Plate Tectonics. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- Greegor, R.B., Lytle, W.B., Sandstrom, D.R., Wong, J., and Schultz, P. (1983) Investigation of
- TiO<sub>2</sub>-SiO<sub>2</sub> glasses by X-ray absorption spectroscopy. Journal of Non-Crystalline Solids, 55, 2743.
- 577 Green, T.H. (2000) New partition coefficient determinations pertinent to hydrous melting
- processes in subduction zones. In State of the Arc 2000: Processes and Timescales (eds. J.P.
- 579 Davidson, J.A. Davidson and R.C. Price). Carolyn Bain Publishing House, Wellington, pp.92-95.
- Green, T.H., and Pearson, N.J. (1986) Ti-rich accessory phase saturation in hydrous mafic-felsic
  compositions at high P, T. Chemical Geology, 54, 185-201.
- 582 Green, T.H., and Pearson, N.J. (1987) An experimental study of Nb and Ta partitioning between
- Ti-rich minerals and silicate liquids at high temperature and pressure. Geochimica etCosmochimica Acta, 51, 55-62.
- Grove, T.L. (1982) Use of FePt alloys to eliminate the iron loss problem in 1 atmosphere gas
  mixing experiments: Theoretical and practical considerations. Contributions to Mineralogy and
  Petrology, 78, 298-304.
- Guignard, M., Cormier, L., Montouillout, V., Menguy, N., and Massiot, D. (2010) Structural
  fluctuations and role of Ti as nucleating agent in an aluminosilicate glass. Journal of NonCrystalline Solids, 356, 1368-1373.
- 591 Guo, S., Tang, P., Su, B., Chen, B., Ye, K., Zhang, L., Gao, Y., Liu, J., and Yang, Y. (2017)
- 592 Unusual replacement of Fe-Ti oxides by rutile during retrogression in amphibolite-hosted veins
- 593 (Dabie UHP terrane): A mineralogical record of fluid-induced oxidation processes in exhumed
- 594 UHP slabs. American Mineralogist, 102, 2268-2283.
- Hermann, J. (2002) Allanite: thorium and light rare earth element carrier in subducted crust.
- 596 Chemical Geology, 192, 289-306.

- Hermann, J., and Rubatto, D. (2009) Accessory phase control on the trace element signature of
   sediment melts in subduction zones. Chemical Geology, 265, 512-526.
- Hills, D.V., and Haggerty, S.E. (1989) Petrochemistry of eclogites from the Koidu kimberlite
   complex, Sierra Leone. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 1989, 397-422.
- Hoff, C.M. (2019) Defect thermometry using rutile and feldspar. Ph.D. thesis, Rensselaer
  Polytechnic Institute.
- Holycross, M.E., and Watson, E.B. (2016) Diffusive fractionation of trace elements in basaltic
   melts. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 171, 80-95.
- Holycross, M.E., and Watson, E.B. (2018) Trace element diffusion and kinetic fractionation in
  wet rhyolitic melt. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 232, 14-29.
- Horng, W.S., and Hess, P.C. (2000) Partition coefficients of Nb and Ta between rutile and
  anhydrous haplogranite melts. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 138, 176-185.
- Jenner, G.A., Foley, S.F., Jackson, S.E., Green, T.H., Fryer, B.J., and Longerich, H.P. (1993)
- 610 Determination of partition coefficients for trace elements in high pressure-temperature
- 611 experimental run products by laser ablation microprobe-inductively coupled plasma-mass
- spectrometry (LAM-ICP-MS). Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 58, 5099-5103.
- John, T., Klemd, R., Klemme, S., Pfander, J.A., Hoffmann, J.E., and Gao, J. (2011) Nb-Ta
- fractionation by partial melting at the titanite-rutile transition. Contributions to Mineralogy and
- 615 Petrology, 161, 35-45.
- Kelemen, P.B., Hanghoj, K., and Greene, A.R. (2003) One view of the geochemistry of
- subduction-related magmatic arcs, with an emphasis on primitive andesite and lower crust.
- Treatise on Geochemistry, 3, 659.
- Klemme, S., Blundy, J.D., and Wood, B.J. (2002) Experimental constraints on major and trace
  element partitioning during partial melting of eclogite. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 66,
  3109-3123.
- Klemme, S., Prowatke, S., Hametner, K., and Günther, D. (2005) Partitioning of trace elements
- 623 between rutile and silicate melts: implications for subduction zones. Geochimica et
- 624 Cosmochimia Acta, 69, 2361-2371.
- Kofstad, P. (1972) Nonstoichiometry, diffusion and electrical conductivity in binary metaloxides. Wiley, New York.
- Kylander-Clark, A.R.C., Hacker, B.R., and Mattinson, J.M. (2008) Slow exhumation of UHP
  terranes: titanite and rutile ages of the Western Gneiss Region, Norway. Earth and Planetary
  Science Letters, 272, 531-540.
- 630 Laubier, M., Grove, T.L., and Langmuir C.H. (2014) Trace element mineral/melt partitioning for
- basaltic and basaltic andesitic melts: An experimental and laser ICP-MS study with application
- to the oxidation state of mantle source regions. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 392, 265-
- 633 278.

- Lanzirotti, A., Dyar, M.D., Sutton, S., Newville, M., Head, E., Carey, C.J., McCanta, M., Lee, L.
- King, P.L., and Jones, J. (2018) Accurate predictions of microscale oxygen barometry in basaltic
- 636 glasses using V K-edge X-ray absorption spectroscopy: A multivariate approach. American
- 637 Mineralogist, 103, 1282-1297
- 638 Lee, C.T.A., Leeman, W.P., Canil, D., and Li, Z.X.A. (2005) Similar V/Sc systematics in MORB
- and arc basalts: implications for the oxygen fugacities of their mantle source regions. Journal of
   Petrology, 46, 2313-2336.
- Lee, C.T., Cheng, X., and Horodyskyj, U. (2006) The development and refinement of continental
- arcs by primary basaltic magmatism, garnet pyroxenite accumulation, basaltic recharge and
  delamination: insights from the Sierra Nevada, California. Contributions to Mineralogy and
- 644 Petrology, 151, 222-242.
- Leitzke, F.P., Fonesca, R.O.C., Michely, L.T., Sprung, P., Munker, C., Heuser, A., and
- 646 Blanchard, H. (2016) The effect of titanium on the partitioning behavior of high-field strength 647 elements between silicates, oxides and lunar basaltic melts with applications to the origin of 648 mars baselts. Chemical Cooless, 440, 210, 229
- mare basalts. Chemical Geology, 440, 219-238.
- Lietzke, F.P., Fonesca, R.O.C., Göttlicher, J., Steininger, R., Jahn, S., Prescher, C., and Lagos,
- 650 M. (2018) Ti K-edge XANES study on the coordination number and oxidation state of titanium
- 651 in pyroxene, olivine, armacolite, ilmenite and silicate glass during mare basalt petrogenesis.
- 652 Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 173, 103.
- Liou, J.G., Zhang, R., Ersnt, W.G., Liu, J., and McLimans, R. (1998) Mineral paragenesis in the
  Pianpalaudo eclogitic body, Gruppo di Voltri, western Ligurian Alps. Schweizerische
- 655 Mineralogische und Petrographische Mitteilungen, 78, 317-335.
- Liu, L., Xiao, Y., Aulbach, S., Li, D., and Hou, Z. (2014) Vanadium and niobium behavior in
  rutile as a function of oxygen fugacity: evidence from natural samples. Contributions to
  Mineralogy and Petrology, 167, 1026.
- 659 Luvizotto, G.L., Zack, T., Meyer, H.P., Ludwig, T., Treibold, S., Kronz, A., Munker, C., Stockli,
- D.F., Prowatke, S., Klemme, S., Jacob, D.E., and von Eynatten, H. (2009) Rutile crystals as
- potential trace element and isotope mineral standard for microanalysis. Chemical Geology, 261,346-369.
- Mallmann, G., and O'Neill, H.S.C. (2007) The effect of oxygen fugacity on the partitioning of
- Re between crystals and silicate melt during mantle melting. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta,
   71, 2837-2857.
- Mallmann, G., and O'Neill, H.S.C. (2009) The crystal/melt partitioning of V during mantle
- 667 melting as a function of oxygen fugacity compared with some other elements (Al, P, Ca, Sc, Ti, 668 Ca Ea Ca V. Za and Nb). Journal of Patralaure 50, 1765, 1704
- 668 Cr, Fe, Ga, Y, Zr and Nb). Journal of Petrology, 50, 1765-1794.
- Mallmann, G., Fonesca, R.O.C., and Silva, A.B. (2014) An experimental study of the
- partitioning of rutile and silicate melt as a function of oxygen fugacity. Anais da Academia
  Brasileira de Ciências, 86, 1609-1629.

- Marschall, H.R., Dohmen, R., and Ludwig, T. (2013) Diffusion-induced fractionation of niobium
- from tantalum during continental crust formation. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 375, 361 371.
- McCallum, I.S., and Charette, M.P (1978) Zr and Nb partition coefficients: implications for the
- genesis of mare basalts, KREEP and sea floor basalts. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 42,859-869.
- Meinhold, G. (2010) Rutile and its applications in earth sciences. Earth-Science Reviews, 102, 1-28.
- Mysen, B.O. (1983) The structure of silicate melts. Annual Review of Earth and Planetary
   Sciences, 11, 7597.
- Nowotny, M.K., Sheppard, L.R., Bak, T., and Nowotny, J. (2008) Defect chemistry of titanium
- dioxide. Application of defect engineering in processing TiO2-based photocatalysts. Journal of
   Physical Chemistry C, 112, 5275-5300.
- 685 O'Neill, H.S.C. (1987) Quartz-fayalite-iron and quartz-fayalite-magnetite equilibria and the free
- energy of formation of fayalite (Fe2SiO4) and magnetite (Fe3O4). American Mineralogist 72,
   67-75
- 688 O'Neill, H.S.C., Berry, A.J., and Mallmann, G. (2018) The oxidation state of iron in Mid-Ocean
- Ridge Basaltic (MORB) glasses: implications for their petrogenesis and oxygen fugacities. Earth
   and Planetary Science Letters, 504, 152-162.
- Papike, J.J., Simon, S.B., Burger, P.V., Bell, A.S., Shearer, C.K., and Karner, J.M. (2016)
- 692 Chromium, vanadium, and titanium valence systematics in Solar System pyroxene as a recorder
- of oxygen fugacity, planetary provenance, and processes. American Mineralogist, 101, 907-918.
- Paton, C., Hellstrom, J., Paul, B., Woodhead, J., and Hergt, J. (2011) Iolite: Freeware for the
  visualization and processing of mass spectrometric data. Journal of Analytical Atomic
  Spectrometry, 26, 2508-2518.
- 697 Pearce, N.J., Perkins, W.T., Westgate, J.A., Gorton, M.P., Jackson, S.E., Neal, C.R., and
- 698 Chenery, S.P. (1997) A compilation of new and major published major and trace element trace
- element data for NIST SRM 610 and NIST SRM 612 glass reference materials. Geostandards
- 700 Newsletter, 21, 115-144.
- Plank, T., Cooper, L.B., and Manning, C.E. (2009) Emerging geothermometers for estimating
  slab surface temperatures. Nature Geoscience, 2, 611-615.
- Rapp, R.P. and Watson, E. B. (1995) Dehydration melting of metabasalt at 8-32 kbar:
- implications for continental growth and crust-mantle recycling. Journal of Petrology 36, 891-931.
- Righter, K., Sutton, S., Danielson, L., Pando, K., Schmidt, G., Yang, H., Berthet, S., Newville,
- M., Choi, Y., Downs, R.T., and Malavergne, V. (2011) The effect of fO2 on the partitioning and
- valence of V and Cr in garnet/melt pairs and the relation to terrestrial mantle V and Cr content.
- American Mineralogist, 96, 1278-1290.

- 710 Rodriguez-Vargas, A., Koester, E., Mallmann, G., Conceição, R.V., Kawashita, K., and Weber
- 711 M.B.I. (2005) Mantle diversity beneath the Colombian Andes, Northern Volcanic Zone:
- 712 Constraints from Sr and Nd isotopes. Lithos, 82, 471-484.
- Romano, C., Paris, E., Poe, B.T., Giuli, G., Dingwell, D.B., and Mottana, A. (2000) Effect of
- aluminum of Ti-coordination in silicate glasses: A XANES study. American Mineralogist, 85,
   108-117.
- Rudnick, R.L., Barth, M., Horn, I., and McDonough, W.F. (2000) Rutile-bearing refractory
- eclogites: missing link between continents and the depleted mantle. Science, 287, 278-281.
- Ryerson, P.J., and Hess, P.C. (1978) Implications of liquid-liquid distribution coefficients to
   mineral-liquid partitioning. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 42, 921-932.
- Ryerson, F.J., and Watson, E.B. (1987) Rutile saturation in magmas: implications for Ti-Nb-Ta
  depletion in island-arc basalts. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 86, 225-239.
- Schmidt, M.W., Dardon, A., Chazot, G., and Vannucci, R. (2004) The dependence of Nb and Ta
- rutile-melt partitioning on melt composition and Nb/Ta fractionation during subduction
- processes. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 226, 415-432.
- Shannon, R.D. (1976) Revised effective ionic radii and systematic studies of interatomic
   distances in halides and chalcogenides. Acta Crystallography, 32, 751-766.
- Shervais, J.W. (1982) Ti-V plots and the petrogenesis of modern and ophiolitic lavas. Earth and
  Planetary Science Letters, 59, 101-118.
- 729 Shishkina, T.A., Portnyagin, M.V., Botcharnikov, R.E., Almeev, R.R., Simonyan, A.V., Garbe-
- 730 Shönberg, D., Schuth, S., Oeser, M. and Holtz, F. (2018) Experimenal calibration and
- 731 implications of olivine-melt vanadium oxybarometry for hydrous basaltic arc magmas. American
- 732 Mineralogist, 103, 369-383.
- Sisson, T.W., and Kelemen, P.B. (2018) Near-solidus melts of MORB + 4 wt% H2O at 0.8-2.8
- GPa applied to issues of subduction magmatism and continent formation. Contributions to
- Mineralogy and Petrology, 173, 70-93.
- Snetsinger, K.G., Bunch, T.E. and Keil, K. (1968) Electron microprobe analysis of vanadium in
  the presence of titanium. American Mineralogist 53, 1770-1773.
- Sossi, P.A., and O'Neill, H.S.C. (2016) Liquidus temperatures of komatiites and the effect of
- cooling rate on element partitioning between olivine and komatiitic melt. Contributions toMineralogy and Petrology, 171, 49-74.
- 741 Sossi, P.A., Prytulak, J., and O'Neill, H.S.C. Experimental calibration of vanadium partitioning
- and stable isotope fractionation between hydrous granitic melt and magnetite at 800 C and 0.5
- GPa. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 173, 27-45.
- 544 Stolper, D.A., and Bucholz, C.E. (2019) Neoproterozoic to early Phanerozoic rise in island arc
- redox state due to deep ocean oxygenation and increased marine sulfate levels. Proceedings of
- the National Academy of Sciences, 116, 8746-8755.

- 747 Sutton, S.R., Karner, J., Papike, J., Delaney, J.S., Shearer, C., Newville, M., Eng, P., Rivers, M.,
- and Dyar, M.D. (2005) Vanadium K edge XANES of synthetic and natural basaltic glasses and
- application to microscale oxygen barometry. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 69, 2333-2348.
- Syracuse, E.M., van Keken, P.E. and Abers, G.A. (2010) The global range of subduction zone
  thermal models. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 183, 73-90.
- 752 Tang, M., Lee, C.T.A., Chen, K., Erdman, M., Costin, G., and Jiang, H. (2019) Nb/Ta
- rang, M., Lee, C.T.A., Chen, K., Erdman, M., Costin, O., and Jiang, H. (2019) No/ Ta
   systematics in arc magma differentiation and the role of arclogites in continent formation. Nature
- 754 Communications, 10, 235.
- 755 Toplis, M.J. and Corgne, A. (2002) An experimental study of element partitioning between
- magnetite, clinopyroxene and iron-bearing silicate liquids with a particular emphasis onvanadium. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 144, 22-37.
- 758 Trail, D., Tailby, N., Wang, Y., Harrison, T.M., and Boehnke, P. (2017) Aluminum in zircon as
- evidence for peraluminous and metaluminous melts from the Hadean to present. Geochmistry,Geophysics, Geosystems, 18, 1580-1593.
- Turner, S.J., and Langmuir, C.H. (2015) What processes control the chemical compositions of
   arc front stratovolcanoes? Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 16, 1865-1893.
- van Keken, P.E., Kiefer, P.B., and Peacock, S.M. (2002) High-resolution models of subduction
   zones: implications for mineral dehydration reactions and transport of water into the deep
- mantle. Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems, 3, 1056.
- Walker, D., Juerwicz, S., and Watson, E.B. (1988) Adcumulus dunite growth in a laboratory
   thermal-gradient. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 99, 306-319.
- Wang, J., Xiong, X., Takahashi, E., Zhang, L., Li, L., and Liu, X. (2019) Oxidation state of the
  arc mantle revealed by partitioning of V, Sc, and Ti between mantle minerals and basaltic
  minerals. Journal of Geophysical Research, in press.
- Watson, E.B. (1976) Two-liquid partition coefficients: experimental data and geochemical
  implications. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 56, 119-134.
- Watson, E.B., and Müller, T. (2009) Non-equilibrium isotopic and elemental fractionation during
  diffusion-controlled crystal growth under static and dynamic conditions. Chemical Geology, 267,
  111-124.
- Wendlandt, R.F. (1990) Partitioning of niobium and tantalum between rutile and silicate melt.
  EOS AGU Fall Meeting 71, 1658.
- Wood, B.J., and Blundy, J.D. (2002) The effect of H2O on crystal-melt partitioning of trace
  elements. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta,66, 3647-3656.
- Xiao, Y., Sun, W., Hoefs, J., Simon, K., Zhang, Z., Li, S., and Hofmann, A.W. (2006) Making
- continental crust through slab melting: constraints from niobium-tantalum fractionation in UHP
- metamorphic rutile. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 70, 4770-4782.

- Xiong, X.L., Adam, J., and Green, T.H. (2005) Rutile stability and rutile/melt HFSE partitioning
- Along, X.L., Adam, J., and Oreen, T.H. (2003) Ruthe stability and ruthe/metriff/SE partitioning
   during partial melting of hydrous basalt: implications for TTG genesis. Chemical Geology, 218,
   339-359.
- Xiong, X., Keppler, H., Audetat, A., Gudfinnsson, G., Sun, W., Song, M., Xiao, W., and Yuan,
- 787 L. (2009) Experimental constraints on rutile saturation during partial melting of metabasalt at the
- amphibolite to eclogite transition, with application to TTG genesis. American Mineralogist, 94,1175-1186.
- Xiong, X., Keppler, H., Audetat, A., Ni, H., Sun, W., and Li, W. (2011) Partitioning of Nb and
- 791 Ta between rutile and felsic melt and the fractionation of Nb/Ta during partial melting of
- hydrous metabasalt. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 75, 1673-1692.
- Zack, T., Kronz, A., Foley, S.F. and Rivers, T. (2002) Trace element abundances in rutiles from
  eclogites and associated garnet mica schists. Chemical Geology, 184, 97-122.
- Zack, T., and Kooijman, E. (2017) Petrology and geochronology of rutile. Reviews in
  Mineralogy and Geochemistry, 83, 443-467.
- 797 Zhang, H.L., Cottrell, E., Solheid, P.A., Kelley, K.A., and Hirschmann, M.M. (2018)
- 798 Determination of  $Fe^{3+}/\Sigma Fe$  of XANES basaltic glass standards by Mössbauer spectroscopy and
- its application to the oxidation state of iron in MORB. Chemical Geology, 479, 166-175.
- Xirouchakis, D., Hirschmann, M.M., and Simpson, J.A. (2001) The effect of titanium on the
- silica content and on mineral-liquid partitioning of mantle-equilibrated melts. Geochimica et
- 802 Cosmochimica Acta, 65, 2201-2217.

## 804 **Figure Captions**

- **Figure 1** Average vanadium valence as a function of oxygen fugacity in silicate glass standards
- 806 measured via X-ray absorption near edge structure (XANES) spectroscopy. Vanadium data is
- temperature corrected as measured by Sutton et al. (2005). Transition from  $V^{4+}$  to higher
- 808 oxidation states occurs at ~QFM-2. The position of "air" is calculated at 1300 °C.
- **Figure 2** Optical microscope view of rutile grains and glass in thin sections made from
- experiments at *f*O<sub>2</sub>=QFM and 1300 °C. a) MORBTi composition b) DacTi composition and c)
- 811 LCOTi composition. Grains become more acicular as melt polymerization increases.
- **Figure 3** Rutile saturation in silicate melts at 1 atm pressure is strongly correlated with melt
- polymerization and temperature. The studies of Mallmann et al. (2014) and Klemme et al. (2005)
- 814 were conducted at temperatures comparable to this study (T=1250-1300 °C). The rutile
- saturation experiments of Gaetani et al. 2008 (dark gray squares) extended to 1450 °C. We
- parameterized the relationship between rutile solubility and melt composition to minimize the
- 817 amount of  $TiO_2$  in our melts at rutile saturation.
- **Figure 4** Rutile/melt partitioning of V at 1300 °C and one atm as a function of oxygen fugacity.
- Values of  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$  change with melt polymerization, parameterized as NBO/T (Mysen 1983).
- Unseen error bars are smaller than the size of data points. Curves are fit to the data using
- equation 5.
- **Figure 5** Comparison of this study to literature data examining rutile/melt partitioning of V at
- one atm pressure and T=1250-1300 °C. In contrast to Mallmann et al. (2014) and Klemme et al.
- 824 (2005), we do not find any conditions where V becomes incompatible in rutile. Error bars
- smaller than the size of data points when unseen. Curves are fit to the data using equation 5.
- **Figure 6** Partitioning of V between rutile and melt at constant  $fO_2$  is dependent on melt
- composition. The relationship between  $D_V^{\text{rt/melt}}$  and composition may be expressed as a function
- of (a) melt polymerization or (b) melt TiO<sub>2</sub> content. Curves define an exponential relationship.
- 829 See discussion in text for more detail.
- **Figure 7** Spider diagram showing trace element partitioning between rutile and melt for three
- experiments (DacTi and MORBTi at QFM-1 and MORBTi at QFM-2). Elements are arranged in
- order of compatibility (Hofmann 1988). Increasing melt polymerization increases  $D^{\text{rt/melt}}$  for all
- cations investigated here—note that decreasing  $fO_2$  increases melt polymerization slightly in the
- 834 MORBTi experiments due to increased volatilization of Na (e.g., Donaldson 1979). Experiments
- conducted at higher oxygen fugacities grew rutile that were insufficient in size for LA-ICP-MS.
- 836 Error bars smaller than data points where unseen.
- **Figure 8** The addition of rutile to refractory eclogite residues reduces the amount of Ti and V
- transferred from the slab to the overlying arc in subduction zones. **a**) Vanadium content of slab
- melts at F=5% (i.e., 5% partial melting) as a function of mineral assemblage and  $fO_2$ . Melts from
- eclogites containing only garnet and clinopyroxene will contain more V than melts from rutile-
- bearing residues. The retention of V in the mineral residue is greatest at the *f*O<sub>2</sub>s (<QFM) where

- 842 V is the most compatible in rutile. **b)** The Ti/V ratios of eclogite slab melts change as a function
- of oxygen fugacity and mineral assemblage. Ti partitioning is constant over the modeled  $fO_2$
- range. Slab melting will not contribute a Ti/V component to the overlying arc that is less than the
- Ti/V of MORB unless the refractory slab assemblage contains >1 wt% rutile and slab melting
- 846 occurs at  $fO2s \ge QFM$ . See text for more detail.

oxide (wt%)	MORBTi	DacTi	LCOTi
SiO <sub>2</sub>	36.27	55.52	68.82
TiO <sub>2</sub>	31.24	16.59	10.72
$Al_2O_3$	8.99	12.62	11.25
FeO	6.45	3.38	0.67
MgO	6.18	1.68	0.06
CaO	7.86	4.21	0.43
Na <sub>2</sub> O	2.14	3.36	3.63
K <sub>2</sub> O	0.15	2.10	3.94
$V_2O_3$	0.40	0.38	0.36
TE (all)	0.12	0.16	0.13
NBO/T	0.71	0.21	0.03

Table 1 Compositions of experimental starting materials

**Table 2** Experiment conditions and measured rutile/melt partition coefficients for vanadium. All experiments were conducted at 1300 °C and 1 atm pressure.

composition	$fO_2$ ( $\Delta QFM$ )	time (hr)	run products	NBO/T melt	TiO <sub>2</sub> melt	$D_{ m V}^{ m rt/melt}$	σ
MORBTi	-2	136.5	rutile, melt	0.66	16.56	3.87	0.05
MORBTi	-1	126.0	rutile, melt	0.64	16.06	3.50	0.04
MORBTi	0	111.3	rutile, melt	0.70	18.16	2.65	0.03
MORBTi	2	42.9	rutile, melt	0.74	19.36	1.81	0.03
MORBTi	6.54 (air)	67.3	rutile, armacolite, melt	0.47	14.51	1.11	0.04
DacTi	-2	72.4	rutile, melt	0.12	7.22	14.02	0.02
DacTi	-1	116.3	rutile, melt	0.14	7.15	10.25	0.05
DacTi	0	101.5	rutile, melt	0.13	7.37	7.08	0.02
DacTi	1	40.0	rutile, melt	0.14	7.51	5.01	0.03
DacTi	1	231.7	rutile, melt	0.13	7.84	5.05	0.03
DacTi	2	66.9	rutile, melt	0.17	8.14	3.87	0.02
DacTi	6.54 (air)	50.3	rutile, melt	0.19	8.71	1.50	0.03
LCOTi	-1	126.0	rutile, melt	0.00	5.30	21.79	0.05
LCOTi	0	88.7	rutile, melt	0.00	5.38	17.27	0.06
LCOTi	1	237.1	rutile, melt	0.00	8.74	9.12	0.08
LCOTi	6.54 (air)	67.3	rutile, melt	0.00	7.40	1.68	0.06

composition	MORBTi		MORBTi		DacTi	
$fO_2 (\Delta QFM)$	-2		-1		-2	
element	D rt/melt	σ	D <sup>rt/melt</sup>	σ	D <sup>rt/melt</sup>	σ
Sc	0.31	0.03	0.30	0.01	1.30	0.13
Cr	14.81	2.16	17.19	1.54	44.96	3.03
Mn	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.00	0.10	0.06
Fe	0.01	0.01	0.06	0.00	0.10	0.05
Ni			0.15	0.02		
Y	1.48E-02	1.99E-03	1.43E-02	2.00E-03	0.11	0.09
Zr	3.90	0.26	3.63	0.12	10.53	0.41
Nb	45.34	3.44	39.29	2.19	120.04	8.14
La			2.02E-03	2.45E-03	0.13	0.06
Ce	9.96E-04	2.01E-05	3.42E-03	2.78E-03	0.12	0.05
Pr	3.64E-04	9.92E-06	2.58E-03	1.87E-03	0.13	0.07
Nd	4.82E-03	2.31E-03	4.80E-03	1.52E-03	0.13	0.06
Sm	6.51E-03	1.43E-04	4.03E-03	3.13E-03	0.09	0.08
Eu	1.36E-03	3.43E-05	3.26E-03	2.32E-03	0.14	0.05
Gd	3.37E-03	1.62E-04	6.65E-03	4.18E-03	0.15	0.08
Dy	2.24E-03	8.91E-04	3.26E-03	2.15E-03	0.15	0.06
Но	2.08E-03	5.19E-04	2.91E-03	2.02E-03	0.11	0.09
Er	5.07E-03	1.96E-03	4.70E-03	1.38E-03	0.11	0.09
Yb	6.13E-03	1.74E-04	7.29E-03	2.37E-03	0.14	0.10
Lu	9.20E-03	1.06E-03	8.82E-03	2.38E-03	0.15	0.11
Hf	5.96	0.31	5.62	0.28	14.69	1.34
Та	115.05	14.11	55.83	11.21	218.36	39.79

Table 3 Rutile/melt trace element partition coefficients at 1300 °C and 1 atm.





# Figure 2





# Figure 3









Always consult and cite the final, published document. See http://www.minsocam.org or GeoscienceWorld



Figure a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. DOI: https://doi.org/10.2138/am-2020-7013

