1	Revised version 4
2	The role of Fe content on the Fe-Mg exchange reaction in augite
3	Murri M. ¹ , Scandolo L. ¹ , Fioretti A.M. ² , Nestola F. ³ , Domeneghetti M.C. ¹ , Alvaro M. ^{*1}
4	
5	¹ Dipartimento di Scienze della Terra e dell'Ambiente, Università degli Studi di Pavia, Italy
6	² Istituto di Geoscienze e Georisorse CNR, Padova, Italy
7	³ Dipartimento di Geoscienze, Università degli Studi di Padova, Italy
8	
9 10 11 12 13	*Corresponding author e-mail: matteo.alvaro@unipv.it For submission to: American Mineralogist Article type: Article Running Title: Intracrystalline geothermometer for augites

- 14
- 15

ABSTRACT

The study of the intracrystalline Fe-Mg exchange between M1 and M2 crystallographic sites in clinopyroxene on samples from a variety of geological settings has provided a framework to understand the thermal history of pyroxene-bearing rocks. The Fe-Mg exchange reaction has successfully been exploited as a geothermometric tool in the study of orthopyroxene and pigeonite-bearing rocks, but relatively few data are available for clinopyroxene. A strong correlation between total iron content and the slope of the Fe²⁺-Mg equilibrium distribution coefficient (k_D) as a function of temperature has been found for orthopyroxene and pigeonite, and we investigate this relationship in augite.

We carried out new equilibrium annealing experiments at 800, 900 and 1000°C followed by single-crystal X-ray diffraction and structural refinement in order to obtain a new geothermometric calibration for augite from a 120-mthick lava flow from Ontario, Canada [Theo's Flow, $En_{49}Fs_9Wo_{42}$ hereafter also referred as Fs_9 where $Fs=100*\Sigma Fe/(\Sigma Fe+Mg+Ca)$ with $\Sigma Fe=Fe^{2+}+Fe^{3+}+Mn$]. This new calibration enabled us to evaluate the compositional effects (mainly Fe content) by comparison with the data previously obtained on augite from MIL 03346 Martian sample ($En_{36}Fs_{24}Wo_{40}$ hereafter referred to as Fs_{24}).

The extremely good agreement observed between the data obtained on Theo's Flow and Miller Range (MIL 03346) augite demonstrate that for the range of compositions between Fs_9 and Fs_{24} total iron content has a negligible or null influence on equilibrium behavior. Furthermore, linear regression of data from Theo's Flow and MIL 03346

32 gave a single calibration equation:

33
$$\ln(k_D = -4040(\pm 180)/T(K) + 1.12(\pm 0.17)(R^2 = 0.988)$$
.

This new calibration describes the equilibrium behavior of augite and can be reliably used to determine the closure temperature (T_c) of augite with composition ranging between Fs₉ and Fs₂₄.

36 Keywords: augite; geothermometer; single-crystal X-ray diffraction; Fe-Mg exchange reaction.

37

38

INTRODUCTION

39 Several methods are commonly used to determine the exchange equilibrium temperature of 40 minerals to infer the thermal history of their host rocks (e.g. Ghose and Ganguly 1982; Ganguly and Saxena 1987). Among these, the intracrystalline Fe-Mg exchange between M1 and M2 41 crystallographic sites in clinopyroxenes has been successfully applied to samples from different 42 geological settings (e.g. Dal Negro et al. 1982; Ghose and Ganguly 1982; Molin and Zanazzi 43 1991; Brizi et al. 2000). More recently, the same method has also been applied to clinopyroxenes 44 from extraterrestrial samples, in particular to pigeonite from ureilite (Alvaro et al. 2011) and to 45 augite from Martian nakhlites (Alvaro et al. 2015). 46

Alvaro et al. (2011) highlighted a possible correlation between total iron content (hereafter 47 referred as $X_{Fe} = Fe^{2+}/Fe^{2+} + Mg$ or Fs) and equilibrium behavior [see Figure 4 of Alvaro et al. 48 2011]. However, these authors could only account for the data already available: their own 49 50 results obtained on natural pigeonite and Brizi et al.s' (2000) data on natural augite. The slope of the arrhenian calibration equation appeared to decrease with increasing Fe content of the 51 pyroxene. Domeneghetti et al. (2013) and Alvaro et al. (2015) suggested that this change in slope 52 was the possible cause of the discrepancy between the closure temperatures (T_c) of the augite 53 from Martian nakhlite Miller Range 03346 (MIL 03346, $T_c=600^{\circ}$ C, (En₃₆Fs₂₄Wo₄₀) and the 54 corresponding terrestrial Theo's Flow (TS, $T_c=720^{\circ}$ C, En₄₉Fs₉Wo₄₂), both calculated using the 55 56 calibration equation obtained on MIL 03346 samples. However, the lack of data on equilibrium behavior $(k_{\rm D})$ as a function of Fe content of augite does not allow confirmation of the 57 abovementioned correlation observed for pigeonite. 58

Here we report the results of a study of the dependence of k_D on temperature, carried out on Theo's Flow augite (En₄₉Fs₉Wo₄₂) samples using the same approach as in MIL 03346, which allows the influence of iron content on the degree of ordering (k_D) to be evaluated as a function of temperature and to provide a reliable means of comparison with the data obtained by Alvaro et al. (2015) on MIL 03346 (En₃₆Fs₂₄Wo₄₀). This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. (DOI will not work until issue is live.) DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2138/am-2016-5717

Intracrystalline geothermometer for augites

64

65

EXPERIMENTAL METHODS

66 *Samples*

A small chip (0.10 g) of the pyroxenite sample TS7 from Theo's flow (Lentz et al. 2011), obtained at 85 m below the cooling surface of the 120-m-thick lava flow [Ontario, Canada; Pyke et al. (1973)] was kindly provided by Dr. A.H. Treiman. One pyroxene crystal (size 0.300 x 0.260 x 0.170 mm), labelled TS7 N.16 (where 16 refers to the progressive numbering of samples) was carefully selected for high-resolution X-ray single crystal diffraction analysis on the basis of the quality of the diffraction peaks and absence of twinning.

73 Annealing experiments

After alternate flushing with nitrogen and evacuation, augite crystal TS7 N.16 was sealed 74 into a silica vial together with an iron-wüstite buffer to control oxygen fugacity fO_2 . The crystal 75 and the buffer were placed in two small separate Pt crucibles to avoid contact between them. The 76 annealing experiments were carried out at 800, 900 and 1000°C on the same augite crystal until 77 equilibrium in the Fe^{2+} -Mg exchange reaction was reached. Quenching was performed by 78 dropping the tubes into cold water. Further details on the annealing protocol used are given in 79 80 Alvaro et al. (2011), Alvaro et al. (2015) and Domeneghetti et al. (2013). Two annealing/quenching experiments of different durations were performed at each temperature to 81 82 ascertain that equilibrium was reached.

83

84 Single-crystal X-ray diffraction

High resolution single-crystal X-ray diffraction data (HR-SC-XRD) up to 0.434 Å⁻¹ were collected on crystal TS7 N.16 before (referred to as "untreated") and after each annealing experiment. A three-circle Bruker AXS SMART APEX diffractometer (graphitemonochromatized Mo*K* α radiation, $\lambda = 0.71073$ Å operating 55 kV, 30 mA), equipped with a CCD detector was used. Because of the small size of the crystals, a 0.3mm MonoCap collimator was used to collect the data.

91	Data up to 9000 frames (frame resolution 512×512 pixels) were gathered using the Bruker
92	SMART software package (Bruker-AXS \mathbb{O}) at ten different goniometer settings, using the ω -scan
93	mode (scan width: $0.2^{\circ} \omega$; exposure time: 10 second/frame; detector-sample distance: 5.02 cm).
94	About 13900 reflections (~ 99% of the measured data) were collected up to $2\theta = 110^{\circ}$.

95

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

96 Data reduction and structural refinement

Data reductions, including intensity integration and background, and Lorentz-polarization 97 corrections, were carried out using the Bruker SAINT+ software v6.45A (Bruker-AXS[©]). The 98 99 semi-empirical absorption correction of Blessing (1995), based on the determination of transmission factors for equivalent reflections in the monoclinic Laue group 2/m was applied using 100 101 the program SADABS (Sheldrick 1996). Table 1 shows the unit-cell parameters, obtained by a least-squares procedure to refine the position of about 7000 reflections in the $6 - 110^{\circ} 2\theta$ range, 102 for the untreated crystal and after each disordering experiment. It also shows the value of the 103 discrepancy factor R_{int} calculated from the average of the $[F_0]^2$ values for equivalent pairs in 2/m104 Laue symmetry. The observed F_0^2 values were then treated with a full-matrix least-squares 105 refinement in the C2/c space group by SHELX-97 (Sheldrick 2008) starting from the atomic 106 coordinates reported by Domeneghetti et al. (2013) for sample TS7 N.2, and taking into account 107 the M21 and O2B1 split sites that had been refined with isotropic displacement parameters [for a 108 detailed description of the M21 and O2B1 split sites see Rossi et al. (1987)]. The atomic scattering 109 curves were taken from the International Tables for X-ray Crystallography (Ibers and Hamilton 110 1970). Neutral vs. ionized scattering factors were refined for all sites not involved in chemical 111 substitutions (Hawthorne et al. 1995) and complete ionization was assumed for Mg and Fe in the 112 *M*1 site, for Ca and Mg in the *M*2 site and for Fe in the *M*21 site [see Domeneghetti et al. (2013)] 113 for further details on the refinement strategies adopted here]. Individual weights and the weighting 114 scheme suggested by the program were used. The extinction correction was applied with the 115 procedures of the SHELX-97 program. Table 1 reports the mean atomic numbers (m.a.n.) in 116 117 electrons per formula unit (e.p.f.u.) at the M1 and (M2 + M21) sites obtained when the structure refinement reached convergence, before introducing the chemical constraints. The average of the 118 atomic numbers of 33.74 e.p.f.u., obtained from the sum of M1 + M2 + M21 for each structural 119

refinement, did not show variations greater than 0.1 e.p.f.u. with respect to the m.a.n. of the untreated sample (see Table 1).

This mean atomic number is in good agreement with those obtained from the Electron 122 Microprobe analysis (EMPA) by Domeneghetti et al., (2013) for crystal TS7 N.2 [33.62(14) 123 e.p.f.u.- here and in the remaining of the text the numbers in parenthesis are 1 standard deviation 124 of our determined values]. The good agreement (less than 1 standard deviation) allowed us to use 125 the EMPA data reported for this crystal (Table 2 of Domeneghetti et al. 2013) for our subsequent 126 structure refinements with chemical constraints, following the same procedure as in Domeneghetti 127 et al. (2013) and Nestola et al. (2007). The site populations obtained from the structural 128 refinements with chemical constraints are reported in Table 2. 129

130 Dependence of the closure temperature of augite on iron content

The site population reported in Table 2 was determined as in Domeneghetti et al. (2013). Fe^{2+} -Mg ordering was estimated from site population by means of the intracrystalline distribution coefficient k_{D} , using the same expression adopted by Brizi et al. (2000): $k_{D} =$ [$(Fe^{2+}_{M1})(Mg_{M2})/(Fe^{2+}_{M2})(Mg_{M1})$]. The obtained k_{D} values and relative propagated errors are also reported in Table 2. As expected, the intracrystalline distribution coefficient increased with temperature.

For the untreated TS7 N.16 crystal a k_D of 0.052(3) was obtained. This value is identical, within error, with those measured for the other two TS7 samples (N.1 and N.2) of 0.052(4) and 0.048(3) respectively, reported by Domeneghetti et al. (2013), confirming the nearly identical cation distribution and closure temperature (T_c) of these crystals.

In Figure 1 plots the $\ln k_D$ against 1/T for our TS7 N.16 along with those by Alvaro et al. (2015) on the MIL 03346 crystal (N.19), and that of Domeneghetti et al. (2013) on the MIL 03346 crystal (N.14). The weighted linear regression of $\ln k_D$ versus 1/T yielded the following equation:

145

$$ln(k_D = -4021(\pm 159)/T(K) + 1.18(\pm 0.14) (R^2 = 0.997)$$
(1)

146

147 which agrees extremely well with that of Alvaro et al. (2015):

148

$$ln(k_D = -4421(\pm 561)/T(K) + 1.46(\pm 0.52) \text{ (R}^2 = 0.988)$$
(2)

149

150

The closure temperatures obtained using our new geothermometer and that by Alvaro et al. (2015) for our sample TS7 N.16 together with those for MIL03346 N.14, N.19 and TS7 N.1 and N.2 (Domeneghetti et al. 2013) are reported in Table 3. As seen in Table 3, and as expected from the similar k_D values, the T_c calculated for the three samples were identical within one standard deviation, once again confirming the good agreement between the two calibration equations. Therefore, a new single calibration equation was obtained using our data together with those reported by Alvaro et al. (2015):

158

$$ln(k_D = -4040(\pm 180)/T(K) + 1.12(\pm 0.17) \text{ (R}^2 = 0.988)$$
(3)

159

160 This equation can be used with confidence to retrieve the closure temperature (T_c) for terrestrial 161 and extraterrestrial augite with composition ranging between Fs₉ and Fs₂₄. Furthermore, these 162 results confirmed once again that the use of the older and erroneous calibration by Brizi et al. 163 (2000) should be abandoned.

164

IMPLICATIONS

In this study we have shown that at least for the range of compositions between Fs₉ and 165 Fs_{24} total iron content has no influence on the Fe^{2+} -Mg exchange equilibrium (Figure 2), 166 although the role of Fe content in kinetic behavior cannot be excluded until a broader range of 167 168 compositions is investigated. Our newly determined calibration allows the calculation of closure temperatures and a preliminary estimation of the cooling rates using the method of Ghose and 169 170 Ganguly (1982) for diopside from the Lesotho Kimberlite pipe and used in Alvaro et al. (2015). This procedure will enable, for instance, calculation of the burial depth for samples from 171 172 different overlapping magmatic units as in Theo's flow (work in progress).

173

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

174 MM and MA have been funded by the MILE DEEp project (RBSI140351) to M. Alvaro. MCD 175 has been funded by the PEA13 grant to L. Folco. F.N. has been funded by the INDIMEDEA 176 ERC starting grant (#307322) to F. Nestola. We thank Allan Treiman for kindly supplying

Theo's Flow samples. The authors wish to thank the Department of Mineral Sciences,
Smithsonian Institution for providing Theo's Flows samples (MMNH7255). We also thank the
three anonymous reviewers.

180

181

REFERENCES

- Alvaro, M., Cámara, F., Domeneghetti, M., Nestola, F., and Tazzoli, V. (2011) HT P2₁/c-C2/c
 phase transition and kinetics of Fe²⁺-Mg order-disorder of an Fe-poor pigeonite:
 implications for the cooling history of ureilites. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology,
 162, 599-613.
- Alvaro, M., Domeneghetti, M.C., Fioretti, A.M., Cámara, F., and Marinangeli, L. (2015) A new
 calibration to determine the closure temperatures of Fe-Mg ordering in augite from
 nakhlites. Meteoritics & Planetary Science, 50, 499–507.
- Blessing, R.H. (1995) An empirical correction for absorption anisotropy. Acta Crystallographica
 Section A, 51, 33–38.
- Brizi, E., Molin, G., and Zanazzi, P.F. (2000) Experimental study of intracrystalline Fe²⁺-Mg
 exchange in three augite crystals: Effect of composition on geothermometric calibration.
 American Mineralogist, 85, 1375–1382.
- Dal Negro, A., Carbonin, S., Molin, G.M., Cundari, A., and Piccirillo, E.M. (1982)
 Intracrystalline cation distribution in natural clinopyroxenes of tholeiitic, transitional, and
 alkaline basaltic rocks. In Advances in Physical Geochemistry pp. 117–150. Springer.
- Domeneghetti, M.C., Fioretti, A.M., Cámara, F., McCammon, C., and Alvaro, M. (2013)
 Thermal history of nakhlites: A comparison between MIL 03346 and its terrestrial analogue
 Theo's flow. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 121, 571–581.
- Ganguly, J., and Saxena, S.K. (1987) Exchange Equilibrium and Inter-Crystalline Fractionation,
 Mixtures a., 131-165 p.
- Ghose, S., and Ganguly, J. (1982) Mg-Fe Order-Disorder in Ferromagnesian Silicates. In S.
 Saxena, Ed., Advances in Physical Geochemistry Vol. 2, pp. 3–99. Springer New York.
- Hawthorne, F.C., Ungaretti, L., and Oberti, R. (1995) Site populations in minerals; terminology
 and presentation of results of crystal-structure refinement. Canadian Mineralogist, 33, 907–
 911.
- Ibers, J.A., and Hamilton, W.C. (1970) International Tables for X-ray Crystallography, 99-101 p.
 J. Chem. Phys Vol. 4. Kynoch Press, Birmingham, UK.
- Lentz, R.C.F., McCoy, T.J., Collins, L.E., Corrigan, C.M., Benedix, G.K., Taylor, G.J., and
 Harvey, R.P. (2011) Theo's Flow, Ontario, Canada: A terrestrial analog for the Martian
 nakhlite meteorites. Geological Society of America Special Papers, 483, 263–277.

212 213	Molin, G., and Zanazzi, P.F. (1991) Intracrystalline Fe2+-Mg ordering in augite: experimental study and geothermometric applications. European Journal of Mineralogy, 3, 863–875.
214 215 216	Nestola, F., Longo, M., Mccamnion, C., and Ballaran, T.B. (2007) Crystal-structure refinement of Na-bearing clinopyroxenes from mantle-derived eclogite xenoliths. American Mineralogist, 92, 1242–1245.
217 218	Pyke, D.R., Naldrett, A.J., and Eckstrand, O.R. (1973) Archean ultramafic flows in Munro Township, Ontario. Geological Society of America Bulletin, 84, 955–978.
219 220 221	Rossi, G., Oberti, R., Negro, A., Molin, G.M., and Mellini, M. (1987) Residual electron density at the M2 site in C2/c clinopyroxenes: Relationships with bulk chemistry and sub-solidus evolution. Physics and Chemistry of Minerals, 14, 514–520.
222	Sheldrick, G.M. (1996) Sadabs. University of Göttingen, Germany.
223 224	Sheldrick, G.M. (2008) A short history of SHELX. Acta Crystallographica Section A, 64, 112–122.
225	
226	
227	
228	
229	
230	
231	
232	
233	
234	
235	
236	
237	
238	



Tables and Figures

Table 1. Unit cell parameters and information on data collection and structure refinement for untreated TS7 N.16. Data for TS7 N.16 obtained after each annealing temperature are also reported.

	Untreated	72 h 800°C	120 h 800°C	73 h 900°C	166 h 900°C	15 h 1000°C	30 h 1000°C
	kcs	kda	kdg	kdu	kdw	kdx	kdz
a (Å)	9.7401 (4)	9.7356 (5)	9.7393 (4)	9.7353 (4)	9.7430 (4)	9.7480 (4)	9.7424 (5)
b (Å)	8.9195 (3)	8.9237 (4)	8.9255 (4)	8.9185 (3)	8.9269 (4)	8.9307 (4)	8.9286 (5)
c (Å)	5.2513 (2) 106.2619	5.2515 (2) 106.2279	5.2524 (2) 106.2341	5.2510 (2) 106.2670	5.2542 (2) 106.2690	5.2577 (2) 106.2734	5.2552 (3) 106.2759
β(°)	(12)	(16)	(13)	(11)	(11)	(12)	(16)
$V(Å^3)$	437.96 (3)	438.06 (3)	438.38 (3)	437.66 (3)	438.68 (3)	439.38 (3)	438.81 (4)
μ (mm ⁻¹)	0.19	0.19	0.19	0.19	0.19	0.19	0.19
I _{ind}	2704	2766	2779	2738	2775	2788	2784
<i>R</i> _{int}	0.022	0.026	0.026	0.013	0.029	0.038	0.034
$R_{\rm all}$	0.023	0.028	0.027	0.023	0.028	0.029	0.030
$R_{ m w}$	0.061	0.077	0.073	0.062	0.073	0.080	0.079
S	1.19	1.13	1.17	1.16	1.18	1.14	1.14
m.a.n	33.78	33.74	33.79	33.74	33.68	33.76	33.71

Standard deviations are given in parentheses. I_{ind} is the number of independent reflections used for structure refinement; $R_{int} = \sum |_{F_o^2} |_{F_o^2} (mean) | / \sum [_{F_o^2}]$ where F_o and F_c are the observed and calculated structure factors; $R_{all} = \sum |_{F_o^2} |_{F_c^2} |_{F_o^2} |_{$

Table 2. Site population and distribution coefficients (k_D) for TS7 N.16 untreated sample together with those obtained on the same crystal at different annealing temperatures.

		Untreate	72 h	120 h	73 h	166 h	15 h	30 h
		d	800°C	800°C	900°C	900°C	1000°C	1000°C
		kcs	kda	kdg	kdu	kdw	kdx	kdz
Т	Si	1.948	1.948	1.948	1.948	1.948	1.949	1.949
	Al	0.052	0.052	0.052	0.052	0.052	0.051	0.051
M1	Mg	0.869(2)	0.860(2)	0.860(3)	0.855(2)	0.854(2)	0.847(2)	0.848(2)
	Fe	0.070(3)	0.079(3)	0.079(3)	0.083(3)	0.085(3)	0.092(3)	0.091(3)
	Fe ³⁺	0.042	0.042	0.042	0.043	0.041	0.041	0.042
	Al	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
	Cr	0.009	0.010	0.010	0.010	0.010	0.010	0.010
	Ti	0.007	0.007	0.007	0.007	0.007	0.007	0.007
	Mn	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.003	0.003	0.003	0.003
M2	Mg	0.065(3)	0.076(3)	0.072(3)	0.079(3)	0.080(3)	0.089(3)	0.086(3)
	Fe	0.101(2)	0.092(2)	0.093(2)	0.086(2)	0.083(2)	0.075(2)	0.077(2)
	Ca	0.817	0.815	0.819	0.816	0.819	0.820	0.819
	Mn	0.003	0.003	0.003	0.003	0.003	0.002	0.003
	Na	0.015	0.014	0.014	0.015	0.014	0.014	0.014
	kr	0.052(3)	0.076(4)	0 071(4)	0 089(4)	0.096(4)	0 129(5)	0.120(5)
	lnk _p	-2.96(6)	-2.58(5)	-2.64(5)	-242(5)	-2.34(5)	-2.05(4)	-212(4)

Note: $k_D = [(Fe^{2+}_{M1})(Mg_{M2})/(Fe^{2+}_{M2})(Mg_{M1})]$. The site occupancy values represent atoms per six oxygen atoms. (a) Chemical constraints introduced are based on the chemical analysis provided by Alvaro et al. (2015). Standard deviations are given in parentheses.

Table 3. Closure temperature calculated with different calibration equations.

$T_{\rm c}$ (°C)	$T_{c}(^{\circ}C)$		references
Brizi et al.	Alvaro et	T_{c} (°C)	
(2000)	al. (2015)	This study	

	Untreated (N.1)	533	640	624	а
	Untreated (N.2)	496	611	593	а
46	Untreated (N.14)	499	612	582	b
133	600°C (N.14)	515	625	609	b
E	Untreated (N.19)	479	597	579	b
N	700°C (N.19)	597	689	677	b
	800°C (N.19)	773	814	811	b
	900°C (N.19)	906	899	904	b
	Untreated (N.1)	649	728	718	а
MO	Untreated (N.2)	625	710	698	а
E	Untreated (N.16)	648	727	726	с
e0,	800°C (N.16)	758	804	809	с
The	900°C (N.16)	890	889	901	с
	1000°C (N.16)	1012	961	980	с

Note: (1) Brizi et al. (2000); (2) Alvaro et al. (2015); (3) This study. References: (a) Domeneghetti et al. (2013); (b) Alvaro et al. (2015); (c) This study.

256

257

Figure 1. Ln k_D versus 1/T (K⁻¹) for the augite samples considered in this work (Theo's Flow TS7 N.16, solid squares) together with those reported by Alvaro et al. (2015) for MIL 03346 and our data (open square). (a) Dashed and dotted lines represent the linear regression of the ln k_D vs 1/T for our sample and for those published by Alvaro et al. (2015), respectively. (b) Solid line represents a single linear regression of the Ln k_D vs 1/T for our sample together with those published by Alvaro et al. (2015).

264

265

266



