The effects of shear deformation on planetesimal core segregation: Results from in-situ X-							
ray micro-tomography							
REVISION 1							
Kasey A. Todd ¹ , Heather C. Watson ² , Tony Yu ³ , Yanbin Wang ³							
¹ Northern Illinois University, ² Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, ³ Center for Advanced							
Radiation Sources, the University of Chicago							
Abstract Keywords: Core formation; Microtomography; Permeability; Lattice Boltzmann							
Abstract							
It is well accepted that the Earth formed by the accretion and collision of small (10-100km), rocky bodies called planetesimals. W-Hf isotopic evidence from meteorites suggest that the cores of many planetesimals formed within a relatively short time frame of ~ 3 My. While a very hot, deep magma ocean is generally thought to have been the driving mechanism for core formation in large planetary bodies, it inadequately explains differentiation and core formation in small planetesimals due to temperatures potentially being insufficient for wide-scale silicate melting to occur. In order for these planetesimals to differentiate within such a relatively short time without a magma ocean, a critical melt volume of the metallic (core-forming) phase and sufficient melt connectivity and grain size must have existed in order to attain the required permeability and lead to efficient core formation. Shear deformation may increase the connectedness of melt and the permeability, and thus could have been a major contributing facto in the formation of planetesimal cores. This deformation may have been caused by large impacts and collisions experienced by the planetesimals in the early solar system. The purpose of this work is to test the hypothesis that shear deformation enhances the connectivity and permeability of Fe-S melt within a solid silicate (olivine) matrix, such that rapid core formation is plausible. A rotational Drickamer apparatus (RDA) was used to heat and torsionally deform a sample of solid olivine + FeS liquid through six steps of large-strain shear deformation. After each deformation step, X-ray microtomographs were collected in the RDA to obtain <i>in-situ</i> 3-dimensional images of the sample. The resulting digital volumes were performed to determine the effect of shear deformation on connectivity and permeability within the sample. The resulting permeability of the sample at various steps of deformation are the same within uncertainty and do not exhibit a change with increasing deformation. Additionally, the							

utilizing similar methods. 37

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27 28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

39 40

41

Introduction

42 Core formation is a significant, yet not completely understood process in the formation of 43 the terrestrial planets and other small, rocky bodies such as large asteroids and satellites.

44 Hafnium-Tungsten isotopic studies of the Earth's mantle and several meteorites indicate that the 45 Earth's core likely formed in \sim 30-100 My after the formation of the proto-earth, while the parent

46 bodies of iron meteorites differentiated much faster (~1-5 My) (Kleine et al., 2002; Scherstén et

47 al., 2006; Rubie et al., 2007; Burkhardt et al., 2008; Kleine et al., 2009), and perhaps even before

48 1 My (Kruijer et al. 2014). This short timescale of 1-5 My for core formation is in agreement

49 with the theoretical model that accretion in the early solar system took place relatively rapidly

50 (Alexander et al., 2001; Wood et al., 2006; Rubie et al., 2007). The mechanism by which core

51 formation took place in planetesimals is largely dependent upon the thermal history of the body

52 (Rubie et al., 2007). Heat generated from 26 Al decay would have melted the core forming alloy

in planetesimals 10-100 km in diameter (Yoshino et al., 2003; Walter and Tronnes, 2004;

54 Bizzarro et al., 2005), but may not have melted the silicate to a significant degree. In the absence

of widespread silicate melting, the mechanism by which metal and silicate might have segregated

56 in planetsimals is limited to inter-granular percolation of metallic melt through a solid silicate

57 matrix (Yoshino et al., 2003; Watson and Roberts, 2011).

In order for core formation to take place efficiently in an equilibrium setting, the metallic
melt must be fully connected within the solid silicate (e.g. Roberts et al., 2007; Watson and
Roberts, 2011). Whether or not connectivity is achieved depends on the dihedral (wetting) angle
between the liquid and solid grains (von Bargen and Waff, 1986). The dihedral angle (θ) can be

62 expressed as:

$$\frac{\gamma_{ss}}{2\gamma_{sl}} = \cos\left(\frac{\theta}{2}\right)$$

64

where γ_{ss} and γ_{sl} refer to the solid-solid and the solid-liquid interfacial energies, respectively (Bulau and Waff, 1979). A dihedral angle less than 60° leads to a fully interconnected melt network in which percolation is possible even at extremely small melt volumes; while a dihedral angle greater than 60° results in isolated pockets of melt and inefficient core formation, unless a critical volume of melt is present. This critical volume of melt is known as the connectivity threshold and increases with increasing dihedral angle (von Bargen and Waff, 1986).

71 Experiments performed at conditions relevant to the interiors of planetesimals (\sim 1-3 GPa) have determined that for the sulfide/metal melt-solid silicate system the dihedral angle is greater 72 than 60° (e.g. Ballhaus and Ellis, 1996; Shannon and Agee, 1996; Gaetani and Grove, 1999; 73 Holzheid et al., 2000; Takafuji et al., 2004; Walte et al., 2007), with an average angle of 90°±5°. 74 75 At a dihedral angle greater than 60° , the melt within planetesimals would only have percolated to the core until the pinch-off threshold was reached, below which the remaining melt would have 76 become stranded in the solid silicate matrix (von Bargen and Waff, 1986). The pinch-off 77 78 threshold, determined to be between 3 and 6 vol% (Yoshino et al., 2003; Roberts et al., 2007; Watson and Roberts, 2011), is slightly below the percolation threshold. Therefore, being able to 79 quantify the critical volume of melt (percolation threshold) required in order to maintain 80 percolative flow becomes essential in understanding the processes that contributed to rapid, 81 efficient core formation in planetesimals (Watson and Roberts, 2011). 82 Estimates of the connectivity threshold in the olivine + FeS system range from ~4 to 83

⁸⁴~17%, (Yoshino et al., 2003; Terasaki et al., 2008; Bagdassarov et al., 2009a, 2009b; Watson

4

and Roberts, 2011) with most accepted values being around 5 vol%. Although we don't have 85 many meteorite samples of differentiated mantle materials, it is commonly thought that it is 86 unlikely for 5vol% of metal to remain in the mantle. If we assume that core formation efficiently 87 removes most core material from the mantle, an alternative segregation mechanism is required in 88 order to lead to efficient core formation. For conditions within planetesimals, deformation 89 caused by large impacts, and possibly convection, has been suggested as a mechanism that may 90 have aided in the enhanced permeability and thus the segregation of the remaining melt (Bruhn 91 92 et al., 2000; Rushmer et al., 2005; Groebner and Kohlstedt, 2006; Hustoft and Kohlstedt, 2006). This manner of efficient core formation via deformation would preclude the necessity of 93 widespread silicate melting (i.e. a magma ocean), particularly in smaller planetesimals that may 94 95 have never reached high enough temperatures. Experiments performed on samples of varying compositions and melt volumes indicate 96 that shear deformation can lead to the enhanced segregation of metallic melt from a solid silicate 97 matrix (Bruhn et al., 2000; Rushmer et al., 2005; Groebner and Kohlstedt, 2006; Hustoft and 98 Kohlstedt, 2006). Deformation induced on these samples had varying outcomes, including: the 99 enhanced interconnection of melt pockets at 4 and 7 vol% sulfide melt (Bruhn et al., 2000) the 100

101 migration of melt within a solid silicate matrix (Rushmer et al., 2005; 20-25 vol%), the formation

102 of a strong melt-preferred orientation of previously isolated melt pockets (Groebner and

103 Kohlstedt, 2006; 4 vol%), and evidence of grain boundary percolation down to a pinch-off

threshold of ~1 vol% (Hustoft and Kohlstedt, 2006; 3, 5, and 9 vol%). The results of these

105 experiments support the idea that shear deformation may lead to the more efficient segregation of

106 metallic melt from a solid silicate matrix at melt volumes close to and above 5 vol%. The main

107 differences between this previous work and the present study are (1) Some previous studies

5

looked at melt volumes that were already significantly connected (i.e. Rushmer et al. 2005). (2) 108 In some cases, the experiments were performed at lower pressure (300MPa) and strain rates up to 109 2 orders of magnitude higher than those here (e.g. Groebner and Kohstedt, 2006, Hustoft and 110 111 Kohlstedt, 2006) and (3) The only other 3-D study (Bruhn et al. 2000) is on a relatively small 112 volume (~35mm x 35mm x 25mm) that may not be fully representative of connectivity and 113 permeability of the whole sample. Recent work by Walte et al. (2011) suggests that the behavior of metallic melt in similar systems (olivine + FeS or Au) is dominated by surface energy at low 114 115 strain rates and actaully may inhibit elongation of melt particles, and that melt may become 116 concentrated into larger melt pockets. The objective of the present study is to observe the effect of shear deformation on the 117

permeability of an olivine + FeS sample that is close to the pinch-off threshold of \sim 3-6 vol% 118 melt. Previous studies have relied upon methods, such as electrical conductivity (e.g. Yoshino, 119 2003, 2004), and using theoretical models based on 2-D images of melt geometry (e.g. Hustoft 120 121 and Kohlstedt, 2006) that indirectly measure permeability by constraining the connection 122 threshold. Recently, synchrotron based X-ray micro-tomography (3D) analysis of quenched 123 samples (Shi et al. 2013) and guenched samples coupled with numerical simulations on both the 124 olivine-basalt system (Zhu et al. 2011, Miller et al. 2014) and the olivine Fe-S system (Watson and Roberts 2011, have demonstrated that X-ray tomography is a useful tool in determining the 125 126 permeability and melt geometry in a more direct way than previous methods. 2-D X-ray radiography at high pressure and temperature has recently been employed to observe the 127 segregation process in-situ (Gotou et al. 2015). Here, we combine the advantages of each of 128 129 these techniques. By using *in-situ* high pressure X-ray micro-tomography (HP-XMT) coupled with numerical simulations to monitor the evolution of the same sample as it is undergoing 130

heating and deformation we evaluate the effect of deformation on the core segregation process.

132

133Experimental Methods

134 Sample Synthesis and High Pressure X-ray Microtomography

135Starting materials consisted of optically clear San Carlos olivine crystals

136 $([MgO_{0.91}Fe_{0.09}]_2SiO_4)$ and troilite powder (FeS). After grinding under ethanol using an agate

mortar and pestle, the olivine was sieved to a grain size of 37-74 micrometers. Pure, powdered

138 FeS (Alfa Aesar) was added to the dried olivine to comprise 4.5 vol% and the mixture was mixed

again under ethanol further to ensure uniformity. The olivine and FeS mixture was packed into a

140 graphite capsule and sintered in a piston-cylinder apparatus at RPI for 20 hours at 1 GPa and

141 1250°C. The sample synthesis assembly is shown in Figure 1a. Previous work indicates that

these conditions allow the sample to attain close to complete textural equilibrium (e.g. Gaetani

and Grove, 1999; Yoshino et al., 2003; Roberts et al., 2007; Watson et al., 2010). Once retrieved,

the sintered sample was shaped with a diamond file into several 1x1 mm cylinders and prepared

145 for high-pressure deformation and imaging experiments. Filing also served to remove the thin

146 coating of graphite around the edge of the sintered samples.

The quenched and equilibrated sample was brought to the Advanced Photon Source (APS) at Argonne National Laboratory for *in-situ* deformation and tomographic imaging at Sector 13 (GeoSoilEnviroCARS; GSECARS), Beamline 13-BM-D). The sample assembly used in the Drickamer cell at APS is shown in Figure 1(b). The details of the experimental set-up available for high pressure X-ray tomography microscopy (HPXTM) are described by Wang (2005) and Wang et al. (2011). Due to the large X-ray absorption contrast between the olivine and FeS

metal, the two materials can be easily distinguished in the resulting tomographic images at a

photon energy of 37 keV (Wang et al., 2011). A major advantage of using HPXTM is that the
sample can be imaged *in-situ* at high pressure and temperature, and so the *evolution* of one
sample can be recorded and observed over time.

Tomographic image collection was performed using a 4-inch tube with a 5x objective 157 lens, resulting in a pixel size of 2 µm. The exposure time was 25 seconds per frame. White field 158 159 images were collected before and after each set of tomography images in order to remove artifacts. The large Si (111) Bragg-Bragg monochromator allows easy switching between 160 monochromatic and white radiation in seconds (see Wang et al., 2011). Sample pressure was 161 162 monitored by energy-dispersive X-ray diffraction of the MgO pressure standard in the sample assembly and was maintained at 10 tons (~ 1.5 GPa ± 0.5 GPa) during the experiment (Speziale et 163 al. 2001). Temperature was estimated through the use of a power curve calibrated at GSECARS 164 for this experimental assembly. Temperatures were $1100^{\circ}C \pm 100^{\circ}C$ during the deformation 165 166 process and lowered to \sim 850°C during tomographic image collection. Shear strain was applied to the sample by rotating the upper and lower tungsten carbide anvils at constant speed in 167 opposite directions, each at 90° steps (Figure 2), for a total of 180° of twist. Each step of 168 deformation lasted for approximately 1.25 hours. Using the total angular rotation (840°) and the 169 total duration of the experiment (6.25 hours), a maximum apparent shear strain rate of 7.70E-5 s⁻ 170 ¹ was obtained. However, this is only a rough estimate of the strain rate experienced by the outer 171 diameter of the sample and is considered an upper bound due to slippage that occurs between the 172 rotating anyils and the sample during torsion. This strain rate is lower than that reported by 173 174 previous workers on a similar system (e.g. Groebner and Kohlstedt, 2006, Hustoft and Kohlstedt, 2006), where strain rates varied from 10^{-2} to 10^{-4} . Walte et al. 2011 report similar strain rates to 175 our reported maximum $(7x10^{-6} - 1x10^{-4})$. 176

177 Electron Microprobe Analysis

Backscattered electron (BSE) imaging, secondary electron (SE) imaging, and 178 wavelength-dispersive spectroscopy (WDS) were conducted on both an undeformed sample of 179 180 the starting material and the deformed sample using the Cameca SX100 electron microprobe at Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute. All imaging was conducted at 15 kV, with a beam current of 181 182 50 nA. The BSE images in **Figure 3** show the basic textures for the undeformed and the deformed samples. The textures of the two samples are clearly different, with FeS grains in the 183 184 deformed sample being much more stretched out and appear to have migrated along olivine grain 185 boundaries. The deformed texture can be seen in Figure 3b, where FeS is present along individual olivine grain boundaries; while in the undeformed sample, FeS occupies triple-grain 186 junctions or grain corners as more equi-dimensional blobs (Figure 3a). The image of the 187 deformed sample was taken from the mid-area of the sample, neither at the edge or in the center, 188 and is broadly characteristic of the texture seen throughout the entire sample. The elongated 189 blobs are no necessarily co-directional with the direction of shear in the sample, and are not 190 uniformly aligned throughout the sample. 191

192 Table 1 summarizes the electron microprobe composition measurements for sulfide and 193 olivine in both the undeformed and deformed samples. The FeS grains in the deformed sample exhibit some quench texture (sulfide immiscibility); however, this internal structure appears to 194 195 have had only a slight effect on the resulting Fe and S measurements. The higher standard deviations in measurements of the deformed sample could also be attributed to the sulfide grains 196 being thinner and more stretched out, making it more difficult to conduct measurements on a 197 198 single bleb due to the beam size of a few microns even in spot mode. We attribute the nickel measured in the sulfide grains to an impurity in the FeS starting material. The small amount of 199

nickel present in the olivine both before and after the deformation experiment can be attributed 200 to the fact that nickel is occasionally substituted for iron in the crystal lattice of olivine 201 (Kohlstedt and Mackwell, 1987). 202 203 **Results and Discussion** 204 **Image Analysis** 205 Ouantitative permeability measurements were acquired from the resulting HPXTM 206 207 images. The individual radiographs collected from the beamline were reconstructed using the scientific data visualization program Tomo Display (Rivers and Gualda, 2009; 208 http://cars9.uchicago.edu/software/idl/tomography.html) and exported as a series of TIFF images. 209 When these individual images are stacked they create a 3-dimensional volume of the sample. 210 Six of these image stacks were chosen at increasing degrees of deformation $(0^{\circ}, 180^{\circ}, 360^{\circ}, 540^{\circ}, 540^{\circ})$ 211 720°, and 840°; all at 10 tons of ram load) so that any change in permeability could be observed. 212 Figure 4a shows a gray-scale XTM image of the sample after reconstruction. These gray-scale 213 images were then binarized into regions of "melt" and "non-melt" using the program ImageJ 214 (Rasband, 1997; Figure 4b). The appropriate threshold was determined by finding a value that 215 would produce the correct proportion of "melt" regions given the expected value from both our 216 synthetic starting material and initial BSE imaging of the starting material and post-deformation 217 218 experiment. The melt volume percent was calculated for each image stack and found to be within one standard deviation of the starting material. The average melt fraction of the binarized 219 XTM volumes in the X-direction is $4.36 \pm 0.11\%$ and an average of $4.44 \pm 0.07\%$ in the Z-220 221 direction, compared to the actual value of 4.5 vol%. The X- and Z-directions within the sample can be seen in Figure 2, and represent the two directions in which flow was simulated and 222

permeability calculated. These are the two bulk directions that we can measure given the 3-D 223 data. We performed calculations in both directions because of the potential to observe 224 anisotropy within the sample due to the shear strain applied to the sample, as well as due to 225 potential shortening of the sample as the experiment continued. Because the nature of rotational 226 227 shear results in a non-uniform strain distribution in the sample, this method we performed calculations of several subvolumes from different areas of the sample at each degree of 228 deformation. There was no measurable difference in the resulting permeability in either direction, 229 230 however there was a well-defined anisotropy between the two direction (see Figure 6). In order to approximate the true texture of the sample, the binarized XTM images were 231 compared to the higher resolution BSE images of the deformed sample. In **Figure 5**, the 232 binarized deformed sample is compared to a binarized XTM image, illustrating the similarities in 233 texture and melt distribution between the two images. After the binarization process, the six 234 image stacks, all with dimensions of 450x450x150 pixels, were each divided into nine 235 150x150x150 pixel sub-volumes and converted into digital volume input files in MATLAB[®]. 236 237

238 Lattice Boltzmann Simulations

The lattice-Boltzmann method applied to 3-D digital rock samples has been shown to be a fast and accurate method of quantifying permeability of complex geometries found in natural porous systems (e.g. White et al. 2006). Here, quantitative permeability calculations were performed on the digital volumes using the open-source program Palabos (Latt, 2009), which utilizes the lattice Boltzmann method (LBM) to simulate flow of a viscous fluid through a matrix while representing the physics of a real system (Chen and Doolen, 1998; Latt, 2008). Palabos and the LBM have been used and validated by several previous studies (e.g. Bosl et al., 1998;

Roberts et al., 2007; Degruyter et al., 2010). Palabos uses Darcy's law to obtain the permeability
of the sub-volumes in non-dimensional lattice units from the average velocity distribution
throughout the 3-D volume, along with an applied pressure gradient and fluid viscosity. This
non-dimensional value is then converted into physical units (m²) by multiplying it with the pixel
size of the XTM image.

The calculated permeabilities for various steps of shear strain for sample R1288 can be 251 found in **Table 2**. The final measurements are all within one standard deviation of one another 252 253 and do not increase with increasing deformation. Figure 6 plots the permeability results from 254 two experiments against the steps of shear strain. The experiment labeled R1288 is the experiment shown in the images in this paper. The experiment labeled R1350 is a second 255 experiment that was repeated using identical methods. The second experiment (R1350) was 256 deformed to a significantly higher degree, although the final textures appeared to be similar. Also, 257 the calculated permeabilities on both samples are consistent within uncertainty, and both sample 258 show the sample anisotropy between the X and Z directions. This anisotropy may be a result of 259 initial shortening of the sample due to compression at the initiation of the experiment. The one 260 point at the highest degree of deformation in R1350 may indicate a slight shift upwards in 261 permeability at very high degrees of deformation, but more work and experiments will need to be 262 done to confirm this result. The quantitative analysis performed on the digital volumes allows 263 264 for a more direct means to calculate the permeability of the sample than previous work that relied on models such as the Kozeny-Carman relationship relating permeability to grain size and model 265 dependent geometric factors. The permeabilities obtained in this study are comparable to the 266 range of values from previous workers' studies, particularly those of Roberts et al. (2007) and 267 Watson and Roberts (2011). These studies both describe the olivine/sulfide system as well as 268

utilize XTM images to quantitatively determine permeability via lattice Boltzmann simulations. 269 Figure 7 compares these three studies to one another, where it can be seen that the permeabilities 270 in this study are within one standard deviation of the permeabilities obtained for samples with 271 272 higher melt fractions. It can also be seen that the results in this study have higher permeabilities than those of Watson and Roberts for the same melt fraction and the pre-deformation 273 274 measurements are consistent with previous studies which state that the pinch-off threshold in the 275 FeS-silicate system is between 3 and 6 vol% (Yoshino et al., 2003; Roberts et al., 2007; Watson 276 and Roberts, 2011).

277 Comparison to Previous Studies

Several previous studies address the question of permeability and connectivity in similar 278 samples with and without the complicating factor of deformation. The present work differs from 279 these previous studies in a few important ways, as described below. In some previous work, the 280 presence of an electrically conductive pathway has been interpreted as evidence for a melt that 281 282 was sufficiently connected to allow for permeable flow (i.e. Yoshino et al., 2003, 2004). However, it has recently been shown (e.g. Watson and Roberts 2011, Watson et al. 2010) that 283 284 small, disconnected, blebs of sulfide can create electrically conductive pathways. This is thought to be due to very thin (~nm) films along grain boundaries and edges even when the melt fraction 285 is well below the percolation threshold (~1 vol% as opposed to 5 vol%). Because the difference 286 287 in electrical conductivity is so drastic between the silicate and the sulfide melt, even a miniscule 288 volume that is connected will produce significantly higher bulk conductivity. In these cases, the connected volume is such a small percentage of the total melt in the sample that it is unlikely to 289 290 add any substantial permeability to the system. A more thorough discussion comparing estimates of permeability from electrical conductivity and x-ray micro-tomography measurements is 291

available in Watson and Roberts, (2011).

There have also been previous studies of the effect of deformation on connectivity and 293 permeability in olivine + iron sulfide systems (e.g. Bruhn et al. 2000, Groebner and Kohlstedt, 294 2006, Hustoft et al. 2007, and Walte et al. 2011). Bruhn et al. (2000) performed experiments 295 with a comparable volume fraction of Fe-S melt in an olivine matrix and deformed the samples 296 at a higher strain rate of between 10^{-4} s⁻¹ and 10^{-3} s⁻¹ at 1250°C and 300MPa. In backscattered 297 electron images they observed similar (but more pronounced) changes in the shape of the Fe-S 298 melt blobs. The pockets became larger, more elongated, and were aligned at an angle of $\sim 20^{\circ}$ 299 with the shear plane. Bruhn et al. performed a 3-D reconstruction on a small portion of their 300 sample (~35mm x 35mm x 25mm) by serial sectioning, and repeated BSE imaging. They interpret 301 the changes in the melt pocket texture as evidence that melt can become interconnected and thus 302 allow permeable flow even in systems with high dihedral angles, as a result of shear deformation. 303 The benefit of this technique is enhanced spatial resolution of the shape of the Fe-S blob, but that 304 comes at a cost of not being able to image as much of the sample (thousands to millions of grains 305 and pockets), and therefore, perhaps not being able to assess the change in connectivity across 306 the whole sample. Groebner and Kohlstedt (2006) expanded on the earlier work with more 307 experiments on an analog system with an even higher dihedral angle of $\sim 150^{\circ}$ (olivine +4% Au). 308 Again, they found a change in texture associated with deformation of the samples, and that the 309 molten gold formed well connected melt bands at an angle of $\sim 15^{\circ}$ to the shear plane. They took 310 these results as evidence that deformation may induce more efficient percolative flow with non-311 wetting melts than previously believed. Again, the strain rates of these experiments were at least 312 2-3 orders of magnitude higher than the maximum strain rate measured here. The theory behind 313 these results and similar results relating to the effect of shear on silicate melt extraction in the 314

Earth is summarized in Kohlstedt and Holtzmann (2009).

Walte et al. (2011) performed a series of similar experiments on olivine + FeS, and 316 Olivine +Au across a broader range of strain rates ($\sim 10^{-4} \text{ s}^{-1} - 10^{-6} \text{ s}^{-1}$). They analyzed the 317 resulting textures in 2-D sections of the samples, and found that the changes in textures could be 318 categorized into different types depending on the strain rate. They show that at high strain rates 319 (the stress dominated regime, above $\sim 10^{-4} \text{s}^{-1}$) the samples show linear zones of elongated melt 320 pockets, and that the degree of elongation increases with increased strain rate. At lower strain 321 rates (the surface tension dominated regime, below $\sim 10^{-5} \text{s}^{-1}$), liquid pockets are not linearly 322 aligned or significantly elongated. The textures seen in our experiments are consistent with an 323 intermediate texture between what was observed for the high and low strain rate samples. This is 324 also consistent with our measured maximum strain rate of 7.7×10^{-5} s⁻¹. Walte's et al. (2011) 325 experiments show that only a very small amount of melt is lost during the low strain rate 326 experiments, indicating that there is limited connectivity of the melt within the sample. All of the 327 experiments by Walte et al. (2011) show that at best, the melt segregation is inefficient, and at 328 least a 2-3vol% of the metallic melt is left behind in the sample, which is consistent with our 329 330 present results.

331

Implications

The permeabilities obtained in this study can be used to calculate the migration velocity of a sulfide melt through an olivine matrix in order to determine if shear deformation can lead to core formation in small (100 km) planetesimals within the 1-5 My time frame. The rate of migration can be calculated using the relationship:

336

where k is the permeability, $\Delta \rho$ is the density difference between sulfide and olivine (2.0E+03)

 $v = k\Delta\rho g/\eta$

kg/m³), *g* is the gravitational acceleration (0.1 m/s²), and η is sulfide melt viscosity (0.01 kg/m·s), after Roberts et al. 2007 and Watson et al. 2011. Using the average of the permeabilities (Xdirection; 6.31E-15 m²), the migration velocity is calculated to be 0.4 cm/year. A migration velocity of ~3.3 cm/year is necessary in order to fully segregate a metallic melt into the core of a small planetesimal within 3 My (Watson and Roberts, 2011).

However, migration velocity is highly dependent on grain size. Figure 8 shows that for a
melt volume of 4.5%, and the conditions above, a grain size of approximately 230 µm is needed
in order to reach a migration velocity of 3.3 cm/year. These grain sizes are reasonable for small
planetesimals (Watson and Roberts, 2011). To obtain the migration velocities in Figure 6, the
Kozeny-Carman relationship was used to calculate the permeabilities at increasing grain sizes:

 $k = (1/C) \cdot d^2 \varphi^n$

with C = 2000 (geometric constant), $\varphi = 4.5$ vol% (porosity), and n = 2, with n being a scaling 349 exponent representing how close to the percolation threshold a system is. The actual grain sizes 350 in this study were between 40 and 80 µm, and so these small sizes could be a contributing factor 351 in the low permeabilities, and thus low migration velocities, observed in this sample. As 352 mentioned above, caution needs to be applied when we are using the Kozeny-Carman 353 relationship, as it is not uniquely determined for this system. The geometric terms chosen are 354 roughly similar to those that have been used with some success to describe the olivine/basalt 355 356 system at equilibrium, but it is unclear that these terms will apply equally well here. The main purpose of this calculation is to illustrate that the permeabilities measured in this olivine/FeS 357 system are low compared to what is required for rapid core formation in planetesimals. It should 358 359 be noted that increasing the exponent n from n=2 to n=3 (the value used for fully connected melt well above the percolation threshold by Faul, 1997 and Bourbie and Zinszer, 1985) decreases the 360

permeability of the system even further. Furthermore, the migration velocity is also highly 361 dependent on viscosity. The values calculated here can essentially be considered an upper bound, 362 as they represent viscosities at the relatively high temperatures of 1300°C, where some silicate 363 melting would be expected. The viscosity of FeS melt at these high temperatures and pressures 364 365 between 1 and 2 GPa is around 0.005 kg/m·s (Kono et al. 2015). But, LeBlanc and Secco (1996) showed that the viscosity of Fe₇₃S₂₇ melts increases by nearly an order of magnitude as the 366 temperature is lowered to $\sim 1100^{\circ}$ C (the conditions of these experiments, and reasonable 367 368 conditions for this model of percolative core formation in the absence of silicate melt). Studies that obtain permeability indirectly through methods such as electrical conductivity yield 369 migration velocities that differ by several orders of magnitude from this study and others that use 370 371 HPXTM. From their electrical conductivity experiments, Yoshino et al. (2003) estimate a migration velocity of ~1-100 m/year. This significantly higher value may be attributed to thin 372 layers of sulfide melt between olivine grains that were unable to be imaged via XTM due to the 373 *in-situ* nature of the experiment and thus the decreased resolution. However, overall, the 374 possible contribution that these narrow connections may have to the calculated permeability is 375 likely insignificant (Roberts et al., 2007; Watson and Roberts, 2011). Instead, this great 376 difference likely stems from the fact that a direct measurement of permeability was not possible 377 and so the Kozeny-Carman relationship was relied upon to infer permeability. In this study, the 378 379 permeability was directly measured, thus the migration velocity calculated likely represents a more realistic scenario for core formation. 380

The main perceived drawback to the tomography method presented here is that the spatial resolution of the imaging is not able to capture the smallest threads of melt that could potentially be connected, and create high permeability pathways. Given our measured voxel size, we

estimate that we can reliably image a feature that about 2-4 micrometers in diameter, especially 384 considering the large contrast between the two phases in our tomographic reconstructions. First, 385 we note that the sulfide melt that is contributing to the permeability of the sample is a small 386 387 fraction of the total melt in the sample (ie. most of the melt is not connected). We can calculate 388 the expected permeability of the sample given different fractions of melt that is well connected (Figure 9). Here the data symbols represent lattice Boltzmann simulations run on artificial (ideal) 389 390 volumes with a cylindrical tubules of varying diameters along grain edges of cubic grains (150 391 micrometer edge length). The solid gray curve is the analytical solution to Darcy's law for the same geometry (Turcotte, 2002). Here we can see that our observed permeability ($\sim 10^{-15} \text{ m}^2$) 392 corresponds to tubules approximately 2-3 micrometers in diameter. This is admittedly close to 393 394 the expected resolution of what we could measure. However, in order to achieve an order of magnitude higher permeability, tubules of approximately 5.5 micrometers in diameter are 395 predicted which we would expect to see clearly, but we do not. Secondly, we can compare 2-D 396 images of the sample at different spatial resolution. Figure 10 shows an example of the 397 differences we can expect to see in thresholding a 2-D backscattered electron image of the 398 399 deformed sample. The first panel shows the original image, the second shows that high 400 resolution image thresholded directly, the fourth shows the thresholding results of an image that was artificially reduced in resolution to mimic the resolution that we would achieve by 401 402 tomography (~2 micrometers per pixel). In both cases the images were thresholded to result in 4.6 vol% melt. Although there are some noticeable differences, the main difference tends to be 403 around the perimeter of the larger melt blobs, which is unlikely to add significantly to the 404 405 permeability. The lower resolution image does miss a few stand-alone pixels that appear in the higher resolution image, but again, these few pixels are unlikely to make a large difference in the 406

18

407 measured permeability.

408 The permeabilities obtained here from the X-ray microtomographic images via lattice Boltzmann simulations indicate that the migration velocity is probably not high enough for 409 410 complete core formation to take place in planetesimals within the 1-5 My time frame. However, there is still much work that can be done in order to increase our understanding of the effects of 411 412 certain parameters such as strain rate, temperature, and metal/silicate composition on the melt 413 connectivity, permeability, and migration velocity. These new results indicate that permeabilities obtained via XTM and the LBM are reliable and accurate; further work utilizing these methods is 414 415 promising and will bring us even closer to understanding the complex and significant event of core formation in planetesimals. The development of in-situ high pressure x-ray tomography 416 techniques allows for novel experiments to be conducted, including those that monitor the 417 evolution of a system undergoing deformation and reaction. These new techniques greatly 418 419 enhance the array of tools to investigate dynamic processes at high temperatures and pressures in 420 more detail and with more accuracy than previously available.

421

Acknowledgements: We would like to thank Jared Singer for assistance with the electron
microprobe at RPI, and E. Bruce Watson for use of the RPI experimental facilities to synthesize
the samples. We also thank Nico Walte and an anonymous reviewer for comments that improved
this paper. This work was supported by NSF grant GEO-1322022.

References

Alexander, C. O. D., Boss, A. P., & Carlson, R. W. (2001). The early evolution of the inner solar system: A meteoritic perspective. *Science*, 293(5527), 64-68.

Bagdassarov, N., Solferino, G., Golabek, G. J., & Schmidt, M. W. (2009a). Centrifuge assisted percolation of Fe–S melts in partially molten peridotite: time constraints for planetary core formation. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 288(1), 84-95.

Bagdassarov N., Golabek, G.J., Solferino, G., Schmidt, M.W. (2009b). Constraints on the Fe–S melt connectivity in mantle silicates from electrical impedance measurements. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 177, 139-146.

Ballhaus, C., & Ellis, D. J. (1996). Mobility of core melts during Earth's accretion. *Earth and planetary science letters*, 143(1), 137-145.

Bizzarro, M., Baker, J. A., Haack, H., & Lundgaard, K. L. (2005). Rapid timescales for accretion and melting of differentiated planetesimals inferred from 26Al-26Mg chronometry. *The Astrophysical Journal Letters*, 632(1), L41.

Bosl, W. J., Dvorkin, J., & Nur, A. (1998). A study of porosity and permeability using a lattice Boltzmann simulation. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 25(9), 1475-1478.

Bourbie, T., Zinzner, B. (1985). Hydraulic and acoustic properties as a function of porosity in Fontainebleau sandstone. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 90 (B3) 11,524-11532.

Bruhn, D., Groebner, N., & Kohlstedt, D. L. (2000). An interconnected network of core-forming melts produced by shear deformation. *Nature*, 403(6772), 883-886.

Bulau, J. R., H. S. Waff, and J. A. Tyburczy (1979), Mechanical and thermodynamic constraints on fluid distribution in partial melts, *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth* 84(B11), 6102–6108.

Burkhardt, C., Kleine, T., Bourdon, B., Palme, H., Zipfel, J., Friedrich, J. M., & Ebel, D. S. (2008). Hf–W mineral isochron for Ca, Al-rich inclusions: age of the solar system and the timing of core formation in planetesimals. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 72(24), 6177-6197.

Chen, S., & Doolen, G. D. (1998). Lattice Boltzmann method for fluid flows. *Annual review of fluid mechanics*, 30(1), 329-364.

Degruyter, W., Burgisser, A., Bachmann, O., & Malaspinas, O. (2010). Synchrotron X-ray microtomography and lattice Boltzmann simulations of gas flow through volcanic pumices. *Geosphere*, 6(5), 470-481.

Faul, U. H. (1997). Permeability of partially molten upper mantle rocks from experiments and percolation theory. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 102:B5, 10,299-10,311.

Gaetani, G. A., & Grove, T. L. (1999). Wetting of mantle olivine by sulfide melt: implications for Re/Os ratios in mantle peridotite and late-stage core formation. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 169(1), 147-163.

Gotou, H., Yagi, T., Iizuka, R., Suzuki, A. (2015) Application of X-ray radiography to study the segregation process of iron from silicate under high pressure and high temperature. High Pressure Research, 35(2), 130-138.

Groebner, N., & Kohlstedt, D. L. (2006). Deformation-induced metal melt networks in silicates: Implications for core–mantle interactions in planetary bodies. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 245(3), 571-580.

Holzheid, A., Schmitz, M. D., & Grove, T. L. (2000). Textural equilibria of iron sulfide liquids in partly molten silicate aggregates and their relevance to core formation scenarios. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 105(B6), 13555-13.

Hustoft, J. W., & Kohlstedt, D. L. (2006). Metal-silicate segregation in deforming dunitic rocks. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 7(2).

Kleine, T., Münker, C., Mezger, K., & Palme, H. (2002). Rapid accretion and early core formation on asteroids and the terrestrial planets from Hf–W chronometry. *Nature*, 418(6901), 952-955.

Kleine, T., Touboul, M., Bourdon, B., Nimmo, F., Mezger, K., Palme, H., & Halliday, A. N. (2009). Hf–W chronology of the accretion and early evolution of asteroids and terrestrial planets. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 73(17), 5150-5188.

Kohlstedt, D. L., & Mackwell, S. J. (1987). High-temperature stability of San Carlos olivine. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, *95*(2), 226-230.

Kohlstedt , D.L., and Holtzmann, B.K. (2009). Shearing melt out of the earth: An experimentalist's perspective on the influence of deformation on melt extraction. *Annual Reviews in Earth and Planetary Science*. 37: 561-93.

Kono, Y., Kenney-Benson, C., Shibazaki, Y., Park, C., Shen, G., Wang, Y. (2015). Highpressure viscosity of liquid Fe and FeS revisited by falling sphere viscometry using ultrafast Xray imaging. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*. 241, 57-64.

Latt, J. (2008). Choice of units in lattice Boltzamnn Simulation. *Lattice Boltzmann Howtos: http://www.lbmethod. org/howtos: main.*

Latt, J. (2009). Palabos, Parallel Lattice Boltzmann Solver. http://www.Palabos.com.

LeBlanc, G.E., Secco, R.A. (1996) Viscosity of an Fe-S liquid up to 1300øC and 5 GPa. Geophysical Research Letters. 23(3) 213-216.

Miller, K.J., Zhu, W., Montesi, L.G.J., Gaetani, G. (2014) Experimental quantification of permeability of partially molten mantle rock. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*. 388, 273-282.

Rivers, M.L., and Gualda, G.A.R., 2009, 'tomo_display' and 'vol_tools': IDL VM packages for tomography data reconstruction, processing, and visualization, Eos Transactions of AGU, Joint Assembly Supplement.

Roberts, J. J., Kinney, J. H., Siebert, J., & Ryerson, F. J. (2007). Fe-Ni-S melt permeability in olivine: Implications for planetary core formation. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 34(14).

Rubie, D. C., Nimmo, F., & Melosh, H. J. (2007). Formation of Earth's core. *Treatise on Geophysics*, 9, 51-90.

Rushmer, T., Petford, N., Humayun, M., & Campbell, A. J. (2005). Fe-liquid segregation in deforming planetesimals: Coupling core-forming compositions with transport phenomena. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 239(3), 185-202.

Scherstén, A., Elliott, T., Hawkesworth, C., Russell, S., & Masarik, J. (2006). Hf–W evidence for rapid differentiation of iron meteorite parent bodies. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 241(3), 530-542.

Shannon, M. C., & Agee, C. B. (1996). High pressure constraints on percolative core formation. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 23(20), 2717-2720.

Shi, C, Y., Zhang, L., Yang, W., Liu, Y., Wang, J., Meng, Y., Andrews, J.C., Mao, W.L. 2013. Formation of an interconnected network of iron melt at Earth's lower mantle conditions. *Nature Geoscience*, 6, 971-975.

Speziale, S., Zha, C., Duffy, T.S., Hemley, R.J., Mao, H.K. (2001). Quasi-hydrostatic compression of magnesium oxide to 52 GPa: Implications for the pressure-volume-temperature equation of state. *Journal of Geophysical Research, Solid Earth*. 106: B1, 515–528.

Takafuji, N., Hirose, K., Ono, S., Xu, F., Mitome, M., & Bando, Y. (2004). Segregation of core melts by permeable flow in the lower mantle. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 224(3), 249-257.

Terasaki, H., Frost, D. J., Rubie, D. C., & Langenhorst, F. (2008). Percolative core formation in planetesimals. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 273(1), 132-137.

Tucotte, D.L., Schubert, G.(2002) Geodynamics. Second ed. Cambridge University Press. New York, NY. USA.

Walte, N. P., Becker, J. K., Bons, P. D., Rubie, D. C., & Frost, D. J. (2007). Liquid-distribution and attainment of textural equilibrium in a partially-molten crystalline system with a high-dihedral-angle liquid phase. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 262(3), 517-532.

Walte, N.P., Rubie, D.C., Bons, P.D., Frost, D.J. (2011) Deformation of a crystalline aggregate with a small percentage of high-dihedral-angle liquid: Implications for core-mantle differentiation during planetary formation. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*. 305. 124-134.

Walter, M. J., & Trønnes, R. G. (2004). Early earth differentiation. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 225(3), 253-269.

Wang, Y., Uchida, T., Westferro, F., Rivers, M. L., Nishiyama, N., Gebhardt, J., ... & Sutton, S. R. (2005). High-pressure x-ray tomography microscope: Synchrotron computed microtomography at high pressure and temperature. *Review of scientific instruments*, 76(7), 073709-073709.

Wang, Y., Lesher, C., Fiquet, G., Rivers, M. L., Nishiyama, N., Siebert, J., ... & Guyot, F. (2011). In situ high-pressure and high-temperature X-ray microtomographic imaging during large deformation: A new technique for studying mechanical behavior of multiphase composites. *Geosphere*, 7(1), 40-53.

Watson, H.C. Roberts, J.J., Tyburczy, J.A. (2010) Effect of conductive impurities on electrical conductivity in polycrystalline olivine. *Geophysical Research Letters* 37(2) L02302, doi:10.1029/2009GL041566

Watson, H. C., & Roberts, J. J. (2011). Connectivity of core forming melts: Experimental constraints from electrical conductivity and X-ray tomography. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 186(3), 172-182.

White, J.A., Borja, R. I., Fredrich, J. T. (2006). Calculating the effective permeability of sandstone with multi-scale lattice Boltzmann/finite element simulations. Acta Geotechnica, 1, 195-209.

Wood, B. J., Walter, M. J., & Wade, J. (2006). Accretion of the Earth and segregation of its core. *Nature*, 441(7095), 825-833.

Yoshino, T., Walter, M. J., & Katsura, T. (2003). Core formation in planetesimals triggered by permeable flow. *Nature*, 422(6928), 154-157.

Yoshino, T., Walter, M.J., Katsura, T. (2004). Connectivity of molten Fe alloy in peridotite based on in situ electrical conductivity measurements: implications for core formation in terrestrial planets. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*. 222(2), 625-643.

Zhu, W. Hirth, G. (2003) A network model for permeability in partially molten rocks. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*. 212, 407-416.

Zhu, W., Gaetani, G., Fusseis, F., Montesi, L.G.J., De Carlo, F. 2011. Microtomography of partially molten rocks: Three dimensional melt distribution in mantle peridotite. *Science*. 332, 88-91.

24

Figure Captions

Figure 1. (a) $\frac{3}{4}$ " piston cylinder cell assembly used to synthesize the olivine + FeS starting material in a graphite capsule. (b) the assembly used for deformation experiments in the Drickamer cell.

Figure 2: Schematic illustration of the sample with the two directions of flow that permeability measurements were obtained from. The X-direction of flow is parallel to the axis of rotation, while the Z-direction is perpendicular.

Figure 3. BSE images of an undeformed sample and the deformed sample. (a) An undeformed sample and (b) the deformed sample, both sectioned parallel to the axis of rotation. The image of the deformed sample is from a location in the midpart of the sample (neither at the edge or at the center).

Figure 4. XTM image before and after binarization. (a) A gray-scale XTM image slice and (b) the same slice binarized. Melt is represented as the white areas, while non-melt (i.e. silicate matrix) is represented by black.

Figure 5. A binarized XTM image compared to a binarized BSE image. (a) Binarized XTM image of the sample deformed to 360° and (b) a binarized BSE image of the fully deformed sample. The texture and melt distribution in both images are very similar, indicating that the binarization process is successful in reproducing the sample texture.

Figure 6: Permeability vs. degrees of deformation for two experiments. The images depicting texture in this paper are all from the first experiment (labeled R1288). The second experiment was performed in an analogous manner, but experienced significantly more deformation. The resulting final textures are very similar between both experiments, and the permeability results are consistent within uncertainty.

Figure 7. Plot of melt fraction vs. permeability comparing the results of this work to previous work. The closed circle is permeability in the X-direction for this work (4.5 vol% melt) and the open circle is for the Z-direction, with each point being an average of the full volumes in each respective direction of flow. One permeability result is shown from Roberts et al. (2007) and six results are shown from Watson and Roberts (2011). The average of the nine permeabilities is represented by the horizontal dashed lines and the gray area represents one standard deviation from this average. The sample from Roberts et al. is 10 vol%, and the results from Watson and Roberts are \sim 4, \sim 6, and \sim 10 vol%. The uncertainties on the data point from Roberts et al. were not available.

Figure 8. Migration velocity plotted as a function of grain size at a melt volume of 4.5%. The vertical gray dashed line represents the minimum grain size necessary ($\sim 230 \,\mu m$) to attain the minimum migration velocity needed (3.3 cm/yr) in order for a small (100 km) planetesimal to fully differentiate within 3 My.

Figure 9: Permeability versus tubule diameter for an idealized geometry of cubic grains of different sizes with melt tubes along grain edges. Symbols represent results from lattice Boltzmann simulations run on idealized artificial volumes, and curves are calculations of the permeability from Darcy's law for this simplified geometry.

Figure 10: (a) BSE image of post-run sample (b) thresholded high resolution BSE image (c). Original BSE image again. (d) thresholding of the same image that has been artificially reduced in resolution to approximate the tomography results .

Tables

Table 1.

Electron Microprobe Results.

Oliv	ine (wt%) - D	eformed					
	SiO ₂	FeO	MgO	NiO	SO	Total	No. of Analyses
Average	40.10±0.28	10.55±0.26	50.28±0.24	0.04±0.01	0.04±0.03	101.02±0.16	54
Sulfide (wt%) - Deformed		-					
	Fe	S	Si	Mg	Ni	Total	No. of Analyses
	62.31±1.45	32.01±3.73	0.43±0.42	0.59±0.79	2.70±2.36	98.04±0.87	20
Oliviı	ne (wt%) - Un	deformed					
Olivin	ne (wt%) - Un SiO ₂	deformed FeO	MgO	NiO	SO	Total	No. of Analyses
Olivin	ne (wt%) - Un SiO ₂ 40.25±0.20	deformed FeO 10.70±0.08	MgO 50.58±0.09	NiO 0.05±0.01	SO 0.03±0.05	Total 101.61±0.21	No. of Analyses 44
Olivin Average Sulfic	ne (wt%) - Un SiO ₂ 40.25±0.20 le (wt%) - Un	deformed FeO 10.70±0.08 deformed	MgO 50.58±0.09	NiO 0.05±0.01	SO 0.03±0.05	Total 101.61±0.21	No. of Analyses 44
Olivin Average Sulfic	ne (wt%) - Un SiO2 40.25±0.20 le (wt%) - Un Fe	deformed FeO 10.70±0.08 deformed S	MgO 50.58±0.09 Si	NiO 0.05±0.01 Mg	SO 0.03±0.05 Ni	Total 101.61±0.21 Total	No. of Analyses 44 No. of Analyses

 σ = one standard deviation

Table 2.

X-Direction

Angle	Melt Fraction	σMF	Log(k)	σlog(k)
0	4.39	0.56	-14.04	0.05
180	4.53	0.89	-14.24	0.05
360	4.34	0.54	-14.21	0.04
540	4.37	0.48	-14.19	0.04
720	4.34	0.53	-14.24	0.08
840	4.20	0.61	-14.27	0.06
Z-Direc	tion			
0	4.32	0.85	-14.52	0.08
180	4.52	1.03	-14.74	0.09
360	4.42	0.68	-14.68	0.05
540	4.45	1.00	-14.78	0.07
720	4.46	1.02	-14.83	0.05
840	4.44	0.80	-14.69	0.11

Final Permeability Results for the Sample R1288 in the X- and Z-Directions.

 σ = one standard deviation.

Figures





Figure 1.



Figure 2.



Figure 3.

Grayscale XTM Image

Binarized XTM Image



Figure 4.



Figure 5.



Figure 6



Melt Fraction vs Permeability

Figure 7.

35



Figure 8.



Figure 9



Figure 10