1

REVISION	Ι
----------	---

2	Temperature dependences of the hyperfine parameters of $Fe^{2+}$ in $FeTiO_3$ as determined
3	by <sup>57</sup> Fe-Mössbauer spectroscopy
4	Antoine Van Alboom <sup>a</sup> and Eddy De Grave <sup>b</sup>
5	
6	<sup>a</sup> Department of Applied Physics, University of Ghent, Valentin Vaerwyckweg 1, B-9000 Gent,
7	Belgium, e-mail: toon.vanalboom@ugent.be
8	<sup>b</sup> Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Ghent, Proeftuinstraat 86, B-9000
9	Gent, Belgium

## 10 Abstract

1

The temperature variations of the ferrous Mössbauer parameters for a synthetic 11 12 ilmenite (FeTiO<sub>3</sub>) have been determined and interpreted over a very wide temperature range (5 K - 900 K). The Debye model of the lattice vibrations was used in interpreting the 13 14 temperature dependence of the center shift, yielding a characteristic Mössbauer temperature of  $350 \pm 20$  K and a zero-Kelvin intrinsic isomer shift of  $1.30 \pm 0.01$  mm/s. The temperature 15 16 dependence of the ferrous Mössbauer quadrupole splitting was interpreted using crystal field theory. A most adequate description of the experimental  $\Delta E_o(T)$  curve was obtained 17 assuming an energy shift of at the most ca.  $500 \pm 50 \text{ cm}^{-1}$  for the highest orbital  $T_{2g}$  level 18 relative to the lowest level within this  $T_{2g}$  triplet. The temperature dependence of the 19 hyperfine field was interpreted within the molecular field theory of magnetism assuming the 20 magnetic exchange energy being a function of inter-atomic spacing, indicating a first-order 21 22 magnetic transition at the magnetic-paramagnetic transition temperature of  $59.0 \pm 0.5$  K.

This detailed presentation of Mössbauer parameters as a function of temperature can serve as a basis for easily detecting ilmenite ore at for example the lunar surface and for

#### 2

monitoring by means of Mössbauer spectroscopy the reduction process of the mined mineral
with the purpose of supplying a future Moon base on site with oxygen and water.

27

Keywords: ilmenite, Mössbauer spectroscopy, hyperfine interactions, temperature variation,
Moon base

30

# INTRODUCTION

Ilmenite (FeTiO<sub>3</sub>) crystallizes in the trigonal system  $R\overline{3}$ , with the Fe<sup>2+</sup> site being 31 trigonally distorted (Barth and Posnjak 1934). The mineral orders antiferromagnetically below 32  $T_{\rm N} \approx 57$  K with spin direction along the *c*-axis (Grant et al. 1972, Kato et al. 1982). 33 34 Mössbauer spectra (MS) for FeTiO3 have been reported earlier by, e.g., Grant et al. 1972, 35 Syono et al. 1981, Ito et al. 1982, and Nakatshuka et al. 2010. Considering the axial point symmetry of the  $Fe^{2+}$  site, Grant et al. (1972) assumed the principal axis z of the electric field 36 gradient (EFG) to be parallel to c and hence to the direction of the hyperfine field  $B_{\rm hf}$ . Using 37 the typical Lorentzian- shaped six-line hyperfine pattern to fit their spectrum recorded at 5 K, 38 39 the authors found values of 4.3  $\pm$  0.3 T for the strength  $B_{\rm hf}$  of the magnetic hyperfine field and 1.44  $\pm$  0.01 mm/s for the quadrupole splitting constant  $\frac{1}{2}e^2qQ$ , with e the proton charge, eq =40  $V_{zz}$  the principal component of the EFG, and Q the nuclear quadrupole moment. Syono et al. 41 (1981) measured the quadrupole splitting  $\Delta E_{\rm O}$  for a synthetic FeTiO<sub>3</sub> sample at four different 42 temperatures, i.e., 4.2, ~80, ~200, and 300 K, respectively. They observed a moderate 43 increase in  $\Delta E_Q$  from ~0.65 mm/s at 300 K to ~1.0 mm/s at ~80 K, with subsequently a 44 relatively steep increase to 1.44 m/s at 4.2 K. They attributed the abrupt increase of  $\Delta E_Q$  at 45 low temperature to the effects of spin-orbit interaction and magnetic exchange interaction 46 upon the electronic energy levels within the ferrous orbital  $T_{2g}$  triplet ground state. Their 47

3

theoretical considerations predicted that the drastic increase of the quadrupole splitting 48 49 presumably takes place on lowering the temperature below about 25 K. Syono et al. (1981) further found for the hyperfine field  $B_{\rm hf}$  at 4.2 K the value of 5.6 T. In a Mössbauer and 50 neutron diffraction study of the  $Co_{1-x}Fe_xO_3$  system, Ito et al. (1982) found for sample x = 1.051 at 4.2 K values of 4.5  $\pm$  0.2 T for  $B_{\rm hf}$  and 1.42 mm/s for  $\frac{1}{2}e^2qQ$ . They reported  $\eta = 0$  for the 52 asymmetry parameter of the EFG tensor and  $\Omega = 0$  for the azimuthal angle of the direction of 53 the hyperfine field with respect to the EFG's principal axis z. More recently, Nakatsuka et al. 54 (2010) presented MS for a synthetic FeTiO3 powder at temperatures between room 55 temperature (RT) and 30 K. The paramagnetic spectra clearly show the presence of  $\sim 9\%$  Fe<sup>3+</sup> 56 57 cations which the authors attributed to the occurrence of inter-valence charge transfer between Fe and Ti cations. The Fe<sup>2+</sup>  $\Delta E_0$  was found to be 0.64 mm/s at RT and 1.41 ± 0.08 mm/s at 30 58 K. The hyperfine field  $B_{\rm hf}$  as deduced from diagonalization of the hyperfine-interaction 59 Hamiltonian was calculated to be  $4.6 \pm 0.2$  T. 60

Detailed and accurate experimental determinations of the ferrous hyperfine parameters 61 of FeTiO<sub>3</sub> over a wide temperature range have so far not been reported. In this study, 62 Mössbauer spectra for synthetic ilmenite, recorded at temperatures in the range from 5 K to 63 900 K, are presented and the temperature dependences of the various hyperfine parameters are 64 65 reported. In the case of trigonal symmetry, as for  $FeTiO_3$ , the temperature variation of the ferrous quadrupole splitting is primarily determined by the Boltzmann population of the lower 66  $T_{2g}$  levels of the ferrous <sup>5</sup>D spectroscopic term and therefore can provide information 67 concerning the positions and splittings of these levels. From various viewpoints within the 68 crystal field formalism, it is attempted to extract such information about the ferrous  ${}^{5}D T_{2g}$ 69 levels from the presently reported experimental results for the involved ilmenite species. The 70 temperature dependence of the hyperfine field is interpreted based on the modified molecular 71 field model developed by Bean and Rodbell (1962), which takes into account the effects of 72

4

magnetistriction on the magnetic exchange interactions. This model may gives indicationsconcerning the ordering of the magnetic moments.

- 75
- 76

## EXPERIMENTAL

77 The sample material was obtained by intimately mixing  $Fe_2O_3$  and  $TiO_2$  powders in stoichiometric proportions. The mixture of the oxides was sintered a first time for 4 hours at 78 900 °C in air, and a second time again for four hours at 1000 °C and also in air. After each 79 firing the obtained product was ball-milled for several hours with the aim of optimizing 80 homogeneity. The final mixture was pressed into a tablet under *ca.* 2 MPa, which was sintered 81 for 24 hours at 1200 °C in air. Subsequently, while temperature maintained at 1200 °C, a 82 reducing gas mixture consisting of 8 % H<sub>2</sub> and 92 % N<sub>2</sub> was blown through the furnace tube 83 84 during 48 hours. Powder X-ray diffraction showed that the finally obtained product was 85 single-phase FeTiO<sub>3</sub>.

Mössbauer spectra (MS) were collected in transmission geometry with the absorber 86 plane perpendicular to the  $\gamma$ -ray beam. "Large-area" <sup>57</sup>Co(Rh) sources with active diameter of 87 5 mm and initial activity of ~75 mCi (2.78 GBq), provided by Gamma-Lab Development S.L. 88  $^{\circ}$ , were used. All center shift values quoted hereafter, however, are relative to  $\alpha$ -Fe at room 89 temperature (RT). Two different time-mode spectrometers, for low and high temperatures, 90 respectively, each composed of Wissel GmbH<sup>©</sup> drive, detection and data-acquisition (CMCA-91 550) modules, were used. They operated under a triangular reference signal and were 92 93 experienced to exhibit excellent linearity. The absorber thickness was approximately 10 mg Fe per cm<sup>2</sup> and counts were accumulated in 1024 channels. Asymmetry in the line intensities 94 of the doublet spectra in the paramagnetic region was not observed, indicating that texture 95 effects were not occurring. For all spectra the velocity (v) increment per channel, as 96 determined from room-temperature spectra of a standard Fe foil at RT, was within the range 97

5

98  $0.0165 \pm 0.0005$  mm/s. Final off-resonance counts were usually ~10<sup>6</sup> per channel. The 99 temperature of the absorber was varied within the range 5 K – 300 K using the CF506 100 continuous flow cryostat with ITC4 temperature controller from Oxford Instruments<sup>©</sup> and 101 using a RICOR<sup>©</sup> Mössbauer furnace, type MF-2B, for temperatures in the range 300 - 900 K 102 equipped with in-house made temperature controller based on a chromel-alumel 103 thermocouple.

104

## RESULTS

Because the  $Fe^{2+}$  occupies only one crystallographic site in the ilmenite structure, it 105 could be expected that the MS at 5 K would be adequately reproduced by one set of values for 106 the Mössbauer parameters as assumed by Grant et al. (1972) and by Syono et al. (1981) see 107 Table 1). However, it was observed for the presently involved FeTiO<sub>3</sub> sample that the spectra 108 recorded at temperatures below the magnetic ordering temperature show a slight but 109 significant line broadening, presumably attributable to the occurrence of distributions on the 110 hyperfine parameters in particular as far as the hyperfine field  $B_{\rm hf}$  is concerned. Therefore, 111 112 MS acquired at temperatures below the transition point were numerically analyzed by modelindependent hyperfine field distributions (Vandenberghe et al. 1994) using in-house 113 developed software based on the IMSL FORTRAN library optimizer routine ZXSSO. 114 Because the involved parameters concern Fe<sup>2+</sup> species, each of the composing elemental 115 116 subcomponents was calculated by diagonalization of the full nuclear interaction Hamiltonian 117 (Hoy and Chandra 1967). Possible distributions on the other hyperfine parameters were taken into account by assuming linear correlations between B<sub>hf</sub> on the one hand and the center shift 118 ( $\delta$ ), the quadrupole splitting ( $\Delta E_O$ ), the zenithal angle ( $\Omega$ ) between the direction of  $B_{\rm hf}$  and the 119 axis of the principal component  $(V_{zz})$  of the diagonalized electric field gradient tensor (EFG) 120 and the asymmetry parameter ( $\eta$ ) of the EFG at the other hand, respectively. As also observed 121

6

in earlier studies (Grant et al. 1972, Syono et al. 1981, Ito et al. 1982), the MS were only very weakly dependent on the azimuthal angle ( $\Psi$ ) of the direction of  $B_{hf}$  with respect to the EFG axis system, and therefore in the final calculation of the MS, this angle was fixed to zero. A selection of the results (with highest probability in the respective distributions) of the parameters yielding the best agreement between calculated and experimental spectra (see Figure 1) are given in Table 1 (T = 5 K). A full list of these results is available as supplementary material.

129 The paramagnetic MS of the present ilmenite sample were found to be somewhat 130 broadened, however only to an extent that can reasonably be expected for a synthetic 131 polycrystalline oxide powder. Nevertheless, for the sake of consistency and for practical 132 reasons, the authors preferred to numerically analyze these spectra by model-independent quadrupole splitting distributions. A possible distribution of the center shift was taken into 133 account by imposing a linear correlation of  $\delta$  with  $\Delta E_{\rm Q}$ . The adjusted parameter values (with 134 135 highest probability in the corresponding distribution profiles) at some selected temperatures 136 are indicated in Table 1 and for a complete list of the results at all temperatures applied in this 137 study the reader is referred to the supplementary material. Examples of experimental and calculated spectra are reproduced in Figure 2. It is to be noted at this stage that no indication 138 whatsoever for the presence of any significant fraction of  $Fe^{3+}$  in the structure can be noticed. 139

For verification, direct information about the asymmetry parameter  $\eta$  was also derived by analyzing a MS that was acquired at 80 K in an external magnetic field of 6 T with orientation parallel to the incident  $\gamma$ -rays. Satisfying agreement between the calculated and experimental spectra (see Figure 3) was obtained for the Mössbauer parameter values as reported in Table 1, with  $\eta = 0.20 \pm 0.05$  and the positive sign of  $V_{zz}$ , thus being consistent with the results from the low-temperature magnetic MS. The anisotropic field-reduction quantities, occurring in the theoretical treatment of the effect of an external field acting at the

7

147 Mössbauer nuclei (Varret 1976), were calculated as 
$$HIZ = -1.4$$
 T,  $HIY = -3.7$  T, and  $HIX =$   
148 -2.0 T (errors: ~0.3 T).

Considering the complexity of the reported Mössbauer spectra, the adjusted parameter values of the ilmenite species determined in this study are generally closely in line with those reported earlier (Grant et al. 1972, Syono et al. 1981, Ito et al. 1982, Nakatshuka et al. 2010).

152

## DISCUSSION

## 153 Analysis of the temperature dependence of the center shift.

The temperature variation of the center shift  $\delta$  is plotted in Figure 4. Generally the quantity  $\delta$ 154 155 consists of two contributions (De Grave and Van Alboom, 1991; Eeckhout and De Grave, 2003a). The first one is the intrinsic isomer shift ( $\delta_i$ ), which is determined by the s-electron 156 density at the probe iron nuclei. In a first approximation,  $\delta_1$  exhibits a slight temperature 157 variation:  $\delta_1(T) = \delta_1(0) + \alpha \cdot 10^{-5}T$  as a result of the thermal expansion of the  $T_{2g}$  and  $E_g$  wave 158 159 functions of the iron probes (Perkins and Hazony 1972). The second contribution to the center shift is the second-order Doppler shift ( $\delta_{\text{NOD}}$ ), which arises from the non-zero squared velocity 160 of the emitting and absorbing <sup>57</sup>Fe nuclei. Its value is strongly dependent on temperature as 161 being related to the vibrational properties of the probe ions in the crystal structure. Within the 162 Debye approximation for the lattice vibrational spectrum,  $\delta_{SOD}$  can be calculated in terms of 163 the so-called characteristic Mössbauer temperature,  $\Theta_M$ , yielding the expression (Pound and 164 Rebka 1960): 165

166

$$\delta_{SOD} = -\frac{9k_B\Theta_M}{16Mc} \left[ 1 + 8\left(\frac{T}{\Theta_M}\right)^4 \int_0^{\frac{\Theta_M}{T}} \frac{x^3}{e^x - 1} dx \right].$$
(1)

167 where  $k_{\rm B}$  and M are the Boltzmann constant and the mass of the <sup>57</sup>Fe nucleus, respectively. 168  $\Theta_{\rm M}$  is related to the well-known Debye temperature of the lattice. The values of  $\delta_{\rm I}(0)$ ,  $\alpha$  and

8

 $\Theta_{\rm M}$  can be obtained by adjusting the theoretical expression for  $\delta(T)$  to the experimental 169 values, yielding  $\delta_1(0) = 1.30 \pm 0.01$  mm/s,  $\alpha = -1.7 \pm 0.1$  mm/(sK) and  $\Theta_M = 350 \pm 20$  K 170 respectively. The solid curve in Figure 4 represents the corresponding calculated temperature 171 variation. The result for  $\Theta_M$  is well in line with a general trend that  $Fe^{2+}$  Mössbauer 172 temperatures lie between *ca*. 300 K and *ca*. 400 K, while  $Fe^{3+}$  species commonly exhibit 173 values close to or exceeding 500 K (De Grave and Van Alboom, 1991; Eeckhout and De 174 Grave 2003a). The value for the thermal coefficient  $\alpha$  is close to the value that was found for 175 176 triphylite, *i.e.*, -1.1 mm/(sK) (Van Alboom et al. 2011), and in absolute value somewhat lower than -6.5 mm/(sK) in eosphorite (Van Alboom et al. 2015) and -4.5 mm/(sK) obtained for 177 hedenbergite (Eeckhout and De Grave 2003b). As has already been remarked in Van Alboom 178 179 et al. (2015), generally the parameter  $\alpha$  is ill defined because of the extremely small misfit 180 effects it corrects for (in particular only at relatively high temperatures) and the strong interference with the parameter  $\Theta_{\rm M}$  in determining the goodness-of-fit of the calculated  $\delta(T)$ 181 curve. From the Mössbauer temperature, information can be extracted about the iron 182 Mössbauer recoil-free fraction within the Debye model of the lattice vibrations (Dyar et al. 183 2007, 2008 and 2013). 184

## 185 Interpretations of the temperature dependence of the quadrupole splitting.

In Figure 5, the quadrupole splitting  $\Delta E_Q$  as a function of temperature *T* is plotted for the presently studied ilmenite species. In their calculations concerning  $\Delta E_Q(T)$ , Syono et al. (1981) modeled the temperature dependence using the equivalence principle of  $T_{2g}$ - and *P*states (Ballhausen 1962). Within this formalism, they found a steep increase of the quadrupole splitting at decreasing temperature below about 25 K. Contrary to this finding the presently observed increase of the quadrupole splitting with decreasing *T* between 120 K and 5 K is not as abrupt as observed or calculated by those authors below *ca*. 25 K. Instead, it is noticed that

9

193  $\Delta E_Q$  increases gradually as temperature lowers from 900 K to *ca.* 120 K, showing a 194 subsequent stronger increase in going from *ca.* 120 K to *ca.* 25 K and then reaching a 195 saturation value of ~1.44 mm/s below ~25 K (see Figure 5).

196 Generally 
$$\Delta E_Q$$
 may be written as:

197 
$$\Delta E_{Q} = \frac{1}{2} e Q |V_{zz}| \sqrt{1 + \frac{\eta^{2}}{3}}$$
 (2)

where Q is the nuclear quadrupole moment of <sup>57</sup>Fe, e the proton charge and  $\eta = \frac{V_{xx} - V_{yy}}{V_{xx}}$  the 198 asymmetry parameter of the diagonalized electric field gradient (EFG) tensor, with diagonal 199 elements  $V_{xx}$ ,  $V_{yy}$  and  $V_{zz}$  ordered as  $V_{zz} > V_{xx} \ge V_{yy}$ . The EFG axes system is commonly 200 chosen so that  $0 \le \eta \le 1$ , thus limiting the contribution of  $\eta$  to the value of  $\Delta E_Q$  to maximum 201 of ca. 15%. Therefore,  $\Delta E_Q$  is mainly determined by the value of  $V_{zz}$  and much less by  $\eta$ . The 202 value of  $\Delta E_Q$  depends on the crystallographic coordination of the Fe<sup>2+</sup> ion, which is reflected 203 in the values of  $V_{\rm zz.}$  and  $\eta$ , both quantities being composed of a valence and a lattice 204 contribution (Van Alboom et al. 2015). In most cases, the lattice contributions are small 205 206 compared to the valence contributions and both have the opposite sign (Ingalls 1964).

The valence contributions to  $V_{zz}$  and  $\eta$  are determined by the Boltzmann occupation of the <sup>5</sup>D orbital levels, the positions of which can be obtained from crystal field theory using symmetry considerations dictated by the local Fe<sup>2+</sup> coordination. Taking the symmetry of the Fe<sup>2+</sup>-site into account, therefore the splitting of the  $T_{2g}$  levels can be determined from the temperature variation of  $\Delta E_Q$  (Ingalls 1964).

Within the crystal field model, the <sup>5</sup>*D* level scheme can be obtained by diagonalization of the crystal field Hamiltonian  $\hat{H}_{cf}$ . For trigonal symmetry  $\hat{H}_{cf}$  can be expressed in the equivalent operator notation (Hutchings 1964) as:

215 
$$\widehat{H}_{cf} = -\frac{2}{3}B_4(\widehat{0}^0_4 + 20\sqrt{2}\,\widehat{0}^3_4) + B_2^0\widehat{0}^0_2.$$
(3)

where the operators  $\widehat{O}_{n}^{m}$  (n = 2 and 4; m = 0 and 3) are the Stevens' equivalent operators of the related tesseral harmonics. The *B* coefficients depend on the charges and the relative positions of the ligands in the coordination of the Fe<sup>2+</sup> probe. Spin-orbit interaction can be taken into account by adding the term  $\lambda \widehat{L}\widehat{S}$  to the right side of Equation 3, with  $\widehat{L}$  and  $\widehat{S}$  the orbital and spin operators respectively and  $\lambda$  the spin-orbit interaction coefficient (Ballhausen 1962).

Due to the trigonal elongation of the Fe<sup>2+</sup>-site in ilmenite and the high-spin state of the Fe<sup>2+</sup>, the lower <sup>5</sup>D  $T_{2g}$  triplet is split into a lower doublet and a higher singlet (with orbital splitting  $\Delta_1$  relative to the doublet ground level), this being confirmed by the observed positive sign of  $V_{zz}$  (see Table 1). For trigonal symmetry, the EFG asymmetry parameter  $\eta$ equals zero and in a good approximation, neglecting spin-orbit effects, the valence contribution (subscript val) to  $\Delta E_Q$  can then be expressed as (Ingalls 1964):

228 
$$\Delta E_{Q,val}(T) = \Delta E_0 \frac{\left(2\beta^2 - \alpha^2\right) - \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_1}{k_B T}\right)}{2 + \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_1}{k_B T}\right)} , \quad (4)$$

where  $k_B$  is the Boltzmann constant,  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$  mixing coefficients of the  $d_{ij}$  wave functions and 229 230  $\Delta E_0$  the so-called zero-Kelvin axial valence term. In Equation 4,  $\Delta_1$  is primarily determined by  $B_2^0$  and to much less extent by  $B_4$ . The value of  $B_4$  is directly related to the cubic splitting 231 10Dq in an octahedral crystal field ( $10Dq = 120B_4$ ). Adjustment of Equation 4 to the 232 experimental  $\Delta E_Q(T)$  values for  $T \ge 80$  K yields a reasonable reproduction for temperatures 233 234 exceeding ca. 120 K (see the blue dashed curve in Fig. 5). However, the observed relative 235 sharp increase of the experimental  $\Delta E_Q$  values on further lowering the temperature below 236  $\sim$ 120 K is by far not predicted by the model. This finding suggests that an additional T

237 dependent contribution to  $\Delta E_Q$  appears at low temperatures as the result of the Boltzmann 238 occupation of intermediately lying  $T_{2g}$  energy levels resulting from a further splitting of the 239 doublet ground level due to spin-orbit interaction.

Adding the spin-orbit term to  $\widehat{H}_{cf}$  in Equation 2 and adjusting  $B_2^0$  and the spin-orbit 240 interaction coefficient  $\lambda$  so that the corresponding <sup>5</sup>D level scheme leads to the calculated 241 242  $\Delta E_{0}(T)$  curve giving the best agreement with the experimental values below 300 K, yields the green fine curve in Figure 5. By this method, a more adequate accordance between 243 244 calculated and experimental  $\Delta E_0(T)$  values is obtained at low temperatures. However for higher temperatures the agreement is less satisfying. From these calculations, it is concluded 245 246 that the combined effect of the trigonal symmetry of the crystal field and the spin-orbit 247 interaction alone is not sufficient to interpret the observed  $\Delta E_Q(T)$  dependence fully. Also the asymmetry of the EFG cannot be understood in this case. The observation that  $\eta \neq 0$  implies a 248 deviation from axial symmetry and consequently to a further lowering of the symmetry of the 249  $Fe^{2+}$  coordination, thus splitting the  $T_{2g}$  triplet in three distinct orbital levels. For such a case, 250 within crystal field theory and neglecting spin-orbit coupling, the valence contributions to the 251 252 quadrupole splitting can be calculated by (Ingalls 1964):

253 
$$\Delta E_{Q,val,zz}(T) = \Delta E_0 \frac{1 - \frac{1}{2} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_1}{k_B T}\right) - \frac{1}{2} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_2}{k_B T}\right)}{1 + \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_1}{k_B T}\right) + \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_2}{k_B T}\right)} \quad \text{and}$$
(5)

254 
$$\Delta E_{Q,val,\eta}(T) = 3 \Delta E_0 \frac{\frac{1}{2} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_1}{k_B T}\right) - \frac{1}{2} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_2}{k_B T}\right)}{1 + \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_1}{k_B T}\right) + \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta_2}{k_B T}\right)}$$
(6)

Taking into account that  $\eta \le 0.36$  experimentally (see Table 1), the valence contribution of  $\eta$ to  $\Delta E_Q$  is at most only *ca.* 2.1 % (neglecting the lattice contribution to  $\eta$ ) as can be verified from Equation 1. As such, the temperature dependence of  $\Delta E_Q$  is mainly determined by the valence contribution of  $V_{zz}$ . Adjusting the theoretical  $\Delta E_Q(T)$  curve using Equations 2, 5, and

11/18

6 to the experimental data finally provides an adequate agreement between the experimental 259 and calculated  $\Delta E_0(T)$  values (see the pink bold curve in Fig. 5) and yields for the  $T_{2g}$ -260 splittings the values of  $\Delta_1 = 80 \pm 10$  cm<sup>-1</sup> and  $\Delta_2 = 500 \pm 50$  cm<sup>-1</sup> for the two higher orbital 261 levels relative to the lowest level. The value of  $\Delta E_0$  was adjusted to be 1.54  $\pm$  0.01 mm/s. 262 Lattice contributions were adjusted to values less than 0.1 mm/s in absolute value and are 263 therefore of minor importance. It is noted here that spin-orbit interaction also causes splitting 264 of the orbital levels in non-degenerate sublevels, however the influence of this splitting is 265 apparently not noticed in the observed  $\Delta E_0(T)$ . The calculated values ( $\eta < 0.10$ ) of the 266 asymmetry parameter are small but different from zero. Within the approximations used in 267 this approach and considering that the contribution of  $\eta$  values smaller than 0.36 to  $\Delta E_{\rm O}$  is at 268 269 the most ca. 2.1 % (neglecting lattice contributions – see above), one may infer that the experimental values of  $\eta$  are only qualitatively explained using this model. Although the 270 asymmetry of the EFG is clear from the Mössbauer analysis, the reason of this asymmetry 271 could not be detected nor verified by other research techniques e.g. x-ray diffraction. 272

273 Within crystal field theory, a more general theoretical treatment of the temperature dependence of  $\Delta E_O$  can be performed by a point-charge model as described earlier by Van 274 275 Alboom et al. (2015). In making such calculation for the present ilmenite, using the structural data of ilmenite given by Wechsler and Prewitt (1984) and taking spin-orbit interaction into 276 account, it was, however, not possible to reproduce the temperature dependence of  $\Delta E_O$ 277 278 satisfactorily with acceptable values of the parameters appearing in the model. On the other hand, a reasonably precise description of the temperature dependence of  $\Delta E_Q$  was obtained 279 (closely following the pink curve in Fig. 5) based on an acceptable  ${}^{5}D$  level scheme, for which 280 281 the corresponding values of the model parameters seem to be unreasonable in view of 282 theoretical values for these parameters as reported in literature (see, e.g., Van Alboom et al.

This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. (DOI will not work until issue is live.) DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2138/am-2016-5262

11/18

13

283 2015). A possible reason for these findings can be attributed to the occurrence of covalency 284 effects, which indeed cannot be adequately described within the crystal field model. Another 285 reason can be found in vibronic effects as a result of orbit-lattice interactions as suggested to 286 occur for  $Fe^{2+}$  in other trigonally distorted octahedral sites with a doublet ground state (see 287 Eeckhout et al. 1999 and references therein).

288 In summary, crystal field calculations with the inclusion of a spin-orbit interaction term alone are not able to provide an acceptable interpretation of the observed  $\Delta E_{O}(T)$ 289 290 dependence over the full temperature range applied in this work. However, the calculations as presented in this section suggest that the non-degenerate sublevels of the  ${}^{5}D T_{2g}$  triplet are 291 most probably spread over an energy band of ca.  $500 \pm 50$  cm<sup>-1</sup> relative to the lowest level. 292 The creation of such a band of energy levels is believed to be due to additional effects such as, 293 294 e.g., spin-orbit interaction, covalency effects, vibronic coupling, etc. The Boltzmann 295 occupation of these various levels may explain, at least qualitatively, the temperature 296 variation of the observed  $\Delta E_0(T)$ . It is plausible that, as a consequence of this occupation, 297  $\Delta E_{\rm O}$  at first increases very gradually as temperature lowers to ca. 120 K, subsequently shows 298 a stronger increase on further decreasing the temperature, and finally reaches a saturation 299 value at and below ca. 25 K. It should be mentioned at this point that the steeper increase 300 below  $\sim 120$  K was not observed earlier and hence not predicted at all by, e.g., Grant et al. 301 (1972) or by Syono et al. (1981).

# 302

#### **Analysis of the temperature dependence of the hyperfine field.**

FeTiO<sub>3</sub> is known as a layer-type antiferromagnet (Kato et al. 1986). Following the molecular field theory of magnetism and assuming the Mössbauer magnetic hyperfine field to be proportional to the magnetization, the temperature variation of the hyperfine field,  $B_{hf}(T)$ , in an antiferromagnetic substance is generally reasonably described by a Brillouin curve (Morrish 1965): This is a preprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineralogist (MSA) Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. (DOI will not work until issue is live.) DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2138/am-2016-5262

11/18

308 
$$B_{hf}(T) = B_{hf}(0) \times B_S(x)$$
 (7)

with  $B_{hf}(0)$  the saturation value of the hyperfine field and  $B_S(x)$  the Brillouin function for magnetic spin moment S = 2 for Fe<sup>2+</sup>. The argument x is given by

311 
$$x = \frac{2T_N}{T} \frac{B_{hf}(T)}{B_{hf}(0)}.$$
 (8)

At low temperatures, depending on the material, the magnetic moments of the 312 magnetic ions show long range ordering, and the hyperfine field then reaches its saturation 313 value. Due to thermal randomization, the magnetic ordering becomes more and more 314 disturbed at increasing temperature. The Brillouin curve describes the related decrease of the 315 316 hyperfine field at increasing temperature in the case of a rigid lattice for which the magnetic interaction is assumed to be independent of lattice spacing. At a certain temperature (the so-317 called Néel temperature  $T_{\rm N}$ ) the magnetic ordering has totally vanished and the hyperfine field 318 becomes zero without discontinuity. Such a transformation is known to be of second order. 319 However, this general molecular field theory has proven to be deficient in describing the 320 observed temperature variation of the hyperfine field for many Fe<sup>2+</sup>-bearing substances. 321 322 including ilmenite as experienced in the present study.

323 A refinement of the classical general molecular field theory is provided by the model of Bean and Rodbell (1962). These authors assume that the magnetic exchange energy is a 324 function of the inter-atomic spacing. As a consequence, a kind of thermal hysteresis in a 325 narrow temperature range around the transition temperature is induced: the temperature at 326 which the field becomes zero in crossing from the antiferromagnetic to the paramagnetic 327 state, is slightly different from the temperature at which the hyperfine field becomes non-zero 328 when temperature decreases in going from the paramagnetic to the antiferromagnetic state. 329 Again assuming proportionality between hyperfine field and sublattice magnetization and S =330

11/18

2, application of the Bean-Rodbell model to  $Fe^{2+}$  in ilmenite leads to the following expression for the argument *x* of the Brillouin function  $B_{\rm S}(x)$  in Equation 8:

333 
$$x = \left[2 + \frac{13b\eta_{BR}}{15} \frac{B_{hf}^2(T)}{B_{hf}^2(0)}\right] \frac{T_N}{T} \frac{B_{hf}(T)}{B_{hf}(0)}.$$
 (9)

where the quantity  $\eta_{BR}$  is a measure of the departure from an ideal second-order magnetic 334 transition. Values for  $\eta_{BR}$  exceeding 1 indicate first-order transitions. Values below or equal 335 to 1 indicate second-order transitions. In the case of a rigid lattice, the value for  $\eta_{\rm BR}$  equals 336 zero and the variation of  $B_{hf}(T)$  then follows the classical Brillouin curve. This theory of Bean 337 and Rodbell predicts that, in the case of a first-order transition ( $\eta_{BR} > 1$ ), the hyperfine field 338 decreases less rapidly with increasing temperature as compared with the comparable rigid 339 system. Hence, the hyperfine field will be different from zero when the Néel temperature of 340 the comparable rigid system is reached. When temperature further increases, at a certain 341 somewhat higher temperature the hyperfine field falls discontinuously to zero. This is 342 demonstrated by the calculated curve in Figure 6, which adequately describes the observed 343 variation of the hyperfine field for  $\text{Fe}^{2+}$  in the present ilmenite. The value of  $\eta_{\text{BR}}$  was found to 344 345 be  $1.56 \pm 0.05$ , implying the magnetic transformation to be of first-order. The corresponding calculated value for  $T_{\rm N}$  is 57.1  $\pm$  0.5 K. However, as expected for a first-order transition 346 following the model of Bean and Rodbell, the hyperfine field falls discontinuously to zero at a 347 somewhat higher temperature, here  $59.0 \pm 0.5$  K, as can be noticed from Figure 6. In contrary 348 349 to Kato et al. (1982), the magnetic transformation of first order in the present ilmenite extends to the all temperatures  $T \le 59.0 \pm 0.5$  K. Further research is planned to confirm these results. 350

11/18

# IMPLICATIONS

353	FeTiO <sub>3</sub> is a common accessory mineral in many terrestrial igneous and metamorphic rocks,
354	and it also occurs in sedimentary deposits on earth (Bowles 2011). It is the most important
355	source of titanium and supplies source material to the large $TiO_2$ pigment industry as well as
356	to the very significant and growing titanium sponge/metal market (Choudhury et al. 2013).
357	Ilmenite is also important for other industries, for example electronics (Raghavender et al.
358	2013, Yan et al. 2010), and for medical applications (Balazic et al. 2007).
359	Ilmenite is also an abundant component of many lunar rocks (Bowles 2011), even to that
360	extent that it is the subject of research to extract Fe, Ti and O <sub>2</sub> from lunar ilmenite on the
361	Moon itself for use in a Moon base (Schwandt et al. 2012) and to produce $H_2O$ for human
362	habitation by reducing lunar ilmenite (Li et al. 2012).
363	To make use of the ilmenite source on the Moon, knowledge about locations with a high
364	ilmenite abundance on the lunar surface is prerequesite. In addition to high-resolution UV-
365	VIS mapping of the lunar surface (Robinson et al. 2007), Mössbauer spectroscopy can play an
366	important role in establishing ilmenite-rich places (Klingelhöfer 2012), because the mineral
367	can be easily identified by its characteristic Mössbauer spectrum, which in the paramagnetic
368	state is only determined by the center shift and the quadrupole splitting of the $Fe^{2+}$ in its
369	structure. Following the experiences gained on the martian surface by the Mimos II
370	spectrometer during the Mars Exploration Rover mission of 2003, Klingelhöfer (2012)
371	proposes to mount a Mössbauer instrument on a lunar rover, which would allow to search for
372	ilmenite very effectively. Using Mössbauer spectroscopy in searching for locations of
373	ilmenite-rich places on the Moon surface, the ferrous center shift and quadrupole splitting
374	data would be of crucial importance. Also their temperature dependences will be very
375	important parameters, because it is known that temperatures at the surface of the Moon can

1	
- 1	1

376	change drastically, depending on where the sun is shining, ranging from about 100 degrees C
377	at daytime to -173 degrees C at night.

- 378 Mössbauer spectroscopy could also be applied in situ to monitor the degree of reduction of
- ilmenite during the oxygen production process (Klingelhöfer 2012). The presented values of
- the Mössbauer parameters will be also very helpful in monitoring this process.
- In summary, measured values of the center shift and the quadrupole splitting for ilmenite as
- presented in this paper therefore can be very conclusive for the identification of Lunar
- ilmenite and have previously never been reported over such a wide temperature range nor in
- such a large number of different temperatures.

## 385 Acknowledgments

386 This work was funded by the Fund for Scientific Research – Flanders, Belgium.

387

## 388 **References cited**

- Ballhausen, C. J. (1962) Introduction to ligand field theory. McGraw-Hill Book Company,
  Inc., New-York.
- Barth, T. F. M., and Posnjak, E. (1934) The crystal structure of ilmenite. Zeitschrift für
- 392 Krystallographie, 88, 265-70.
- Balazic, M., Kopac, J., Jackson, M.J., and Ahmed, W. (2007) Review: titanium and titanium
- alloy applications in medicine. International Journal of Nano and Biomaterials 1, 3-34.
- Bean, C.P., and Rodbell D.S. (1962) Magnetic disorder as a first-order phase transformation.
- 396 Physical Review, 126, 104-115.

- 397 Bowles, J.F.W. (2011) Ilmenite. In Rock-Forming Minerals: Non-Silicates: Oxides,
- Hydroxides and Sulphides, Eds.: Deer, Howie and Zussman, Volume 5A (Second Edition),
- 399 The Geological Society of London, UK.
- 400 Choudhury, R.N.P., Pati, B., Das, P.R., Dash, R.R., and Paul, A. (2013) Development of
- 401 Electronic and Electrical Materials from Indian Ilmenite. Journal of Electronic Materials,
- 402 42(4), 769-782.
- 403 De Grave, E., and Van Alboom, A. (1991) Evaluation of ferrous and ferric Mössbauer
- 404 fractions. Physics and Chemistry of Minerals, 18, 337-342.
- 405 Dyar, M.D., Klima, R.L., Lindsley, D., and Pieters, C.M. (2007) Effects of differential
- 406 recoil-free fraction on ordering and site occupancies in Mössbauer spectroscopy of
- 407 orthopyroxenes. American Mineralogist, 92, 424-428.
- 408 Dyar, M.D., Klima, R.E., Fleagle, A., and Peel, S.E. (2013) Fundamental Mössbauer
- 409 parameters of synthetic Ca-Fe-Mg pyroxenes. American Mineralogist, 98, 1172-1186.
- 410 Dyar, M.D., Schaefer, M.W., Sklute, E.C., and Bishop, J.L. (2008) Mössbauer spectroscopy
- 411 of phyllosilicates: Effects of fitting models on recoil-free fractions and redox ratios. Clay
- 412 Minerals, 43, 3-33.
- 413 Eeckhout, S.G., and De Grave, E. (2003a) Evaluation of ferrous and ferric Mossbauer
- 414 fractions. Part II. Physics and Chemistry of Minerals, 30 (3), 142-146.
- 415 Eeckhout, S.G., and De Grave, E. (2003b) Fe-57 Mossbauer-effect studies of Ca-rich, Fe-
- bearing clinopyroxenes: Part I. Paramagnetic spectra of magnesian hedenbergite. American
- 417 Mineralogist, 88, 1129-1137.

- 418 Eeckhout, S.G., De Grave, E., Vochten, R., and Blaton, N.M. (1999). Mössbauer effect study
- of anapaite,  $Ca_2Fe^{2+}(PO_4)_2.4H_2O$ , and of its oxidation products. Physics and Chemistry of
- 420 Minerals, 26, 506-512.
- 421 Grant, R.W., Housley, R.M., and Geller, S. (1972) Hyperfine interactions of Fe<sup>2+</sup> in ilmenite.
- 422 Physical Review B5, 1700-1706.
- 423 Hoy, G.R., and Chandra, S. (1967) Effective Field Parameters in Iron Mössbauer
- 424 Spectroscopy. Journal of Chemical Physics, 47, 961-965.
- 425 Hutchings, M.T. (1964) Point-charge calculations of energy levels of magnetic ions in
- 426 crystalline electric fields. Solid State Physics, 16, 227-273.
- Ingalls, R. (1964) Electric-field gradient tensor in ferrous compounds. Physical Review,
  133(3A), 787-795.
- 429 Ito, A., Morimoto, S., Someya, Y., and Ikeda, H. (1982) Mössbauer and neutron diffraction
- 430 studies of competing magnetic orderings in random mixtures: Co<sub>1-x</sub>Fe<sub>x</sub>TiO<sub>3</sub>. Solid State
- 431 Communications, 41(7), 507-510.
- 432 Kato, H., Yamada, M., Yamauchi, H., Hiroyoshi, H., Takei, H., and Watanabe, H. (1982)
- 433 Metamagnetic phase transitions in FeTiO<sub>3</sub>. Journal of the Physical Society of Japan, 51(6),
- 434 1769-1777.
- 435 Kato, H., Yamaguchi, Y., Yamada, M., Funahashii, S., Nakagawa, Y., and Takei, H. (1986)
- 436 Neutron scattering study of magnetic excitations in oblique easy-axis antiferromagnet FeTiO<sub>3</sub>.
- 437 Journal of Physics C: Solid State Physics, 19, 6993-7011.
- 438 Klingelhöfer, G. (2012). Extraterrestrial Mössbauer spectroscopy. In: The Rudolf Mössbauer
- 439 Story. Eds.: Kalvius, M., and Kienle, P., Springer-Verlag, Berlin Heidelberg.

- 440 Li, Y., Li, X., Wang, S., Tang, H., Gan, H., Li, S., Wei, G., Zheng, Y., Tsang, K.T., and
- 441 Ouyang, Z. (2012) In-Situ Water Production by Reducing Ilmenite. In: Moon: Prospective
- 442 Energy and Material Resources, Ed.: Badescu, V., Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg.
- 443 Morrish, A.H. (1965) The Physical Principles of Magnetism, Wiley, New-York.
- 444 Nakatsuka, D., Fujii, T., Nakanishi, M., and Takada, J. (2010) Synthesis of Ge substituted
- ilmenite and their magnetic and electronic properties. Journal of Physics: Conference Series
- 446 200, 012144.
- 447 Perkins, H.K., and Hazony, Y. (1972) Temperature-dependent crystal field and charge
- density: Mossbauer studies of FeF<sub>2</sub>, KFeF<sub>3</sub>, FeCl<sub>2</sub>, and FeF<sub>3</sub>. Physical Review B, 5, 7-18.
- 449 Pound, R.V., and Rebka, G.A.Jr. (1960) Variation with temperature of the energy of recoil
- 450 free gamma rays from solids. Physical Review Letters, 4, 274-277.
- 451 Raghavender, A.T., Hong, N.H., Lee, K.J., Jung, M., Skoko, Z., Cerqueira, M.F.,
- 452 Samantilleke, A.P., and Vasilevskiy, M. (2013) Nano-ilmenite FeTiO: Synthesis and
- 453 characterization. Journal of Magnetism and Magnetic Materials 331, 129–132.
- 454 Robinson, M.S., Hapke, B.W., Garvin, J.B., Skillman, D., Bell III, J.F., Ulmer, M.P., and
- 455 Pieters, C.M. (2007). High resolution mapping of TiO<sub>2</sub> abundances on the Moon using the
- 456 Hubble Space Telescope. Geophysical Research Letters 34, L13203.
- 457 Schwandt, C., Hamilton, J.A., Fray, D.J., and Crawford, I.A. (2012) Oxygen from Lunar
- 458 Regolith. In Moon: Prospective Energy and Material Resources, Ed.: Badescu, V., Springer-
- 459 Verlag Berlin, Heidelberg.
- 460 Syono, Y., Ito, A., and Morimoto, S. (1981) Systematics of Mössbauer parameters in <sup>57</sup>Fe-
- doped titanate and germanate ilmenites. Journal of Physical Chemistry, 42, 483-486.

- 462 Van Alboom, A., De Grave, E., and Wohlfahrt-Mehrens, M. (2011) Temperature dependence
- 463 of the Fe<sup>2+</sup> Mössbauer parameters in triphylite (LiFePO<sub>4</sub>). American Mineralogist, 96, 408-
- 464 416.
- 465 Van Alboom, A., de Resende, V.G., da Costa, G.M., and De Grave, E. (2015) Mössbauer
- spectroscopic study of natural eosphorite, [(Mn,Fe)AlPO<sub>4</sub>(OH)<sub>2</sub>H<sub>2</sub>O]. American Mineralogist,
- 467 100, 580-587.
- Vandenberghe, R.E., De Grave, E., and de Bakker, P.M.A. (1994) On the methodology of the
- analysis of Mössbauer spectra. Hyperfine Interactions, 83, 29-49.
- 470 Varret, F. (1976) Mössbauer spectra of paramagnetic powders under applied field:  $Fe^{2+}$  in
- 471 fluosilicates. Journal of Physics and Chemistry of Solids, 37(3), 265-271.
- 472 Wechsler, B.A., and Prewitt, C.T. (1984) Crystal structure of ilmenite (FeTiO<sub>3</sub>) at high
- temperature and at high pressure. American Mineralogist, 69, 176-185.
- 474 Yan, S., Ge, S., Qiao, W., and Zuo, Y. (2010) Synthesis of ferromagnetic semiconductor
- 475 0.67FeTiO<sub>3</sub>-0.33Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> powder by chemical co-precipitation. Journal of Magnetism and
- 476 Magnetic Materials, 322, 824–826.
- 477
- 478
- 479

## 22

# 480 Figure captions

- 481 Figure 1: Experimental (+) and calculated (full line) spectra at selected temperatures below
- the magnetic ordering temperature (left) and corresponding  $B_{\rm hf}$ -probability distributions
- (right). The size of the symbols (+) roughly corresponds to twice the standard deviation  $(2\sigma)$
- 484 for the observed counts.
- Figure 2: Experimental (+) and calculated (full line) spectra at selected temperatures in the
- 486 paramagnetic region (left) and corresponding  $\Delta E_Q$  -probability distributions (right). The size
- 487 of the symbols (+) roughly corresponds to twice the standard deviation  $(2\sigma)$  for the observed 488 counts.
- 489 Figure 3: Experimental (+) and calculated (full line) spectra at 80 K in a longitudinal external
- 490 magnetic field of 6 T. The size of the symbols (+) roughly corresponds to twice the standard
- 491 deviation  $(2\sigma)$  for the observed counts.
- Figure 4: Experimental (+) and calculated (full line) center shifts as function of temperaturefor the present ilmenite.
- 494 Figure 5: Experimental (+) and calculated (full lines) quadrupole splittings as function of
- temperature for the present ilmenite. Blue dashed line: calculation in the case of trigonal
- 496 symmetry of the Fe<sup>2+</sup>-site (adjusted for  $T \ge 80$  K). Green thin line: calculation in the case of
- 497 trigonal symmetry of the  $Fe^{2+}$ -site and spin-orbit interaction taken into account (adjusted for *T*
- 498  $\leq$  300 K). Pink bold line: calculation in the case of an additional distortion of the Fe<sup>2+</sup>-site
- 499 neglecting spin-orbit interaction (adjusted for the whole *T*-region).
- 500 Figure 6: Experimental (+) and calculated (full line) hyperfine fields as function of
- temperature in the present ilmenite, using the model of Bean and Rodbell (1962).

## 503 Tables

Table 1: Relevant Mössbauer parameters with highest probability in the  $B_{hf}$  and  $\Delta E_Q$ -

distributions at selected temperatures for ilmenite ( $\Gamma$ : full width at half maximum; other

506 symbols: see text). \*: Grant et al. 1972; <sup>\*</sup>: Syono et al. 1981;\*\*: measured in the present

507 work in a longitudinal external magnetic field of 6 T. Errors for the present measurements: 1

508 K on *T*, 0.02 mm/s on  $\delta$ ; 0.02 mm/s on  $\Delta E_Q$ ; 0.05 on  $\eta$ ; 0.1 T on  $B_{hf}$ ; 2° on  $\Omega$ ; 0.01 mm/s on

509 *Γ*.

<i>T</i> (K)	$\delta$ (mm/s)	$\Delta E_Q (\text{mm/s})$	$V_{zz}$	η	$B_{\rm hf}({\rm T})$	$\Omega\left(^{\circ} ight)$	$\Gamma$ (mm/s)
4.2*		1.44		0.0	5.6	0	
5*	1.22	1.44	>0	0.0	4.3±0.3	0	
5	1.22	1.44	>0	0.29	4.5	13	0.29
80	1.19	1.00					0.26
80**	1.22	1.05	>0	0.20			0.31
295	1.07	0.65					0.26
900	0.62	0.24					0.26

510





Figure 2



Figure 3



Figure 4



Figure 5



Figure 6