1 Revision 1

2 Recoil-free Fractions of Iron in Aluminous Bridgmanite from Temperature 3 Dependent Mössbauer Spectra 4

- 5 Jiachao Liu¹, Bjorn Mysen², Yingwei Fei², Jie Li¹
- 6
- Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Michigan, Ann
 Arbor, MI 48109, USA
- 9 2. Geophysical Laboratory, Carnegie Institution of Washington, Washington, DC
 20015, USA

11

12 Abstract

13 Aluminous bridgmanite (Al-Bm) is the dominant phase in the Earth's lower mantle. In this study, the Mössbauer spectra of an Al-Bm sample Mg_{0.868}Fe_{0.087}Si_{0.944}Al_{0.101}O_{2.994} 14 15 were recorded from 65 K to 300 K at 1 bar. The temperature dependence of the center 16 shift was fitted by the Debye model and yielded the Debye temperatures of 305±3 K for Fe^{2+} and 361±22 K for Fe^{3+} . These values are lower than those of Al-free bridgmanite by 17 18 17% and 24%, respectively, indicating that the presence of Fe and Al increases the 19 average Fe-O bond length and weakens the bond strength. At 300 K, the calculated recoil-free fractions of Fe^{2+} (0.637±0.006) and Fe^{3+} (0.72±0.02) are similar and therefore 20 the molar fractions of Fe^{2+} and Fe^{3+} are nearly the same as the area fractions of the 21 22 corresponding Mössbauer doublets. At 900 K, the calculated recoil-free fractions of Fe³⁺ is 46% higher than that of Fe^{2+} , implying that the molar fraction of Fe^{3+} is only 4 1% for a 23

measured spectral area fraction of 50%, and that the area fractions of iron sites may change with temperature without any changes in the valence state or spin state of iron. We infer that Fe^{3+} accounts for 46 ± 2 % of the iron in the Al-Bm and it enters the A site along with Al^{3+} in the B site through the coupled-substitution mechanism. An Fe^{2+} component with large QS ~4.0mm/s was observed at cryogenic conditions and interpreted as a high-spin distorted iron site.

30 Keywords: Mössbauer spectroscopy, aluminous bridgmanite, ferric iron, recoil-free
31 fraction, Debye temperature, crystallographic site, lower mantle

32 1. Introduction

33 Aluminum- and iron-bearing magnesium silicate bridgmanite (abbreviated as "Al-34 Bm", following the same convention as Rw for ringwoodite) is the predominant phase in 35 the Earth's lower mantle, and its physical properties and crystal chemistry play an 36 important role in mantle dynamics. Iron, with a partially filled 3d shell, adds a variety of 37 influences to the physical properties and chemical behavior of Bm. The oxidation state, 38 spin state, and site occupancy of iron in Bm are of particular importance because these 39 factors may influence the density and velocity structure and convective pattern of the 40 lower mantle (e.g., Badro 2014; Li 2007; Lin et al. 2013)

Mössbauer spectroscopy probes the hyperfine interactions between the nuclei/nucleus and the surrounding electric and magnetic fields. These interactions are expressed as center shift (CS), quadrupole splitting (QS), and the magnetic Zeeman splitting. Mössbauer spectroscopy also has been widely used to measure the valence state of iron in geological materials (Dyar et al., 2006). In the past two decades, Mössbauer spectroscopy has been applied to investigating the valence state, spin state and crystal chemistry of iron 47 in lower-mantle Bm (e.g., Fei et al. 1994; McCammon 1997, 1998; Jackson et al. 2005; 48 Li et al. 2006; Lin et al. 2012; Bengtson et al. 2009; Narygina et al. 2010; Grocholski et 49 al. 2009; Catalli et al. 2010; Hummer and Fei 2012). Of particular importance are 50 Mössbauer measurements at variable temperatures, which provide information on recoil-51 free fractions (f) of different iron sites and thus allow for reliable determination of the 52 relative proportions of divalent and trivalent iron. Moreover, effects of temperature on the 53 hyperfine parameters have been used to test the validity of the fitting procedure of 54 Mössbauer data, and to gain additional insights on electron delocalization in Al-free Bm 55 at elevated temperatuers (Fei et al. 1994; McCammon 1998).

56 Bridgmanite in the lower mantle contains 4.0~5.3 weight % Al (Wood and Rubie 57 1996). The presence of Al alters the crystal chemistry of iron and appears to stabilize 58 trivalent iron in the structure (McCammon 1997; Frost et al. 2004). Such structural changes may also affect the recoil-free fractions of both Fe^{2+} and Fe^{3+} , which need to be 59 determined in order to derive the Fe³⁺/Fe ratios from Mössbauer spectra. Mössbauer data 60 61 of Al-Bm under cryogenic conditions appear not to have been reported. In this study, we 62 measured Mössbauer spectra of an Al-Bm sample from 65 to 300 K at 1 bar and applied the results to examine the crystal chemistry of Fe^{2+} and Fe^{3+} in lower mantle Bm. 63

64 2. Experimental Method

65 **2.1. Sample Synthesis and Characterization**

An Al-Bm sample was synthesized and characterized at the Geophysical Laboratory, Carnegie Institution of Washington. The synthesis procedure started with reducing a 94% ⁵⁷Fe enriched Fe₂O₃ to FeO at 1273 K and $\log f_{O2} = -14$ (between the iron-wüstite and wüstite-magnetite buffers) for 24 hours in a CO-CO₂ gas-mixing furnace to reduce all

 Fe^{3+} to Fe^{2+} . An $(Mg_{0.9}Fe_{0.1})(Si_{0.9}Al_{0.1})O_3$ orthopyroxene was then synthesized by 70 71 equilibrating the stoichiometric mixture of MgO, SiO₂, FeO and Al₂O₃ in a graphite 72 capsule at 2 GPa and 1673 K for 3 days in a piston cylinder apparatus. A Mössbauer spectrum of this sample shows all iron in orthopyroxene to be Fe^{2+} . Several milligrams of 73 74 the orthopyroxene were packed into a rhenium capsule and equilibrated at 26.5 GPa and 75 2023 K for 30 minutes with a multi-anvil apparatus by using methods described by 76 Bertka and Fei (1997). The recovered run product was crushed between two tungsten 77 carbide (WC) anvils at 77 K to minimize back transformation or amorphization. The 78 average composition of the synthesized Al-Bm, determined with the JEOL 8900 electron microprobe at the Geophysical Laboratory, is $Mg_{0.868(11)}Fe^{2+}_{0.087(5)}Si_{0.944(10)}Al_{0.101(3)}O_{2.994}$ 79 80 as formulated on the two- cation basis and assuming all iron to be ferrous The structure 81 and purity of the run product were further confirmed by an energy-dispersive powder X-82 ray diffraction (XRD) pattern collected at the GSECARS of the Advanced Photon 83 Source, Argonne National Laboratory, and by a Raman spectrum collected at the 84 Geophysical Laboratory, which matched the existing references (Bertka and Fei 1997). 85 Ferropericlase was not detected in the electron microprobe, or XRD measurements. The absence of ferropericlase is consistent with the excess SiO_2 in the starting composition 86 87 and the presence of a smaller amount of stishovite in the run product.

88

2.2. Conventional Mössbauer Spectroscopy

89 Mössbauer spectra of Al-Bm were acquired at temperatures between 65 and 300 K at 90 the Geophysical Laboratory, following the method described in Fei et al. (1994). A 91 closed-cycle refrigerator was used to generate cryogenic temperatures. For Mössbauer 92 measurements, a 0.5" or ~12 mm-diameter pellet was prepared by mixing the crushed

93 sample with transoptic binder, which was sandwiched between two sheets of high-purity 94 alumina foil. This sample was placed between the faces of two Cu discs with a 0.75-in or \sim 19 mm aperture, each lined with indium foil and attached to the cold finger of the 95 96 cryostat. Temperature was monitored with a chromel alumel thermocouple next to the 97 sample. An Austin Science Drive operating in the constant acceleration mode produced 98 velocities in the range of ±4 mm/s. The Mössbauer absorption intensity was collected 99 over 512 channel in a mirror-imaged mode. The velocity-channel relation was calibrated 100 using the inner four lines of the stainless steel sextet. The gamma-ray source was a 30 101 mCi Co in Pd matrix. Spectra were first collected at the lowest temperature of 65 K, and 102 then at progressively higher temperature until reaching the room temperature.

103 **3.** Results and Discussions

The Mössbauer spectra (Fig. 1) do not show evidence of metallic Fe, which would produce a sextet associated with magnetic Zeeman splitting. The absence of metallic Fe was also indicated from examination of electron back-scattered images. Accordingly, we fitted the spectra by multiple doubles with Lorentzian line shape using the fitting program "MossA" (Prescher et al. 2012).

To account for the main feature of each spectrum (Fig. 1), we first introduced two doublets with distinct quadruple splitting (QS) values, corresponding to one Fe^{2+} site and one Fe^{3+} site, respectively. The broad and asymmetric absorption peaks near -1 mm/s and 2 mm/s suggest the presence of a second Fe^{2+} doublet. A small peak near 3 mm/s requires a third Fe^{2+} doublet with unusually large quadrupole splitting value, exceeding 4 mm/s. The central shift (CS) of the Fe^{2+} III doublet is well constrained and its value falls into the range of CS for Fe^{2+} in minerals (Dyar et al. 2006). The $Fe^{2+}II$ doublet has an 116 anomalously large width. Treatment of this doublet with a Voigt-based function involving correlated QS and CS distributions (Lagarec and Rancourt 1997) did not 117 improve the fits based on the F test. We chose, therefore, to keep $Fe^{2+}II$ as a Lorentzian 118 doublet. The line shape of Fe²⁺II did not affect its own hyperfine parameters but 119 influenced those of Fe^{3+} because the low-velocity peak of the Fe^{3+} doublet overlaps with 120 other peaks. The Fe²⁺II doublet are broader than those reported in the literature (e.g., Fei 121 et al. 1994). With the maximum full width at half maximum (FWHM) of the Fe²⁺II 122 constrained to a typical value of 0.6 mm/s, the derived Fe^{3+}/Fe ratio decreases by 10% 123 124 between 65 K and 300 K. This approach is discarded because the valence state of iron is 125 unlikely to change under the cryogenic conditions. We interpret the broad line widths as a 126 manifestation of complexity in the local electronic environment of iron site (Bengtson et al. 2009). With increasing temperature, the relative area of the $Fe^{2+}II$ doublet increased at 127 the expense of the Fe²⁺I doublet and the large QS site (Fe²⁺III doublet), with the 128 combined area of all three Fe^{2+} sites remaining nearly constant (Fig. 2). Previous studies 129 130 used an additional doublet to fit systematic aberrations near 1.2~1.3 mm/s (Fei et al. 1994; McCammon 1998) and attributed this component to $Fe^{2+}-Fe^{3+}$ electron 131 delocalization. We did not find it necessary to introduce this component (Fig. 1). 132 133 Furthermore, the fitted CS of each site from our fits decreases with increasing 134 temperature (Fig. 2d), as expected for the second-order Doppler shift (Fei et al. 1994). The areas of Fe^{3+} and total Fe^{2+} are constant within uncertainties over the temperature 135 range investigated (Table 1). All the above evidence supports the conclusion that Fe²⁺-136 Fe^{3+} electron delocalization does not happen in the Al-Bm sample examined here. 137

138 **3.1.** The Recoil-free Fractions of Fe²⁺ and Fe³⁺ in Al-Bm

As Fe²⁺ and Fe³⁺ have different valence states and may occupy different 139 crystallographic sites, the recoil-free fractions of Fe^{2+} and Fe^{3+} , denoted as f_2 and f_3 , 140 respectively, are generally unequal. Knowledge of the recoil-free fractions is necessary to 141 142 convert the Mössbauer spectral areas of iron sites to their molar fractions. According to 143 the harmonic theory of lattice dynamics, the recoil-free fraction, f (also known as Lamb-144 Mössbauer factor), decreases with the mean square displacement of the Mössbauer isotope from its equilibrium position $\langle x^2 \rangle$ and depends on the wavelength of the gamma 145 photons, λ , through the equation $f = \exp(-4\pi^2 \langle x^2 \rangle / \lambda^2)$ (Frauenfelder 1962). By using 146 147 the Debye approximation for lattice vibration, the recoil free fraction at a given 148 temperature f(T) is commonly calculated from the characteristic Debye temperature Θ_{D} according to: 149

$$f(T) = \exp\left\{-\frac{3}{2}\frac{E_R}{k_B\Theta_D}\left[1 + 4\left(\frac{T}{\Theta_D}\right)^2 \int_0^{\Theta_D/T} \frac{xdx}{e^x - 1}\right]\right\}$$

where the recoil energy E_R is 3.13425×10^{-22} J for the 14.4 keV gamma ray from the decay of ⁵⁷Co to stable ⁵⁷Fe, and k_B is the Boltzmann constant (Pound and Rebka 1960). Given Mössbauer data at variable temperatures, the Θ_D can be determined by fitting the temperature-dependent center shift $\delta(T)$ to the following relation:

$$\delta(T) = \delta_I - \frac{9}{2} \frac{k_B T}{Mc} \left(\frac{T}{\Theta_D}\right)^3 \int_0^{\Theta_D/T} \frac{x^3 dx}{e^x - 1}$$

154 Where δ_I is the intrinsic isomer shift, *M* is the mass of the Mössbauer nucleus, and *c* is 155 the velocity of light in vacuum. For the Al-Bm sample, we fitted the CS of Fe³⁺, Fe²⁺III, 156 and the weighted average of Fe²⁺I and Fe²⁺II to the above equation and derived the δ_I and 157 Θ_D values and the corresponding *f* at 300 K for each site (Fig. 2d, Table 2).

158 For a given site *i*, the relation between its molar fraction, x_i , and Mössbauer spectral area fraction, A_i , is $x_i = (A_i/f_i)/\Sigma(A_i/f_i)$. The recoil free fraction of Fe²⁺ f_2 and that of Fe³⁺ 159 f_3 derived from our data are similar between 65 and 300 K (Table 2 and Fig. 3). 160 Therefore, the molar fraction of trivalent iron with respect to total iron ($Fe^{3+}/Fe =$ 161 162 $46\pm2\%$) is indistinguishable from its spectral area fraction of $49\pm2\%$ (Table 1). 163 According to the Debye model, both f_2 and f_3 of the Al-Bm become considerably smaller 164 and diverge from each other at higher temperatures (Fig. 3). At 900 K, the calculated f_3 is 46% higher than f_2 , implying that the molar fraction of Fe³⁺ is only 41% for a measured 165 spectral area fraction of 50% and that the area fractions of iron sites may change with 166 167 temperature without any changes in the valence state or spin state of iron.

168 **3.2.** Crystal Chemistry

169 Knowledge of the site occupancy of iron in Bm is essential to understand the 170 chemistry and physics of the lower mantle, including the nature of spin crossover and the 171 mechanism of thermal and electrical conduction (e.g. Badro 2014; Li 2007; Lin et al. 2013). According to experimental observations and atomistic calculations, Fe²⁺ occupies 172 the pseudo-dodecahedral or A site through simple substitution: $Fe_{A}^{2+} = Mg_{A}^{2+}$ (e.g., 173 174 Wright and Price, 1989). A number of mechanisms have been proposed for the site occupancy of Fe³⁺ (Frost and Langenhorst 2002; Frost et al. 2004; Lauterbach et al. 2000; 175 Hummer and Fei 2012). Given the knowledge of chemical composition and the Fe³⁺ 176 fraction we may use the (Fe,Mg)₂O₂-(Fe³⁺,Al)₂O₃-Si₂O₄ ternary diagram to infer the site 177 occupancies of Fe^{3+} in Bm (Fig. 4). In compositions that plot along the $(\text{Fe}^{3+},\text{Al})_2\text{O}_3$ and 178 $(Mg,Fe^{2+})SiO_3$ join, Fe^{3+} likely enters either the A site or the octahedral B site through 179 substitution of two trivalent ions for Mg^{2+} in the A site and Si^{4+} in the B site: $Mg^{2+}{}_{A}$ + 180

 $Si^{4+}_{B} = Fe^{3+}_{A} + (Fe^{3+},Al^{3+})_{B}$, known as the coupled substitution mechanism. In 181 compositions showing oxygen deficiency, Fe³⁺ may have substituted for Si⁴⁺ in the B site 182 and is charge balance by introducing a vacancy in the oxygen site (V₀): $2Si^{4+} + O^{2-} =$ 183 $2Fe^{3+} + V_0$, known as the oxygen vacancy substitution mechanism. For compositions 184 with excess oxygen, Fe^{3+} may have substituted for Mg^{2+} in the A site and is charge-185 balanced by removing an extra Mg^{2+} which produces an apparent excess in oxygen: $2Fe^{3+}$ 186 $= 3Mg^{2+}$, known as the cation vacancy substitution mechanism. As an alternative to 187 removing an extra Mg²⁺, charge balance may be maintained by introducing an interstitial 188 189 oxygen, which is considered energetically unfavorable (Smyth 1993).

Bm compositions that were synthesized at different pressure and temperature conditions spread over a broad range in the $(Fe,Mg)_2O_2-(Fe^{3+},Al)_2O_3-Si_2O_4$ ternary diagram, indicating variable site occupancy of iron in the structure (Fig. 4). This is consistent with the previous findings that the synthesis condition influences the volume and compressibility of Bm, as well as its spin-pairing transition behavior (Catalli et al. 2010; Fujino et al. 2012; Hummer and Fei 2012; Lundin et al. 2008).

Using the ternary diagram, we infer that most Al-free Bm compositions in the literature involve a combination of coupled substitution and cation vacancy substitution. Those synthesized in very oxidizing environment are exceptions and scattered significantly in this plot (Hummer and Fei 2012). Relatively large uncertainty in Fe³⁺ content also results in wide scatter (Frost and Langenhorst 2002).

The situation is more complex in Al-Bm (Frost et al. 2004; Richmond and Brodholt 1998). Whereas the majority of Al-Bm involve the oxygen vacancy substitution and coupled substitution mechanisms (Fig. 4), the Al-Bm sample from our study and that of 204 Narygina et al. (2009) plot between the joins (2) and (3), indicating that some trivalent 205 cations entered the structure through the cation vacancy mechanism. Richmond and 206 Brodholt (1998) showed that the most favorable mechanism to incorporate trivalent cations in the Bm structure is through the coupled substitution $Mg^{2+}_{A} + Si^{4+}_{B} = Fe^{3+}_{A} + Si^{4+}_{B} = Fe^{3+}_{B} + Si^{4+$ 207 Al^{3+}_{B} , where Fe^{3+} and Al^{3+} substitute into adjacent sites. Given that the Al^{3+}/Fe^{3+} ratio of 208 the Al-Bm is larger than one, we infer that all the Fe³⁺ occupies the A site, coupled with 209 an equal fraction of Al^{3+} in the B site. Because the Mg/Si ratio of the sample is smaller 210 than one, some of the remaining Al^{3+} may adopt the A site through the cation vacancy 211 212 mechanism in order to approach an equal distribution of cations in the two sites. The inferred occupancy of Fe³⁺ in the A site alone is consistent with the narrow width of the 213 corresponding doublet (Fig. 1 and Table 1), and with the absence of Fe^{n+} in our sample. 214 Previous studies interpreted Fe^{n+} as a result of electron hopping between Fe^{2+} and Fe^{3+} . 215 216 which likely occurs between the adjacent A and B sites the cation-cation distance falling 217 within the range for electron hopping in oxides and silicates (Fei et al. 1994, McCammon 218 1998). In contrast, the cation-cation distance between adjacent A sites is marginally 219 within the range of electron hopping and hence less likely to occur. Note that the presence of Fe^{3+} in the Al-Bm cannot be inferred from the composition alone because its 220 221 influence on the cation to oxygen ratio depends on how trivalent ions are incorporated in 222 the structure: The ratio would exceed the stoichiometric value of 2 to 3 if trivalent ions 223 preferentially enters the A site, fall below the value if they preferentially enters the B site, 224 or does not change if all trivalent ions enters both sites in equal proportion through the 225 coupled substitution mechanism.

226 **3.3. Debye Temperature**

227	Even though the physical meaning of Debye temperature Θ_D , derived from
228	Mössbauer measurements, is not fully understood, it is generally accepted that it can be
229	used to compare the strength of chemical bonding among structurally related compounds
230	(De Grave et al. 1985). McCammon (1998) reported the Debye temperatures of an Al-
231	free Bm (Table 2). We were able to exactly reproduce the results, thus confirming the
232	validity of the fitting procedure. Compared with the Al-free Bm, the Debye temperatures
233	of Fe ²⁺ and Fe ³⁺ in the Al-Bm are lower by 17% and 24%, respectively, resulting in f_2 and
234	f_3 values at 300 K that differ by 13 % (Table 2). The lower Debye temperatures in Al-Bm
235	are consistent with the finding that substituting larger Al^{3+} ion for smaller Si^{4+} ion in the
236	B site expands its volume and increases the average bond length (Lundin et al. 2008;
237	Vanpeteghem et al. 2006). Moreover, this substitution causes tilting of the octahedra,
238	therefore, inflates the A site. The elongated and weakened Fe-O bond then give rise to the
239	lower Debye temperatures and smaller recoil free fractions, f_2 and f_3 , in Al-Bm.

One intriguing phenomenon is that the fitted Debye temperature of the $Fe^{2+}III$ site 240 241 exceeds 1000 K (Table 2) and is more than twice the highest value reported in the 242 literature (De Grave and Van Alboom 1991). Unlike the very large values of Debye temperatures for Fe²⁺ in Al-free Bm samples (Fei et al. 1994), which have been attributed 243 244 to fitting artifacts (McCammon 1998), the unusually high Debye temperature is a robust feature because the CS values of the Fe²⁺III doublets are well constrained by the 245 246 Mössbauer data. Theoretical calculations have shown that at 0.1 MPa two high-spin (HS) Fe^{2+} sites with distinct QS values exist in the A site of Bm, and the one with a large QS 247 248 value (~ 3.2 mm/s) has a shorter average bond length (Bengtson et al. 2009; Hsu et al. 2010). This is consistent with the observation that Fe²⁺III with large QS has 249

extraordinarily high Debye temperatures, reflecting its short bond length and high bondstrength.

252 **3.4.** The Fe²⁺ Site with Large QS

Recent Mössbauer studies detected Fe^{2+} sites with extremely large QS values (~4.0 253 254 mm/s) at pressures above 30 GPa (Kupenko et al. 2014; Lin et al. 2008; McCammon et al. 2008; Narygina et al. 2010; Potapkin et al. 2013). These values were interpreted to be 255 the results of intermediate-spin (IS) Fe^{2+} according to the spin numbers derived from X-256 ray emission spectroscopy data (Lin et al. 2008), or attributed to high-spin (HS) Fe²⁺ 257 258 (Grocholski et al. 2009; Jackson et al. 2005; Li et al. 2004, 2006; Lin et al. 2012). Theoretical calculations suggested that IS Fe^{2+} is unstable relative to HS or low-spin (LS) 259 Fe^{2+} and that the QS of the intermediate-spin Fe^{2+} in the A site falls into the range of 0.7 260 261 to 1.4 mm/s, which is well below 4.0 mm/s (Bengtson et al. 2009; Hsu et al. 2010). Additionally, these studies showed that HS Fe^{2+} in the A site could have high OS (3.2-3.6 262 263 mm/s) due to difference in d-orbital occupation and local distortion.

In the Al-Bm, the Fe²⁺III site has similar OS-values (3.47-4.03 mm/s) and CS-values 264 (~1.1 mm/s) to those proposed for IS Fe^{2+} (Kupenko et al. 2014; Lin et al. 2008; 265 266 McCammon et al. 2008; Narygina et al. 2010; Potapkin et al. 2013), and its area fraction 267 in the Mössbauer absorption spectra decreased with temperature from 6% at 65 K to near 268 0% at 300 K (Table 1). It is generally understood that the high-spin state is favored at low 269 pressures and/or high temperatures. A potential explanation for the large QS and temperature dependence of the Fe²⁺ III site is, therefore, that it represents an IS or LS-site 270 271 at low temperatures, which transforms to a HS state as temperature rises. To test this 272 hypothesis, we estimated the temperature of spin-pairing transition at 0.1 MPa, on the

273	basis of simplified crystal field theory and existing data on pressure-induced spin-pairing
274	transition in Bm at 300 K. The spin transition at 65 K is expected to take place below 30
275	GPa as a result of the entropy difference between IS (or LS) and HS iron (dS) and
276	thermal contraction. By assuming the crystal field splitting energy (CFSE), Δ , relates to
277	the Fe-O bond length, R, through $\Delta \sim R^{-5}$ (Burns 1993) and ignoring the volume
278	difference between the adjacent spin states (Catalli et al. 2010; Lundin et al. 2008), for a
279	temperature drop of dT , the spin transition pressure would decrease by $dT \cdot dS/(5n\Delta/3K_T)$
280	because of the entropy difference, and by $(\alpha K_{\rm T} dT)_{\rm V}$ because of thermal contraction,
281	where n is the number of electrons that flip spin through the transition, $K_{\rm T}$ is the
282	isothermal bulk modulus, and α is the isobaric thermal expansion coefficient. By using
283	the parameters in Li (2007), we found that the pressure of HS to LS transition of Fe^{2+} at
284	65 K is 1.7 GPa lower than that at 300 K, where 0.4 GPa is from the entropy and 1.3 GPa
285	from thermal contraction. From HS to IS, the transition pressure at 65 K is 3.1 GPa
286	lower, where 1.8 GPa comes from the entropy effect and 1.3 GPa from the thermal
287	contraction effect. Given the pressures of spin transitions in Bm at 300 K range from 30
288	to 120 GPa (e.g., Badro et al. 2004; Fujino et al. 2012; Catalli et al. 2010; McCammon et
289	al. 2010; Jackson et al. 2005; Li et al. 2006), and that these pressures would only be
290	lowered by a few GPa, we conclude that the Fe ²⁺ III site represents a HS state and that the
291	large QS likely result from temperature-induced change in the degree of lattice distortion
292	(Bengtson et al. 2009; Hsu et al. 2010).
202	1 Implications

293 4. Implications

294 For an Al- and Fe-bearing Bm sample with a composition that is applicable to the Earth's lower mantle, we found that the recoil-free fractions of Fe^{2+} and Fe^{3+} at 300 K are 295 0.637 and 0.72, respectively. These values are sufficiently similar so that the molar 296 297 fractions of the two ions can be roughly equated to the area fractions of their respective 298 Mössbauer doublet. By using the fitted Debye temperatures to calculate the recoil-free fractions at different temperatures we expect the recoil-free fraction of Fe³⁺ at 900 K to 299 be 46% higher than that of Fe^{2+} because of different temperature dependence, thus 300 requiring a downward correction to calculate the molar fraction of Fe³⁺ from its area 301 fraction in the Mössbauer spectra. 302

303 Contrary to some of the recent studies that interpreted exceptionally large QS value as 304 a diagnostic feature of intermediate spin state of iron in Bm, we observed a Fe^{2+} 305 component with a large QS near 4.0mm/s at 1 bar and below 250 K, which supports the 306 theoretical prediction of large QS resulting from distortion rather than spin-crossover.

307 Our analyses of a large number of Bm samples reported in the literature suggest that 308 site occupancy of Fe^{3+} depends on Al content and synthesis conditions: Whereas the 309 majority of the Al-free samples can be explained by a combination of coupled 310 substitution and cation vacancy substitution, a combination of coupled substitution and 311 oxygen vacancy mechanism is inferred for most of the Al-bearing samples.

The geophysical estimate of the lower-mantle electric conductivity has been adequately explained by the Bm component (e.g., Katsura et al. 1998). It was shown that at temperatures up to 1500 K conduction mechanism was dominated by $Fe^{2+}-Fe^{3+}$ electron hopping with relatively small activation energy, whereas at higher temperatures the dominant mechanism is ionic conduction through A site vacancies and oxygen

317	vacancies, which involves larger activation energy (Katsura et al. 1998; Xu and
318	McCammon 2002). In the Al-Bm at 300 K examined here, Fe ³⁺ was found to exclusively
319	enter the pseudo-dodecahedral A site through the coupled substitution mechanism, which
320	is consistent with the Mössbauer results that indicate no electron hopping. Accordingly
321	the Al-Bm is expected to have low electric conductivity at ambient conditions. A recent
322	study on spin crossover suggested that at pressures above 50-60 GPa and high
323	temperatures, Fe^{3+} in the A site exchanged with Al^{3+} in the B sites and transitioned to the
324	low-spin state (Fujino et al. 2012). Such migration would enable electron hopping
325	between Fe^{2+} in the A site and low-spin Fe^{3+} in the B site and therefore lower the
326	activation energy and increase the electric conductivity of the Al-Bm.

327 References

- Badro, J. (2014) Spin transitions in mantle minerals. Annual Review of Earth and
 Planetary Sciences, 42, 231-248.
- Badro, J., Rueff, J.P., Vanko, G., Monaco, G., Fiquet, G., and Guyot, F. (2004) Electronic
- transitions in perovskite: possible nonconvecting layers in the lower mantle.
- 332 Science, 305, 383-386.
- Bengtson, A., Li, J., and Morgan, D. (2009) Mössbauer modeling to interpret the spin
- state of iron in (Mg,Fe)SiO₃ perovskite. Geophysical Research Letters, 36,
 L15301.
- Bertka, C. M., and Y. Fei (1997) Mineralogy of the Martian interior up to core-mantle
- boundary pressures, J. Geophys. Res., 103, 5251-5264.
- 338 Burns, R.G. (1993) Mineralogical Applications of Crystal Field Theory, Seond ed.,
- Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, p. 551.

- 340 Catalli, K., Shim, S.H., Prakapenka, V.B., Zhao, J.Y., Sturhahn, W., Chow, P., Xiao,
- 341 Y.M., Liu, H.Z., Cynn, H., and Evans, W.J. (2010) Spin state of ferric iron in
- 342 MgSiO₃ perovskite and its effect on elastic properties. Earth and Planetary
 343 Science Letters, 289, 68-75.
- De Grave, E., and Van Alboom, A. (1991) Evaluation of ferrous and ferric Mössbauer
- fractions. Physics and Chemistry of Minerals, 18, 337-342.
- 346 De Grave, E., Verbeeck, A.E., and Chambaere, D.G. (1985) Influence of small aluminum
 347 substitutions on the hematite lattice. Physics Letters A, 107, 181-184.
- 348 Dyar, M.D., Agresti, D.G., Schaefer, M.W., Grant, C.A., and Sklute, E.C. (2006)
- 349 Mössbauer spectroscopy of earth and planetary materials. Annual Review of
 350 Earth and Planetary Sciences, 34, 83-125.
- 351 Fei, Y., Virgo, D., Mysen, B.O., Wang, Y., and Mao, H.K. (1994) Temperature-
- dependent electron delocalization in (Mg,Fe)SiO₃ perovskite. American
 Mineralogist, 79, 826-837.
- Frauenfelder H. 1962. The Mössbauer effect. New York: WA Benjamin, p. 333.
- Frost, D.J., and Langenhorst, F. (2002) The effect of Al₂O₃ on Fe-Mg partitioning
 between magnesiowustite and magnesium silicate perovskite. Earth and Planetary
- 357 Science Letters, 199, 227-241.
- 358 Frost, D.J., Liebske, C., Langenhorst, F., McCammon, C.A., Tronnes, R.G., and Rubie,
- 359 D.C. (2004) Experimental evidence for the existence of iron-rich metal in the
 360 Earth's lower mantle. Nature, 428, 409-412.
- 361 Fujino, K., Nishio-Hamane, D., Seto, Y., Sata, N., Nagai, T., Shinmei, T., Irifune, T.,
- 362 Ishii, H., Hiraoka, N., Cai, Y.Q., and Tsuei, K.D. (2012) Spin transition of ferric

- iron in Al-bearing Mg-perovskite up to 200 GPa and its implication for the lower
 mantle. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 317, 407-412.
- 365 Grocholski, B., Shim, S.H., Sturhahn, W., Zhao, J., Xiao, Y., and Chow, P.C. (2009) Spin
- and valence states of iron in $(Mg_{0.8}Fe_{0.2})SiO_3$ perovskite. Geophysical Research
- 367 Letters, 36, L24303.
- Hsu, H., Umemoto, K., Blaha, P., and Wentzcovitch, R.M. (2010) Spin states and
 hyperfine interactions of iron in (Mg,Fe)SiO₃ perovskite under pressure. Earth
 and Planetary Science Letters, 294, 19-26.
- Hummer, D.R., and Fei, Y.W. (2012) Synthesis and crystal chemistry of Fe³⁺-bearing
- 372 $(Mg,Fe^{3+})(Si,Fe^{3+})O_3$ perovskite. American Mineralogist, 97, 1915-1921.
- 373 Jackson, J.M., Sturhahn, W., Shen, G.Y., Zhao, J.Y., Hu, M.Y., Errandonea, D., Bass,
- J.D., and Fei, Y.W. (2005) A synchrotron Mössbauer spectroscopy study of
 (Mg,Fe)SiO₃ perovskite up to 120 GPa. American Mineralogist, 90, 199-205.
- Katsura, T., Sato, K., Ito, E., 1998. Electrical conductivity of silicate perovskite at lowermantle conditions. Nature 395, 493-495.
- 378 Kupenko, I., McCammon, C., Sinmyo, R., Prescher, C., Chumakov, A.I., Kantor, A.,
- Ruffer, R., and Dubrovinsky, L. (2014) Electronic spin state of Fe,Al-containing
 MgSiO₃ perovskite at lower mantle conditions. Lithos, 189, 167-172.
- 381 Lagarec, K., and Rancourt, D.G. (1997) Extended Voigt-based analytic lineshape method
- 382 for determining N-dimensional correlated hyperfine parameter distributions in
- 383 Mössbauer spectroscopy. Nuclear Instruments & Methods in Physics Research
- 384 Section B-Beam Interactions with Materials and Atoms, 129, 266-280.

385	Lauterbach, S., McCammon, C.A., van Aken, P., Langenhorst, F., and Seifert, F. (2000)
386	Mössbauer and ELNES spectroscopy of (Mg,Fe)(Si,Al)O3 perovskite: a highly
387	oxidised component of the lower mantle. Contributions to Mineralogy and
388	Petrology, 138, 17-26.

- Li, J., Struzhkin, V.V., Mao, H.K., Shu, J.F., Hemley, R.J., Fei, Y.W., Mysen, B., Dera,
 P., Prakapenka, V., and Shen, G.Y. (2004) Electronic spin state of iron in lower
 mantle perovskite. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the
 United States of America, 101, 14027-14030.
- 393 Li, J., Sturhahn, W., Jackson, J.M., Struzhkin, V.V., Lin, J.F., Zhao, J., Mao, H.K., and
- Shen, G. (2006) Pressure effect on the electronic structure of iron in
 (Mg,Fe)(Si,Al)O₃ perovskite: a combined synchrotron Mössbauer and X-ray
 emission spectroscopy study up to 100 GPa. Physics and Chemistry of Minerals,
 33, 575-585.
- Li, J. (2007) Electronic transitions and spin states in the lower mantle. Post-perovskite:
 the last mantle phase transition, 174, 47-68.
- Lin, J.F., Alp, E.E., Mao, Z., Inoue, T., McCammon, C., Xia, Y.M., Chow, P., and Zhao,
- J.Y. (2012) Electronic spin states of ferric and ferrous iron in the lower-mantle
 silicate perovskite. American Mineralogist, 97, 592-597.
- 403 Lin, J.F., Watson, H., Vanko, G., Alp, E.E., Prakapenka, V.B., Dera, P., Struzhkin, V.V.,
- Kubo, A., Zhao, J.Y., McCammon, C., and Evans, W.J. (2008) Intermediate-spin
 ferrous iron in lowermost mantle post-perovskite and perovskite. Nature
 Geoscience, 1, 688-691.

3/11

- 407 Lin, J.F., Speziale, S., Mao, Z., and Marquardt, H. (2013) Effects of the electronic spin
- 408 transitions of iron in lower mantle minerals: implications for deep mantle
 409 geophysics and geochemistry. Reviews of Geophysics, 51, 244-275.
- 410 Lundin, S., Catalli, K., Santillan, J., Shim, S.H., Prakapenka, V.B., Kunz, M., and Meng,
- 411 Y. (2008) Effect of Fe on the equation of state of mantle silicate perovskite over 1
 412 Mbar. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 168, 97-102.
- 413 McCammon, C. (1997) Perovskite as a possible sink for ferric iron in the lower mantle.
 414 Nature, 387, 694-696.
- 415 McCammon, C. (1998) The crystal chemistry of ferric iron in Fe_{0.05}Mg_{0.95}SiO₃ perovskite
- 416 as determined by Mössbauer spectroscopy in the temperature range 80-293 K.
 417 Physics and Chemistry of Minerals, 25, 292-300.
- 418 McCammon, C., Kantor, I., Narygina, O., Rouquette, J., Ponkratz, U., Sergueev, I.,
- 419 Mezouar, M., Prakapenka, V., and Dubrovinsky, L. (2008) Stable intermediate-
- spin ferrous iron in lower-mantle perovskite. Nature Geoscience, 1, 684-687.
- 421 McCammon, C., Dubrovinsky, L., Narygina, O., Kantor, I., Wu, X., Glazyrin, K.,
- Sergueev, I., and Chumakov, A.I. (2010) Low-spin Fe²⁺ in silicate perovskite and
 a possible layer at the base of the lower mantle. Physics of the Earth and Planetary
 Interiors, 180, 215-221.
- Narygina, O.V., Kantor, I.Y., McCammon, C.A., and Dubrovinsky, L.S. (2010)
 Electronic state of Fe²⁺ in (Mg,Fe)(Si,Al)O₃ perovskite and (Mg,Fe)SiO₃ majorite
 at pressures up to 81 GPa and temperatures up to 800 K. Physics and Chemistry
 of Minerals, 37, 407-415.

429	Narygina, O.V., Mattesini, M., Kantor, I., Pascarelli, S., Wu, X., Aquilanti, G.,
430	McCammon, C., and Dubrovinsky, L. (2009) High-pressure experimental and
431	computational XANES studies of (Mg,Fe)(Si,Al)O3 perovskite and (Mg,Fe)O
432	ferropericlase as in the Earth's lower mantle. Physical Review B, 79, 174115.
433	Potapkin, V., McCammon, C., Glazyrin, K., Kantor, A., Kupenko, I., Prescher, C.,
434	Sinmyo, R., Smirnov, G.V., Chumakov, A.I., Ruffer, R., and Dubrovinsky, L.
435	(2013) Effect of iron oxidation state on the electrical conductivity of the Earth's
436	lower mantle. Nature Communications, 4, 1427.
437	Pound, R.V., and Rebka, G.A. (1960) Variation with temperature of the energy of recoil-
438	free gamma-rays from solids. Physical Review Letters, 4, 274-275.
439	Prescher, C., McCammon, C., and Dubrovinsky, L. (2012) MossA: a program for
440	analyzing energy-domain Mössbauer spectra from conventional and synchrotron
441	sources. Journal of Applied Crystallography, 45, 329-331.
442	Richmond, N.C., and Brodholt, J.P. (1998) Calculated role of aluminum in the
443	incorporation of ferric iron into magnesium silicate perovskite. American
444	Mineralogist, 83, 947-951.
445	Smyth, D.M. (1993) Oxidative nonstoichiometry in Perovskite oxides. In: Tejuco, L.G.,
446	Fierro, J.L.G., Eds., Properties and Applications of Perovskite-Type Oxides, p.
447	47-72. Marcel Dekker, New York.
448	Vanpeteghem, C.B., Angel, R.J., Ross, N.L., Jacobsen, S.D., Dobson, D.P., Litasov, K.D.,
449	and Ohtani, E. (2006) Al, Fe substitution in the MgSiO ₃ perovskite structure: a
450	single-crystal X-ray diffraction study. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors,
451	155, 96-103.

- 452 Wood, B.J., and Rubie, D.C. (1996) The effect of alumina on phase transformations at
- 453 the 660-kilometer discontinuity from Fe-Mg partitioning experiments. Science,
- 454 273, 1522-1524.
- Wright, K., and Price, G.D. (1989) Computer-Simulations of Iron in Magnesium-Silicate
 Perovskite. Geophysical Research Letters, 16, 1399-1402.
- 457 Xu, Y.S., McCammon, C., and Poe, B.T. (1998) The effect of alumina on the electrical
- 458 conductivity of silicate perovskite. Science, 282, 922-924.
- 459 Xu, Y.S., McCammon, C., 2002. Evidence for ionic conductivity in lower mantle
- 460 (Mg,Fe)(Si,Al)O₃ perovskite. Journal of Geophysical Research, 107, 2251.

462 Figure Captions

Figure 1. Mössbauer spectra of Mg_{0.868}Fe_{0.087}Si_{0.944}Al_{0.101}O_{2.994} bridgmanite between 65
K and 300 K at 1 bar. Each spectrum (black dots) was fitted by four doublets (black
envelop): Fe³⁺ (green solid), Fe²⁺I (blue dotted), Fe²⁺II (red dashed) and Fe²⁺III (gray
filled). Red dots represent the fitting residual. Within the velocity range of our
measurements, a sextet from metallic Fe would consist of peaks near -3.0, -1.0, 1.0, and
3.0 mm/s.
Figure 2. Area fractions (a, b) and hyperfine parameters (c, d) of iron sites in

- 470 $Mg_{0.868}Fe_{0.087}Si_{0.944}Al_{0.101}O_{2.994}$ bridgmanite as a function of temperature at 1 bar. The
- 471 iron sites include $Fe^{2+}I$ (open squares), $Fe^{2+}II$ (open circles), $Fe^{2+}III$ (gray triangles), and
- 472 Fe^{3+} (solid diamonds). In (d), the curves represent the Debye model fittings for the
- 473 weighted average of $Fe^{2+}I$ and $Fe^{2+}II$ (solid), $Fe^{2+}III$ (dashed), and Fe^{3+} (gray dotted).
- 474 Figure 3. Calculated recoil-free fractions as a function of temperature, according to the
- 475 Debye model. Red solid and dashed curves represent Fe²⁺ and Fe³⁺, respectively, in Al-
- 476 Bm from this study; Gray solid and dashed curves represent Fe^{2+} and Fe^{3+} , respectively,
- 477 in Al-free Bm from McCammon (1998).

Figure 4. Ternary diagram illustrating the cation substitution mechanisms in bridgmanite in full compositional range (a) and a close-up (b). The end-member compositions Si_2O_4 , (Mg,Fe²⁺)₂O₂, and (Fe³⁺,Al)₂O₃ are written on the two-cation basis. Lines connecting the trivalent-cation-free composition (Mg, Fe²⁺)SiO₃ to each of the three trivalent-bearing compositions represent (1) (Mg,Fe²⁺)(Fe³⁺,Al)O_{2.5}, oxygen vacancy substitution mechanism, (2) (Fe³⁺,Al)₂O₃, coupled substitution mechanism, and (3) (Fe³⁺,Al)SiO_{3.5}, cation vacancy substitution mechanism. Open and closed symbols represent Al-free and

- 485 Al-bearing compositions, respectively. Error bars in this study are smaller than the
- 486 symbol size. More complex compositions including cations other than Mg, Si, Al, and Fe
- 487 are not included.

Table 1. Hyperfine parameters of $Mg_{0.868}Fe_{0.087}Si_{0.944}Al_{0.101}O_{2.994}$ bridgmanite at 1 bar.

		Fe ²⁻	⁺ I				Fe ²⁺ II		
Т	QS	CS	FWHM	A ^a	QS	CS	FWHM	A ^a	
(K)	(mm/s)	(mm/s)	(mm/s)	(%)	(mm/s)	(mm/s)	(mm/s)	(%)	
65	2.80(2)	1.051(6)	0.44(4)	31(4)	1.8(5)	1.17(5)	1.2(3)	14(7)	
100	2.76(1)	1.039(4)	0.37(3)	27(2)	1.8(1)	1.13(2)	0.9(1)	20(3)	
150	2.72(2)	1.004(4)	0.38(3)	23(3)	1.80(8)	1.09(1)	0.76(6)	25(3)	
200	2.67(2)	0.962(5)	0.36(4)	17(3)	1.78(6)	1.048(8)	0.73(4)	33(3)	
250	2.61(3)	0.924(9)	0.36(6)	11(3)	1.78(6)	1.000(8)	0.75(4)	39(3)	
300	2.55(4)	0.89(1)	0.32(9)	5(3)	1.72(4)	0.956(7)	0.75(3)	44(2)	
		Fe ²⁺	III				Fe ³⁺		
Т	QS	CS	FWHM	A ^a	QS	CS	FWHM	A ^a	Fraction ^b
(K)	(mm/s)	(mm/s)	(mm/s)	(%)	(mm/s)	(mm/s)	(mm/s)	(%)	(%)
65	4.03(3)	1.11(2)	0.34(7)	6(1)	0.89(1)	0.407(7)	0.52(1)	49(5)	46(5)
100	3.97(3)	1.12(1)	0.32(5)	6(1)	0.897(8)	0.397(5)	0.449(9)	48(3)	45(3)
150	3.86(4)	1.11(2)	0.30(6)	4(1)	0.898(9)	0.372(5)	0.439(9)	48(2)	48(2)
200	3.74(5)	1.11(2)	0.28(8)	3(1)	0.902(9)	0.339(5)	0.437(9)	47(2)	44(2)
250	3.55(5)	1.09(2)	0.20(8)	1(1)	0.91(1)	0.306(6)	0.47(1)	48(3)	45(3)
300	3.47(9)	1.06(4)	0.2(1)	1(1)	0.91(1)	0.306(6)	0.47 (1)	48(3)	46(2)

CS: Center shift. QS: Quadruple splitting. FWHM: Full width at half maximum. ^aArea Fractions. ^bMolar fractions. Numbers in parentheses represent fitting errors.

Site	Composition	$\Theta_{D}\left(\mathrm{K} ight)$	$\delta_I (\text{mm/s})$	<i>f</i> 300 к
	Fe9Al10 (this study)	305(3)	1.096(5)	0.637(6)
Fe ²⁺	Fe ₁₀ (Fei)	233	1.304	0.47
ге	Fe ₅ (Fei)	405	1.264	0.77
	Fe_5 (McC)	366	1.259	0.73
Fe ²⁺ large QS	Fe ₉ Al ₁₀ (Liu)	1102(114)	1.115(4)	0.956(4)
	Fe9Al10 (this study)	361(22)	0.412(4)	0.72(2)
Fe ³⁺	Fe ₁₀ (Fei)	1553	0.426	0.97
ге	Fe ₅ (Fei)	1366	0.430	0.97
	$Fe_5(McC)$	476	0.426	0.82

Table 2. Debye parameters and recoil-free fractions of bridgmanites at 1 bar.

 Θ_b : Debye temperature. δ_1 : Intrinsic isomer shift. $f_{300 \text{ K}}$: recoil-free fraction at 300 K. Numbers in parentheses represent fitting errors.

Data sources: Fe_9Al_{10} (this study): $Mg_{0.868}Fe_{0.087}Si_{0.944}Al_{0.101}O_{2.994}$ from this study; Fe₅ (Fei) and Fe₁₀ (Fei): $Mg_{0.95}Fe_{0.05}SiO_3$ and $Mg_{0.90}Fe_{0.10}SiO_3$, respectively (Fei et al. 1994); Fe₅ (McC): $Mg_{0.95}Fe_{0.05}SiO_3$ (McCammon 1998).



Figure 1. Mössbauer spectra of $Mg_{0.868}Fe_{0.087}Si_{0.944}Al_{0.101}O_{2.994}$ bridgmanite between 65 K and 300 K at 1 bar. Each spectrum (black dots) was fitted by four doublets (black envelop): Fe^{3+} (green solid), $Fe^{2+}I$ (blue dotted), $Fe^{2+}II$ (red dashed) and $Fe^{2+}III$ (gray filled). Red dots represent the fitting residual. Within the velocity range of our measurements, a sextet from metallic Fe would consist of peaks near -3.0, -1.0, 1.0, and 3.0 mm/s.



Figure 2. Area fractions (a, b) and hyperfine parameters (c, d) of iron sites in bridgmanite $Mg_{0.868}Fe_{0.087}Si_{0.944}Al_{0.101}O_{2.994}$ as a function of temperature at 1 bar. The iron sites include $Fe^{2+}I$ (open squares), $Fe^{2+}II$ (open circles), $Fe^{2+}III$ (gray triangles), and Fe^{3+} (solid diamonds). In (d), the curves represent the Debye model fittings for the weighted average of $Fe^{2+}II$ and $Fe^{2+}II$ (solid), $Fe^{2+}III$ (dashed), and Fe^{3+} (gray dotted).



Figure 3. Calculated recoil-free fractions as a function of temperature, according to the Debye model. Black solid and dashed curves represent Fe^{2+} and Fe^{3+} , respectively, in Al-Bm from this study; Gray solid and dashed curves represent Fe^{2+} and Fe^{3+} , respectively, in Al-free Bm from McCammon (1998).



Figure 4. Ternary diagram illustrating the cation substitution mechanisms in bridgmanite in full compositional range (a) and a close-up (b). The end-member compositions Si_2O_4 , $(Mg,Fe^{2+})_2O_2$, and $(Fe^{3+},Al)_2O_3$ are written on the two-cation basis. Lines connecting the trivalent-cation-free composition (Mg, Fe²⁺)SiO₃ to each of the three trivalent-bearing compositions represent (1) (Mg,Fe²⁺)(Fe³⁺,Al)O_{2.5}, oxygen vacancy substitution mechanism, (2) (Fe³⁺,Al)₂O₃, coupled substitution mechanism, and (3) (Fe³⁺,Al)SiO_{3.5}, cation vacancy substitution mechanism. Open and closed symbols represent Al-free and Al-bearing compositions, respectively. Error bars in this study are smaller than the symbol size. More complex compositions including cations other than Mg, Si, Al, and Fe are not included.