MS 5283 R3: Name on machine: Lin Part R3

# Linear partitioning in binary solutions: a review with a novel partitioning array

# S. A. Morse\*

Department of Geosciences, University of Massachusetts, 611 North Pleasant Street, Amherst, Massachusetts, 01003-9297, U. S. A.

\*E-Mail: tm@geo.umass.edu

1

## Revision 3 8 January 2015

## ABSTRACT

| 2  | Linear partitioning refers to a graphical plot of a partition ratio $D \le 1.0$ against a                   |
|----|---|
| 3  | composition ratio $X_2$ given as the mole fraction of a refractory component 2.                             |
| 4  | When this plot is linear from $D = 1.0$ , $X_2 = 0.0$ , its intercept at $X_2 = 1.0$ is a value             |
| 5  | on the D scale here identified as the value of the exchange coefficient $K_{\rm D}$ . The                   |
| 6  | plot is generated from phase compositions 1,2 in states $L_{\rm V}$ or $L_{\rm S}$ or $S_{\rm S}$ depending |
| 7  | on whether the system is a boiling mixture, a melting equilibrium, or a solid-solid                         |
| 8  | equilibrium. The linear partitioning equation so generated is a mathematical                                |
| 9  | description of a binary solution loop, and it has the form $y = ax + b$ where $y = D$ ,                     |
| 10 | a = $K_D$ , x = $X_2$ , and b = 1-x = 1- $X_2$ . In practice, the linearity is tested by                    |
| 11 | regressing values of D against $X_2$ to find the intercept $K_D$ . If linearity occurs, the                 |
| 12 | system is a binary solution loop; if it does not occur, the system is not a binary                          |
| 13 | loop. Strict linearity is not always observed even in true binary solutions; in such                        |
| 14 | cases the path to $K_{\rm D}$ may be either segmented or moderately curved. Such is the                     |
| 15 | case with the melting equilibria of both plagioclase and olivine, possibly a clue to                        |
| 16 | the non-ideality of solution. Loop width is an inverse function of $K_{\rm D}$ , and can                    |
| 17 | vary with pressure as in the case of plagioclase in troctolites and gabbros.                                |
| 18 | Systems with two loops joined at a common minimum or maximum are called                                     |

| 19 | azeotropes and all of them show linear partitioning. Sanidine crystalline solutions            |
|----|--|
| 20 | form a classic example of such behavior. When the system An-Ab is revisited to                 |
| 21 | repeat the Bowen thermodynamic calculation from the latent heats of fusion with                |
| 22 | modern data, the array shows a single modest curvature. The monoclinic                         |
| 23 | pyroxene pairs augite and pigeonite form a binary loop; augite - orthopyroxene                 |
| 24 | does not. The olivine compositions of rocks in the Kiglapait intrusion follow a                |
| 25 | linear partitioning line with $K_{\rm D} = 0.26$ for data above fifty percent crystallized (50 |
| 26 | PCS). All the rocks below 50 PCS occupy a new trend in the linear partitioning                 |
| 27 | diagram. This trend is anchored at $D = 0.0$ , $X_2^{S} = 1.0$ and runs to the calculated      |
| 28 | liquid composition at its intercept with the $D = 1.0$ upper bound. The new trend is           |
| 29 | the graphical solution to the ambient liquid composition given the crystal                     |
| 30 | composition and the value of $K_{\rm D}$ . Its origin involves at least three working          |
| 31 | hypotheses not yet fully explored.   |

Key words: Binary solutions, linear partitioning, phase equilibrium, plagioclase, olivine, augite,
melting, crystallization.

34

#### INTRODUCTION

35 Linear partitioning in binary solutions is a device by which fractionation or reactive 36 equilibrium processes can be explored mathematically and compared with natural or 37 experimental results. Linearity occurs when a ratio of mole fractions is a linear function of 38 composition in a binary solution. If this condition fails to occur, the object studied is not a 39 binary solution. In this review the intent is to organize previous derivations and expositions into 40 a concise collective whole with examples drawn from boiling mixtures, feldspars, pyroxenes and 41 olivine. This exercise results in a geometrical solution to the problem of finding the liquid 42 composition of a binary mixture when the crystal composition and crystal-liquid exchange 43 coefficient are known or given. It is then possible to introduce a new and unforeseen application 44 that defines a liquid composition but has plausible origins still being explored.

45 Abbreviations used in this paper are listed in Table 1.

46

#### **GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS**

47 The linear partitioning equation is the mathematical description of a binary solution loop. It is the simple equation y = ax + b where y is the partition coefficient, a is the exchange 48 49 coefficient, x (in melting equilibria) is the refractory crystal composition, and b = 1-x. This equation first appeared in a discussion of olivine in the Kiglapait Intrusion (Morse, 1996) in 50 which its chief purpose was to aid in the calculation of Rayleigh fractionation by iteration in 51 small steps. This operation was accomplished by adjusting the partition coefficient at every step 52 53 of the iteration using the current value of the exchange coefficient. For melting equilibria the 54 linear partitioning equation takes the form

$$_{55} \qquad D = K_D \cdot X_2^S + X_1^S \qquad (1)$$

where *D* is the partition coefficient set  $\le 1.0$  and defined as  $X_1^{S}/X_1^{L}$ , *X* is a mole fraction, *S* is a solid crystalline solution, *L* is liquid, component 1 is the low-temperature melting component and component 2 the corresponding high-temperature melting component. The *exchange coefficient*  $K_D$  is the double ratio of moles *n*:  $(n1/n2)^S$  so formed also as to be  $\le 1.0$ . The equation is generally used by regressing values of *D* against  $X_2^S$  to test for unity at  $X_2^S = 0$  and to find the intercept  $K_D$  at  $X_2^S = 1.0$ .

This formulation, developed more fully below, was then subsequently tested against a variety of melting equilibria, boiling mixtures (*L-V* equilibria), and solid-solid assemblages stimulated by the suggestion of *garnet-chlorite* or *biotite-garnet* Mg-Fe exchange within multicomponent systems (Ramberg, 1952). The history after the olivine application is contained in papers by Morse (1997, 2000, 2001) and summarized in Morse (2013).

Some results of these explorations are listed in Table 2. They run from the standards of
igneous petrology in the melting loops of olivine, plagioclase, alkali feldspars and pyroxenes, to
systems with water, systems at pressure, solid-solid mantle equilibria such as magnesiowüstite,
spinel, augite-olivine equilibria, chlorite-garnet and high-temperature biotite-garnet. Another

result in multi-component systems is the increase of  $K_D$  with pressure for plagioclase crystallizing with pyroxene and olivine, to a value exceeding 1.0 at 15 kbar (Morse, 2013), a result that would suggest the presence of an azeotrope (a melting maximum) except that it is in fact the breakdown of plagioclase to spinel, garnet, and two aluminous pyroxenes (McIntosh, 2009).

For *L-V* and *S-S* equilibria the notation of linear partitioning needs to be changed to be more general in terms of components and ratios. This is done in Morse (2000) and need not concern us in the present mineralogical context. There are attendant thermodynamic considerations, developed in that paper as well; these are of secondary interest here.

80

## Systematics of Linear Partitioning

#### 81 Notation

The conventions of Beattie et al. (1993) are followed herein. Problems eternally arise because in some conventions the *partition coefficient D* and the *exchange coefficient K<sub>D</sub>* have been interchanged, at least in name. The distinction can be important, because in the convention adopted here the partition coefficient can have a thermal dimension whereas the exchange coefficient is rigorously athermal. The partition coefficient is akin to the Nernst *distribution coefficient* and has often been called that in the older geochemical literature.

88

## ALGEBRAIC DERIVATION FOR MELTING OF CRYSTALLINE SOLUTIONS

89 Here we derive equation (1) for melting equilibria so as to clarify each step of the 90 development. For a solid phase *S* and liquid phase *L* we define the *partition coefficient D* set 91 always to be  $\leq 1.0$  and hence

92 
$$D_{X_1}^{S/L} = X_1^S / X_1^L$$
 (2)

4

93 where the *mole fraction*  $X_1$  is the normalized fraction of the low-melting component (1), i.e.

$$_{94}$$
  $X_1 = n_1 / (n_1 + n_2)$  (3)

95 where n is the number of moles and component (2) is the high-melting component. The notation

96 may apply in other cases with different names, to units of mass, gram-atoms, or oxygen-

97 normalized cations. Defining the *exchange coefficient*  $K_{\rm D}$  as

98 
$$K_{D(n1/n2)}^{S/L} = \frac{(n_1 / n_2)^S}{(n_1 / n_2)^L}$$
 (4)

and using this, we obtain

100 
$$D_{X_1}^{S/L} = K_{D_{1/2}}^{S/L} \cdot (1 - X_1^S) + X_1^S$$
 (5)

$$101 \qquad = (K_D \cdot X_2^s) + X_1^s \quad (6)$$

102 which is the linear partitioning equation relating the partition coefficient to the exchange

103 coefficient via the crystal compositions (Morse, 1996).

## 104 **Proof**

The above result is shown to be true as follows, using for petrologic interest a familiar caseof olivine melting (Morse, 1997). Defining

$$_{107} \quad K_{D} \equiv \frac{\left(n_{Fe} / n_{Mg}\right)^{S}}{\left(n_{Fe} / n_{Mg}\right)^{L}} = \frac{\left(X_{Fe}^{S} / X_{Mg}^{S}\right)}{\left(X_{Fe}^{L} / X_{Mg}^{L}\right)} = \frac{X_{Fa}^{S} / \left(1 - X_{Fa}^{S}\right)}{X_{Fa}^{L} / \left(1 - X_{Fa}^{L}\right)} (7)$$

5

108 we have

109 
$$K_D(X_{Fa}^L) \cdot (1 - X_{Fa}^S) = X_{Fa}^S (1 - X_{Fa}^L)$$
 (8)

110 
$$K_D(X_{Fa}^L) - K_D X_{Fa}^L \cdot (X_{Fa}^S) = X_{Fa}^S - X_{Fa}^S X_{Fa}^L$$
 (9)

111 
$$K_D - K_D X_{Fa}^S = \frac{X_{Fa}^S}{X_{Fa}^L} - X_{Fa}^S$$
 (10)

112 and finally

113 
$$K_D(1 - X_{Fa}^S) = D - X_{Fa}^S$$
 QED (11)

## 114 **Discussion and an application**

The geometric expression of this result is illustrated in Fig. 1. If the system is a true binary 115 loop then the partitioning is strictly linear from (0,1) to the value of  $K_{\rm D}$  at  $X_2^{\rm S} = 1.0$ . This was 116 117 found to be almost true for olivine as computed by Bradley (1962) from the data of Bowen and 118 Schairer (1935), but the actual data points for Fe-rich olivines defined a slightly variable array 119 above the linear approximation (Morse, 1997 Fig. 1). The result is that in the real case the 120 implied value of  $K_{\rm D}$  changes from 0.227 at pure Fo to 0.266 at pure Fa. Although this would 121 seem to be a trivial difference, it is probably not erroneous. A more significant effect on olivine 122 partitioning is the structure of the liquid, to be discussed.

## 123 **Loop width and** $K_{\rm D}$

124 The exchange coefficient  $K_D$  carries the essential feature of the binary loop because its value 125 relates inversely to the width of the loop. Thus a low value of  $K_D$  describes a wide or fat loop 126 with a large distance between the solidus and liquidus, whereas a high value of  $K_D$  describes a 127 narrow loop. It helps to remember this relationship if note is taken that a  $K_D$  of 1.0 means a loop 128 with no width at all: a single line. This limit is actually achieved in azeotropes, systems with a 129 maximum or minimum, as we shall see. And of course, the lower limit of  $K_D = 0$  describes a 130 rectangular box, hence no longer a loop. This loop-width feature of  $K_D$  is quantified for an 131 arbitrary special case in Fig. 2a. Figure 2b describes another feature of  $K_D$ , the pressure effect 132 on natural plagioclase feldspar.

133

#### APPLICATION TO BOILING MIXTURES

134 In an earlier treatment (Morse, 2000) the formulation of equation (5) was expanded for 135 boiling mixtures to erect a general notation for components (i, j) in place of (1, 2) and states of 136 matter (L, V) for boiling mixtures. An example of a rigorously linear result is shown in Fig. 3 137 here. The cited paper also illustrated this notation in a reverse linear partitioning diagram, and 138 one example of a boiling mixture was shown in three frames: one with Xi in the liquid; one with Xi in the vapor, and a third with a comparison of both  $Di^{-1}$  and Di, plotted against the vapor 139 composition. In that case the inverse formulation  $D_i^{-1}$  is linear and the direct formulation  $D_i$  is a 140 141 concave-up curve. This reference also showed a pronounced failure of linear partitioning in a boiling mixture (CCL4 - Acetone at 0.600 bar), reproduced here as Fig. 4. In this case the strong 142 143 curvature of the data require a distorted loop with a nearly isothermal tail. The reference also 144 lists the outcome of examining 11 boiling mixtures among which five clearly failed to yield 145 linear partitioning.

## 146 Azeotropes

An azeotrope is a pair of interconnected binary solutions melting (condensing) at a common point that is either a thermal (pressure) minimum or a maximum. Familiar examples in petrology are the alkali feldspars. The application of linear partitioning to azeotropes requires dual partitioning equations; the identities of components *i* and *j* are switched at the azeotropic point (AP). Each regression is carried out independently and each finds a unique value of the composition of the AP. These are averaged if required to find a joint solution, and the treatment 153 of regressions to find the intercepts at each end member is discussed in the referenced article.

154 Continuing the literature search in boiling mixtures, of six azeotropic mixtures examined, all 155 were linear, including both *T-X* and *P-X* variations. Typical correlations found for azeotropes 156 have a correlation coefficient  $R^2 > 0.99$ . Because of the common azeotropic point, all 157 azeotropes are made of binary solution loops. This result leads us back to familiar silicate 158 systems.

159

#### Alkali feldspars: the azeotropic system Ab-Or

160 Azeotropic systems are typically non-ideal mixtures. A major contribution to the science of 161 mixing properties in crystalline solutions was made by Waldbaum (1969) on the system NaCl -162 KCl and by Waldbaum and Thompson (1969) on sanidine crystalline solutions in the system 163 NaAlSi<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub>-KAlSi<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub>, Albite-Orthoclase, Ab-Or. Because their solution models are so elegant, 164 they make especially good examples of linear partitioning. Both systems were figured and 165 described in Morse (2000); a new version of the Ab-Or system is shown here in Fig. 5, using all 166 data from the original Table 2 of Waldbaum and Thompson (1969). Part A of the figure shows 167 the T-X binary loop with a minimum, the azeotropic point AP at 1063 °C. The temperatures are 168 uncorrected to Ab = L at 1100 °C (see the An-Ab system discussed below). The sanidine (Or 169 component) limb is metastable with respect to leucite plus liquid, caused by the incongruent 170 melting of Or (e.g., Morse, 1994). Part B of Fig. 5 is the linear partitioning diagram showing the 171 separate treatments of the two limbs of the binary loop. Here the protocols described above are put to work: the identities of  $X_1$  and  $X_2$  (reverting to the previous notation) are switched at the 172 173 AP and separate regressions are run on each. This interchange means that, for example in the Ab-rich limb,  $X_2 = Ab$  and  $X_1 = Or$ ; as always component (1) is the low-*T* component. For each 174 limb the linear partitioning equation is modified so that  $D = K_D X_2^S + (a \cdot X_1^S)$  where a is a fitting 175 176 parameter, with calculated values shown in the figure. The values of  $K_{\rm D}$  are received in the 177 regressions. As commonly found, the values at the extrema of composition are highly sensitive 178 to rounding error and exact coincidence with the regressed limit is rare. In this example the last

1/23

179 data points are omitted from the regression, which has in both cases  $R^2 = 0.999$ .

180

#### **EFFECT OF A THIRD COMPONENT**

181 Simple binary solutions are ideal systems for rigorous understanding of the geometric and 182 physical principles underlying their behavior. In many cases, the addition of a third component 183 would not have a profound effect on the binary equilibria. For example, the addition of quartz to 184 the system Ab-Or cited above does not by itself change the fundamentally azeotropic nature of the 185 binary loop, because silica is common to both binary components in similar ways. On the other 186 hand, the addition of a new component contained in only one of the binary pairs is likely to have a 187 significant effect. Such is the effect of adding a Ca-pyroxene to plagioclase. This classic example 188 of the system Di-An-Ab due to Bowen (1915) furnishes yet another linear partition of interest for 189 the information it yields. The ternary diagram in Fig. 6a (inset) reminds us of the single cotectic 190 running through the ternary with diopside crystallizing on one side and plagioclase on the other 191 side.

192 Readers may recall that the liquid in the plagioclase field runs sharply toward the cotectic, but 193 when that is reached, the liquid makes a hard turn towards Ab and runs directly away from both of 194 the Ca-rich phases on the Di-An sideline. Accordingly, the fractionation toward Ab speeds up 195 greatly when the liquid is multiply-saturated. But we diverge from the task at hand. The main 196 feature of Fig. 6a is the T-X plot showing the steepening toward the Ab end and in particular the 197 incomplete termination near Ab. This occurs because when the liquid reaches the sideline Ab-Di 198 it leaves the ternary plane into multicomponent space involving all components of all three phases 199 liquid, pyroxene, and plagioclase. The details need not concern us here, but of some interest is the 200 composition of the plagioclase when the liquid reaches the sideline.

Bowen's tools and his fine-grained crystals were not well suited to this determination. Figure 6b contains the answer. Bowen's original three-phase triangle determinations yield the points marked with filled black rectangles. These eight points were found through a series of subtle and 204 canny experiments involving several bulk compositions and the beginning of melting. In two 205 experiments using electron microprobe determinations by Kushiro (1973), shown as filled 206 triangles, one lies exactly on Bowen's line and another well off the line despite a long run time. 207 The line is the linear regression on all but two points, yielding a value of  $K_{\rm D}$  = 0.26. The upper end 208 of the correlation misses the upper corner and instead lands at D = 0.975. From the partitioning 209 equation the limiting plagioclase composition is An 9, and that is where the T-X diagram places it. 210 The loop is not strictly binary, but its treatment with linear partitioning brings out a useful quantification of its imperfection. Of major interest is the value of  $K_{\rm D} = 0.26$  given by the 211 212 regression, because this gives us a best 1-atm value for plagioclase - liquid partitioning in a 213 pyroxene - saturated system, corresponding to the nature of many mafic igneous rock types 214 including norite and gabbro. This value serves as the anchor for the effect of pressure on the value of  $K_{\rm D}$  in pyroxene-saturated plagioclase previously mentioned and as shown in figures 5 and 7 of 215 216 Morse (2013).

In summary, the addition of a third component can change the partitioning of a binary loop and needs to be considered when seeking information about the behavior of liquids in natural systems.

220

## **IDEALITY IN BINARY SOLUTIONS**

Ideal solutions evidently display linear partitioning. Non-ideal solutions might not be expected to do so. Nevertheless, as the Ab-Or system has dramatically shown, linear partitioning can occur even in an azeotrope for which the substantial mixing energies were famously calculated from thermodynamic principles.

A system at equilibrium has a locally minimized Gibbs free energy related to the exchange coefficient and the activity coefficient by

$$_{227} \quad \ln K_{\rm D} = -\frac{\Delta G^{\circ}}{RT} - \ln K_{\gamma} \, (12)$$

10

where  $\gamma$  is the activity coefficient and  $K\gamma$  is the ratio of activities in one phase divided by the ratio of activities in the other phase when there is a simple equilibrium of the form a = b. For the case  $K\gamma = 1.0$ , the solution is said to be ideal, but alternatively their ratio is fortuitously equal to 1.0. In the case of the azeotropes (for which  $K_D$  is a constant for each individual side), a practical result must be the assumption that the activity coefficient is fortuitously equal to 1.0. In this case, the linearity of the partition coefficient against composition says nothing whatever about the individual activities of the conjoined binary solutions.

The plagioclase feldspar system is expected to be non-ideal from the behavior of  $Al^{3+}$  in An and Ab and the disorder of AlSi in anorthite (*e.g.*, Mysen and Richet, 2005). In an earlier treatment (Morse, 1997) it was shown that for Bowen's (1913) system An-Ab the partitioning was not linear, but curved, concave-up, with an intercept at  $K_D = 0.282$ . It was also shown that the departure from linearity became less at high pressure. We may now revisit this problem with a brief review of Bowen's analysis of the data, in which possibilities arise for retrieving fundamental information from linear partitioning.

242

#### MELTING IN THE SYSTEM AN-AB AT 1-ATM

#### 243 Introduction

244 It is now a century plus two years since Bowen (1913) published "The melting phenomena of the plagioclase feldspars," a treatise that is surely the rock-bottom foundation of all modern 245 246 igneous petrology. In this document, Bowen not only determined the liquidus and solidus curves 247 and temperatures of the plagioclase loop, but also used thermodynamics to analyze the result. In 248 this exercise, he proceeded not merely to assume the provisional enthalpies of fusion of An and 249 Ab, but ultimately to *extract* one of these values from the experimental array. He then conducted 250 an error analysis (Bowen's Table V) by changing each value of the enthalpy of fusion by 10% and recalculating the implied temperature for each of the liquidus and solidus. In this exercise he 251 252 showed that the result of the 10% variation was "well beyond the limits of error of the temperature 253 measurements."

In passing, it is worth our notice to cite two of Bowen's classic statements, as follows:

255 "van Laar derives a more rigid relation which contains factors for the heats of mixing in both

- 256 phases, but in its application he finds it necessary to neglect these and the equations then
- reduce substantially to the form given above" (page 590)<sup>1</sup>

And again from p. 590:

259 "If the calculated mean molal latent heat of melting of anorthite is divided by the formula

260 weight, the result is  $29000 \div 278 = 104.2$ . Åkerman and Vogt have found by direct

261 measurement that the latent heat of melting of anorthite is 105 cal. per gram, which agrees

well with the calculated value. The extraordinary agreement is, of course, in part pureaccident."

264 NB: "in part"

Bowen's Figure 8 shows the calculated liquidus and solidus curves for plagioclase along with the experimental data. All the points lie on the lines except three solidus points close to the Ab endmember, which lie at lower temperatures than observed.

## 268 **Present work**

The current exercise to find a modern working diagram for plagioclase is basically that of Bowen (1913). The history of the albite melting point is interesting. With much struggle, Bowen concluded that this end member melted at  $1100 \pm 2$  °C. This result was later changed to 1118 °C by Schairer and Bowen (1956), and then returned to 1100 °C by Anovitz and Blencoe (1999; see discussion by Lange, 2003). The melting point of An (1553 °C instead of Bowen's 1550 °C) is taken from Osborn (1942). The liquidus and solidus curves were first recalculated from the latent

heats of fusion using Bowen's value for  $\Delta H_{\rm f}$  (An) = 121.3 kJ and the value for  $\Delta H_{\rm f}$  (Ab) = 59.28

Bowen does not provide a reference for van Laar, but presumably refers to the noteworthy paper of 1908 now referenced here. Note that the problem of non-ideal mixing goes back to van Laar, along with the partial solution (i.e.: ignore it).

kJ (compared to Bowen's 53.3 kJ) from Robie et al. (1978). The liquidus curve (Fig. 7a) so
calculated fits Bowen's data almost exactly. The solidus curve is continuous (Fig. 7a) instead of
the former straight line at high values of An followed by a curve to the Ab end point (*e.g.*, Morse,
1994 p. 63).

There is an objection to the use of modern data for the latent heats of fusion when they were determined on glass (quenched melt) which is frozen in at the glass transition. In consequence, the heat of fusion calculated from solution calorimetry of glasses, as done in the recent literature including Robie et al. (1978), is not the  $\Delta H$  of melting (*e.g.*, Richet and Bottinga, 1986). There is, however, a purely empirical approach in which we may test the results of new data inputs against the experimental *T-X* data of Bowen (1913). This procedure reflects the original use of the phase diagram from which Bowen extracted at least one of the heats of fusion, as discussed above.

287 Still using Bowen's  $\Delta H_f(An) = 121.3$  kJ, the partitioning plot is linear in two segments joined 288 at An<sub>60</sub> (dotted line in Fig. 7b) and a  $K_{\rm D}$  value of 0.3. However, using instead an updated value  $\Delta H_{\rm f}$  (An) = 134.6 kJ (Navrotsky et al. 1980), the partitioning line becomes a single curve with  $K_{\rm D}$ 289 290 = 0.276, as shown by the heavy solid line in Fig. 7b. As also shown in the figure, the data near the An end of the array are typically scattered because an error of only 0.001 in  $X_{An}$  has a large effect 291 292 on the result. This marriage of old and new data continues the Bowen principle of testing for a 293 thermodynamic quantity by fitting to the experimental data. In this comparison there is no 294 empirical evidence for rejecting the 1980 result, despite its origin from glass. As a result, we have 295 a reasonable interim model for plagioclase alone to compare with more complex bulk 296 compositions.

297

#### Solid-solid equilibria: a pyroxene solvus

The system Wo-En-Fs furnishes in its lower half the familiar **pyroxene quadrilateral** bounded by the Mg-Fe solutions Diopside-Hedenbergite at the top ( $X_{Wo} = 0.5$ ) and Enstatite-Ferrosilite at the bottom ( $X_{Wo} = 0$ ). This diagram features a three - dimensional solvus whose limbs separate Ca-rich augites from Ca-poor pigeonites accompanied by even Ca-poorer 302 orthopyroxenes. The solvus has the form of an eastward-plunging anticline that becomes narrower 303 with pressure as the temperatures rise (Lindsley, 1983). Two partitioning plots taken graphically 304 from Fig. 9a of Lindsley (1983) are shown in Fig. 8. In the upper panel the augite-pigeonite pairs 305 show an ideal linear partitioning relationship with a value of  $K_{\rm D} = 0.74$  received from the 306 regression, and an exact intercept at D = 1.0. This result is not unsurprising for the two 307 structurally-similar monoclinic crystal species. Using the same original diagram we find that the 308 augite-orthopyroxene partitioning (Fig. 8b) is erratic – that is, the data points are randomly distributed without slope and a rough estimate of  $D = K_D = 0.94$ . For these two mixed-309 crystallographic phases there is no binary solution loop and the relationships are not athermal. 310 311 They are not well-related to temperature either. Examples of the pyroxene solvus at higher 312 pressures, 5 to 15 kbar, are also furnished in the Lindsley (1983) address, but are derived from the 313 1-atm solvus and are not reviewed here except to say that the augite-pigeonite pairs also give 314 linear partitioning results at pressure.

315

#### **EXTENSION TO MULTI-COMPONENT SYSTEMS**

316 At Figure 2 it was mentioned that linear plagioclase partitioning could be studied within such 317 multi-component systems as anorthosite and gabbro. Experimental studies by Morse et al. (2004), 318 McIntosh (2009), and Fram and Longhi (1992) all involved bulk compositions made up of natural 319 mineral components. The liquid compositions for binary solutions within multi-component 320 systems are obtained from the normative calculation of mineral components in quenched glass for 321 which the composition is determined by electron probe. The norm calculations are commonly 322 made in oxygen units and corrected for pyroxene compositions as found in nature rather than, for 323 example, on the Di-Hd join at 50% wollastonite. Further details are reported by Morse et al. 324 (2004). Extension to a global range of bulk compositions is reported in the study of large databases by Morse (2013), in which the problems and pitfalls of liquid calculations are discussed 325 326 at some length. In what follows, the linear partitioning principle is extended to a suite of natural 327 olivine compositions.

328

#### **KIGLAPAIT OLIVINE STUDIES**

329 Here we begin with a review of olivine compositions in the entire intrusion (Morse, 1979a; 330 1996). Liquid compositions are then introduced from earlier-published estimates. Partitioning of 331 augite against liquid and against olivine is reviewed with linear plots. The choice of exchange 332 coefficient values is reviewed in the light of liquid structure as represented by NBO/T indices 333 (where NBO is the sum of non-bridging oxygens and T is the number of tetrahedral cations: 334 Mysen et al., 1982). Then the linear partitioning plots for olivine - liquid are examined. This 335 exercise reveals a novel second linear array that identifies the liquid composition and might be 336 used to deduce a previously existing liquid composition.

## 337 Stratigraphic relationships

Olivine compositions in the Kiglapait intrusion are plotted in stratigraphic context, Fig. 9, along with key arrivals of new phases augite, Fe-Ti oxide minerals, and apatite. The *X* axis is stratigraphic and runs from the base of the intrusion at the left to the top at the right. The PCS scale represents the volume percent solidified as calculated from cross sections (Morse, 1969). The logarithmic scale is based on the fraction of remaining liquid  $F_L$ , equal to 1-(PCS/100). It is used to display quantities in detail that would be simply a blur at linear scale.

344 The initial trend in the Lower Zone is limited in variation from  $Fo_{71}$  to about  $Fo_{61}$ . As shown 345 also in Fig. 8 of Morse (2008) the expectation for cotectic olivine + plagioclase would be 346 fractionation to  $Fo_{40}$  at 65 PCS. The retardation of the natural olivine variation in the Lower Zone 347 can be attributed in considerable part to the evolving ferric iron component of the magma, which 348 reduces the activity of the ferrous end-member fayalite. Much of the other scatter to high-Fo 349 values, as found for example after 99.9 PCS, can also be attributed to the contact of olivine with 350 grains of magnetite. Of note in the figure is the cluster of Fo-rich olivines labeled "Oxygen 351 spikes" in the stratigraphic region after the Fe-Ti oxide minerals become important. The cause of 352 the oxygen spikes was discussed in Morse (1979a,b) and particularly in Morse (1980) where the 353 oxygen and silica activities of the magma were described in some detail. In that contribution,

reversed rims on olivine grains among the titanomagnetite grains of the Main Ore Band were reported in Figure 4, ranging from Fo<sub>58.8</sub> to as high as Fo<sub>66</sub>. A jump in  $f_{O2}$  from well below FMQ to well above FMQ at the top of the Main Ore Band was shown in figure 10 of that paper. This oxidation effect on local olivine compositions can be seen as a low- $f_{O2}$  counterpart to the olivine hiatus in the Skaergaard intrusion, where the loss of olivine can be ascribed to a locally high silica activity that de-stabilizes Mg-olivine until the magma eventually evolves to a more iron-rich composition that stabilizes Fe-olivine (*e.g.*, Morse et al. 1980).

361

## LIQUID COMPOSITIONS FOR KIGLAPAIT OLIVINE PARTITIONING

Kiglapait olivines and their parent liquids were discussed in detail by Morse (1996) and Morse (2001). The result for the Kiglapait liquid compositions in  $X_{\text{Fe}}$  = molecular Fe<sup>2+</sup>/(Fe<sup>2+</sup>+Mg) was listed in Table 2 of he 1996 paper. These compositions were generated from the linear partitioning equation assuming  $K_{\text{D}}$  = 0.33 for all of the Lower Zone, 0-84 PCS, and varying to 0.45 at the end of crystallization based on earlier literature data. These assumptions are re-visited below.

## 368 Augite-Olivine relations

369 The linear partitioning of Kiglapait augite with liquid is demonstrated in Fig. 10a from data 370 calculated from the QUILF equilibria with olivine and liquid (Morse, 1996). The solid-solid plot 371 of augite on olivine compositions is shown in Fig. 10b in which three points lie well above the 372 linear partitioning line defined by the other six points. This result was ascribed (Morse, 2001) to 373 metastable, supercooled compositions of augite that crystallized early from augite-oversaturated 374 liquids and became too Fe-rich as a result. [It might be thought that the olivines were at fault 375 instead, being too Mg-rich, but the Mg-rich ("Ox-spikes") olivine compositions were not used in 376 the cited paper.]

377

#### LIQUID POLYMERIZATION AND OLIVINE PARTITIONING

378 Experimental and theoretical investigation has shown that the partitioning of olivine and

16

1/23

379 silicate melts clearly depends on the polymerization of the melt. Among significant steps in the 380 evolution of this principle are studies by Kushiro and Walter (1998), Toplis (2004), and Mysen 381 (2007). The NBO/T data<sup>2</sup> for experimental Kiglapait liquid compositions (Fig. 11) show a base 382 line near a value 0.8, increasing to > 1.0 near the augite + oxide mineral maximum, and with a 383 long gap to ~1.0 in the Upper Zone. Very mafic samples have high values of NBO/T, as seen in 384 three cases at 95 and  $\sim$ 99.9 PCS. All other liquid samples plot among those for the rocks, so the 385 paucity of data for liquids between 93 and 99.7 PCS is of little concern. This range in NBO/T lies 386 essentially at the crest of Mysen's (2007) figure 7 where the values of  $K_{\rm D}$  range from ~0.23 to 387 0.35, with a mean of 0.27. A formal calculation with a best fit to the experimental data can be 388 made as follows. Using a best fit for the experimental data represented by the gray filled circles in 389 Fig. 11, we have a stratigraphic variation of NBO/T, as follows. For x = the stratigraphic measure "-log  $F_{\rm I}$ ", NBO/T (experimental) = -.0614x<sup>2</sup> + 0.2811x + 0.6452. From this and the diagram of 390  $K_{\rm D}$  v. NBO/T of Mysen's (2007) figure 7 we solve for  $K_{\rm D}$  as follows: For x = NBO/T,  $K_{\rm D} = 0.01x^3$ 391 -  $0.1053x^2 + 0.2118x + 0.155$ . The values of  $K_D$  vary from 0.25 to 0.27, with a mean of 0.26. 392 393 These values are significantly lower than previously assumed to be  $\ge 0.33$ .

From these results we can now generate a new estimate of the liquid composition in
equilibrium with the observed olivine compositions in the Kiglapait intrusion. The result is shown
in Fig. 12.

397

## LINEAR PARTITIONING OF OLIVINE IN THE KIGLAPAIT INTRUSION

## 398 Region 50 PCS to the end of crystallization

399 The partitioning result for the whole intrusion is shown in Fig. 13, where the derived criterion

400 of the mean value of  $K_{\rm D} = 0.26$  is identified by a horizontal line. The data for all stratigraphic

401 levels above 50 PCS are shown as black filled circles. The data are partly from the Lower Zone,

402 50-84 PCS, and the rest are from the Upper Zone, >84 PCS. The previously noted "oxygen

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Calculations of NBO/T for this contribution were made in a spreadsheet kindly furnished by B. O. Mysen.

403 spikes" from Fig. 9 are clearly revealed in this linear partitioning plot. The scatter of data about 404 the nominal trend line is to a lesser extent due to the small variation of  $K_D$  values  $\pm 0.01$  from the 405 mean of 0.26, and to greater extent due to local variations in crystal nucleation and growth, and the

406 subsequent effects of trapped liquid.

#### 407 Lower Zone 0-50 PCS

The data plotted in gray filled circles occupy a completely different trend in the linear partitioning diagram. The trend originates precisely at the origin (1, 0). The crystal compositions are measured and therefore unquestioned. These samples do not plot as expected for reasons discussed below. This array is the graphical solution to the problem of finding the liquid composition at the y = 1.0 intercept, given the crystal composition and the value of  $K_D$ . The novel array has the equation y = -ax + a, where  $a \ge 1.0$  is a function of slope, as shown near the base of Fig. 13.

415 INTERPRETATIONS OF THE NOVEL ARRAY

416 It is essential here to recapitulate the origin of the partitioning arrays and particularly the new 417 array. The crystal compositions are measured in grain mounts and represent secure input data. The 418 liquid compositions are calculated from the crystal compositions using the linear partitioning 419 equation and the experimental values of NBO/T and  $K_{\rm D}$ . It is of interest that the upper intercept 420 value of the new array at D = 1.0 does reliably represent the liquid composition in equilibrium 421 with the nominal maximum crystal composition at  $Fo_{71}$ . This fact demonstrates internal consistency, given the value of  $K_{\rm D}$  used. It is also to be noted that the lower values of  $K_{\rm D}$  now 422 423 used, based on the experimental NBO/T, are lower than the Roeder-Emslie result and they 424 consequently describe a fatter loop than that shown in Fig. 1a (but not as fat as that in Fig. 1b). 425 There are at least three plausible origins for the new array. It could represent equilibrium

426 crystallization in which cumulus olivine crystals have reacted with intercumulus (trapped) liquid

having the composition of the main magma. Or it could represent partial quenching of magma in a
chilled margin in which liquids were to variable extent supercooled to the solidus. Or it could
represent a mistaken assumption that the liquid producing the new array was that of the main
magma, whereas it was in fact a magma with a more evolved composition.

431 These multiple working hypotheses can be tested in various ways. The first is to test the 432 evidence from plagioclase. The next is to test the stratigraphic relationships of the samples in the 433 array. Another is to find a calculation of some assumed quantity that makes the new array 434 disappear. All three of these tests are in progress, and the final result will be reported in a separate 435 contribution. It can be anticipated that some degree of each cause could play a role, but that one 436 central principle will be dominant. The equilibrium crystallization hypothesis is mostly falsified 437 by the plagioclase data and the lack of correlation with measured trapped liquid volumes. The 438 extent of the array to half the entire volume of the Kiglapait magma makes the quenching notion 439 seem unlikely. It remains to test and document the extent and effect of the liquid composition, and 440 to find the least ambiguous result.

441

#### IMPLICATIONS

442 The study of linear partitioning and its systematics leads to new questions and answers about 443 old rocks – the ones we see that crystallized in the past. It is a tool that allows the observer to 444 calculate a magma composition from the crystal composition. Although mathematical and simple, 445 it leads into serious considerations about unknown mixing properties of melts and crystals. It 446 presents the following dilemma. In azeotropic systems such as Albite-Orthoclase where two loops 447 meet in a conjugate minimum, we know very well the non-ideality of the solutions (solid and 448 liquid). And yet the linear partitioning arrays are rigorously straight. So linear partitioning in such 449 cases reveals nothing about the non-ideality of the liquid. Without the azeotropic constraint, some 450 systems also show rigorously straight linearity, whilst other systems require curved or segmented 451 partitioning arrays. The plagioclase feldspars are a case in point: they clearly form a true binary 452 loop, but give curved partitioning. Better enthalpy data than used here are required, but the true 453 meaning of the curve must be a target for future enlightenment about the interaction of the mixing

- 454 properties of solutions. The one should predict the other. These are classic systems known and
- 455 studied for 102 years and yet still full of secrets. The novel partitioning array could have
- 456 important consequences for understanding the history of mafic intrusions.
- 457

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

- 458 I am grateful for the comments by an anonymous reviewer that led to correction of some
- 459 significant problems in the manuscript. The intensive review and commentary by Associate Editor
- 460 Bjorn Mysen were extremely helpful and resulted in many improvements and corrections.
- 461 Further intensive attentions by the Editor, Keith Putirka, are gratefully acknowledged. This article
- 462 is based on research supported by NSF under Award No. 0948095.

- Andersen, D.J., Lindsley, D.H., and Davidson, P.M. (1993) QUILF: a Pascal program to assess
  equilibria among Fe-Mg-Mn-Ti oxides, pyroxenes, olivines, and quartz. Computers and
  Geosciences 9, 1333-1350.
- 467 Anovitz, L.M., and Blencoe, J.G. (1999) Dry melting of albite. American Mineralogist 84,
  468 1830-1842.
- 469 Beattie, P., Drake, M., Jones, J., Leeman, W., Longhi, J., McKay, G., Nielsen, R., Shaw, D.,
- 470 Takahashi, E., and Watson, B. (1993), Terminology for trace-element partitioning.
- 471 Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 57, 1605-1606.
- Bowen, N.L. (1913) The melting phenomena of the plagioclase feldspars. American Journal of
  Science 25, 577-599.
- 474 Bowen, N.L. (1915) The crystallization of haplobasaltic, haplodioritic, and related magmas.
- 475 American Journal of Science, 40, 161-185.

Bowen, N.L., and Schairer J.F. (1935) The system, MgO-FeO-SiO<sub>2</sub>. American Journal of Science
5th Series, 29, 151-217.

478 Bradley, R. S. (1962) Thermodynamic calculations on phase equilibria involving fused salts. Part

- 479 II. Solid solutions and application to the olivines. American Journal of Science, 260, 550-
- 480 554.
- 481 Fram, M.S., and Longhi, John (1992) Phase equilibria of dikes associated with Proterozoic

482 anorthosite complexes. American Mineralogist, 77, 605-616.

- 483 Hoover, J.D., and Irvine, T.N. (1978) Liquidus phase relations and Mg-Fe partitioning on part of
- 484 the system  $Mg_2SiO_4$   $Fe_2SiO_4$   $CaMgSi_2O_6$   $KAlSi_3O_8$   $SiO_2$ . Carnegie Institution of
- 485 Washington Year Book 77, 774-784.
- 486 Kushiro, Ikuo (1973) The system diopside-anorthite-albite: determination of compositions of
- 487 coexisting phases. Carnegie Institution of Washington Year Book 72, 502-507.
- Kushiro, Ikuo, and Walter, M. J. (1998) Mg-Fe partitioning between olivine and mafic-ultramafic
  melts. Geophysical Research Letters 25, 2337-2340.
- 490 van Laar, J. J. (1908) Die Schmelz- oder Erstarungskurven bei binären Systemen, wenn die feste
- 491 Phase ein Gemisch (amorphe feste Lösung oder Mischkrystall) der beiden Komponenten ist.
- 492 Zeitschrift Physikalische Chemie, 64, 257-297. [The melting- or evaporation-curve of binary
- 493 systems, when the condensed phase is a mixture (amorphous condensed solution or mix-
- 494 *crystal) of both components. SAM*].
- 495 Lange, R.A. (2003) The fusion curve of albite and the compressibility of  $NaAlSi_3O_8$  liquid with 496 pressure. American Mineralogist, 88, 109-120.
- 497 McIntosh, D.B. (2009) High pressure liquidus studies of the inferred magma composition of the
- 498 Kiglapait layered intrusion, Labrador, Canada. MS thesis, University of Massachusetts.
- 499 Lindsley, D.H. (1983) Pyroxene thermometry. American Mineralogist, 68, 477-493.
- 500 Morse, S. A. (1969) The Kiglapait Layered Intrusion, Labrador. Geological Society of America

- 501 Memoir 112, 204 pp.
- Morse, S.A. (1970) Alkali feldspars with water at 5 kb pressure. Journal of Petrology, 11, 221251.
- Morse, S.A. (1979a) Kiglapait geochemistry I: Systematics, sampling, and density. Journal of
   Petrology, 20, 555-591.
- 506 Morse, S.A. (1979b) Kiglapait geochemistry II: Petrography. Journal of Petrology, 20, 592-624.
- Morse, S.A. (1980) Kiglapait mineralogy II: Fe-Ti oxide minerals and the activities of oxygen and
   silica. Journal of Petrology, 21, 685-719.
- Morse, S.A. (1981) Kiglapait geochemistry IV: The major elements. Geochimica et Cosmochim
  Acta, 45, 461- 479.
- 511 Morse, S.A. (1994) Basalts and Phase Diagrams. Corrected and reprinted by Krieger, Melbourne,
  512 FL, 493 pp.
- Morse, S.A. (1996) Kiglapait mineralogy III: Olivine compositions and Rayleigh fractionation
  models. Journal of Petrology, 37, 1037-1061.
- 515 Morse, S.A. (1997) Binary solutions and the lever rule revisited. Journal of Geology 105, 471516 482.
- 517 Morse, S.A. (2000) Linear partitioning in binary solutions. Geochimica et Cosmochimica
- 518 Acta,64, 2309-2319.
- Morse, S.A. (2001) Augite-olivine equilibria in the Kiglapait Intrusion, Labrador, Canada.
  Canadian Mineralogist, 39, 267-274.
- 521 Morse, S.A. (2008) The internal magma reservoir of large intrusions revealed by multiphase
- 522 Rayleigh fractionation. Journal of Petrology, 49, 2081-2098.
- Morse, S.A. (2012) Plagioclase An range and residual porosity in igneous cumulates of the
  Kiglapait Intrusion. Journal of Petrology, 53, 891-918.

1/23

- 525 Morse, S.A. (2013) Experimental equilibrium tested by plagioclase loop widths. Journal of
- 526 Petrology, 54, 1793-1813.
- Morse, S. A., and Ross, Malcolm (2004). Kiglapait mineralogy IV: The augite series. American
  Mineralogist, 89, 1380-1395.
- 529 Morse, S.A., Brady, J.B., and Sporleder, B.A. (2004) Experimental petrology of the Kiglapait
- intrusion: Cotectic trace for the Lower Zone at 5kb in graphite. Journal of Petrology, 45,2225-2259.
- 532 Morse, S.A., Lindsley D.H, and Williams R.J. (1980) Concerning intensive parameters in the
- 533 Skaergaard intrusion. American Journal of Science, 280-A (Jackson Vol.),159-170.
- 534 Mysen, B.O. (2007) Partitioning of calcium, magnesium, and transition metals between olivine

and melt governed by the structure of the silicate melt at ambient pressure. American

- 536 Mineralogist 92, 844-862.
- 537 Mysen, B.O., and Richet, P. (2005) Silicate Glasses and Melts Properties and Structure.
- 538 Developments in Geochemistry, New York: Elsevier, 548 pp.
- 539 Mysen, B.O., Virgo, D. and Seifert, F.A. (1982) The structure of silicate melts: Implications for
- chemical and physical properties of natural magma. Reviews of Geophysics and Space
  Physics, 20, 353-383.
- 542 Navrotsky, A., Hon, R., Weill, D.F., and Henry, D.J. (1980) Thermochemistry of glasses and
- 543 liquids in the systems  $CaMgSi_2O_6$ - $CaAl_2Si_2O_8$ -NaAlSi\_3O\_8, SiO\_2-CaAl\_2Si\_2O\_8-NaAlSi\_3O\_8 and
- 544  $SiO_2$ -Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>-CaO-Na<sub>2</sub>O. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 44, 1409-1413.
- 545 Nekvasil, H. (1992) Feldspar crystallization in felsic magmas: A review. Transactions Royal
  546 Society Edinburgh Earth Science, 83, 399-407.
- 547 Osborn, E.F. (1942) The system CaSiO<sub>3</sub> diopside anorthite. American Journal of Science 240,
  548 751-788.
- 549 Peterson, A.L. (1999) Quest for the liquid line of descent of the Upper Zone of the Kiglapait

- intrusion, Labrador, Canada: an experimental study. MS thesis, University of Massachusetts,80 pp.
- Ramberg, H. (1952) The Origin of Metamorphic and Metasomatic Rocks. Chicago University
  Press, Chicago.
- Richet, P., and Bottinga, Y. (1986) Thermochemical properties of silicate glasses and liquids: A
  review. Reviews in Geophysics, 24, 1-25.
- 556 Robie, R.A., Hemingway, B.S., and Fisher, J.R. (1978) Thermodynamic properties of minerals and
- related substances at 298.15 K and 1 bar ( $10^5$  Pascals) pressure and at higher temperatures.
- 558 Washington, DC: US Government Printing Office, Geological Survey Bulletin No. 1452.
- 559 Roeder, P.L., and Emslie, R.F. (1970) Olivine-liquid equilibrium. Contributions to Mineralogy
- 560 and Petrology, 29, 275-289.
- 561 Schairer, J.F., and Bowen, N.L. (1956) The system  $Na_2O Al_2O_3 SiO_2$ . American Journal of 562 Science 254, 681-746.
- 563 Toplis, M.J. (2005) The thermodynamics of iron and magnesium partitioning between olivine and
- 564 liquid: criteria for assessing and predicting equilibrium in natural and experimental systems.
- 565 Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 149, 22-39.
- Waldbaum, D.R. (1969) Thermodynamic mixing properties of NaCl KCl liquids. Geochimica et
   Cosmochimica Acta, 33, 1415-1427.
- 568 Waldbaum, D.R., and Thompson, J.B. Jr. (1969) Mixing properties of sanidine crystalline
- solutions. IV. Phase diagrams from equations of state. American Mineralogist, 54, 1274-1298.
- 571 Weishaupt, J. (1975) Thermodynamic Equilibria of Boiling Mixtures. Landholt-Börnstein, New
- 572 Ser. Gp. IV. 3. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.

573

#### **FIGURE CAPTIONS**

574 Fig. 1. (a) Components of a linear partitioning diagram using the olivine melting series Fo-Fa as

575 an example. Symbols: *D*, partition coefficient; *X*, mole fraction;  $K_D$ , exchange coefficient with

value from Roeder and Emslie (1970); (S), solid; (L), liquid; Fa, fayalite (Fe end member); Fo,

forsterite (Mg end member). (b) With the value of  $K_{\rm D}$  changed to 0.2, for values of NBO/T equal

to either 0.2 or 2.4, from a concave-down relationship of  $K_{\rm D}$  with NBO/T illustrated by Mysen

579 (2007). This figure illustrates the inverse relationship between  $K_{\rm D}$  and loop width.

580 Fig. 2. Characteristics of binary loops related to linear partitioning. Symbols: An, anorthite

581 content in percent = 100  $X_{An}$ ,  $X_2 = X_{An}$ . (a) Variation of loop width with for varying values of  $K_D$ 

582 with a fixed crystal composition of  $An_{60}$ . The curve is calculated from a spreadsheet that generates

583 T-X loops for differing values of  $K_{\rm D}$ . (b) The pressure effect on natural plagioclase feldspar. Fram

and Longhi (1992) found that a natural anorthosite showed an increase of  $K_{\rm D}$  with pressure up to

585 27 kbar, and a gabbroic composition showed a steeper correlation. With the work of Morse et al.

586 (2004) and McIntosh (2009) the combined data show a strong pressure effect yielding the

relationship shown in the figure. See also Fig. 7 of Morse (2013) for more details.

- 588 Fig. 3. Linear partitioning diagram for the boiling mixture Methylcyclohexane ("MCH") CCl4
- 589 with data taken from Weishaupt (1975). The ordinate is the partition coefficient for the mole

590 fraction of CCl4 in the liquid (L) divided by that in the vapor (V).

- Fig. 4. Linear partitioning diagram for the boiling mixture CCl4-Acetone. The data curve fails the
  linear test. Inset: *T-X* loop for the system.
- 593 Fig. 5. The azeotropic melting diagram for sanidine crystalline solutions, the system Ab-Or. A.
- 594 The T-X diagram; AP = the azeotropic point. The Or-rich liquidus is metastable with respect to
- 595 leucite plus liquid because of the incongruent melting of sanidine. The temperatures are

uncorrected for the adjustment to 1100 °C for albite melting (Anovitz & Blencoe, 1999). The binary loops are plotted from the data in Table 2 of Waldbaum and Thompson (1969). B. the linear partitioning diagram constructed from regressions on the same table, along with the isotherms. The individual AP intercepts of the regression are listed near the top of the diagram, and their average is given as the AP at  $X_{Or} = 0.331$ . The regressions are described by the two equations with adjustments as described in the text.

- 602 Fig. 6. The system Di-An-Ab. A. The *T-X* loop calculated from the linear regression shown in
- 603 (B). The inset shows the ternary phase diagram with cotectic. B. The linear regression, re-plotted 604 from Morse (1997).

Fig. 7. The system An-Ab. A. The *T-X* diagram recalculated in Bowen's method from the new enthalpies of fusion as described in the text. B. The linear partitioning result. The dotted array with a kink at  $An_{60}$  is calculated using the original latent heat  $\Delta H_f$  (An) from Bowen. The solid curve is the result of using a newer value of that enthalpy, from Navrotsky et al. (1980), with the second-order polynomial fit shown. The similarity between the two curves recalls Bowen's error analysis, in which errors in latent heat can result in excessive errors in temperature.

- 611 Fig. 8. Two pairs of solutions from the pyroxene quadrangle (Lindsley, 1983). A. Augite-
- 612 Pigeonite with an exact received intercept at 1.00 and a  $K_{\rm D}$  value of 0.74. B. Augite-
- 613 Orthopyroxene, with no linear partitioning.

614 Fig. 9. Kiglapait olivine compositions in stratigraphic context. The "oxygen spikes" refer to

615 stratigraphically abnormal Mg-rich samples associated with titanomagnetite crystals that reflect

616 enhanced ferric iron in the melt, thereby depleting the local activity of the ferrous component in

- 617 the olivine. This matter is discussed at some length in the text. Symbols: MOB, Main Ore Band;
- Aug, augite; Ox, titanomagnetite; Ap, apatite; PCS, volume percent solidified; F(L) fraction of
- 619 system present as liquid.

Fig. 10. Kiglapait augite-olivine-liquid relations in linear partitioning diagrams, calculated from olivine compositions and QUILF equilibria. (a) Augite-liquid partitioning with  $K_D = 0.19$  (Morse and Ross, 2004). (b) Augite-olivine equilibria simplified from Morse (2001) showing the off-line results for early augites interpreted in the cited study as being metastable.

624 Fig. 11. Calculated ratios of non-bridging oxygens divided by tetrahedral cations (NBO/T; e.g., 625 Mysen and Richet, 2005) for Kiglapait whole rocks (solid black diamonds) and experimental 626 liquids (quenched melts, in grayscale,) for the Lower Zone (Morse et al. 2004) and the uppermost 627 Upper Zone (Peterson, 1999). Note that feldspar-rich, hence more polymerized, compositions (in 628 the Lower Zone and above 95 PCS) have low values of NBO/T, whereas feldspar-poor 629 compositions rich in mafic minerals have *higher* values. Whole-rock analyses are from Morse 630 (1981). The curve for the whole-rocks accurately reflects the arrival and over-production of augite and Fe-Ti oxide minerals in the region 85-95 PCS (modal data from Morse, 1979b). The sag after 631 632 95 PCS reflects a local increase and maximum in the amount of normative feldspar, as does the 633 tail-end of the data at the end of crystallization. Two high values near 99.9 PCS are low-silica, 634 mafic compositions with only 40-44 % normative feldspar and 57- 60 % normative augite + 635 olivine. Otherwise, most of the liquid compositions are similar to the whole-rock compositions. 636 Abbreviation: OG, olivine gabbro. The data for the liquids help to define the more appropriate value of  $K_{\rm D}$  for olivine-liquid equilibria. 637

638 Fig. 12. Estimated  $X_{\text{Fe}}$  compositions of Kiglapait liquids, derived from Fig. 11, transformed as 639 described in the text. The stratigraphically varying value of  $K_{\text{D}}$  is applied to the crystal

640 compositions to find the value of  $X_{Fe}^{L}$  from the linear partitioning equation.

Fig. 13. Linear partitioning plot of all Kiglapait olivine compositions, for which the liquid

642 compositions are those from Fig. 12. The horizontal line identifies the mean value of the exchange

643 coefficient as  $K_{\rm D} = 0.26$ . The black data points reflect all data above 50 PCS, including points

644 from the Lower Zone 50-84 PCS and all the data from the Upper Zone, defined as >84 PCS. The

- 645 gray filled circles represent all the data from 0 to 50 PCS. These points define a novel array
- 646 arising from the lower right corner of the diagram with the dotted line and equation shown. The
- 647 upper intercept of this regression gives the value of the initial liquid composition assumed for the
- 648 earliest crystals with Fo  $\sim$  71. The origin of this array has three possible causes, as discussed in
- 649 the text. The two most likely are an initial evolved magma and the effects of early trapped liquid.



Morse Figure 1



Morse Fig. 2



Morse Fig. 3



Morse Fig. 4

eprint, the final version is subject to change, of the American Mineral Cite as Authors (Year) Title. American Mineralogist, in press. ill not work until issue is live.) DOI: http://dx.tdl@Borg/10.2138/am-201



cite the final, published document. See http://www.minsocam.org o



Morse Fig. 6



Morse Fig. 7



Morse Fig. 8



OL FO All 14

Morse Fig. 9



Morse Fig. 10



Morse Fig. 11



Morse Fig. 12



Morse Fig. 13

## Table 1. Abbreviations used in the text

| Ab             | Albite   |
|----------------|--|
| An             | Anorthite  |
| Aug            | Augite   |
| AUG            | Oxygen-normative augite*   |
| ∆Hf            | Latent heat (enthalpy) of fusion   |
| D              | Partition coefficient  |
| Di             | Diopside   |
| Fa             | Fayalite   |
| FL             | Volume fraction of system present as liquid                                  |
| Fo             | Forsterite   |
| FSP            | Oxygen-normative feldspar*   |
| J              | Joule  |
| k              | kilo-  |
| K <sub>D</sub> | Exchange coefficient   |
| L              | Liquid   |
| LZ             | Lower Zone   |
| OL             | Oxygen-normative olivine*  |
| Орх            | Orthopyroxene  |
| Or             | Orthoclase   |
| Р              | Pressure   |
| PCS            | (volume) percent solidified in the Kiglapait intrusion                       |
| QUILF          | Quartz-Ulvöspinel-Ilmenite-Fayalite equilibria (Andersen <i>et al.</i> 1993) |
| S              | Solid  |
| T              | Temperature  |
| UBZ            | Upper Border Zone  |
| UZ             | Upper Zone   |
| V              | Vapor  |
| <u>X</u>       | Mole fraction  |

Note: \*normative phases normalized to total AUG + FSP + OL

## TABLE 2.LIST OF LINEAR PARTITIONING RESULTS

May 14, 2014

## **A. Binary Solutions**

Single Loop: Liquidus & Solidus

| SYSTEM                             | K <sub>D</sub> | Р              | SOURCE  | COMMENTS                  |
|------------------------------------|----------------|----------------|---|---------------------------|
| Fo-Fa Olivine<br>An-Ab Plagioclase | 0.227<br>0.282 | 1-atm<br>1-atm | Morse 1997 (Bowen & Schairer)<br>Morse 1997 (Bowen) | Small curve<br>NOT linear |
| -do-                               |                |                | Morse 2000 (Bowen)                                  | Two segments              |
| -do-                               | 0.22           | 5 kb M         | orse 2000 (Nekvasil)                                | Barely 2 segments         |
| -do-                               | 0.252          | 10 kb          | Morse 1997 (Lindsley)                               | Two segments              |
| -do-                               | 0.276          | 1-atm          | This study  | Single curve              |
| An-Ab-H <sub>2</sub> O             | 0.05           | 5 kb M         | orse 2000 (Nekvasil)                                | $R^2 0.9997$              |
| Di-An-Ab                           | 0.26           | 1-atm          | Morse 1997 (Bowen, Kushiro)                         | Intercept 0.975           |
| Basaltic Olivine                   | 0.33           | 1-atm          | Morse 1997 (Hoover-Irvine)                          | Variable $K_{\rm D}^*$    |
| Augite - Olivine                   | 0.32           | 1-atm          | Morse 2001 (Selected range)                         | $R^2 0.995$               |

## **B.** Three-Phase Systems

(1) Two crystal species plus liquid (Two binary S - L solutions and one S-S(L) where () signifies the saturating phase).

| Augite - Olivine - Liquie | b     | Ba    | -          |                                  |              |
|---------------------------|-------|-------|------------|----------------------------------|--------------|
| Augite - Liquid (Ol)      | 0.19  | 1-atm | This study |                                  | $R^2 0.9995$ |
| Olivine - Liquid (Aug)    | 0.335 | 1-atm | This study | Variable <i>K</i> <sub>D</sub> * |              |
| Augite - Olivine (L)      | 0.361 | 1-atm | This study |                                  | $R^2 0.9972$ |

(2) Two crystal species plus a third saturating phase: The pyroxene solvus (Lindsley, 1983).Augite - Pigeonite0.741-atmThis study $R^2$ 0.990Augite - Opx-NA--1-atmThis study $R^2$ 0.01

# C. Azeotropes in solid-liquid systems

(Binary solutions with a common invariant point between phases)

| < ·   |              | 1             | 1 /                                     |  |  |
|---|--------------|---------------|---|--|--|
| NaCl-KCl 0.215, 0.395                                 |              | 1-atm         | Morse 1997 (Waldbaum) Classic precision |  |  |
| Ab-Or wt %  | 0.325, 0.417 | 1-atm         | Morse 1997 (Waldbaum & Thompson) ditto  |  |  |
| Ab-Or mol %   | 0.320, 0.417 | 1-atm         | This study (Waldbaum & Thompson) ditto  |  |  |
| Ab-Or-H <sub>2</sub> O                                | 0.04, 0.12   | 5 kb          | Morse 2000 (Morse 1970)                 |  |  |
| D. Two solid phases                                   |              |               |   |  |  |
| Magnesiowüstite - spinel                              | 0.205        | 16-22 GPa, 1  | 600 C Morse 2000 (Matsuzaka)            |  |  |
| Chlorite - Garnet                                     | 0.162        | Chlorite zone | e Morse 2001 (Spear)                    |  |  |
| Biotite - Garnet                                      | 0.25         | Sillimanite z |   |  |  |
| Synthetic van Laar loops<br>Augite - Olivine as above |              | )77           | Morse 2001 (Kretz) $R^2 \sim 1$         |  |  |

# E. Boiling Mixtures

| 1. Simple liquid-vapo                                      | or systems. | All data from | n Weishaupt (1975). | _            |  |  |  |
|--|-------------|---------------|---------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| Methylcyclohexane -CCl                                     | 4 0.514     | 1-atm         | Morse 2000          | $R^2 0.9996$ |  |  |  |
| CCL4 - Acetone   | Var.        | 0.600 bar     | Morse 2000          | NOT LINEAR   |  |  |  |
| Many others not linear, listed in Table 1 of Morse (2000). |             |               |                     |              |  |  |  |

# 2. Azeotropes

| Methanol-Chloroform                                  | 0.336, 0.182 | 1-atm | Morse 2000 | $R^2 > 0.996$ |  |  |  |
|--|--------------|-------|------------|---------------|--|--|--|
| Toluol - Isobutanol                                  | 0.352, 0.306 | 1-atm | Morse 2000 | >=0.9996      |  |  |  |
| Many others linear listed in Table 1 of Morse (2000) |              |       |            |               |  |  |  |

\*D flattens out at low Mg- high Fa: See also this study

| 1996 Data |         | X2S MAX | X1S   | NBO/T | KD    | X1L       |
|-----------|---------|---------|-------|-------|-------|-----------|
| PCS       | -lgF(L) | XMg(OL) |       |       |       | XFe (Liq) |
| 0         | 0       | 0.740   | 0.260 | 0.645 | 0.251 | 0.584     |
| 10        | 0.0458  | 0.734   | 0.266 | 0.658 | 0.252 | 0.590     |
| 20        | 0.0969  | 0.727   | 0.273 | 0.672 | 0.253 | 0.598     |
| 30        | 0.1549  | 0.719   | 0.281 | 0.687 | 0.254 | 0.606     |
| 40        | 0.2218  | 0.710   | 0.290 | 0.705 | 0.255 | 0.615     |
| 50        | 0.3010  | 0.700   | 0.300 | 0.724 | 0.257 | 0.625     |
| 60        | 0.3979  | 0.687   | 0.313 | 0.747 | 0.259 | 0.638     |
| 70        | 0.5229  | 0.672   | 0.328 | 0.775 | 0.261 | 0.652     |
| 80        | 0.6990  | 0.650   | 0.350 | 0.812 | 0.263 | 0.672     |
| 84        | 0.7959  | 0.610   | 0.390 | 0.830 | 0.264 | 0.708     |
| 89.5      | 0.9788  | 0.540   | 0.460 | 0.862 | 0.266 | 0.762     |
| 94.7      | 1.2757  | 0.374   | 0.626 | 0.904 | 0.268 | 0.862     |
| 96.6      | 1.4685  | 0.222   | 0.778 | 0.926 | 0.269 | 0.929     |
| 97.8      | 1.6576  | 0.153   | 0.847 | 0.942 | 0.269 | 0.954     |
| 98.6      | 1.8539  | 0.112   | 0.888 | 0.955 | 0.270 | 0.967     |
| 99.59     | 2.3872  | 0.075   | 0.925 | 0.966 | 0.270 | 0.979     |
| 99.9      | 3.0000  | 0.050   | 0.950 | 0.936 | 0.269 | 0.986     |
| 99.953    | 3.3279  | 0.036   | 0.964 | 0.901 | 0.268 | 0.990     |
| 99.98     | 3.6999  | 0.015   | 0.985 | 0.845 | 0.265 | 0.996     |
| 99.985    | 3.8239  | 0       | 1     | 0.822 | 0.264 | 1.000     |
| 99.99     | 4       | 0       | 1     | 0.787 | 0.261 | 1.000     |

Table 3. Liquid compositions for Kiglapait olivines