

1 Revision 1

2

3 Highlights and Breakthroughs article for Thomas Bristow David Bish et al.,:The origin and  
4 implications of clay minerals from Yellowknife Bay, Gale crater, Mars.

5

6

7

8

9

10 Title (if needed): Clays are messy - also on Mars

11 Javier Cuadros

12 Earth Sciences Department, Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London SW7 5BD, UK

13 e-mail: [j.cuadros@nhm.ac.uk](mailto:j.cuadros@nhm.ac.uk)

14

15 Abstract

16 The Curiosity rover on Mars, landed in 2012, is capable of mineralogical investigation using X-ray  
17 diffraction, complementing the abundant infrared remote sensing data already available on clay  
18 minerals. We can, however, expect that the in situ X-ray diffraction information will convey a more  
19 complex picture than that inferred from infrared spectroscopy alone.

20

21

CheMin has landed

22 Curiosity is the first planetary probe equipped with an X-ray diffraction (XRD) apparatus. This feat  
23 has taken place 117 years after the discovery of X-rays and exactly 100 after the first X-ray  
24 diffraction experiment. If we think of the size and requirements of the diffractometers we use in our  
25 laboratories, we can see better the technical achievement that this represents. From the scientific  
26 point of view, the step is also very important because XRD is the basic tool of the mineralogist.

27 Mineral identification on Mars has been relying mainly on infrared remote sensing. The  
28 shortcomings of this approach are obvious: some minerals have no or very weak infrared  
29 signature, some minerals share spectral features, the reflection/absorption of infrared radiation on  
30 the surface of rock and regolith is a complex phenomenon that affects the spectral shape, and  
31 there are atmospheric effects to deal with. Fortunately for clay investigation, clay and other  
32 hydrated minerals have a strong infrared signature. An important advantage of the reliance on  
33 infrared data in Mars studies is that the interpretation of spectral features has progressed  
34 considerably and we can read a good deal into the spectra. In order to progress in this direction,  
35 complementary XRD and infrared analyses are essential. However, the shortcomings of XRD  
36 analysis on Mars are also obvious. The number of studies will be very small and spatially limited.  
37 For clay investigation, the articles by Bristow et al. (this issue) and Vaniman et al. (2014), the very  
38 first ones to investigate extraterrestrial clay minerals in situ, highlight the interpretation problems  
39 that are faced: why do two clay materials that were collected 2.5 m apart and appear to have the  
40 same mineralogy and chemistry have different interlayer expansion behaviour? These problems  
41 are typically solved in Earth studies using a variety of physical and chemical treatments before  
42 XRD analysis, which are not available for Curiosity. And yet, the issue is crucial, because the  
43 measured d-spacing of the *00l* peaks contains information about layer interstratification as well as

44 inorganic and organic intercalation, all of which are very important for deciphering the very nature  
45 of the clay, formation conditions, later processes and organic presence. The latter, however, would  
46 require such concentrations to affect measurably the expansion behaviour of clays that it is not  
47 contemplated at the moment as a likely possibility on Mars. CheMin, the diffractometer on board  
48 Curiosity, will allow helpful but limited comparison between XRD and infrared data that will help the  
49 interpretation of the wider infrared database from Mars. Such comparison can be completed  
50 carrying out similar investigations with Earth analogues, where the infrared spectral features of fully  
51 characterized mineral suits are compared with martian spectra.

52

53

#### How much water?

54 Before Curiosity landed on Mars it was known that Mount Sharp, at the center of Gale Crater,  
55 contains strata with Fe/Mg-rich smectite. Curiosity's investigation on site has found what appear to  
56 be fluvio-lacustrine materials on the floor of the crater which contain clay (Bristow et al., this issue).  
57 This is a welcome discovery suggesting the existence of abundant clay easily accessible below a  
58 thin layer of sediment on Mars' surface, and providing further evidence for protracted interaction  
59 between water and the martian rocks. Bristow et al. (this issue) interpret that the clay-containing  
60 material was formed in situ, rather than transported and sedimented, because the overall rock  
61 chemical composition is similar to that of the average martian crust. If such is the case, the results  
62 from Bristow et al. provide important information about water activity and timing on Mars' surface.  
63 First of all, the investigated rocks formed after the Noachian era, later than the generally accepted  
64 time limit for formation of phyllosilicates of the Fe-Mg composition (Ehlmann et al., 2011), thus  
65 potentially pushing forward this limit. Second, the mineralogical composition of the studied  
66 samples, including plagioclase, olivine and pyroxene as major phases (Vaniman et al., 2014),  
67 indicates incomplete alteration of the original rock and points toward limited liquid water availability.  
68 Liquid water is not the only possible agent of clay formation on Mars' surface as ice has also been  
69 proposed (Michalski et al., 2013), but the rock morphology indicating a standing water body makes  
70 the latter a more likely candidate here. The composition of the clay, an Fe-containing saponite,  
71 also points towards limited water availability. On Earth, microscopic saponite is found as a product  
72 of in-situ alteration of mineral or glass grains in basalt, while further alteration usually produces

73 montmorillonite. Saponite formation in macroscopic amounts typically requires high Mg activity.  
74 Thus, the investigated rocks on Mars suggest that the water:rock ratio during the alteration reaction  
75 was low and that the fluids were in near equilibrium with the basalt. Interestingly, however, the  
76 composition of clay in strata at the base of Mount Sharp, detected by infrared remote sensing, is  
77 different and consists of nontronite. There is the uncertainty about the authigenic or detrital origin  
78 of such clay but if the nontronite formed in situ, the different chemistry may indicate that enough  
79 water was available to produce chemical differentiation in the corresponding altered rocks. The  
80 future investigation of these rocks by Curiosity, as it makes its way up Mount Sharp, can provide  
81 further clues about the mass of water involved in the alteration processes at different locations.

82

83 Is all hydrated clay smectite?

84 The article by Bristow et al. also provides important information about relative humidity conditions  
85 on Mars' surface, the hydration state of clays and their spectral identification. Relative humidity  
86 measurements by Curiosity in Gale crater (Figure 1 in Bristow et al., this issue) shows sharp daily  
87 and seasonal variations. Averaged values have reached 80% relative humidity. According to these  
88 results, it is expected that smectite retains hydration water, even if it undergoes cycles of hydration  
89 and drying. The spectral identification of smectite is based on the position and shape of the  
90 hydroxyl infrared vibration bands and the existence of the molecular water vibration band at ~1.9  
91  $\mu\text{m}$ . According to Curiosity's measurements of relative humidity such identification is validated.  
92 However, submarine Fe-rich hydrothermal talc of low crystal order has been described with near-  
93 infrared spectra similar to that of the Mg/Fe-smectite identified on Mars (Michalski et al., 2014).  
94 The molecular water in this talc is not located in the interlayer space, as in smectite, but seemingly  
95 trapped within the hexagonal cavity of the tetrahedral sheet and is more difficult to release  
96 (Cuadros et al., 2013). Talc with such form of molecular water retention is a possibility on Mars and  
97 an alternative to automatically linking hydration water in clay with smectite. Further investigation  
98 and improved interpretation of spectral features may shed light on the possible presence of  
99 hydrated clay phases other than smectite.

100

101 One final thought. Clay investigation in Earth studies is challenging even though we can use a  
102 whole array of analytical tools. There is no reason to expect that clay on Mars is any less messy.  
103 We should not be surprised if, at the first stage, XRD of martian clay complicates rather than  
104 simplifies the picture that we have generated with infrared remote sensing.

105

## 106 References

107 Bristow, T., Bish, D., Vaniman, D., Morris, R., Blake, D., Grotzinger, J., Rampe, E., Crisp J.,  
108 Achilles, C., Ming, D., Ehlmann, B., King, P., Bridges, J., Eigenbrode, J., Sumner, D., Chipera, S.,  
109 Moorokian, J., Treiman, A., Morrison, S., Downs, R., Farmer, J., Des Marais, D., Sarrazin, P.,  
110 Floyd, M., Mischna, M. (20XX) The origin and implications of clay minerals from Yellowknife Bay,  
111 Gale crater, Mars. *American Mineralogist*, XXX, XX-XX.

112

113 Cuadros, J., Michalski, J.R., Dekov, V., Bishop, J., Fiore, S., Dyar, M.D. (2013) Crystal-chemistry  
114 of interstratified Mg/Fe-clay minerals from seafloor hydrothermal sites. *Chemical Geology*, 360-  
115 361, 142-158.

116

117 Ehlmann, B.L., Mustard, J.F., Murchie, S.L., Bibring, J.-P., Meunier, A., Fraeman, A.A., Langevin,  
118 Y. (2011) Subsurface water and clay mineral formation during the early history of Mars. *Nature*,  
119 479, 53-60.

120

121 Michalski, J.R., Niles, P.B., Cuadros, J., Balbridge, A.M. (2013) Multiple working hypotheses for  
122 the formation of compositional stratigraphy on Mars: Insights from the Mawrth Vallis region. *Icarus*,  
123 226, 816-840.

124

125 Michalski, J.R., Cuadros, J., Dekov, V., Bishop, J.L., Fiore, S., Dyar, M.D. (2014) Constraints on  
126 the crystal chemistry of Fe-Mg clays on Mars based on infrared analyses of Fe-rich seafloor clays.  
127 45th Lunar and Planetary Science Conference, abstract 1781.

128

129 Vaniman et al. (2014) Mineralogy of a mudstone at Yellowknife Bay, Gale Crater, Mars. Science  
130 343, 1243480.