| 1 | REVISION 3 |
|----------------|--|
| 2 | |
| 3 | |
| 4 | Phosphorus partitioning between olivine and melt: An experimental study in the |
| 5 | system Mg2SiO4-Ca2Al2Si2O9-NaAlSi3O8-Mg3(PO4)2. |
| 6 | |
| 7 | Thomas B. Grant ^{*1,2} and Simon C. Kohn ¹ |
| 8 | |
| 9 | ¹ Department of Earth Sciences, University of Bristol, Queens Rd., Bristol, BS8 1RJ, United |
| 10 | Kingdom |
| 11 12 13 | ² Institut für Geologische Wissenschaften, Freie Universität Berlin, Malteserstrasse, 74-100 12249 Berlin, Germany |
| 14 | Abstract |
| 15 | The partitioning of phosphorus between olivine and melt was measured by conducting |
| 16 | partitioning experiments within the system Mg2SiO4-Ca2Al2Si2O9-NaAlSi3O8-Mg3(PO4)2, |
| 17 | using olivines crystallized with cooling rates in the range 1°C/hour to 10°C/hour. Partition |
| 18 | coefficients, $D_P^{ol/melt}$, vary from 0.05 to 1.41 and are strongly influenced by melt composition, |
| 19 | with high partition coefficients observed for more polymerized melts. Correlations between |
| 20 | elemental abundances in the olivines demonstrate that phosphorus substitutes on a near one |
| 21 | for one basis for Si, charge-balanced by a vacancy in Mg and no correlation between P and |
| 22 | Al concentration in the olivine was observed. A complete understanding of the controls on |
| 23 | $D_P^{ol/melt}$ is required to model quantitatively the zoning of P in olivine that has recently been |
| 24 | shown to be a common feature of igneous olivine crystals. The strong melt compositional |
| 25 | dependence observed in this study implies that both changing concentrations of P in the melt |
| 26 | during fractionation, and changing values of $D_P^{ol/melt}$ can contribute to core-to-rim variations |
| 27 | in P when the surface composition of a growing olivine crystal is in equilibrium with the |
| 28 | melt. The common observation of zones in natural olivines where high P is correlated with |
| 29 | high Al and Cr must be explained by processes other than equilibrium growth and, as |
| 30 | suggested previously, such zones are probably related to solute trapping during episodes of |
| 31 | rapid growth. |
| 32 | |
| 33 | Key words: Phosphorus, Olivine, Partitioning, Zoning, Experiemental petrology |

34

35 INTRODUCTION

36

37 The role of phosphorus in primary magmatic melts has gained significant attention over the 38 last thirty years due to its impact on phase equilibria (particularly the size of liquid 39 immiscibility fields) (Kushiro 1975, Toplis et al 1994), its preference for basic melts over 40 acid (more evolved) melts, and its higher partition coefficient in olivine relative to pyroxene 41 (Mallmann et al 2009, Millman-Barris et al 2008, Konzett et al., 2012). More recently, a wide 42 range of phosphorus zoning features have been discovered within olivine phenocrysts from a 43 variety of sources including basalts, andesites, dacites, komatiites, chondrites and 44 experimentally produced olivines (Millman-Barris et al 2008, Spandler et al 2007, Mallmann 45 et al 2009, McCanta et al 2008, McCanta et al 2009) and even metasomatised peridotites 46 (Mallmann et al., 2009). The reproducibility of these findings by a number of different 47 authors and for different magmatic conditions suggest that phosphorus zoning is very 48 common. This is largely due to the slow diffusion rate of P (Spandler et al 2007) within 49 olivine, which makes zoning difficult to erase even under long magmatic residence times and 50 high temperatures. Many of the zoning patterns previously described have been attributed to 51 rapid growth kinetics coupled with the slow diffusivity of P in melts leading to the process of 52 solute trapping (Reitano et al 1994). This occurs when the rate of crystal growth exceeds the 53 rate at which phosphorus can diffuse through the melt away from the crystal / liquid 54 boundary layer. The net effect is that it is generally difficult to produce olivines that are in 55 equilibrium with the melt with respect to P and once created, P-zones are difficult to erase. 56

57 Whilst many of these zoning features have been attributed to disequilibrium kinetics, the 58 value of the equilibrium phosphorus partition coefficient is somewhat poorly known. To have 59 any hope of quantitatively exploiting phosphorus zoning in olivine, well constrained values 60 for the partition coefficient, and its sensitivity to parameters such as pressure, temperature, 61 melt concentration and volatile fugacities are required. The focus of the research presented 62 here is to provide experimentally produced coefficients for the partitioning of phosphorus between olivine and melt $(D_P^{ol/melt})$ over a range of compositions and temperatures with the 63 64 potential application to natural magmatic systems which develop P zoned olivine. 65

66 There are currently two sources of data on $D_P^{ol/melt}$; experimental mineral-melt partitioning 67 studies and partition coefficients derived from natural mineral-melt pairs. The available data 68 are summarized in table 1. The reported values of $D_P^{ol/melt}$ vary significantly from around 1

69 down to about 0.02. The lowest figures are thought to represent values closest to equilibrium, 70 and McCanta et al (2008) and Millman-Barris et al (2008) both noted that the equilibrium 71 partition coefficient for their experiments should be <0.1. The higher values have been 72 attributed to non-equilibrium partitioning via processes such as solute trapping (Reitano et al 73 1994) during rapid growth. Scenarios that can generate non-equilibrium, apparent partition 74 coefficients are detailed by Albarede and Bottinga (1972). 75 A further consideration is the mechanism by which P^{5+} is incorporated into olivine. It is 76 widely accepted that, due to its similar charge and ionic radius P will dominantly substitute 77 for Si^{4+} into the tetrahedral site. However, the extra positive charge of P^{5+} compared with Si^{4+} 78 must be balanced, either: i) by the creation of vacancies on M sites (Agrell et al 1998, 79 80 Tropper et al, 2004 and Boesenberg and Hewins, 2010); ii) by a charge coupled substitution 81 of a monovalent ion such as Li, Na (Mallmann et al 2009) or H (Witt-Eickschen and O'Neill, 82 2005) replacing a divalent cation on an M site or iii) by a charge coupled substitution of a 83 trivalent cation such as Al or Cr (Millman-Barris et al, 2008; McCanta et al, 2008) replacing Si⁴⁺ on a T site. These mechanisms are represented by the following reactions: 84 85 86 $Mg_{2}SiO_{4(ol)} + \frac{1}{2}P_{2}O_{5(m)} \Longrightarrow Mg_{1.5}[]_{0.5}PO_{4(ol)} + \frac{1}{2}MgO_{(m)} + SiO_{2(m)}$ (1) 87 88 $Mg_{2}SiO_{4(ol)} + \frac{1}{2}P_{2}O_{5(m)} + \frac{1}{2}Li_{2}O_{(m)} \Longrightarrow MgLiPO_{4(ol)} + MgO_{(melt)} + SiO_{2(m)}$ (2) 89 90 $Mg_{2}SiO_{4(ol)} + \frac{1}{4}P_{2}O_{5(m)} + \frac{1}{4}Al_{2}O_{3(m)} \Longrightarrow Mg_{2}Al_{0.5}P_{0.5}O_{4(ol)} + SiO_{2(m)}$ (3) 91 92 The different substitution reactions would give different predictions of the covariance of 93 element concentrations in olivine. All reactions would predict an inverse correlation between 94 P and Si in olivine, but for the system studied here, (2) would predict a correlation between P and Na and (3) would predict a correlation between P and Al in olivine. In this study we will 95 provide new experimental data on the equilibrium values of $D_P^{ol/melt}$ and its melt 96 97 compositional dependence, determine the mechanism of P incorporation and discuss the 98 relevance of the data to non-equilibrium incorporation of P during rapid crystal growth. 99 100

101 EXPERIMENTAL METHODS

102

| 102 | |
|-----|---|
| 103 | The starting compositions chosen for this study were guided by the phase diagram for the Fo- |
| 104 | An-Ab system (Schairer and Yoder, 1966), but in the system Mg ₂ SiO ₄ -Ca ₂ Al ₂ Si ₂ O ₉ - |
| 105 | NaAlSi ₃ O ₈ . Initially two sets of starting compositions were produced, shown as the filled |
| 106 | symbols in Figure 1. The compositions of all starting materials are given in Table 2. Starting |
| 107 | materials in the system Mg_2SiO_4 - $Ca_2Al_2Si_2O_9$ - $NaAlSi_3O_8$ - $Mg_3P_2O_8$ were made by preparing |
| 108 | mixtures of forsterite, albite and Ca2Al2Si2O9 compositions. Each end-member composition |
| 109 | was prepared by weighing and mixing the respective oxide and carbonate in the correct molar |
| 110 | proportions. Then each composition was heated at about 1000°C to decarbonate and form a |
| 111 | homogenous mixture before being ground into a fine powder using an agate pestle and |
| 112 | mortar. Half of a gram of each experimental composition was then produced by accurately |
| 113 | weighing the required mass of each end member normalized to 98% to account for the |
| 114 | addition of 2% P_2O_5 . The source of the P_2O_5 was trimagnesium phosphate octahydrate |
| 115 | (Mg ₃ P ₂ O ₈ \cdot 8H ₂ O); the mass of the water in this compound was accounted for in measured |
| 116 | amounts of the starting materials and later removed by dehydrating each starting |
| 117 | composition. |
| 118 | |
| 119 | The choice of 2% P_2O_5 in starting materials was made to facilitate analysis by electron probe |
| 120 | microanalysis but leads to phosphorus concentrations in the experimental products that are |
| 121 | much higher than is normally found in naturally occurring mafic terrestrial melts not |
| 122 | saturated in apatite (although some meteorite samples have olivine with high P contents). It is |
| 123 | also higher than previously conducted experiments whose compositions contained 0.24% |
| 124 | (McCanta et al 2008) or 0.16-1.18% P ₂ O ₅ (Millman-Barris et al 2008). A further set of |
| 125 | starting compositions were therefore produced to test the effect of differing amounts of $P_2 O_5$ |
| 126 | (compositions 11-13, used in samples 21-23). These were based on composition 3, but with |
| 127 | P_2O_5 concentrations of 1%, 0.6% and 0.3%. In order for direct comparisons to be made, |

- 128 additional MgO was added to the starting compositions to account for the lower amounts of
- 129 trimagnesum phosphate used.

130

Starting materials were packed into 3mm diameter and 8-10 mm long platinum capsules that had been sealed at one end using a PUK3 arc welder and then the capsules were crimped at the open end using a pair of pliers. The capsules were dried in a box furnace at around 600-900°C for 30-60 minutes to release any water adsorbed onto the powdered starting materials and then the crimped end was welded shut. Completely sealed capsules were used to avoid

136 the loss of volatile components during the long, high-temperature runs. Platinum wire was 137 used to wrap around the capsules and to suspend them at the hotspot of a vertical 1 138 atmosphere furnace. The furnace was already at the starting temperature of the run when the 139 samples were introduced and the position of the hotspot had been previously calibrated for 140 each run temperature. The samples were all within about 10 mm of a thermocouple bead. All 141 experiments were drop quenched into water. Full details of the run conditions, composition 142 numbers and sample numbers are given in table 3. It is worth noting that the cooling rates (1, 143 5, or 10° /hr) of the experiments presented here are up to an order of magnitude lower than 144 those of previous experimental runs by other authors whose cooling rates typically ranged 145 from 5°. 10°, and 15°C/hr in McCanta et al (2008) and 15° or 30°C/hr in Millman-Barris et al 146 (2008). After quenching, samples were removed from their capsules and mounted in 1 inch 147 aluminum rings using epoxy resin. These were then ground and polished to a 1μ m finish 148 using diamond-impregnated pads. 149 150 Samples were imaged using a JEOL JXA 8600 SEM, and quantitative analysis of olivine and 151 glass phases was performed using a CAMECA SX100 electron microprobe (EPMA). Olivine 152 analysis was performed using an accelerating voltage of 20keV, a beam current of 100 nA 153 and a 1 μ m focused beam to maximize the analytical sensitivity for P. P counts were 154 measured simultaneously on 3 spectrometers, each with a PET crystal, giving a total counting 155 time of 720s on peak and 720s on background. Al was measured with 120s on peak and 156 background, Ca with 240s on peak and background and Mg, Si and Na with 10s on peak and 157 background. In contrast, for the glasses, an accelerating voltage of 20keV, a beam current of 158 2-4 nA and a defocused beam (about 12μ m in diameter) was used to minimize beam damage 159 to the sample. Counting times were 30s (peak and background) for P and Ca and 10s for all 160 other elements. The standards used were St. John's Island olivine (Mg in olivine and glass; Si 161 in olivine), Amelia albite (Na), Eifel sanidine (Al), wollastonite (Si in glass) and Durango 162 apatite (Ca, P). 163

164 A limited number of additional analyses were performed using a JEOL JXA 8530F FEG

165 (field emission gun) EPMA. These analyses were focused on samples 1 and 6, the samples

166 with this highest measured $D_P^{\text{ol/melt}}$ for the high temperature and low temperature 1°C/hour

167 series respectively and sample 2. Sample 6 in particular was judged to be the one that was

168 most likely to be affected by processes such as enrichment or depletion in P in the melt

| 169 | adjacent to growing crystals, olivine rims with compositions different from cores and other |
|-----|---|
| 170 | experimental difficulties. Therefore, several high-spatial-resolution traverses across |
| 171 | crystal/melt interfaces were measured and detailed investigations of the heterogeneity of |
| 172 | olivine rims were performed. A variety of analytical conditions were used for the different |
| 173 | analyses, but the emphasis was on spatial resolution rather than counting statistics. The |
| 174 | accelerating voltage was 8-10 keV and the beam current was 9-50 nA. Under the conditions |
| 175 | used the analysed volume was always less than $1 \mu\text{m}^3$ as determined using the CASINO |
| 176 | software (Hovington et al., 1997) for Monte Carlo simulation of the electron-sample |
| 177 | interaction (personal communication, Dr Ben Buse) and fluorescence problems were |
| 178 | negligible. |
| 179 | |
| 180 | A separate set of five isothermal experiments with a duration of 167 hours were performed at |
| 181 | 1420°C to avoid the potential complexities of crystal growth during cooling ramp |
| 182 | experiments. However, the crystals were too small to be analyzed without contamination by |
| 183 | glass, so the results of this set of experiments are not reported here. Furthermore, 2 of the 5 |
| 184 | samples from this series were found to have very low bulk phosphorus concentrations. The |
| 185 | phosphorus loss is probably due to failure of the capsule weld and subsequent volatilization |
| 186 | of P ₂ O ₅ (e.g. Welch and Gutt, 1961; Levin and Roth, 1970). The same problem of |
| 187 | phosphorus loss was observed in one other sample from the 1400°C/5°C per hour cooling |
| 188 | rate series. We therefore do not report any data for that sample |
| 189 | |
| 190 | RESULTS |
| 191 | |
| 192 | Phosphorus partitioning data |
| 193 | |
| 194 | All samples contained olivine crystals within a homogenous glass, and no other phases were |
| 195 | seen in any sample. Olivine crystals were typically euhedral and rarely showed any textures |
| 196 | diagnostic of rapid growth, although some crystals in the faster cooling-rate experiments |
| 197 | included small melt pools within euhedral outer crystal edges. Olivine composition |
| 198 | measurements were predominantly taken as traverses across randomly oriented sections in |
| 199 | the polished samples, and the glass compositions were taken at random locations and also as |
| 200 | traverses away from crystals. Averages of all these points were taken for each sample and are |
| 201 | given in table 4. Glass compositions for samples 1-10 (all of which cooled at 1°C/hour) are |

202 plotted as open symbols in Figure 1, together with the compositions of the starting materials 203 for these samples (filled symbols). The compositions are consistent with crystallization of 204 around 10% forsterite from each starting composition, and the glass compositions represent 205 the 1400°C and 1270°C isotherms in the modified Fo-An-Ab system used here. The average 206 olivine and glass compositions for each sample were used to calculate the partition 207 coefficients for each sample and these are also given in Table 4. The lowest observed value of D_p^{ol/melt} was 0.05, obtained for sample 5 (An-rich melt, final temperature of 1400°C, 208 209 cooling rate of $1^{\circ}/hr$), and the highest value of 1.41 was observed in sample 6 (Ab-rich melt, 210 final temperature of 1270°C, cooling rate of 1°/hr). It is obvious from these two points alone 211 that there is a significant effect of the melt composition and temperature on partitioning of P 212 even when the cooling rate is the same (and very slow). The trend of increasing partition 213 coefficient with increasing albite content / decreasing forsterite content of the melt and at 214 lower temperatures is consistent across all the different experimental runs. An additional 215 trend that can be seen is that there is a slight increase in the partition coefficient with 216 increasing cooling rate, although this is far less pronounced than the variations across 217 different compositions under the same cooling rate. Whereas some of the data obtained in this 218 study are comparable to those from previous published studies (Adam and Green 2006; 219 Anderson and Greenland 1969; Brunet and Chazot 2001; Beck et al. 2006) some of the new 220 values are much higher. An analysis of whether these samples are equilibrated or not will be 221 presented in the discussion section.

222

223 Nearly all observed olivine crystals were, to some extent, zoned with respect to P. Typical 224 core to rim traverses are shown in figure 2. A number of features were documented, including 225 P concentrations that rise smoothly towards the rims, P concentrations that drop smoothly 226 towards the rims and jumps in P concentration leading to either symmetrical or asymmetrical 227 low or high P zones. Many of these features are comparable to those described in the 228 literature (Millman-Barris et al 2008, McCanta et al 2009, McCanta et al 2008). The 229 smoothly increasing P concentrations can be explained by some combination of changing P 230 concentration in the melt as crystallization progresses (Rayleigh distillation) combined with 231 increasing D_P as the melts become more polymerized by the removal of the forsterite 232 component in the melt. Similarly, smooth decreases in P concentration are consistent with 233 changing P concentration in the melt for samples with $D_P > 1$. The jumps in P concentration 234 could be related to sector zoning which was observed in some crystals using 235 cathodoluminescence. In addition, phenomena such as solute trapping resulting from the

interplay between P diffusivity in the melt, D_P and growth rate may play some role, especially at the faster cooling rates.

238

The values of $D_{P}^{ol/melt}$ reported in table 4 are, in some cases, surprisingly high, therefore our 239 240 approach of calculating D_P for each sample using a simple average of all P analyses in all 241 olivine crystals for a given sample needs further consideration. It could be argued: i) that a 242 better measure of equilibrium P concentration in olivine is the P concentration at the rims of 243 crystals; and ii) that the melt adjacent to olivine crystals could be enriched in P (because of 244 slow diffusion in the melt. To investigate these two potential problems with our data, two samples with the highest $D_P^{ol/melt}$ for the high temperature, 1°C/hour series (sample 1 and 2) 245 246 and one from the low temperature, 1°C/hour series (sample 6) were studied in more detail by 247 FEG EPMA. The counting statistics are inferior to the standard EPMA, and calibration is 248 more difficult, so we do not include any of the data in the calculation of $D_P^{ol/melt}$ but the 249 superior spatial resolution of the FEG instrument allows the details of P distribution around 250 crystal/melt interfaces to be studied in more detail. The two questions addressed with the 251 FEG probe were: (i) is there a zone of P enrichment or depletion in the melt adjacent to 252 growing crystals? Such a zone could result from crystal growth rates exceeding P diffusion 253 rates in the melt and would have implications for measured $D_P^{ol/melt}$ and (ii) is there a 254 systematic difference in olivine rim compositions compared with olivine core compositions? 255 Figure 3 shows a data set for sample 2 from the FEG probe that includes a backscattered 256 electron image, Mg, Si and P X-ray maps and a traverse generated from the P X-ray map that 257 shows the relative count rates as the rim is approached and over the olivine/melt interface. 258 The map and profile clearly show that P concentration at the rim of the olivine is close to that 259 of the interior of the olivine and that there is absolutely no trace of zoning in the glass 260 adjacent to the crystal. Figure 4 shows a high-resolution (FEG probe) line scan across an 261 olivine crystal in sample 6. This is the sample with the highest partition coefficient in this 262 study, and hence the one that is most likely to display non-equilibrium features. As expected 263 (c.f. figure 2d) there is significant core-to-rim zoning, but what was not expected was the 264 jump in P concentration and the complex profile near the rim. We do not have a satisfactory 265 explanation for these effects, but these measurements do show that using rim compositions 266 alone to obtain the P concentration of olivine in equilibrium with melt is unlikely to be 267 successful. As a direct test of this idea we used the FEG probe to measure the composition of 268 48 points near the rim of several different olivines in sample 1 and 11 points near rims on 269 sample 6. For sample 1 we obtained a mean P₂O₅ concentration of 0.766 wt% with a standard 270 deviation of 0.213 wt%. This compares with our preferred method of averaging all CAMECA 271 EPMA analyses of olivines for that sample of 0.961 wt% with a standard deviation of 0.073 272 wt% (see Table 4). Thus in this case the rims compositions are <u>more</u> variable than the 273 olivines as a whole, and the mean values, although a little different, are within the 274 uncertainties. For sample 6 we obtained a mean of 2.945±0.703 wt% for olivine rims using 275 the FEG probe and 2.896±0.418 wt% using the overall olivine compositions from the 276 CAMECA EPMA data (Table 4). The explanation for the variation in rim compositions is 277 probably that different crystals nucleate at different times during the run, then grow at 278 different rates and while some will continue to grow throughout the run, some may dissolve 279 during the process of surface energy minimisation, thus different crystals are at different 280 stages of evolution at the time of quenching. In summary the detailed analyses using the FEG 281 probe confirm that using the overall average olivine composition from the CAMECA data set 282 is the best approximation to the equilibrium olivine composition and that there is no 283 measurable inhomogeneity in the glass close to olivine crystals. 284

- 285 Mechanisms of phosphorus incorporation in olivine
- 286

287 Figure 5 shows the correlations between P and other elements in samples from the two 288 1°C/hour series, expressed as the number of cations per four oxygens. In each case the 289 expected correlation for each of reactions 1, 2 and 3 is shown. For Si the slope is exactly that 290 expected for both reactions 1 and 2; the offset (1% of the value for the number of Si per 4O) 291 is almost certainly a consistent, systematic, analytical error arising from the analytical 292 conditions that were optimized for sensitive determination of low concentrations of P rather 293 than accurate measurements on major elements. For Mg, the slope matches equation 1, with 294 an offset that can be explained in the same way as the Si plot, but for Al and Na there is no 295 agreement with the expected trends for reactions 3 and 2 respectively. For Al, the P 296 concentration seems to be essentially independent of Al concentration, whereas for Na the 297 increasing P concentration as a function of increasing Na concentration is simply a 298 consequence of a correlation between albite and forsterite concentrations in the melt. Thus 299 our data clearly point to incorporation of P in olivine according to reaction 1 in agreement 300 with the observations of Agrell et al. (1998), Tropper et al, (2004) and Boesenberg and 301 Hewins, (2010). It is significant to note that the lack of correlation between the concentration 302 of P and Al in the olivine crystals is in contrast to the observations of Millman-Barris et al 303 (2008) and McCanta et al (2008). The correlation of P with Al and Cr observed in the earlier

studies is likely to be a reflection of the disequilibrium rapid-growth conditions in bothexperiments and naturally occurring phenocrysts.

306

307 **Partitioning data for other elements**

308

309 Although this study was aimed at elucidating the phosphorus partitioning behavior, the Ca, 310 Na and Al concentrations of both olivine and melt were also measured, allowing partition 311 coefficients for these elements to be determined. D_{Ca} is found to be 2.6±0.3 x 10⁻², with no 312 systematic trends as a function of temperature, melt composition or cooling rate being 313 apparent. This is contrary to the data summarized in Libourel (1999) where D_{Ca} increases 314 significantly with the sodium content of the melt. However, in the case of Watson (1977) and 315 for the majority of the glasses presented here, the sodium effect is cancelled out by the anti 316 correlation of CaO and Na₂O (Libourel, 1999). Our D_{Ca} values are consistently around a 317 factor of 2 lower than those predicted by Libourel (1999). This could be due to the creation of 318 vacancies in the M sites of olivine by the incorporation of P, or partly due to the 319 stoichiometry of the melts, having no excess Ca. Our values are fairly consistent with those of Adam and Green (2006) (1.3 x 10⁻² - 2.4 x 10⁻²), Beattie (1994) (1.92 x 10⁻² - 3.75 x 10⁻²), 320 Dunn (1987) (3.4×10^{-2}) and Ohtani et al (1989) (2×10^{-2}) despite the varying range of melt 321 compositions and conditions. D_{Na} has a value of $4.8 \pm 1.4 \times 10^{-3}$ in our experiments, similar to 322 previous measurements of 3.1 x 10^{-3} (Borisov et al., 2008) and 1.5 x 10^{-4} to 3 x 10^{-2} (Grant 323 324 and Wood 2010). The very low concentrations of Na in olivine make it difficult to observe 325 any significant trends in the data. D_{Al} is the only element of the three where clear trends can be observed as a function of composition. D_{A1} has a range of 5 x 10⁻³ to 1.5 x 10⁻² with an 326 327 average of $8.5\pm3.0 \times 10^{-3}$, which is similar to the values found by Grant and Wood (2010) 328 and the lowest values given by Millman-Barris et al (2008). For our experiments with the 329 higher cooling rates the uncertainty on Al concentration in olivine is larger, which was also 330 noted by Pack and Palme (2003). Pack and Palme (2003) did not find any correlation 331 between cooling rate and Al content but in their study the incorporation of Al became notably 332 more irregular at higher cooling rates. The 1°C/hour samples show interesting trends, 333 particularly the 1400°C samples which show a progressive reduction in D_{Al} with increasing 334 albite component in the melt and decreasing NBO/T. In summary, the olivines in the present 335 study tend to have partition coefficients for elements other than P that agree well with the 336 literature, providing further indirect evidence that our experiments represent conditions close 337 to equilibrium, particularly for the 1°C/hour samples.

338 339 DISCUSSION 340 341 Attainment of equilibrium 342 343 The original motivation for the present study was the observation that very fine scale zoning 344 can be observed in natural olivines, apparently preserved through later processes by the 345 extraordinarily slow diffusion of P in olivine. This slow diffusion rate poses a problem for 346 experimental studies as once olivine has crystallized with a particular phosphorus 347 concentration it is very difficult to re-equilibrate it. Reversal experiments are therefore not 348 feasible. In this study we use the following criteria to indicate close approach to equilibrium 349 (while acknowledging that true equilibrium is not possible in this system): i) near-constant P 350 concentration across measured profiles within individual olivines; ii) the same P 351 concentrations in different olivine crystals in the same sample; iii) homogeneous glass 352 compositions, even close to olivine crystals; iv) consistent trends in partition coefficients as a 353 function of T and/or melt composition; v) constant partition coefficients as a function of 354 cooling rate. In all samples the glasses are effectively homogeneous, satisfying criterion (iii). 355 The range of olivine compositions observed for each sample (a combination of criteria (i) and 356 (ii)) are reflected in the quoted standard deviations in table 4, and are clearly lower for the 357 1400°C and 1°C/hour samples than the equivalent 5°C/hour and 10°C/hour samples. As 358 illustrated in Figure 2 this is partly because the zoning of individual crystals is less 359 pronounced than in the more rapidly-cooled samples, but more strongly influenced by the 360 smaller distribution in P concentrations between crystals. Finally for all the 1400°C samples, 361 there is rather little variation in D_P as a function of cooling rate for each bulk composition, 362 despite the signs of disequilibrium in the 5°C/hour and 10°C/hour samples, therefore we can 363 accept the values of D_P for the 1°C/hour series as reliable, near-equilibrium partition 364 coefficients. For the 1270°C series we have only one cooling rate, so criterion (v) cannot be 365 applied. As the P concentration in olivine is much higher in this series, the standard 366 deviations are of course larger, but even as a proportion of the P concentration the standard 367 deviations are on average 50% larger than the standard deviations for the 1400°C and 1°C/hour series. 368 369 The effect of melt composition on $D_P^{ol/melt}$ 370

371

372 Several previous studies of trace element partitioning in simple systems have shown that melt 373 composition plays a role in controlling partition coefficients, and systematic relationships 374 between D_i and NBO/T (the number of non-bridging oxygens per tetrahedral cation) have 375 been observed (e.g. Mysen and Virgo, 1980, Kohn and Schofield, 1994, Toplis and Corgne, 376 2002). Other studies have preferred simpler formulations such as X_{SiO2} (e.g. Evans et al., 377 2008). Figure 6 shows $\ln D_P$ plotted as a function of both NBO/T and X_{SiO2} . Both plots show a 378 reasonable linear correlation for samples from the 1°C/hour series (filled symbols) and even 379 if the 5°C/hour and 10°C/hour data are included there is a clear overall trend, although the 380 more rapidly cooled samples have generally slightly higher values of D_P. The very strong 381 effect of melt composition on $D_{\rm P}$ is consistent with the well-known melt compositional 382 controls on apatite solubility in melts (e.g. Watson, 1979, Wolf and London, 1994). There is 383 an excellent correlation between D_P from this study and apatite solubility calculated 384 according to the model of Harrison and Watson (1984), with increasing D_P correlating with 385 decreasing predicted apatite solubility. However, the slope is relatively shallow, so that the 386 predicted apatite solubility varies by a factor of 3, whereas the observed values of D_P vary by 387 a factor of 28. It should be noted however that the Harrison and Watson (1984) model only 388 includes wt% SiO₂ and temperature as variables, whereas factors such as ASI probably also 389 play a role in the extreme behavior observed here. The complexities in component mixing in 390 the melt will be reflected in extreme activity coefficients for P_2O_5 in high-silica, Ab-rich, 391 highly polymerized melts.

392

393 Effect of P concentration on D_P

394

395 One issue that has not yet been addressed in the discussion of the data so far, is whether or 396 not D_P depends on bulk P concentration in the system i.e. whether P partitioning follows 397 Henry's Law behaviour. We cannot unambiguously answer this question, as the three 398 samples with low P concentrations (21, 22 and 23) do seem to have D_P values that are below 399 the regression lines in figure 6. However, the uncertainties in D_P for the samples with low 400 total P concentration may simply be too large to allow a meaningful comparison of the 401 apparent differences in D_P at this level of detail. Further studies of the effect of P 402 concentration on D_P using analytical methods such as laser ablation ICPMS, that are more 403 suited to low concentrations, would be worthwhile. It would be surprising for a lower trace 404 element concentration to lead to a reduced partition coefficient, as most cases of non-Henry's 405 Law behavior show the opposite effect, i.e. partition coefficients are reduced at trace element

406 concentrations above the Henry's Law limit (e.g. Beattie 1993, Pan et al. 2003, Prowatke and 407 Klemme 2006). Thus we are confident that our partition coefficients can be applied to natural 408 olivine-melt systems, and that the strong melt compositional effect on D_P should be taken 409 into account in interpreting zoning profiles in natural olivine crystals. 410 411 **Implications to observed zoning profiles in natural olivine crystals** 412 413 The most important finding of this study is that there is a strong melt compositional control 414 on D_P such that an olivine growing in a fractionating igneous system will have a changing D_P 415 as the melt composition evolves. Most basalts and basaltic andesites have NBO/T in the 416 range 1 - 0.5 which, for the melt compositions in the present study, would correspond to a 417 range in D_P of 0.2 to 0.8 (although further work on the effect of different types of melt 418 composition is required). Therefore even if P concentration in a melt is constant, the P 419 concentration of crystallizing olivine in an evolving system could increase substantially as 420 the melt composition evolves to more polymerized, silica-rich compositions. Furthermore the 421 absence of any correlation between P and Al in the olivines grown in this study provides 422 clues on the growth-rate-dependence of the coupled P+Al and P+Cr substitutions. Our data 423 suggest that the observation of a zone with high P concentration but without high Al 424 concentration could imply a local equilibrium between the olivine surface and melt during the 425 growth of that zone. Conversely, the observation of correlated P and Al or Cr in previously 426 published studies of zoned olivines may suggest higher growth rates than those of even our 427 10°C/hour samples, and a role for solute trapping. 428 429 Whatever the reason for variable P concentrations in a growing olivine crystal, we agree with 430 previous suggestions that the extremely slow diffusion of P in olivine (Spandler et al 2007) 431 preserves P zoning profiles and provides a potentially very useful method for studying the 432 early history of magmatic evolution. To take full advantage of this resource, more work is 433 required on the role of mineral surface structure, P diffusion in both olivine and melt, 434 boundary layer enrichment in melts and solute trapping effects and the effect of melt 435 composition, temperature and volatile concentrations on D_P. Nonetheless, the equilibrium

436 partitioning data produced in this study lay the foundations for quantitative modeling of the

437 zoning profiles of P in olivine. It is particularly significant that D_P cannot be assumed always

438 to be low (<0.1) or constant, as phosphorus can even become compatible in olivine in some

439 extreme circumstances, such as in the highly polymerized, silica rich melts studied here.

| 440 | |
|-----|---|
| 441 | Acknowledgements. We thank Dr Stuart Kearns for help and instruction with SEM and |
| 442 | EPMA, Dr Ben Buse for working out the optimal conditions and training in FEG EPMA and |
| 443 | Profs. Jon Blundy, Steve Sparks and Mike Walter and Drs. Oleg Melnik and Ralf Dohmen |
| 444 | for illuminating discussions. We are also grateful to Guil Mallmann, an anonymous reviewer |
| 445 | and associate editor Chip Lesher for their thorough work and insights. |
| 446 | |
| 447 | REFERENCES |
| 448 | |
| 449 | Adam, G., Green, T. (2006). Trace element partitioning between mica- and amphibole- |
| 450 | bearing garnet lherzolite and hydrous basanitic melt: 1. experimental results and the |
| 451 | investigation of controls on partitioning behaviour. Contributions to Mineralogy and |
| 452 | Petrology, 152, 1-17. |
| 453 | |
| 454 | Agrell, S.O., Charnley, N.R., Chinner, G.A. (1998). Phophoran olivine from pine canyon, |
| 455 | Piute Co., Utah. Mineralogical Magazine, 62, 265-269. |
| 456 | |
| 457 | Albarede, F., Bottinga, Y. (1972). Kinetic disequilibrium in trace element partitioning |
| 458 | between phenocrysts and host lava. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 36, 141-156. |
| 459 | |
| 460 | Anderson, A. T., Greenland, L.P. (1969). Phosphorus fractionation diagram as a quantitative |
| 461 | indicator of crystallization differentiation of basaltic liquids. Geochimica et Cosmochimica |
| 462 | Acta, 33, 493-505. |
| 463 | |
| 464 | Beattie, P. (1993). On the occurrence of apparent non-Henry's Law behavior in experimental |
| 465 | partitioning studies. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 57, 47-55. |
| 466 | |
| 467 | |
| 468 | Beattie, P. (1994). Systematics and energetics of trace-element partitioning between olivine |
| 469 | and silicate melts: Implications for the nature of mineral/melt partitioning. Chemical |
| 470 | Geology, 117, 57-71 |
| 471 | |
| 472 | Beck, P., Barrat, J., A., Gillet, Ph., Wadhwa, M., Franchi, I.A., Greenwood, R.,C., Bohn, M., |
| 473 | Cotton, J., van de Moortele, B., Reynard, B. (2006). Petrography and Geochemistry of the |

| 474 | chassingite Northwest Africa 2737 (NWA 2737). Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 70, |
|-----|--|
| 475 | 2127-2139. |
| 476 | |
| 477 | Boesenberg, J.S., Hewins, R.H. (2010). An experimental investigation into the metastable |
| 478 | formation of phosphoran olivine and pyroxene. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 74, |
| 479 | 1923-1941. |
| 480 | |
| 481 | Borisov, A. Pack, A., Kropf, A., Palme H. (2008) Partitioning of Na between olivine and |
| 482 | melt: An experimental study with application to the formation of meteoritic Na ₂ O-rich |
| 483 | chondrule glass and refractory forsterite grains. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 72, |
| 484 | 5558–5573 |
| 485 | |
| 486 | Brunet, F., Chazot, G. (2001) Partitioning of phosphorus between olivine, clinopyroxene and |
| 487 | silicate glass in a spinel lherzolite xenolith from Yemen. Chemical Geology, 176, 51-72. |
| 488 | |
| 489 | Dunn, T. (1987). Partitioning of Hf, Lu, Ti, and Mn between olivine, clinopyroxene and |
| 490 | basaltic liquid. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 96, 476-484. |
| 491 | |
| 492 | Evans, T.M., O'Neill, H.St.C., Tuff J. (2008) The influence of melt composition on the |
| 493 | partitioning of REEs, Y, Sc, Zr and Al between forsterite and melt in the system CMAS. |
| 494 | Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 72, 5708–5721 |
| 495 | |
| 496 | Foley, S.F., Jacob, D.E. and O'Neill, H. St. C. (2011) Trace element variations in olivine |
| 497 | phenocrysts from Ugandan potassic rocks as clues to the chemical characteristics of parental |
| 498 | magma. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 162, 1–20 |
| 499 | |
| 500 | Grant, K.J., Wood, B.J. (2010) Experimental study of the incorporation of Li, Sc, Al and |
| 501 | other trace elements into olivine. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 74, 2412-2428 |
| 502 | |
| 503 | Harrison, T.M. and Watson, E.B. (1984) The behavior of apatite during crustal anatexis: |
| 504 | equilibrium and kinetic considerations. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 48, 1467-1477 |

505

| 506 | Hovington, P., Drouin, D. and Gauvin, R. (1997) CASINO: A new Monte Carlo code in C |
|-----|---|
| 507 | language for electron beam Interaction - Part I: Description of the Program. Scanning, 19 1- |
| 508 | 14. |
| 509 | |
| 510 | Kohn, S.C. and Schofield, P.F. (1994) The importance of melt composition in controlling |
| 511 | trace-element behaviour: an experimental study of Mn and Zn partitioning between forsterite |
| 512 | and silicate melts. Chemical Geology, 117, 73-87. |
| 513 | |
| 514 | Konzett, J., Rhede, D. and Frost, D.J. (2012) The high PT stability of apatite and Cl |
| 515 | partitioning between apatite and hydrous potassic phases in peridotite: an experimental study |
| 516 | to 19 GPa with implications for the transport of P, Cl and K in the upper mantle. |
| 517 | Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology, 163, 277-296. |
| 518 | |
| 519 | Kushiro, I. (1975) On the nature of silicate melt and its significance in magma genesis: |
| 520 | regularities in the shift of the liquidus boundaries involving olivine, pyroxene and silica |
| 521 | minerals. American Journal of Science, 275, 411-431. |
| 522 | |
| 523 | Levin, E.M. and Roth, R.S. (1970) The system niobium pentoxide – phosphorus pentoxide. |
| 524 | Journal of Solid State Chemistry, 2, 250-261. |
| 525 | |
| 526 | Libourel, G. (1999). Systematics of calcium partitioning between olivine and silicate melt: |
| 527 | implications for the melt structure and calcium content of magmatic olivines. Contributions |
| 528 | to Mineralogy and Petrology, 136, 63-80. |
| 529 | |
| 530 | Mallmann, G., O'Neill, H. St. C., Klemme, S. (2009). Heterogenous distribution of |
| 531 | phosphorus in olivine from otherwise well-equilibrated spinel peridotite xenoliths and its |
| 532 | implications for the mantle geochemistry of lithium. Contributions to Mineralogy and |
| 533 | Petrology 158, 485-504. |
| 534 | |
| 535 | McCanta, M.C., Beckett, J.R., Stolper, E.M. (2008). Zonation of phosphorus in olivine: |
| 536 | Dynamic crystallization experiments and a study of chondrule olivine in unequilibrated |
| 537 | ordinary chondrites. Lunar and Planetary Science XXXIX, 1807. |
| 538 | |

| 539 | McCanta, M.C., Beckett, J.R., Stolper, E.M. (2009). Phosphorus zonation in H chondrite |
|-----|--|
| 540 | olivines: The effects of increasing petrologic grade. 40th lunar and planetary science |
| 541 | conference, 2048. |
| 542 | |
| 543 | Millman-Barris, M.S., Beckett, J.R., Baker, M.B., Hofmann, A.E., Morgan, Z., Crowley, |
| 544 | M.R., Vielzeuf, D., Stolper, E. (2008). Zoning of phosphorus in igneous olivine. |
| 545 | Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology 155, 739-765. |
| 546 | |
| 547 | Mysen B.O. and Virgo D. (1980) Trace element partitioning and melt structure: an |
| 548 | experimental study at 1 atm pressure. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta |
| 549 | 44, 1917-1930. |
| 550 | |
| 551 | Ohtani, E., Kawabe, I., Moriyama, J., Nagata, Y. (1989). Partitioning of elements between |
| 552 | majorite garnet and melt and implications for petrogenesis of komatiite. Contributions to |
| 553 | Mineralogy and Petrology, 103, 263-269. |
| 554 | |
| 555 | Pack, A., Palme, H. (2003). Partitioning of Ca and Al between forsterite and silicate melt in |
| 556 | dynamic systems with implications for the origin of Ca, Al-rich forsterite in primitive |
| 557 | meteorites. Meteoritics and Planetary Science, 38, 1263-1281. |
| 558 | |
| 559 | Pan, Y., Dong, P., Chen, N. (2003) Non-Henry's Law behavior of REE partitioning between |
| 560 | fluorapatite and CaF2-rich melts: Controls of intrinsic vacancies and implications for natural |
| 561 | apatites. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 67, 1889-1900. |
| 562 | |
| 563 | Prowatke, S., Klemme, S. (2006) Rare earth element partitioning between titanite and silicate |
| 564 | melts: Henry's law revisited. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 70, 4997-5012. |
| 565 | |
| 566 | Reitano, R., Smith, P.M., Aziz M.J. (1994). Solute trapping of group III, IV, and V elements |
| 567 | in silicon by an aperiodic stepwise growth mechanism. Journal of Applied Physics 76, 1518- |
| 568 | 1529. |
| 569 | |
| 570 | Schairer, J.F., Yoder, H.S. (1966). The system albite-anorthite-forsterite at 1 atmosphere. |
| 571 | Carnegie Institute Washington, Yearbook 65, 206. |
| 572 | |

| 573 | Spandler, C., O'Neill, H.St.C., Kamenetsky, V.S. (2007). Survival times of anomalous melt |
|-----|---|
| 574 | inclusions from element diffusion in olivine and chromite. Nature, 447, 303-306. |
| 575 | |
| 576 | Toplis, M.J. and Corgne, A. (2002) An experimental study of element partitioning between |
| 577 | magnetite, clinopyroxene and iron-bearing silicate liquids with particular emphasis on |
| 578 | vanadium. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology. 144, 22-37. |
| 579 | |
| 580 | Toplis, M.J., Libourel, G., Carroll, M.R. (1994). The role of phosphorus in crystallization |
| 581 | processes of basalt: An experimental study. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 58, 797-810. |
| 582 | |
| 583 | Tropper, P., Recheis, A., Konzett, J. (2004). Pyrometamorphic formation of phosphorus-rich |
| 584 | olivines in partially molten metapelitic gneisses from a prehistoric sacrificial burning site |
| 585 | (Otz Valley, Tyrol, Austria). European Journal of Mineralogy 16, 631-640. |
| 586 | |
| 587 | Watson, E.B. (1977). Partitioning of manganese between forsterite and silicate liquid. |
| 588 | Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 41, 1363-1374. |
| 589 | |
| 590 | Watson, E.B. (1979). Apatite saturation in basic to intermediate magmas. Geophysical |
| 591 | Research Letters, 6, 937-940. |
| 592 | |
| 593 | Welch, J.H. and Gutt, W. (1961) High temperature studies of the system calcium oxide - |
| 594 | phosphorus pentoxide. Journal of the Chemical Society 4442-4444 |
| 595 | |
| 596 | Wolf, M.B. and London, D. (1994). Apatite dissolution into peraluminous haplogranitic |
| 597 | melts: An experimental study of solubilities and mechanisms Geochimica et Cosmochimica |
| 598 | Acta, 58, 4127-4145. |
| 599 | |
| 600 | Witt-Eickschen, G., O'Neill, H.St.C. (2005). The effect of temperature on the equilibrium |
| 601 | distribution of trace elements between clinopyroxene, orthopyroxene, olivine and spinel in |
| 602 | upper mantle peridotite. Chemical Geology 221, 65-101. |
| 603 | |
| 604 | |
| 605 | List of Tables. |
| 606 | |

| 607 | Table 1. Summary of previously reported olivine/melt partition coefficients for phosphorus. |
|--|---|
| 608 | |
| 609 | Table 2. Chemical compositions of starting materials. |
| 610 | |
| 611 | Table 3. Temperature conditions and durations of experiments. |
| 612 | |
| 613 | Table 4. Compositions of olivines and coexisting glasses, together with calculated partition |
| 614 | coefficients. |
| 615 616 617 618 619 620 | Figure Captions. |
| 621 | |
| 622 | Figure 1. Compositions of starting materials and experimentally produced glasses expressed |
| 623 | as a proportion of the number of Mg, Na and Ca cations. The filled symbols are starting |
| 624 | materials and the open symbols are the melt compositions for samples 1-10 which were |
| 625 | cooled at 1°C per hour to a final temperature of 1400°C (circles) or 1270°C (squares). In all |
| 626 | cases the bulk compositions lie close to the tie line connecting the melt compositions with the |
| 627 | Mg apex (as expected if forsterite is the only crystalline phase). |
| 628 | |
| 629 | Figure 2. Examples of P zoning profiles in experimentally produced olivines. Each panel |
| 630 | shows the profiles for several crystals from a specific sample. To aid comparison, all profiles |
| 631 | represent crystallization from starting material 3. Panels A, B and C all show crystals from |
| 632 | the series of experiments cooled to a temperature of 1400°C. Note the relatively constant P |
| 633 | concentration and similarity between the 3 crystals in A (1°C/hour), and the more varied style |
| 634 | of zoning and absolute P concentrations in B and C (5°C and 10°C/hour respectively). D |
| 635 | shows the data for 3 crystals in a sample cooled at 1°C/hour to 1270°C. Despite the much |
| 636 | higher P concentrations in the olivine, all 3 crystals have similar zoning profiles and similar |
| 637 | absolute P concentrations. |
| 638 | |
| 639 | Figure 3. The chemical gradients at an olivine-melt interface in sample 2 elucidated by FEG |
| 640 | EPMA. (a) is a back-scattered electron image, (b) and (c) are X-ray maps of Mg and Si |

641 respectively, (d) is a P X-ray map obtained by summing the output of 3 different

spectrometers, and (e) is a traverse generated using imagej64 to integrate the count rates for rectangular area shown in (d). Note the rise and then fall in the P count rate from core to rim within the olivine, the sharp transition from olivine to glass and the homogeneous nature of the glass adjacent to the crystal. The field of view in (a) to (d) is $61.4 \times 61.4 \mu m$ and the pixel size is $0.12 \times 0.12 \mu m$.

647

648 Figure 4. A high-resolution line scan across an olivine crystal in sample 6, the sample with 649 the highest partition coefficient in this study, and hence the sample most likely to display 650 non-equilibrium features. (a) shows a BSE image of the crystal oriented so that the traverse 651 runs horizontally from west to east. The scale bar is 100 microns. (b) shows wt% P_2O_5 652 concentration (black squares) across the whole crystal together with wt% SiO₂/50 (red 653 diamonds) to clearly show the boundary between olivine and glass. (c) is a close-up view of 654 the edge of the crystal, showing that the complex excursions in P_2O_5 concentration occur 655 within the olivine.

656

Figure 5. Correlations between P concentration and concentration of other elements in

olivine, where concentrations are expressed as the number of cations per four oxygens. Data

points are for samples 1-10, which were all cooled at 1°C/hour. The solid lines are not fits to

the data, they are the predicted co-variations of elemental abundances for reactions (1), (2),

and (3). The slopes strongly support equation (1) as the correct mechanism for P

662 incorporation in olivine in this study. The 1% offset between experiment and prediction

663 (discussed in the text) for Si and Mg is almost certainly an analytical artifact.

664

665 Figure 6. Phosphorus partition coefficients for all samples plotted as a function of NBO/T

and X_{SiO2} . Error bars are smaller than the symbols unless shown. The samples with cooling

rates of 1°C/hour are plotted with filled symbols. Circles are samples 6-10 (cooled to

668 1270°C), squares are samples 1-5 (cooled to 1400°C) and diamonds are samples 21-23

669 (cooled to 1400°C but with varying bulk P concentration). The samples with more rapid

670 cooling rates are plotted with open or grey symbols. The open triangles are samples 17-20

 $(5^{\circ}C/hour)$, the grey triangles are samples 24-28 ($10^{\circ}C/hour$). Three methods were initially

672 used for the calculation of NBO/T. In all cases, the first step is to recalculate melt

673 compositions in terms of number of cations per 100 oxygens. In method one, it is assumed

674 that P polymerises the melt, so the number of NBO is calculated as 2(Mg+Ca)+Na-Al

- 675 (because some cations are removed from a network modifying role by charge balancing
- tetrahedral Al) and T is (Si+Al+P). In method 2, it is assumed that P depolymerises the melt
- 677 (while remaining tetrahedrally coordinated), so NBO is calculated as 2(Mg+Ca)+Na+P-Al
- and T is (Si+Al+P). As we do not know which of these models is correct (and there is very
- 679 little difference in the calculated value of NBO/T anyway) the value used here is the average
- of the two calculations. A third method simply uses the equation NBO/T = [200-
- 681 4(Si+Al+P)]/[Si+Al+P], and gives essentially the same as method 2 in this simple system.
- X_{SiO2} was calculated on a single-cation basis, e.g. using $X_{AlO1.5}$ not X_{Al2O3} (following Evans et
- al., 2008). The lines through the data are least squares linear fits through the 1°C/hour data
- 684 only.
- 685
- 686





6/5

Always consult and cite the final, published document. See http://www.minsocam.org or GeoscienceWorld



Figure 6

Table 1. Summary of previously reported olivine/melt partition coefficients for phosphorus.

| Rock Type | ${D_P}^{ol/melt}$ | Reference |
|-----------------------------|-------------------|-----------|
| Experimental studies | | |
| nepheline basanite | 0.038-0.05 | 1 |
| nepheline basanite | 0.05 | 1 |
| Mauna Kea basalt (doped) | 0.5-<0.1 | 2 |
| ferro-basalt | 0.02-0.2 | 3 |
| Natural mineral-melt pairs | | |
| subalkaline basalt | 0.043 | 4 |
| subalkaline andesite | 0.055 | 4 |
| alkaline basalt | 0.019 | 4 |
| chassignite | 0.3 | 5 |
| spinel lherzolite | 0.1 | 6 |
| ugandite / leucite basanite | 0.0102 | 7 |

1) Adam and Green (2006)

2) Millman-Barris et al. (2008)

3) Toplis et al. (1994)

4) Anderson and Greenland (1969)

5) Beck et al. (2006)

6) Brunet and Chazot (2001)

7) Foley et al. (2011)

Table 2. Chemical compositions of starting materials.

| | composition number | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------|--------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| Oxide Wt. % | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 |
| MgO | 23.92 | 25.27 | 26.4 | 27.41 | 27.89 | 14.05 | 14.99 | 16.92 | 17.97 | 19.46 | 28.43 | 29.25 | 30.11 |
| SiO ₂ | 54.33 | 49.87 | 45.74 | 42.59 | 38.82 | 57.31 | 53.96 | 50.63 | 47.69 | 44.59 | 45.34 | 45.03 | 44.69 |
| AI_2O_3 | 11.85 | 12.83 | 13.8 | 14.46 | 15.64 | 15.76 | 16.39 | 16.79 | 17.37 | 17.76 | 13.69 | 13.59 | 13.49 |
| P_2O_5 | 2.00 | 2.00 | 2.00 | 2.02 | 2.02 | 2.01 | 2.03 | 2.02 | 2.00 | 2.03 | 0.97 | 0.64 | 0.31 |
| CaO | 1.69 | 5.36 | 8.81 | 11.36 | 14.76 | 3.12 | 5.98 | 8.24 | 10.6 | 12.89 | 8.26 | 8.20 | 8.14 |
| Na ₂ O | 6.21 | 4.67 | 3.24 | 2.15 | 0.88 | 7.76 | 6.64 | 5.40 | 4.36 | 3.26 | 3.30 | 3.28 | 3.26 |

| | Starting | Run | Ramp | Initial dwell | Final dwell | Total run |
|------------|----------|----------------|------|---------------|-------------|-----------|
| Sample no. | material | temperature °C | °/hr | time (hr) | time (hr) | time (hr) |
| 1 | 1 | 1530-1400 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 137 |
| 2 | 2 | 1530-1400 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 137 |
| 3 | 3 | 1530-1400 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 137 |
| 4 | 4 | 1530-1400 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 137 |
| 5 | 5 | 1530-1400 | 1 | 5 | 2 | 137 |
| 6 | 6 | 1400-1270 | 1 | 5.3 | 3 | 138.3 |
| 7 | 7 | 1400-1270 | 1 | 5.3 | 3 | 138.3 |
| 8 | 8 | 1400-1270 | 1 | 5.3 | 3 | 138.3 |
| 9 | 9 | 1400-1270 | 1 | 5.3 | 3 | 138.3 |
| 10 | 10 | 1400-1270 | 1 | 5.3 | 3 | 138.3 |
| 17 | 2 | 1530-1400 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 26 |
| 18 | 3 | 1530-1400 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 26 |
| 19 | 4 | 1530-1400 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 26 |
| 20 | 5 | 1530-1400 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 26 |
| 21 | 11 | 1530-1400 | 1 | 0 | 11.5 | 141.5 |
| 22 | 12 | 1530-1400 | 1 | 0 | 11.5 | 141.5 |
| 23 | 13 | 1530-1400 | 1 | 0 | 11.5 | 141.5 |
| 24 | 1 | 1530-1400 | 10 | 0 | 4 | 17 |
| 25 | 2 | 1530-1400 | 10 | 0 | 4 | 17 |
| 26 | 3 | 1530-1400 | 10 | 0 | 4 | 17 |
| 27 | 4 | 1530-1400 | 10 | 0 | 4 | 17 |
| 28 | 5 | 1530-1400 | 10 | 0 | 4 | 17 |

Table 3. Temperature/time conditions of experiments.

Table 4. Compositions of olivines and coexisting glasses, together with calculated phosphorus partition coefficients (D_P). All compositions expressed as wt%. The standard deviation (given in parentheses) is calculated from the spread of compositions across all analysed points. It is dominated by heterogeneity in the samples rather than counting statistics of EMPA. See text for calculation of NBO/T.

| | MgO | SiO ₂ | AI_2O_3 | P_2O_5 | CaO | Na ₂ O | Total | N ^a | | |
|---|--|--|---|---|--|---|--|--|--|--|
| Olivine | compositions | 5 | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | 56.01(16) | 41.89(22) | 0.073(2) | 0.961(73) | 0.044(2) | 0.027(7) | 99.00 | 20 | | |
| 2 | 55.81(12) | 41.98(12) | 0.103(8) | 0.670(123) | 0.139(4) | 0.021(5) | 98.73 | 20 | | |
| 3 | 55.89(9) | 42.04(9) | 0.108(3) | 0.576(79) | 0.247(5) | 0.019(5) | 98.87 | 35 | | |
| 4 | 55.86(17) | 42.01(14) | 0.151(6) | 0.555(72) | 0.364(5) | 0.014(5) | 98.96 | 20 | | |
| 5 | 56.20(24) | 42.67(23) | 0.219(11) | 0.146(7) | 0.598(17) | 0.006(6) | 99.84 | 20 | | |
| 6 | 55.25(15) | 40.20(33) | 0.121(19) | 2.896(418) | 0.087(5) | 0.031(6) | 98.58 | 43 | | |
| 7 | 55.93(28) | 40.98(25) | 0.114(32) | 2.453(272) | 0.147(5) | 0.033(5) | 99.66 | 42 | | |
| 8 | 55.50(17) | 41.16(15) | 0.096(7) | 1.885(240) | 0.201(8) | 0.028(6) | 98.88 | 34 | | |
| 9 | 56.13(19) | 42.12(17) | 0.160(58) | 0.792(237) | 0.262(10) | 0.020(6) | 99.49 | 38 | | |
| 10 | 55.87(19) | 42.27(13) | 0.137(17) | 0.374(136) | 0.356(8) | 0.012(6) | 99.02 | 24 | | |
| 17 | 57.28(26) | 41.72(30) | 0.087(8) | 1.171(340) | 0.134(6) | 0.029(4) | 100.42 | 27 | | |
| 18 | 57.68(15) | 41.65(16) | 0.115(9) | 0.731(203) | 0.247(11) | 0.023(5) | 100.45 | 30 | | |
| 19 | 57.09(82) | 42.19(28) | 0.142(20) | 0.380(102) | 0.361(11) | 0.015(5) | 100.19 | 26 | | |
| 20 | 57.14(85) | 42.09(35) | 0.270(103) | 0.513(125) | 0.305(52) | 0.009(6) | 100.32 | 29 | | |
| 21 | 57.41(39) | 42.87(37) | 0.114(22) | 0.186(51) | 0.270(15) | 0.015(5) | 100.86 | 73 | | |
| 22 | 58.02(23) | 42.79(16) | 0.116(10) | 0.070(8) | 0.276(6) | 0.007(3) | 101.28 | 86 | | |
| 23 | 57.54(21) | 42.97(14) | 0.118(9) | 0.039(7) | 0.333(15) | 0.009(4) | 101.02 | 41 | | |
| 24 | 57.45(19) | 41.33(56) | 0.207(53) | 1.384(728) | 0.171(174) | 0.030(16) | 100.58 | 38 | | |
| 25 | 56.89(15) | 41.67(35) | 0.140(19) | 1.049(458) | 0.143(54) | 0.034(16) | 99.93 | 32 | | |
| 26 | 57.02(20) | 41.92(20) | 0.179(43) | 0.512(164) | 0.250(11) | 0.020(6) | 99.90 | 37 | | |
| 27 | 56.56(43) | 42.10(33) | 0.266(129 | 0.394(94) | 0.391(157) | 0.012(5) | 99.72 | 31 | | |
| 28 | 56.37(199) | 41.74(57) | - | 0.393(174) | - | - | 98.50 | 24 | | |
| | • • | () | | () | | | | | | |
| Glass | compositions | () | | ~ / | | | | | NBO/T | D _P |
| Glass 1 | compositions 17.23(41) | 57.62(41) | 13.78(31) | 2.38(12) | 1.80(4) | 6.96(31) | 99.77 | 20 | NBO/T 0.705 | D _P 0.40(4) |
| Glass 1 2 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) | 99.77 99.64 | 20 23 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) |
| Glass 1 2 3 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 | 20 23 17 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 | 20 23 17 20 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 | 20 23 17 20 25 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 20 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 20 13 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) 3.94(25) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 20 13 16 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 19 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) 19.46(19) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) 44.27(46) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) 17.27(24) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) 3.76(21) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) 13.29(13) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) 3.94(25) 2.62(16) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 100.67 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 20 13 16 14 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 1.074 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.10(3) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 19 20 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) 19.46(19) 19.33(29) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) 44.27(46) 39.83(42) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) 17.27(24) 18.86(22) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) 3.76(21) 3.89(12) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) 13.29(13) 17.84(21) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) 3.94(25) 2.62(16) 1.13(10) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 100.67 100.87 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 25 20 13 16 14 16 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 1.074 1.185 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.10(3) 0.13(3) |
| Glass Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 19 20 21 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) 19.46(19) 19.33(29) 18.59(24) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) 44.27(46) 39.83(42) 49.29(35) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) 17.27(24) 18.86(22) 16.97(16) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) 3.76(21) 3.89(12) 1.29(7) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) 13.29(13) 17.84(21) 10.09(7) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) 3.94(25) 2.62(16) 1.13(10) 4.19(11) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 100.67 100.87 100.42 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 25 20 13 16 14 16 27 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 1.074 1.185 0.934 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.10(3) 0.13(3) 0.14(4) |
| Glass Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 19 20 21 22 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) 19.46(19) 19.33(29) 18.59(24) 19.26(91) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) 44.27(46) 39.83(42) 49.29(35) 49.68(80) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) 17.27(24) 18.86(22) 16.97(16) 17.24(16) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) 3.76(21) 3.89(12) 1.29(7) 0.70(27) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) 13.29(13) 17.84(21) 10.09(7) 10.31(22) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) 3.94(25) 2.62(16) 1.13(10) 4.19(11) 2.84(105) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 100.67 100.87 100.42 100.02 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 20 13 16 14 16 27 32 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 1.074 1.185 0.934 0.921 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.10(3) 0.13(3) 0.14(4) 0.10(4) |
| Glass Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) 19.46(19) 19.33(29) 18.59(24) 19.26(91) 17.80(16) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) 44.27(46) 39.83(42) 49.29(35) 49.68(80) 48.94(75) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) 17.27(24) 18.86(22) 16.97(16) 17.24(16) 17.92(16) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) 3.76(21) 3.89(12) 1.29(7) 0.70(27) 0.41(2) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) 13.29(13) 17.84(21) 10.09(7) 10.31(22) 10.65(12) | $\begin{array}{c} 6.96(31)\\ 5.34(20)\\ 3.83(15)\\ 2.47(11)\\ 1.07(12)\\ 8.31(54)\\ 7.12(21)\\ 6.10(16)\\ 4.26(55)\\ 3.86(21)\\ 5.36(15)\\ 3.94(25)\\ 2.62(16)\\ 1.13(10)\\ 4.19(11)\\ 2.84(105)\\ 4.52(13)\end{array}$ | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 100.67 100.87 100.87 100.42 100.02 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 20 13 16 14 16 27 32 20 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 1.074 1.185 0.934 0.921 0.905 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.10(3) 0.13(3) 0.14(4) 0.10(4) 0.10(2) |
| Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) 19.46(19) 19.33(29) 18.59(24) 19.26(91) 17.80(16) 16.55(57) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) 44.27(46) 39.83(42) 49.29(35) 49.68(80) 48.94(75) 57.44(48) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) 17.27(24) 18.86(22) 16.97(16) 17.24(16) 17.92(16) 13.92(23) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) 3.76(21) 3.89(12) 1.29(7) 0.70(27) 0.41(2) 2.23(12) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) 13.29(13) 17.84(21) 10.09(7) 10.31(22) 10.65(12) 1.83(5) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) 3.94(25) 2.62(16) 1.13(10) 4.19(11) 2.84(105) 4.52(13) 7.16(26) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 100.67 100.87 100.42 100.02 100.22 99.12 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 20 13 16 14 16 27 32 20 24 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 1.074 1.185 0.934 0.921 0.905 0.683 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.10(3) 0.13(3) 0.14(4) 0.10(4) 0.10(2) 0.62(33) |
| Glass Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) 19.46(19) 19.33(29) 18.59(24) 19.26(91) 17.80(16) 16.55(57) 18.09(19) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) 44.27(46) 39.83(42) 49.29(35) 49.68(80) 48.94(75) 57.44(48) 52.84(55) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) 17.27(24) 18.86(22) 16.97(16) 17.24(16) 17.92(16) 13.92(23) 14.86(23) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) 3.76(21) 3.89(12) 1.29(7) 0.70(27) 0.41(2) 2.23(12) 2.27(11) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) 13.29(13) 17.84(21) 10.09(7) 10.31(22) 10.65(12) 1.83(5) 5.77(6) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) 3.94(25) 2.62(16) 1.13(10) 4.19(11) 2.84(105) 4.52(13) 7.16(26) 5.32(24) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 100.67 100.87 100.42 100.02 100.22 99.12 99.15 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 25 20 13 16 14 16 27 32 20 24 13 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 1.074 1.185 0.934 0.921 0.905 0.683 0.831 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.10(3) 0.13(3) 0.14(4) 0.10(4) 0.10(2) 0.62(33) 0.46(20) |
| Glass Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) 19.46(19) 19.33(29) 18.59(24) 19.26(91) 17.80(16) 16.55(57) 18.09(19) 19.39(38) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) 44.27(46) 39.83(42) 49.29(35) 49.68(80) 48.94(75) 57.44(48) 52.84(55) 47.97(34) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) 17.27(24) 18.86(22) 16.97(16) 17.24(16) 17.92(16) 13.92(23) 14.86(23) 16.01(23) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) 3.76(21) 3.89(12) 1.29(7) 0.70(27) 0.41(2) 2.23(12) 2.27(11) 2.14(21) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) 13.29(13) 17.84(21) 10.09(7) 10.31(22) 10.65(12) 1.83(5) 5.77(6) 9.56(11) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) 3.94(25) 2.62(16) 1.13(10) 4.19(11) 2.84(105) 4.52(13) 7.16(26) 5.32(24) 3.77(17) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 100.67 100.87 100.42 100.02 100.22 99.12 99.15 98.83 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 25 25 20 13 16 14 16 27 32 20 24 13 18 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 1.074 1.185 0.934 0.921 0.905 0.683 0.831 0.985 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.10(3) 0.13(3) 0.14(4) 0.10(2) 0.62(33) 0.46(20) 0.24(8) |
| Glass Glass 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 | compositions 17.23(41) 18.83(31) 19.99(29) 20.20(32) 19.26(28) 8.85(186) 9.89(58) 10.34(26) 10.77(31) 10.63(22) 19.41(71) 19.62(21) 19.46(19) 19.33(29) 18.59(24) 19.26(91) 17.80(16) 16.55(57) 18.09(19) 19.39(38) 19.64(29) | 57.62(41) 52.52(52) 48.42(31) 44.90(36) 41.34(40) 60.14(134) 57.17(55) 54.01(51) 51.79(80) 47.61(52) 51.77(29) 47.16(38) 44.27(46) 39.83(42) 49.29(35) 49.68(80) 48.94(75) 57.44(48) 52.84(55) 47.97(34) 45.81(81) | 13.78(31) 14.84(34) 15.80(23) 16.88(34) 18.40(34) 17.15(73) 17.86(38) 18.73(30) 19.89(40) 20.61(33) 14.63(22) 15.80(24) 17.27(24) 18.86(22) 16.97(16) 17.24(16) 17.92(16) 13.92(23) 14.86(23) 16.01(23) 17.50(36) | 2.38(12) 2.40(9) 2.55(12) 2.70(11) 2.87(10) 2.05(20) 2.01(21) 2.20(14) 1.49(60) 2.52(13) 3.18(16) 3.56(17) 3.76(21) 3.89(12) 1.29(7) 0.70(27) 0.41(2) 2.23(12) 2.27(11) 2.14(21) 1.55(56) | 1.80(4) 5.72(6) 9.50(12) 12.73(7) 17.24(13) 3.14(42) 5.84(14) 8.70(10) 11.65(20) 14.50(9) 5.81(7) 9.90(11) 13.29(13) 17.84(21) 10.09(7) 10.31(22) 10.65(12) 1.83(5) 5.77(6) 9.56(11) 13.08(25) | 6.96(31) 5.34(20) 3.83(15) 2.47(11) 1.07(12) 8.31(54) 7.12(21) 6.10(16) 4.26(55) 3.86(21) 5.36(15) 3.94(25) 2.62(16) 1.13(10) 4.19(11) 2.84(105) 4.52(13) 7.16(26) 5.32(24) 3.77(17) 1.66(81) | 99.77 99.64 100.08 99.88 100.18 99.64 99.96 100.09 99.85 99.72 100.15 99.99 100.67 100.87 100.42 100.02 100.22 99.12 99.15 98.83 99.24 | 20 23 17 20 25 26 25 25 25 25 25 20 13 16 14 16 27 32 20 24 13 18 29 | NBO/T 0.705 0.865 1.009 1.096 1.161 0.364 0.446 0.515 0.556 0.635 0.904 1.021 1.074 1.185 0.934 0.921 0.905 0.683 0.831 0.985 1.030 | D _P 0.40(4) 0.28(5) 0.23(3) 0.21(3) 0.051(3) 1.41(25) 1.22(19) 0.86(12) 0.53(27) 0.15(6) 0.37(11) 0.21(6) 0.10(3) 0.13(3) 0.14(4) 0.10(4) 0.10(2) 0.62(33) 0.46(20) 0.24(8) 0.25(11) |

^aN is the number of analyses.